

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2	Elias, Marc E.	10/17/2014	1.00	\$700.00	\$700.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Meet regarding legal challenge (.7); review same (.3);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
3	Elias, Marc E.	10/20/2014	0.50	\$700.00	\$350.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review case issue;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
4	Frost, Elisabeth C.	10/20/2014	0.70	\$430.00	\$301.00	\$390.00		\$273.00			Determine whether state redistricting challenge could be filed in Eastern District of Virginia as a related case to the federal redistricting case (.5); emails with M. Elias and K. Hamilton regarding filing as a related case (.2);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
5	Elias, Marc E.	10/21/2014	0.50	\$700.00	\$350.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Meet regarding litigation plan (.4); review same (.1);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
6	Frost, Elisabeth C.	10/21/2014	0.60	\$430.00	\$258.00	\$390.00		\$234.00			Prepare for meeting with M. Elias regarding staffing and litigation strategy (.2); meet with M. Elias regarding staffing and litigation strategy (.4);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
7	Elias, Marc E.	10/23/2014	0.50	\$700.00	\$350.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Telephone call regarding lawsuit (.2); review past complaint (.3);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
8	Frost, Elisabeth C.	10/23/2014	0.20	\$430.00	\$86.00	\$390.00		\$78.00			Telephone conference with A. Khanna regarding history of matter and litigation strategy;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
9	Khanna, Abha	10/23/2014	0.40	\$450.00	\$180.00	\$410.00		\$164.00			Telephone conference with M. Elias regarding initiation of case (.2); review docket of previously-filed challenge to VA House of Delegates, including complaint (.1); email with M. Elias regarding same (.1);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
10	Frost, Elisabeth C.	10/24/2014	0.20	\$430.00	\$86.00	\$390.00		\$78.00			Meet with M. Elias regarding litigation strategy (.1); emails with K. Hamilton, M. Elias, and A. Khanna regarding scheduling call to discuss litigation strategy (.1);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
11	Elias, Marc E.	10/28/2014	1.00	\$700.00	\$700.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Telephone conference regarding new lawsuit (.8); review issues regarding same (.2);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
12	Frost, Elisabeth C.	10/28/2014	1.00	\$430.00	\$430.00	\$390.00		\$390.00			Telephone conference with M. Elias regarding analysis of state legislative maps (.5); telephone conference with M. Elias and A. Khanna regarding litigation strategy (.3); exchange related emails (.2);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
13	Khanna, Abha	10/30/2014	0.50	\$450.00	\$225.00	\$410.00		\$205.00			Review Memorandum Opinion of three-judge panel in preparation for drafting complaint;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
14	Frost, Elisabeth C.	10/31/2014	1.00	\$430.00	\$430.00	\$390.00		\$390.00			Researching districts for potential challenge;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
15	Elias, Marc E.	11/10/2014	2.00	\$700.00	\$1,400.00	\$575.00		\$1,150.00			Telephone conferences regarding lawsuit (1.9); review issues regarding same (.1);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
16	Frost, Elisabeth C.	11/10/2014	1.90	\$430.00	\$817.00	\$390.00		\$741.00			Telephone conference with K. Hamilton, M. Elias and A. Khanna regarding litigation strategy (.8); telephone conferences with M. Elias regarding litigation strategy (1.1);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
17	Hamilton, Kevin J.	11/10/2014	0.90	\$615.00	\$553.50	\$575.00		\$517.50			Prepare for and participate in telephone conference with M. Elias, A. Khanna, and L. Frost;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
18	Khanna, Abha	11/10/2014	1.80	\$450.00	\$810.00	\$410.00		\$738.00			Review summary of potential district challenges in preparation for call with legal team regarding legal strategy (.5); participate in call with legal team (.8); email with legal team regarding same (.2); research case law regarding issues related to challenge (.2); call and leave voicemail for S. Ansolabehere regarding expert analysis (.1);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
19	Khanna, Abha	11/11/2014	0.60	\$450.00	\$270.00	\$410.00		\$246.00			Telephone conference with S. Ansolabehere regarding case outline and expert participation (.4); draft and circulate email to legal team regarding same (.2);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
20	Frost, Elisabeth C.	11/12/2014	1.00	\$430.00	\$430.00	\$390.00		\$390.00			Emails with A. Khanna regarding preparing complaints (.3); meet with A. Branch regarding background of matter and drafting complaints (.6); email A. Branch materials for drafting complaints (.1);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
21	Hamilton, Kevin J.	11/12/2014	0.30	\$615.00	\$184.50	\$575.00		\$172.50			Exchange email with L. Frost and A. Khanna regarding new case challenging state redistricting;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
22	Frost, Elisabeth C.	11/13/2014	0.20	\$430.00	\$86.00	\$390.00		\$78.00			Review House plan totals to identify majority-minority districts;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
23	Khanna, Abha	11/13/2014	0.10	\$450.00	\$45.00	\$410.00		\$41.00			Review statistics about House districts being challenged;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
24	Frost, Elisabeth C.	11/17/2014	0.30	\$430.00	\$129.00	\$390.00		\$117.00			Emails from S. Ansolabehere regarding legislative map statistics (.1); emails with A. Khanna regarding S. Ansolabehere initial analysis (.2);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
25	Khanna, Abha	11/17/2014	0.30	\$450.00	\$135.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Telephone conference with S. Ansolabehere regarding preliminary expert analysis (.3);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
26	Elias, Marc E.	11/18/2014	0.80	\$700.00	\$560.00	\$575.00		\$460.00			Review issues re lawsuit (.2); telephone conference and conference re same (.6);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
27	Frost, Elisabeth C.	11/18/2014	0.20	\$430.00	\$86.00	\$390.00		\$78.00			Meet with A. Branch regarding drafting complaint challenging state house of delegates map;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
28	Khanna, Abha	11/18/2014	0.10	\$450.00	\$45.00	\$410.00		\$41.00			Telephone conference with S. Ansolabehere regarding precinct data;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
29	Branch, Aria C.	11/19/2014	5.00	\$325.00	\$1,625.00	\$300.00		\$1,500.00			Review cases, research, and material in preparation for drafting House complaint;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
30	Khanna, Abha	11/21/2014	0.30	\$450.00	\$135.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Telephone conference with S. Ansolabehere regarding data analysis;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
31	Frost, Elisabeth C.	11/23/2014	0.60	\$430.00	\$258.00	\$390.00		\$234.00			Email from M. Elias regarding status of matter (.1); emails with A. Khanna regarding preparing senate complaint (.3); email with A. Branch regarding status of draft complaint (.2);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
32	Branch, Aria C.	11/24/2014	8.30	\$325.00	\$2,697.50	\$300.00		\$2,490.00			Draft House of Delegates complaint;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
33	Branch, Aria C.	11/25/2014	10.90	\$325.00	\$3,542.50	\$300.00		\$3,270.00			Draft Virginia House of Delegates redistricting complaint;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
34	Branch, Aria C.	11/26/2014	3.30	\$325.00	\$1,072.50	\$300.00		\$990.00			Draft Virginia House of Delegates redistricting complaint;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
35	Branch, Aria C.	11/27/2014	1.80	\$325.00	\$585.00	\$300.00		\$540.00			Draft Virginia House of Delegates redistricting complaint;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
36	Branch, Aria C.	11/28/2014	0.70	\$325.00	\$227.50	\$300.00		\$210.00			Draft Virginia House of Delegates redistricting complaint;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
37	Frost, Elisabeth C.	11/30/2014	1.70	\$430.00	\$731.00	\$390.00		\$663.00			Review draft House complaint (.3); revise draft House complaint (1.2); email A. Branch regarding draft complaint (.1); circulate revised draft complaint to M. Elias, K. Hamilton and A. Khanna (.1);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
38	Hamilton, Kevin J.	11/30/2014	1.00	\$615.00	\$615.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Review draft state complaint;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
39	Branch, Aria C.	12/1/2014	2.90	\$325.00	\$942.50	\$300.00		\$870.00			Research issues related to Virginia House of Delegates redistricting complaint;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
40	Hamilton, Kevin J.	12/1/2014	0.50	\$615.00	\$307.50	\$575.00		\$287.50			Conference with A. Khanna regarding complaint;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
41	Khanna, Abha	12/1/2014	0.10	\$450.00	\$45.00	\$410.00		\$41.00			Email with expert regarding precinct data;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
42	Elias, Marc E.	12/2/2014	1.00	\$700.00	\$700.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Review issues re complaint and lawsuit;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
43	Hamilton, Kevin J.	12/2/2014	1.90	\$615.00	\$1,168.50	\$575.00		\$1,092.50			Review and comment on early draft of complaint (1.4); review and respond to email regarding analysis of challenged state General Assembly districts (.5);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
44	Hamilton, Kevin J.	12/3/2014	1.50	\$615.00	\$922.50	\$575.00		\$862.50			Review and revise draft state complaint (1.1); exchange email with A. Khanna and L. Frost regarding same (.4);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
45	Khanna, Abha	12/3/2014	0.80	\$450.00	\$360.00	\$410.00		\$328.00			Telephone conference with E. Frost and K. Hamilton regarding status of lawsuit (.5); review draft House complaint (.3);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
46	Branch, Aria C.	12/4/2014	1.60	\$325.00	\$520.00	\$300.00		\$480.00			Research issues related to Virginia House of Delegates redistricting complaint;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
47	Elias, Marc E.	12/4/2014	0.50	\$700.00	\$350.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Telephone conference re lawsuit (.4); review options re same (.1);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
48	Khanna, Abha	12/4/2014	1.90	\$450.00	\$855.00	\$410.00		\$779.00			Telephone conference with legal team regarding status of complaint (.3); confer with E. Frost regarding draft complaint and legislative statements regarding BVAP threshold (.5); review exhibits regarding same (.9); email with E. Frost and A. Branch regarding same (.2);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
49	Branch, Aria C.	12/5/2014	5.70	\$325.00	\$1,852.50	\$300.00		\$1,710.00			Research issues related to Virginia House of Delegates redistricting complaint;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
50	Khanna, Abha	12/5/2014	3.80	\$450.00	\$1,710.00	\$410.00		\$1,558.00			Review and revise complaint (2.4); research election statistics and review shape of districts in process of doing same (1.0); email with E. Frost and A. Branch comprehensive email summary of key points (.4);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
51	Branch, Aria C.	12/8/2014	1.40	\$325.00	\$455.00	\$300.00		\$420.00			Research issues related to Virginia House of Delegates redistricting complaint;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
52	Elias, Marc E.	12/8/2014	1.00	\$700.00	\$700.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Telephone conference re lawsuit (.9); review issues re same (.1);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
53	Khanna, Abha	12/8/2014	4.30	\$450.00	\$1,935.00	\$410.00		\$1,763.00			Confer with A. Branch regarding questions on comments regarding House complaint (.4); review and revise same (3.5); review House committee resolution on redistricting criteria (.2); email with S. Ansolabehere regarding data and analysis for Senate litigation (.2);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
54	Frost, Elisabeth C.	12/9/2014	1.00	\$430.00	\$430.00	\$390.00		\$390.00			Telephone conference with A. Khanna regarding preparing House complaint and researching legal theory (.9); email to M. Elias regarding status of case (.1);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
55	Khanna, Abha	12/9/2014	3.90	\$450.00	\$1,755.00	\$410.00		\$1,599.00			Review and revise draft complaint (2.0); confer with E. Frost regarding same (.9); telephone conference with S. Ansolabehere regarding precinct data, initial analysis, and potential claims (.5); research and chart election results for minority candidates in challenged districts (.5);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
56	Elias, Marc E.	12/10/2014	0.50	\$700.00	\$350.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Email re lawsuit review same;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
57	Branch, Aria C.	12/12/2014	1.00	\$325.00	\$325.00	\$300.00		\$300.00			Research expert witness qualifications;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
58	Frost, Elisabeth C.	12/12/2014	1.00	\$430.00	\$430.00	\$390.00		\$390.00			Review draft complaint (.8); emails with A. Khanna regarding litigation strategy (.2);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
59	Hamilton, Kevin J.	12/12/2014	0.30	\$615.00	\$184.50	\$575.00		\$172.50			Exchange email with L. Frost regarding state court complaint;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
60	Branch, Aria C.	12/15/2014	2.50	\$325.00	\$812.50	\$300.00		\$750.00			Research expert witness qualifications;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
61	Branch, Aria C.	12/16/2014	0.40	\$325.00	\$130.00	\$300.00		\$120.00			Research expert witness qualifications;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
62	Elias, Marc E.	12/16/2014	1.00	\$700.00	\$700.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Review draft complaint;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
63	Frost, Elisabeth C.	12/16/2014	0.20	\$430.00	\$86.00	\$390.00		\$78.00			Circulate draft of complaint to M. Elias;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
64	Hamilton, Kevin J.	12/16/2014	0.40	\$615.00	\$246.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Review draft complaint (.3); exchange email with L. Frost regarding same (.1);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
65	Frost, Elisabeth C.	12/17/2014	0.60	\$430.00	\$258.00	\$390.00		\$234.00			Review draft redistricting recommendations (.3); revise draft complaint (.3);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
66	Roche, John K.	12/18/2014	0.50	\$510.00	\$255.00	\$465.00		\$232.50			Review draft complaint and exchange emails with L. Frost regarding same;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
67	Frost, Elisabeth C.	12/21/2014	1.80	\$430.00	\$774.00	\$390.00		\$702.00			Emails with M. Elias regarding filing (.1); revise complaint (.5); prepare civil cover sheet, summons, and cover letter for filing (1.2);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
68	Elias, Marc E.	12/22/2014	1.50	\$700.00	\$1,050.00	\$575.00		\$862.50			Review final papers; email and telephone conference re filing;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
69	Frost, Elisabeth C.	12/22/2014	2.30	\$430.00	\$989.00	\$390.00		\$897.00			Finalize papers for filing (1.5); prepare chart of plaintiffs (.7); emails with J. Roche and K. Elhawary regarding filing (.1);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
70	Roche, John K.	12/22/2014	1.50	\$510.00	\$765.00	\$465.00		\$697.50			Revise draft complaint and case opening documents and exchange emails with L. Frost and M. Elias regarding filing and service of same;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
71	Frost, Elisabeth C.	12/23/2014	0.60	\$430.00	\$258.00	\$390.00		\$234.00			Prepare pro hac vice motions and circulate to relevant attorneys (.6);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
72	Hamilton, Kevin J.	12/23/2014	0.70	\$615.00	\$430.50	\$575.00		\$402.50			Review complaint, case filing and judge assignment (.6); exchange email regarding same (.1);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
73	Roche, John K.	12/23/2014	0.20	\$510.00	\$102.00	\$465.00		\$93.00			Review emails from M. Elias and client regarding case status and service of pleadings;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
74	Frost, Elisabeth C.	12/24/2014	0.10	\$430.00	\$43.00	\$390.00		\$39.00			Emails with K. Hamilton and A. Khanna regarding pro hac vice motions (.1);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
75	Hamilton, Kevin J.	12/24/2014	1.00	\$615.00	\$615.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Exchange email with L. Frost regarding pro hac vice application; review, sign, and return certification form;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
76	Roche, John K.	12/29/2014	0.10	\$510.00	\$51.00	\$465.00		\$46.50			Draft email to M. Melis and T. Cox regarding service of complaint;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
77	Khanna, Abha	12/30/2014	0.20	\$450.00	\$90.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Review and sign pro hac vice papers (.1); email with E. Frost regarding plaintiff contact information (.1);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
78	Elias, Marc E.	12/31/2014	0.50	\$700.00	\$350.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Telephone conference and email regarding issues regarding lawsuit;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
79	Khanna, Abha	12/31/2014	0.10	\$450.00	\$45.00	\$410.00		\$41.00			Email with legal team regarding potential Section 2 claim and press inquiries;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
80	Roche, John K.	12/31/2014	0.20	\$510.00	\$102.00	\$465.00		\$93.00			Draft emails to M. Elias regarding media inquiries and service of complaint on defendants;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
81	Frost, Elisabeth C.	1/5/2015	0.30	\$475.00	\$142.50	\$390.00		\$117.00			Review returned engagement letters (.2); emails with J. Medile regarding engagement letters (.1);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
82	Roche, John K.	1/5/2015	0.50	\$535.00	\$267.50	\$465.00		\$232.50			Review and sign pro hac vice motions (.3), exchange emails with L. Frost regarding same (.1), and exchange emails with Y.Y. Huang regarding service of complaint (.1);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
83	Roche, John K.	1/13/2015	0.10	\$535.00	\$53.50	\$465.00		\$46.50			Exchange emails with Y.Y. Huang regarding service of pleadings;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
84	Frost, Elisabeth C.	1/20/2015	0.10	\$475.00	\$47.50	\$390.00		\$39.00			Email from J. Roche regarding affidavits of service;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
85	Roche, John K.	1/20/2015	0.10	\$535.00	\$53.50	\$465.00		\$46.50			Draft email to team regarding service of complaint;	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
86	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/2/2015	0.10	\$475.00	\$47.50	\$390.00		\$39.00			Emails with J. Medile regarding engagement letter (.1);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
87	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/9/2015	0.10	\$475.00	\$47.50	\$390.00		\$39.00			Emails with J. Medile and M. Elias regarding engagement letters (.1);	Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
88			106.50		\$46,595.50			\$41,912.00				SUBTOTAL for Pre-Filing, Complaint, and Service
89	Frost, Elisabeth C.	1/23/2015	0.10	\$475.00	\$47.50	\$390.00		\$39.00			Email from J. Roche regarding telephone call from from intervenors' counsel;	Intervention Related
90	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/23/2015	1.20	\$620.00	\$744.00	\$575.00		\$690.00			Review voicemail regarding intervention (.2); exchange related email (1.0);	Intervention Related

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
91	Khanna, Abha	1/23/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Review motion to intervene by General Assembly (.1); email with legal team regarding same (.1);	Intervention Related
92	Elias, Marc E.	1/26/2015	0.50	\$735.00	\$367.50	\$575.00		\$287.50			Telephone conference with counsel for the State regarding lawsuit (.4); review same (.1);	Intervention Related
93	Frost, Elisabeth C.	1/26/2015	0.30	\$475.00	\$142.50	\$390.00		\$117.00			Review of motion to intervene by Virginia General Assembly (.2); telephone call with M. Elias to T. Troy (left VM) (.1);	Intervention Related
94	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/26/2015	1.20	\$620.00	\$744.00	\$575.00		\$690.00			Review motion to intervene (.9); exchange email regarding same (.3);	Intervention Related
95	Khanna, Abha	1/28/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Review Motion to Intervene filed by House of Delegates;	Intervention Related
96	Frost, Elisabeth C.	1/29/2015	0.70	\$475.00	\$332.50	\$390.00		\$273.00			Emails with K. Hamilton, M. Elias, A. Khanna and A. Branch regarding litigation strategy and opposing intervention (.2); research in support of opposition to motion to intervene (.3); telephone conference with A. Khanna (.2);	Intervention Related
97	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/29/2015	1.20	\$620.00	\$744.00	\$575.00		\$690.00			Review and respond to email regarding motion to intervene and related issues;	Intervention Related
98	Khanna, Abha	1/29/2015	3.50	\$500.00	\$1,750.00	\$410.00		\$1,435.00			Email and confer with legal team regarding potential opposition to VA House of Delegates' Motion to Intervene (.5); research House Resolution and case law regarding same (2.0); draft outline for same (1.0);	Intervention Related
99	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/30/2015	1.30	\$620.00	\$806.00	\$575.00		\$747.50			Conference with A. Khanna regarding house rules and potential opposition to motion to intervene (.9); exchange related emails (.3);	Intervention Related
100	Khanna, Abha	1/30/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Confer with K. Hamilton regarding House intervention (.1); email with legal team regarding same; review order signed by magistrate judge (.1); research local rules on participation of magistrate judges (.1);	Intervention Related
101	Khanna, Abha	2/2/2015	0.40	\$500.00	\$200.00	\$410.00		\$164.00			Draft response to Motion to Intervene and coordinate filing of same (.4);	Intervention Related
102	Roche, John K.	2/2/2015	0.30	\$535.00	\$160.50	\$465.00		\$139.50			Revise and file response to motion to intervene;	Intervention Related
103	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/5/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Correspond with team about NAACP intervening;	Intervention Related
104			11.60		\$6,508.50			\$5,674.50				SUBTOTAL for Intervention Related
105	Frost, Elisabeth C.	12/22/2014	0.10	\$430.00	\$43.00	\$390.00		\$39.00			Draft cover letter to plaintiffs with as-filed copy of complaint (.1);	Communications Concerning Clients
106	Frost, Elisabeth C.	12/23/2014	0.20	\$430.00	\$86.00	\$390.00		\$78.00			Emails with K. Elhawary regarding sending copies of complaint to plaintiffs (.2);	Communications Concerning Clients
107	Frost, Elisabeth C.	12/24/2014	0.10	\$430.00	\$43.00	\$390.00		\$39.00			Emails with K. Elhawary regarding following up with plaintiffs regarding engagement letters (.1);	Communications Concerning Clients
108	Frost, Elisabeth C.	12/30/2014	0.10	\$430.00	\$43.00	\$390.00		\$39.00			Update plaintiff contact sheet (.1);	Communications Concerning Clients

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
109	Frost, Elisabeth C.	1/12/2015	0.30	\$475.00	\$142.50	\$390.00		\$117.00			Emails with J. Medile regarding following up with plaintiffs regarding engagement letters and updating plaintiff contact chart (.3);	Communications Concerning Clients
110	Frost, Elisabeth C.	1/22/2015	0.40	\$475.00	\$190.00	\$390.00		\$156.00			Emails to plaintiffs regarding press inquiries (.2); emails with J. Medile regarding contacting plaintiffs regarding press inquiries (.1); emails with M. Elias regarding press inquiries (.1);	Communications Concerning Clients
111	Frost, Elisabeth C.	1/28/2015	0.10	\$475.00	\$47.50	\$390.00		\$39.00			Emails with J. Medile regarding following up with plaintiffs regarding engagement letters;	Communications Concerning Clients
112	Elias, Marc E.	2/5/2015	0.70	\$735.00	\$514.50	\$575.00		\$402.50			Telephone conference with client regarding scheduling (.7);	Communications Concerning Clients
113	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/10/2015	0.40	\$475.00	\$190.00	\$390.00		\$156.00			Telephone call to G. Bethune-Hill regarding litigation status (left VM) (.1); email to G. Bethune-Hill regarding scheduling call (.2); email to J. Medile regarding contacting plaintiffs (.1);	Communications Concerning Clients
114	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/26/2015	0.30	\$475.00	\$142.50	\$390.00		\$117.00			Telephone call with A. Branch regarding plaintiff contact and discovery (.3);	Communications Concerning Clients
115	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/27/2015	0.10	\$475.00	\$47.50	\$390.00		\$39.00			Emails with A. Branch regarding plaintiff contacts (.1);	Communications Concerning Clients
116	Spear, Ryan M.	5/23/2015	0.10	\$500.00	\$50.00	\$410.00		\$41.00			Review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding issues regarding plaintiffs (.1);	Communications Concerning Clients
117	Spear, Ryan M.	5/24/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding issues regarding plaintiffs (.2);	Communications Concerning Clients
118	Spear, Ryan M.	5/25/2015	0.10	\$500.00	\$50.00	\$410.00		\$41.00			Review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding issues regarding plaintiffs (.1);	Communications Concerning Clients
119	Spear, Ryan M.	6/8/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding potential new plaintiff (.3);	Communications Concerning Clients
120	Spear, Ryan M.	7/12/2015	0.50	\$500.00	\$250.00	\$410.00		\$205.00			Prepare and send message to plaintiffs (.5);	Communications Concerning Clients
121	Spear, Ryan M.	7/13/2015	0.10	\$500.00	\$50.00	\$410.00		\$41.00			Email with litigation team regarding plaintiff (.1);	Communications Concerning Clients
122	Stafford, William B.	11/16/2015	0.10	\$495.00	\$49.50	\$405.00		\$40.50			Exchange correspondence with L. Frost and A. Khanna regarding case status update to plaintiffs;	Communications Concerning Clients
123	Frost, Elisabeth C.	11/17/2015	0.10	\$475.00	\$47.50	\$390.00		\$39.00			Emails with A. Branch regarding plaintiff contact information (.1);	Communications Concerning Clients
124	Branch, Aria C.	10/26/2016	0.20	\$430.00	\$86.00	\$345.00		\$69.00			Telephone conversation with lead plaintiff;	Communications Concerning Clients
125	Spear, Ryan M.	7/8/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Emails with litigation team regarding plaintiffs;	Communications Concerning Clients
126	Branch, Aria C.	7/12/2017	0.10	\$650.00	\$65.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$41.00	\$34.50	\$6.50	Call with R. Louijeun regarding plaintiffs (.1);	Communications Concerning Clients
127	Louijeune, Ruthzee	7/12/2017	1.70	\$550.00	\$935.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$714.00	\$544.00	\$170.00	Make calls and send e-mails to Plaintiffs re status of case (1.2); Follow up with e-mails to plaintiffs (0.5);	Communications Concerning Clients
128	Spear, Ryan M.	7/12/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Emails with litigation team regarding plaintiffs (.2);	Communications Concerning Clients
129	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/12/2017	0.30	\$850.00	\$255.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$202.50	\$172.50	\$30.00	Correspond with team regarding plaintiffs (.3);	Communications Concerning Clients
130	Louijeune, Ruthzee	7/13/2017	0.50	\$550.00	\$275.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$210.00	\$160.00	\$50.00	Confer with counsel re: plaintiffs (0.5);	Communications Concerning Clients

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
131	Louijeune, Ruthzee	7/17/2017	0.50	\$550.00	\$275.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$210.00	\$160.00	\$50.00	Call and e-mail plaintiffs (0.5);	Communications Concerning Clients
132	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/20/2017	0.40	\$755.00	\$302.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$270.00	\$230.00	\$40.00	Review email regarding plaintiff issue (.4);	Communications Concerning Clients
133	Khanna, Abha	7/20/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Email with legal team regarding plaintiffs' current residences (0.2);	Communications Concerning Clients
134	Louijeune, Ruthzee	7/20/2017	0.60	\$550.00	\$330.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$252.00	\$192.00	\$60.00	Contact Plaintiffs with regard to discovery (0.6);	Communications Concerning Clients
135	Spear, Ryan M.	7/20/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Emails with litigation team regarding plaintiffs (.2);	Communications Concerning Clients
136	Khanna, Abha	7/21/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Research and email with legal team regarding substitution of plaintiffs (0.3);	Communications Concerning Clients
137	Louijeune, Ruthzee	7/21/2017	1.20	\$550.00	\$660.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$504.00	\$384.00	\$120.00	Confer with counsel re: plaintiff issues (1.2);	Communications Concerning Clients
138	Spear, Ryan M.	7/21/2017	0.40	\$620.00	\$248.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$204.00	\$164.00	\$40.00	Emails with litigation team regarding plaintiffs, including motion to substitute plaintiffs (.4);	Communications Concerning Clients
139	Spear, Ryan M.	7/22/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Emails with litigation team regarding plaintiffs (.2);	Communications Concerning Clients
140	Branch, Aria C.	7/24/2017	1.50	\$650.00	\$975.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$615.00	\$517.50	\$97.50	Telephone conferences regarding plaintiff (1.5);	Communications Concerning Clients
141	Khanna, Abha	7/24/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Email and confer with legal team regarding new plaintiff status (0.3)	Communications Concerning Clients
142	Spear, Ryan M.	7/24/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Emails with litigation team regarding plaintiffs (.2);	Communications Concerning Clients
143	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/24/2017	0.80	\$850.00	\$680.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$540.00	\$460.00	\$80.00	Correspond with team regarding new plaintiffs and motion to substitute (.8);	Communications Concerning Clients
144	Khanna, Abha	7/25/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Email and confer with legal team regarding new plaintiffs (0.3);	Communications Concerning Clients
145	Spear, Ryan M.	7/25/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Emails with litigation team regarding plaintiffs (.1); review research regarding plaintiffs (.1); review proposed engagement letters (.1);	Communications Concerning Clients
146	Louijeune, Ruthzee	7/26/2017	0.30	\$550.00	\$165.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$126.00	\$96.00	\$30.00	Confer with counsel regarding plaintiff replacement issues (0.3);	Communications Concerning Clients
147	Louijeune, Ruthzee	7/27/2017	0.90	\$550.00	\$495.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$378.00	\$288.00	\$90.00	Draft letters to clients and provide related updates team (0.9);	Communications Concerning Clients
148	Louijeune, Ruthzee	7/28/2017	1.50	\$550.00	\$825.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$630.00	\$480.00	\$150.00	Provide updates to plaintiffs (1.2); send out engagement letters (0.3);	Communications Concerning Clients
149	Louijeune, Ruthzee	8/2/2017	1.20	\$550.00	\$660.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$504.00	\$384.00	\$120.00	Contact plaintiffs (1.2);	Communications Concerning Clients
150	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/4/2017	0.50	\$755.00	\$377.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$337.50	\$287.50	\$50.00	Conference with legal team regarding address and confirmation of status of plaintiffs (.5);	Communications Concerning Clients
151	Louijeune, Ruthzee	8/16/2017	0.30	\$550.00	\$165.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$126.00	\$96.00	\$30.00	Advise paralegal on communications with plaintiffs (0.3);	Communications Concerning Clients
152	Louijeune, Ruthzee	9/10/2017	1.30	\$550.00	\$715.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$546.00	\$416.00	\$130.00	Confer with client on conference call about status of case and outstanding tasks);	Communications Concerning Clients
153	Branch, Aria C.	8/24/2018	0.10	\$720.00	\$72.00	\$430.00	\$345.00	\$43.00	\$34.50	\$8.50	Send email to plaintiffs;	Communications Concerning Clients
154	Khanna, Abha	8/24/2018	0.40	\$665.00	\$266.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$220.00	\$164.00	\$56.00	Confer with client regarding remedial process (0.4);	Communications Concerning Clients

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
155	Khanna, Abha	8/28/2018	0.10	\$665.00	\$66.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$55.00	\$41.00	\$14.00	Telephone conference with client regarding census error in VA with respect to proposed remedial maps (0.1);	Communications Concerning Clients
156	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/14/2018	0.20	\$795.00	\$159.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$143.00	\$115.00	\$28.00	Review and respond to email regarding communications with clients (.2);	Communications Concerning Clients
157	Khanna, Abha	12/18/2018	0.20	\$665.00	\$133.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$110.00	\$82.00	\$28.00	Telephone conference with client regarding case update (0.2);	Communications Concerning Clients
158			21.90		\$12,909.50			\$10,108.00				SUBTOTAL for Communications Concerning Clients
159	Frost, Elisabeth C.	1/8/2015	0.70	\$475.00	\$332.50	\$390.00		\$273.00			Compile materials for public records request (.5); emails with A. Branch regarding preparing public records request (.1); reviewing materials in preparation for preparing requests for production and interrogatories (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
160	Branch, Aria C.	1/9/2015	1.00	\$380.00	\$380.00	\$345.00		\$345.00			Research issues related to FOIA request;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
161	Branch, Aria C.	1/12/2015	2.30	\$380.00	\$874.00	\$345.00		\$793.50			Draft FOIA records request;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
162	Branch, Aria C.	1/13/2015	1.30	\$380.00	\$494.00	\$345.00		\$448.50			Draft FOIA records request;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
163	Frost, Elisabeth C.	1/13/2015	0.40	\$475.00	\$190.00	\$390.00		\$156.00			Review draft FOIA request prepared by A. Branch (.2); emails with A. Branch regarding draft FOIA request (.1); emails with K. Hamilton, A. Khanna and A. Branch regarding draft FOIA request (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
164	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/13/2015	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Exchange email regarding FOIA requests (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
165	Khanna, Abha	1/13/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Review and revise draft FOIA request circulated by A. Branch (.2); email with legal team regarding same (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
166	Frost, Elisabeth C.	1/14/2015	0.20	\$475.00	\$95.00	\$390.00		\$78.00			Emails with K. Hamilton, A. Khanna and A. Branch regarding FOIA request (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
167	Khanna, Abha	1/14/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Email with legal team regarding FOIA request (.2); review prior FOIA request and communications regarding same (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
168	Branch, Aria C.	1/15/2015	0.20	\$380.00	\$76.00	\$345.00		\$69.00			Send FOIA records request;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
169	Branch, Aria C.	1/21/2015	0.10	\$380.00	\$38.00	\$345.00		\$34.50			Revise FOIA records request;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
170	Branch, Aria C.	1/26/2015	0.20	\$380.00	\$76.00	\$345.00		\$69.00			Resolve issues related to FOIA records request;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
171	Frost, Elisabeth C.	1/26/2015	0.30	\$475.00	\$142.50	\$390.00		\$117.00			Meet with M. Elias regarding litigation strategy and meeting with legislators (.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
172	Branch, Aria C.	1/27/2015	0.60	\$380.00	\$228.00	\$345.00		\$207.00			Manage FOIA requests;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
173	Frost, Elisabeth C.	1/27/2015	0.20	\$475.00	\$95.00	\$390.00		\$78.00			Emails with M. Elias and A. Branch regarding responses to public records requests (.1); review responses to public records requests (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
174	Branch, Aria C.	2/5/2015	0.20	\$380.00	\$76.00	\$345.00		\$69.00			Create search terms for FOIA request;	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
175	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/5/2015	0.10	\$475.00	\$47.50	\$390.00		\$39.00			Emails with A. Khanna, K. Hamilton, A. Branch, B. Stafford and M. Elias regarding public records requests;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
176	Khanna, Abha	2/5/2015	3.30	\$500.00	\$1,650.00	\$410.00		\$1,353.00			Email with legal team regarding conference call with the Court (.6); email with all counsel to schedule call regarding discovery plan (.6); confer with K. Hamilton and B. Stafford regarding same (1.0); draft preliminary proposal regarding same and circulate to legal team (1.0); confer with legal team regarding same (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
177	Stafford, William B.	2/5/2015	1.20	\$495.00	\$594.00	\$405.00		\$486.00			Conference with A. Khanna and K. Hamilton regarding Rule 26(f) conference and case trial and discovery strategy (1.0); review proposed search terms by State to respond to FOIA request and propose additional search terms (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
178	Khanna, Abha	2/6/2015	1.90	\$500.00	\$950.00	\$410.00		\$779.00			Participate in Rule 26(f) conference (.9); draft email summary of same (.7); email with legal team regarding same (.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
179	Stafford, William B.	2/6/2015	0.90	\$495.00	\$445.50	\$405.00		\$364.50			Participate in Rule 26(f) conference;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
180	Branch, Aria C.	2/9/2015	0.20	\$380.00	\$76.00	\$345.00		\$69.00			Edit search terms for FOIA request;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
181	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/9/2015	0.10	\$475.00	\$47.50	\$390.00		\$39.00			Emails with A. Branch regarding search terms for records requests (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
182	Hamilton, Kevin J.	2/9/2015	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Call with A. Khanna regarding pretrial schedule and plan for discovery;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
183	Khanna, Abha	2/9/2015	1.30	\$500.00	\$650.00	\$410.00		\$533.00			Review discovery requests issued in Page case (.5); begin drafting discovery requests to Intervenor-Defendants (.8);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
184	Branch, Aria C.	2/10/2015	0.40	\$380.00	\$152.00	\$345.00		\$138.00			Edit search terms for FOIA request;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
185	Branch, Aria C.	2/12/2015	1.00	\$380.00	\$380.00	\$345.00		\$345.00			Draft response email regarding search terms for FOIA request;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
186	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/12/2015	0.20	\$475.00	\$95.00	\$390.00		\$78.00			Emails with M. Elias, K. Hamilton, A. Khanna and A. Branch regarding public records requests (.1); emails with A. Branch regarding response to public records request message (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
187	Hamilton, Kevin J.	2/12/2015	1.00	\$620.00	\$620.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Review and respond to email regarding public records act request and related correspondence with Commonwealth of Virginia;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
188	Khanna, Abha	2/12/2015	0.10	\$500.00	\$50.00	\$410.00		\$41.00			Review and revise response regarding FOIA request (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
189	Roche, John K.	2/12/2015	0.50	\$535.00	\$267.50	\$465.00		\$232.50			Review discovery and initial pretrial plan and exchange emails with E. Frost regarding same;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
190	Hamilton, Kevin J.	2/13/2015	0.60	\$620.00	\$372.00	\$575.00		\$345.00			Exchange email regarding FOIA requests (.6);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
191	Khanna, Abha	2/13/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Review correspondence regarding FOIA request (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
192	Hamilton, Kevin J.	2/14/2015	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Review initial disclosures;	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
193	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/16/2015	0.10	\$475.00	\$47.50	\$390.00		\$39.00			Email regarding initial disclosures (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
194	Khanna, Abha	2/16/2015	1.40	\$500.00	\$700.00	\$410.00		\$574.00			Review discovery in congressional case and prepare same for current case (.7); participate in telephone conference with legal team regarding initial disclosures and case strategy (.7);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
195	Branch, Aria C.	2/17/2015	0.50	\$380.00	\$190.00	\$345.00		\$172.50			Manage FOIA request (.2); research related to initial disclosures (.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
196	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/17/2015	1.80	\$475.00	\$855.00	\$390.00		\$702.00			Emails with M. Elias regarding meeting with potential witness (.2); prepare for meeting with potential witness (.2); telephone conference with potential witness (.6); summarizing conversation with potential witness in email to A. Khanna, M. Elias, K. Hamilton, B. Stafford and A. Branch (.8);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
197	Hamilton, Kevin J.	2/17/2015	0.80	\$620.00	\$496.00	\$575.00		\$460.00			Review FOIA request response (.4); conference with A. Khanna regarding follow up (.4);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
198	Khanna, Abha	2/17/2015	1.20	\$500.00	\$600.00	\$410.00		\$492.00			Prepare initial disclosures (.7); research relevant legislators to list in same (.3); email with E. Frost regarding same (.1); email with A. Branch regarding FOIA request (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
199	Branch, Aria C.	2/18/2015	2.60	\$380.00	\$988.00	\$345.00		\$897.00			Research related to initial disclosures;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
200	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/18/2015	0.80	\$475.00	\$380.00	\$390.00		\$312.00			Emails with A. Khanna, K. Hamilton, M. Elias, B. Stafford and A. Branch regarding initial disclosures (.1); emails with M. Elias regarding meeting regarding alternative maps (.1); emails with A. Khanna and A. Branch regarding draft initial disclosures (.2); review draft initial disclosures (.2); emails with library staff regarding locating witnesses (.1); review witness search results from library (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
201	Hamilton, Kevin J.	2/18/2015	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Conference with A. Khanna regarding initial disclosures (.3); review email summary of witness interviews (.6);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
202	Khanna, Abha	2/18/2015	3.50	\$500.00	\$1,750.00	\$410.00		\$1,435.00			Research and draft initial disclosures (2.5); email with E. Frost and A. Branch regarding revisions to same (.5); review email from E. Frost regarding potential witness interview and email with legal team regarding follow-up questions (.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
203	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/19/2015	1.20	\$475.00	\$570.00	\$390.00		\$468.00			Emails regarding discovery (.1); emails with A. Khanna and A. Branch regarding initial disclosures (.1); emails with A. Khanna, K. Hamilton, M. Elias and A. Branch regarding initial disclosures and litigation strategy (.6); telephone conference regarding same (.4);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
204	Hamilton, Kevin J.	2/19/2015	1.20	\$620.00	\$744.00	\$575.00		\$690.00			Review draft initial disclosures (.8); conference with A. Khanna regarding same (.3); review related email (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
205	Khanna, Abha	2/19/2015	1.30	\$500.00	\$650.00	\$410.00		\$533.00			Review and revise initial disclosures (.9); circulate same along with cover email to legal team (.1); email with legal team regarding discussions/interviews with individual delegates (.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
206	Branch, Aria C.	2/20/2015	0.50	\$380.00	\$190.00	\$345.00		\$172.50			Research related to initial disclosures;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
207	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/20/2015	1.30	\$475.00	\$617.50	\$390.00		\$507.00			Meet with M. Elias regarding initial disclosures (.4); emails with A. Khanna, M. Elias, K. Hamilton, A. Branch and B. Stafford regarding initial disclosures (.1); research in support of initial disclosures (.4); review defendant-intervenors' initial disclosures and telephone conference with A. Khanna regarding defendant-intervenors' initial disclosures (.3); review defendants' initial disclosures (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
208	Khanna, Abha	2/20/2015	2.60	\$500.00	\$1,300.00	\$410.00		\$1,066.00			Review and revise Initial Disclosures (1.7); email with legal team regarding same (.1); confer with E. Frost regarding same (.2); circulate same to opposing counsel (.2); review initial disclosures provided by Defendants and Intervenors (.3); confer with E. Frost regarding same (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
209	Roche, John K.	2/20/2015	0.20	\$535.00	\$107.00	\$465.00		\$93.00			Review initial disclosures and exchange emails with A. Khanna regarding same;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
210	Elias, Marc E.	2/23/2015	1.00	\$735.00	\$735.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Telephone conference and email regarding status of case and discovery (.9); review same (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
211	Branch, Aria C.	2/25/2015	1.00	\$380.00	\$380.00	\$345.00		\$345.00			Manage FOIA request (1.0);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
212	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/25/2015	0.10	\$475.00	\$47.50	\$390.00		\$39.00			Emails with A. Branch regarding document management (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
213	Branch, Aria C.	2/26/2015	2.60	\$380.00	\$988.00	\$345.00		\$897.00			Manage FOIA request;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
214	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/26/2015	0.10	\$475.00	\$47.50	\$390.00		\$39.00			Email to A. Branch regarding plaintiff contact information (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
215	Hamilton, Kevin J.	2/26/2015	0.40	\$620.00	\$248.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Follow up with A. Khanna regarding FOIA requests, discovery and litigation strategy;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
216	Khanna, Abha	2/26/2015	2.50	\$500.00	\$1,250.00	\$410.00		\$1,025.00			Work with E. Gonzalez to develop case calendar (.7); review initial disclosures and create master spreadsheet of potential witnesses (1.8);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
217	Branch, Aria C.	2/27/2015	1.80	\$380.00	\$684.00	\$345.00		\$621.00			Manage FOIA request (.8); review discovery requests from Page case (1.7);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
218	Elias, Marc E.	2/27/2015	0.70	\$735.00	\$514.50	\$575.00		\$402.50			Telephone conference and email regarding document production and FOIA response;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
219	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/27/2015	0.50	\$475.00	\$237.50	\$390.00		\$195.00			Review FOIA case cited by Defendants (.3); emails with K. Hamilton, M. Elias, A. Branch and A. Khanna regarding FOIA dispute (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
220	Hamilton, Kevin J.	2/27/2015	0.80	\$620.00	\$496.00	\$575.00		\$460.00			Review and respond to email regarding state refusal to provide FOIA materials without payment for attorneys fees;	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
221	Khanna, Abha	2/27/2015	1.00	\$500.00	\$500.00	\$410.00		\$410.00			Draft and revise list of potential witnesses (.6); circulate same along with cover email to legal team (.2); email with legal team regarding expense for FOIA request (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
222	Khanna, Abha	2/28/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Email with legal counsel regarding research on attorneys' fees in FOIA context and response to counsel for State regarding same;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
223	Branch, Aria C.	3/1/2015	5.00	\$380.00	\$1,900.00	\$345.00		\$1,725.00			Draft letter regarding FOIA request;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
224	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/1/2015	0.40	\$475.00	\$190.00	\$390.00		\$156.00			Review and revise draft letter regarding FOIA request (.4);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
225	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/1/2015	1.20	\$620.00	\$744.00	\$575.00		\$690.00			Review and revise draft letter regarding state demand for attorneys' fees for FOIA request(.8); exchange email regarding same (.2); review draft changes and comment(.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
226	Khanna, Abha	3/1/2015	0.70	\$500.00	\$350.00	\$410.00		\$287.00			Review and revise letter to OAG regarding FOIA request (1.5); email with legal team regarding same (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
227	Branch, Aria C.	3/2/2015	8.30	\$380.00	\$3,154.00	\$345.00		\$2,863.50			Edit letter regarding FOIA request (.3); draft written discovery requests and manage FOIA responses (.8);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
228	Elias, Marc E.	3/2/2015	0.70	\$735.00	\$514.50	\$575.00		\$402.50			Telephone conference and email regarding FOIA matter;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
229	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/2/2015	0.90	\$475.00	\$427.50	\$390.00		\$351.00			Emails with M. Elias, K. Hamilton, A. Khanna and A. Branch regarding FOIA request (.1); review draft letter regarding FOIA request (.2); telephone conference with A. Branch regarding draft letter regarding FOIA request (.1); telephone conference with M. Elias, T. Troy and A. Branch regarding FOIA request (.2); meet with M. Elias and A. Branch regarding FOIA request (.2); emails with M. Elias, K. Hamilton, A. Khanna, B. Stafford and A. Branch regarding public records requests (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
230	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/2/2015	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Review and respond to email regarding FOIA response and demand for attorneys' fees (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
231	Khanna, Abha	3/2/2015	0.40	\$500.00	\$200.00	\$410.00		\$164.00			Review and revise letter regarding FOIA request (.2); email with legal team regarding communications around same (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
232	Branch, Aria C.	3/3/2015	3.00	\$380.00	\$1,140.00	\$345.00		\$1,035.00			Manage FOIA responses (1.0); draft discovery requests (2.0);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
233	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/3/2015	0.50	\$475.00	\$237.50	\$390.00		\$195.00			Review and revise draft requests for production and interrogatives (.4); emails with A. Branch, I. Balom and R. Celina regarding processing documents produced pursuant to FOIA request (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
234	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/3/2015	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review email regarding FOIA production (hard copy v. electronic) and coordinate review activities;	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
235	Khanna, Abha	3/3/2015	4.30	\$500.00	\$2,150.00	\$410.00		\$1,763.00			Review, revise, and edit all written discovery (4.0); email and confer with legal team regarding same (.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
236	Branch, Aria C.	3/4/2015	1.50	\$380.00	\$570.00	\$345.00		\$517.50			Draft written discovery requests;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
237	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/4/2015	0.10	\$475.00	\$47.50	\$390.00		\$39.00			Emails with A. Branch regarding requests for production and interrogatories (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
238	Khanna, Abha	3/4/2015	0.50	\$500.00	\$250.00	\$410.00		\$205.00			Review and revise draft discovery requests (.4); email with legal team regarding same (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
239	Stafford, William B.	3/4/2015	0.60	\$495.00	\$297.00	\$405.00		\$243.00			Conference with A. Khanna regarding draft outbound discovery and propose additions to same;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
240	Elias, Marc E.	3/5/2015	0.50	\$735.00	\$367.50	\$575.00		\$287.50			Telephone conference and email regarding discovery issues;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
241	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/5/2015	3.30	\$475.00	\$1,567.50	\$390.00		\$1,287.00			Emails with K. Hamilton, M. Elias, A. Khanna, B. Stafford and A. Branch regarding draft discovery requests (.1); draft requests for admission (2.4); review draft requests for production (.7); review requests for production from Defendants (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
242	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/5/2015	1.60	\$620.00	\$992.00	\$575.00		\$920.00			Prepare for and participate in team call regarding discovery (1.0); review email regarding potential deponents (.2); review and revise discovery requests (.2); exchange related email with L. Frost and A. Khanna (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
243	Khanna, Abha	3/5/2015	4.00	\$500.00	\$2,000.00	\$410.00		\$1,640.00			Draft, review and revise all discovery to all Defendants and Intervenor-Defendants (1.3); work with E. Gonzalez to format, finalize, and serve discovery (2.7);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
244	Stafford, William B.	3/5/2015	1.70	\$495.00	\$841.50	\$405.00		\$688.50			Review and revise outbound interrogatories, requests for production, and requests for admission (1.3); exchange correspondence with E. Frost and A. Khanna regarding same (.4);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
245	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/6/2015	0.10	\$475.00	\$47.50	\$390.00		\$39.00			Email to T. Troy regarding FOIA request;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
246	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/6/2015	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Follow up on FOIA production (.3); review and respond to related email (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
247	Branch, Aria C.	3/9/2015	2.50	\$380.00	\$950.00	\$345.00		\$862.50			Review discovery requests;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
248	Branch, Aria C.	3/10/2015	1.80	\$380.00	\$684.00	\$345.00		\$621.00			Manage FOIA responses;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
249	Stafford, William B.	3/10/2015	0.30	\$495.00	\$148.50	\$405.00		\$121.50			Conference with A. Branch regarding discovery responses(.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
250	Branch, Aria C.	3/11/2015	1.80	\$380.00	\$684.00	\$345.00		\$621.00			Manage FOIA responses;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
251	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/11/2015	0.50	\$475.00	\$237.50	\$390.00		\$195.00			Meet with A. Branch regarding responding to discovery requests;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
252	Branch, Aria C.	3/12/2015	3.70	\$380.00	\$1,406.00	\$345.00		\$1,276.50			Review discovery requests (3.0) and draft email to team (.7);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
253	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/12/2015	1.10	\$475.00	\$522.50	\$390.00		\$429.00			emails with K. Hamilton, A. Khanna, M. Elias, A. Branch and B. Stafford regarding contacting witnesses (.1); emails with A. Branch regarding objections and responses to discovery requests (.2); email from K. McKnight regarding discovery search terms (.1); emails with A. Branch regarding discovery search terms (.1); emails with A. Khanna, K. Hamilton, M. Elias, B. Stafford and A. Branch regarding discovery search terms (.1); emails with A. Khanna, K. Hamilton, M. Elias, B. Stafford and A. Branch regarding discovery responses (.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
254	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/12/2015	0.60	\$620.00	\$372.00	\$575.00		\$345.00			Review discovery requests and exchange email regarding proposed draft objections (.6);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
255	Khanna, Abha	3/12/2015	2.60	\$500.00	\$1,300.00	\$410.00		\$1,066.00			Telephone conference with E. Frost regarding response to discovery requests, witness interviews, depositions, and staffing (1.5); draft search terms for discovery and email with opposing counsel regarding same (.6); consider responses to discovery requests and email with legal team about same (.3); coordinate conference call with legal team (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
256	Branch, Aria C.	3/13/2015	8.30	\$380.00	\$3,154.00	\$345.00		\$2,863.50			Research and draft responses to discovery requests (7.4); conference call (.9);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
257	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/13/2015	1.10	\$475.00	\$522.50	\$390.00		\$429.00			Email to A. Khanna regarding legislative privilege brief (.1); research in support of legislative privilege brief (.2); emails with B. Spiva regarding background of matter (.4); telephone conference with B. Spiva, K. Hamilton, A. Khanna, B. Stafford, and A. Branch regarding discovery issues (.4);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
258	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/13/2015	2.60	\$620.00	\$1,612.00	\$575.00		\$1,495.00			Prepare for and participate in call on discovery (1.1); conference with B. Spiva regarding depositions (.3); review email regarding draft objections and forward comments (.9); conference with A. Khanna regarding same (.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
259	Khanna, Abha	3/13/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Email with opposing counsel regarding search terms for discovery requests (0.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
260	Branch, Aria C.	3/14/2015	6.70	\$380.00	\$2,546.00	\$345.00		\$2,311.50			Research and draft responses to discovery requests;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
261	Branch, Aria C.	3/15/2015	4.50	\$380.00	\$1,710.00	\$345.00		\$1,552.50			Research and draft responses to discovery requests;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
262	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/15/2015	1.30	\$620.00	\$806.00	\$575.00		\$747.50			Review and revise draft objections to discovery (1.0); exchange related email (.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
263	Branch, Aria C.	3/16/2015	12.00	\$380.00	\$4,560.00	\$345.00		\$4,140.00			Research and draft responses to discovery requests;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
264	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/16/2015	2.60	\$475.00	\$1,235.00	\$390.00		\$1,014.00			Review and revise draft responses to discovery requests (2.2); emails with K. Hamilton, M. Elias, A. Branch, A. Khanna, B. Stafford, B. Spiva and A. Branch regarding draft responses to discovery requests (.4);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
265	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/16/2015	4.70	\$620.00	\$2,914.00	\$575.00		\$2,702.50			Review and revise draft objections to defendants' and intervenor-defendants' discovery (3.1); conference with A. Khanna and L. Frost regarding same (.7); review witness lists and outline discovery (.9);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
266	Khanna, Abha	3/16/2015	7.90	\$500.00	\$3,950.00	\$410.00		\$3,239.00			Participate in conference call with K. Hamilton and B. Spiva regarding scheduling, discovery, depositions, and trial (1.3); email with legal team regarding same (0.1); review and revise objections to Defendants' and Intervenors' discovery requests, email and telephone conference with various members of legal team regarding same, and work with A. Branch to finalize and serve same (5.7); email with opposing counsel to schedule call regarding search terms for discovery (0.1); draft and circulate agenda for weekly call with legal team (0.2); research case law on legislative history (0.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
267	Roberts, Rachel M.	3/16/2015	1.50	\$125.00	\$187.50	\$125.00		\$187.50			Cite-check and proof-read discovery responses (1.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
268	Spiva, Bruce V.	3/16/2015	0.10	\$600.00	\$60.00	\$575.00		\$57.50			Review chart of witnesses;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
269	Spiva, Bruce V.	3/16/2015	0.70	\$600.00	\$420.00	\$575.00		\$402.50			Confer with team regarding draft discovery, objections, and responses;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
270	Spiva, Bruce V.	3/16/2015	1.30	\$600.00	\$780.00	\$575.00		\$747.50			Review and comment on draft discovery objections and responses;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
271	Stafford, William B.	3/16/2015	0.20	\$495.00	\$99.00	\$405.00		\$81.00			Conference with A. Khanna regarding strategic approach to answering requests for admission;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
272	Branch, Aria C.	3/17/2015	1.80	\$380.00	\$684.00	\$345.00		\$621.00			Manage discovery;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
273	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/17/2015	0.10	\$475.00	\$47.50	\$390.00		\$39.00			Emails from A. Khanna regarding negotiating discovery issues with intervenors (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
274	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/17/2015	1.90	\$620.00	\$1,178.00	\$575.00		\$1,092.50			Conference with A. Khanna regarding staffing, discovery responses and potential depositions (.8); review table of potential witnesses and draft discovery plan (.9); circulate for review (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
275	Khanna, Abha	3/17/2015	3.60	\$500.00	\$1,800.00	\$410.00		\$1,476.00			Prepare for and participate in call with Intervenors' counsel regarding discovery issues (1.0); draft email summary of same and circulate to legal team (0.2); email materials to K. Hamilton in preparation for upcoming discussions regarding discovery, witnesses, and objections; email with opposing counsel regarding contacting Court about upcoming discovery deadlines (0.2); review Defendants' and Intervenors' objections to Plaintiffs' discovery requests (0.9); research case law regarding legislative privilege (1.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
276	Roberts, Rachel M.	3/17/2015	2.40	\$125.00	\$300.00	\$125.00		\$300.00			Made list of discovery/production deadlines stated in 1st set of discovery responses per A. Branch;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
277	Spiva, Bruce V.	3/17/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Telephone conference with team regarding discovery responses and plan for joint request for continuance;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
278	Stafford, William B.	3/17/2015	0.20	\$495.00	\$99.00	\$405.00		\$81.00			Conference with A. Khanna regarding search terms;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
279	Branch, Aria C.	3/18/2015	3.00	\$380.00	\$1,140.00	\$345.00		\$1,035.00			Manage discovery;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
280	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/18/2015	2.90	\$620.00	\$1,798.00	\$575.00		\$1,667.50			Conference with A. Khanna regarding responses and objections to discovery (1.3); exchange email regarding same (.7); review table of witnesses and exchange email with team regarding interviews, depositions and related issues (.9)	Fact Discovery - First Trial
281	Khanna, Abha	3/18/2015	2.30	\$500.00	\$1,150.00	\$410.00		\$943.00			Email and confer with opposing counsel regarding extension of discovery deadlines (0.5); email and confer with M. Parsons (court clerk) regarding same (0.2); draft and revise consent motion and consent order (0.4); email with legal team regarding same (0.1); email with opposing counsel regarding same (0.2); email with legal team regarding document production in response to discovery requests (0.7); email and confer with K. Hamilton regarding witness interviews and depositions (0.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
282	Branch, Aria C.	3/19/2015	6.00	\$380.00	\$2,280.00	\$345.00		\$2,070.00			Draft supplemental responses to discovery requests;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
283	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/19/2015	0.10	\$475.00	\$47.50	\$390.00		\$39.00			Emails with K. Hamilton, B. Spiva, M. Elias and A. Khanna regarding discovery strategy;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
284	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/19/2015	3.20	\$620.00	\$1,984.00	\$575.00		\$1,840.00			Review issues relating to application of the attorney-client privilege and conference with A. Khanna regarding same (1.3); review and revise draft substantive responses to discovery from defendants and intervenor-defendants (1.5); exchange email regarding staffing for interviews and depositions (.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
285	Khanna, Abha	3/19/2015	2.10	\$500.00	\$1,050.00	\$410.00		\$861.00			Email with legal team regarding document production and privilege log (0.4); review and revise discovery responses (1.7);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
286	Roberts, Rachel M.	3/19/2015	4.50	\$125.00	\$562.50	\$125.00		\$562.50			Review transcripts of redistricting hearings for information related to discovery responses per A. Branch;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
287	Spiva, Bruce V.	3/19/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Correspond with team regarding privilege issues;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
288	Spiva, Bruce V.	3/19/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Review draft discovery responses and comments regarding same;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
289	Spiva, Bruce V.	3/19/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with team regarding depositions;	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
290	Branch, Aria C.	3/20/2015	5.40	\$380.00	\$2,052.00	\$345.00		\$1,863.00			Draft responses to discovery requests;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
291	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/20/2015	1.10	\$475.00	\$522.50	\$390.00		\$429.00			Emails with A. Branch and A. Khanna regarding responses to discovery requests (.2); meet with A. Branch regarding responses to discovery requests (.2); review draft responses to discovery requests (.2); telephone conference with A. Branch regarding document production (.3); emails with I. Balom, R. Celing, A. Branch and A. Khanna regarding document production (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
292	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/20/2015	1.40	\$620.00	\$868.00	\$575.00		\$805.00			Review witness lists (.4); exchange email regarding staffing, interviews, and depositions (.7); exchange email with M. Elias regarding same (.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
293	Khanna, Abha	3/20/2015	2.60	\$500.00	\$1,300.00	\$410.00		\$1,066.00			Review and revise responses to discovery requests (0.9); review and redact documents to be produced (0.8); email and confer with legal team regarding same (0.4); gather and send R. Spear all materials providing case background (0.2); review letter from Defendants' counsel regarding discovery conference (0.2); email with legal team regarding same (0.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
294	Roberts, Rachel M.	3/20/2015	1.10	\$125.00	\$137.50	\$125.00		\$137.50			Answer question for A. Branch re: research for discovery responses;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
295	Roche, John K.	3/20/2015	0.20	\$535.00	\$107.00	\$465.00		\$93.00			Review meet and confer letter from Defendants' counsel regarding discovery objections and exchange emails with A. Khanna regarding same;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
296	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/21/2015	1.60	\$620.00	\$992.00	\$575.00		\$920.00			Prepare for and telephone conference with A. Khanna and R. Spear regarding staffing, interviews and depositions (1.0); relay discussion to M. Elias and related telephone conference (.6);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
297	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/22/2015	1.50	\$620.00	\$930.00	\$575.00		\$862.50			Prepare for and telephone conference with litigation team regarding staffing and discovery plan going forward (1.1); review and respond to follow up email regarding discovery and objections (.4);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
298	Khanna, Abha	3/22/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Update witness spreadsheet (0.1); send R. Spear all discovery materials (0.1); email with A. Branch regarding response to Defendants' letter regarding our discovery objections (0.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
299	Branch, Aria C.	3/23/2015	1.90	\$380.00	\$722.00	\$345.00		\$655.50			Review Defendants' discovery responses and determine potential disputes;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
300	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/23/2015	0.30	\$475.00	\$142.50	\$390.00		\$117.00			Emails with A. Khanna, B. Stafford and R. Spear regarding contacting witnesses (.2); email regarding witnesses (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
301	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/23/2015	1.70	\$620.00	\$1,054.00	\$575.00		\$977.50			Review correspondence regarding objections (.5); prepare for and telephone conference with litigation team regarding discovery planning, response to objection, deposition scheduling and related issues (1.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
302	Khanna, Abha	3/23/2015	2.20	\$500.00	\$1,100.00	\$410.00		\$902.00			Email and telephone conference with Intervenor's counsel regarding search terms and legislative privilege (0.8); prepare for same (0.2); review J. Morgan deposition transcript regarding participation in House plan (0.4); email with legal team regarding same (0.1); review Defendants' letter regarding discovery objections (0.2); prepare responses to same, reviewing each of Plaintiffs' discovery requests (0.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
303	Spear, Ryan M.	3/23/2015	2.20	\$500.00	\$1,100.00	\$410.00		\$902.00			Prepare for conference and confer with litigation team regarding discovery issues (0.6); review pleadings and papers, including discovery requests and objections (1.3); review and respond to emails with A. Khanna regarding deposition scheduling (0.2); review and respond to emails with E. Frost regarding fact investigation (0.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
304	Spiva, Bruce V.	3/23/2015	0.50	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review intervenors' and defendants' objections to our discovery;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
305	Spiva, Bruce V.	3/23/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Telephone conference with team about discovery, case strategy and deposition;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
306	Branch, Aria C.	3/24/2015	3.20	\$380.00	\$1,216.00	\$345.00		\$1,104.00			Review Defendants' discovery responses and determine potential disputes;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
307	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/24/2015	1.10	\$475.00	\$522.50	\$390.00		\$429.00			Emails with A. Khanna and A. Branch regarding discovery issues (.1); emails with J. Medile and A. Branch regarding discovery (.1); telephone conference with A. Branch, R. Spear, and B. Stafford regarding contacting witnesses (.7); emails with A. Khanna, B. Stafford and R. Spear regarding contacting witnesses (.1); emails with A. Branch, A. Khanna and J. Butler regarding discovery transfer (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
308	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/24/2015	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Review and respond to email from L. Frost, A. Khanna and A. Branch regarding analysis of defendants and defendant-intervenor's objections;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
309	Khanna, Abha	3/24/2015	4.20	\$500.00	\$2,100.00	\$410.00		\$1,722.00			Email with opposing counsel regarding search terms (.2); confer with B. Stafford regarding same (.1); email with legal team (A. Branch and K. Hamilton) regarding discovery conference with Defendants (.2); telephone conference with legal team (E. Frost, R. Spear, B. Stafford) regarding witness interviews (.8); draft and circulate outline for witness interviews (.2); research legislative privilege issue (2.7);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
310	Spear, Ryan M.	3/24/2015	1.10	\$500.00	\$550.00	\$410.00		\$451.00			Confer with litigation team regarding witness interviews (0.5); review draft script for interviews (0.3); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding same (0.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
311	Spiva, Bruce V.	3/24/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Correspond with team about depositions;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
312	Spiva, Bruce V.	3/24/2015	0.70	\$600.00	\$420.00	\$575.00		\$402.50			Confer with A. Branch about defendants' and intervenors' discovery responses;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
313	Stafford, William B.	3/24/2015	0.70	\$495.00	\$346.50	\$405.00		\$283.50			Conference with A. Khanna regarding search terms for e-discovery (.2); participate in conference call regarding witness calls (.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
314	Branch, Aria C.	3/25/2015	1.10	\$380.00	\$418.00	\$345.00		\$379.50			Manage discovery (0.6); meet with paralegal regarding discovery (0.5)	Fact Discovery - First Trial
315	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/25/2015	0.70	\$475.00	\$332.50	\$390.00		\$273.00			Telephone conference with A. Khanna, R. Spear and B. Stafford regarding witnesses (.4); email regarding witnesses (.1); emails with A. Khanna, R. Spear and B. Stafford regarding witnesses (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
316	Khanna, Abha	3/25/2015	1.30	\$500.00	\$650.00	\$410.00		\$533.00			Email with Defendants' counsel regarding discovery conference (0.3); email with legal team regarding same (0.1); email with legal team regarding potential witnesses (0.8); email with legal team regarding legislative privilege discussion with Intervenor's counsel (0.1)	Fact Discovery - First Trial
317	Roberts, Rachel M.	3/25/2015	0.30	\$125.00	\$37.50	\$125.00		\$37.50			Discuss processing of hard copy documents (responsive to FOIA request) with A. Branch;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
318	Spear, Ryan M.	3/25/2015	0.80	\$500.00	\$400.00	\$410.00		\$328.00			Review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding witness interviews and other discovery issues (0.4); confer with litigation team regarding same (0.4);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
319	Stafford, William B.	3/25/2015	0.50	\$495.00	\$247.50	\$405.00		\$202.50			Participate in conference call to discuss witness calls;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
320	Branch, Aria C.	3/26/2015	2.60	\$380.00	\$988.00	\$345.00		\$897.00			Review Defendants' discovery responses and determine potential disputes (2.2); email summary to team (.4);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
321	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/26/2015	0.20	\$475.00	\$95.00	\$390.00		\$78.00			Emails with R. Roberts, A. Khanna and A. Branch regarding review of discovery;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
322	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/26/2015	1.70	\$620.00	\$1,054.00	\$575.00		\$977.50			Review email regarding delegate interviews (.8); exchange email regarding preparation for discovery call (.9);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
323	Khanna, Abha	3/26/2015	6.80	\$500.00	\$3,400.00	\$410.00		\$2,788.00			Telephone conferences with potential witnesses (1.2); confer with R. Spear regarding same (.2); telephone conference with Intervenor's counsel regarding legislative privilege (.4); research case law on legislative privilege (1.0); review Intervenor's privilege log (1.0); confer with R. Spear regarding same (.3); review Defendants' concerns to our discovery objections and draft and circulate to legal team comprehensive responses to same in preparation of discovery conference (1.3); telephone conference with K. Hamilton regarding legislative privilege and discovery issues requiring resolution (1.2); email with R. Spear to coordinate call with Intervenor's counsel (.1); review email from A. Branch regarding Defendants' discovery objections in preparation for discovery conference (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
324	Roberts, Rachel M.	3/26/2015	1.80	\$125.00	\$225.00	\$125.00		\$225.00			Review documents produced in response to 1/15/15 FOIA Request (1.5); discuss same with A. Branch and J. Balom (.3)	Fact Discovery - First Trial
325	Spear, Ryan M.	3/26/2015	1.20	\$500.00	\$600.00	\$410.00		\$492.00			Confer with A. Khanna and potential witness (0.6); confer with potential witness (0.6);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
326	Spiva, Bruce V.	3/26/2015	0.60	\$600.00	\$360.00	\$575.00		\$345.00			Review discovery dispute summary and correspond with team and about same and seeking further continuance of deadline for motions to compel;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
327	Branch, Aria C.	3/27/2015	3.90	\$380.00	\$1,482.00	\$345.00		\$1,345.50			Discovery call with Defendants (1.1); follow up call (1.0); review notes from call and flag follow-up issues (1.8);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
328	Elias, Marc E.	3/27/2015	0.70	\$735.00	\$514.50	\$575.00		\$402.50			Telephone conference, email and review discovery issues;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
329	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/27/2015	0.50	\$475.00	\$237.50	\$390.00		\$195.00			Emails with A. Branch, A. Khanna, R. Spear, and B. Stafford regarding discovery management (.1); emails with A. Khanna, R. Spear and B. Stafford regarding witnesses (.2); emails regarding witnesses (.1); review file memo regarding interview with J. Ward (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
330	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/27/2015	2.80	\$620.00	\$1,736.00	\$575.00		\$1,610.00			Prepare for and participate in discovery conference with defendants' counsel (1.9); follow up call regarding implications and remaining disputed issues (.9);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
331	Khanna, Abha	3/27/2015	3.70	\$500.00	\$1,850.00	\$410.00		\$1,517.00			Draft and circulate file memo of J. Ward interview (0.5); prepare for call(s) with intervenors' counsel regarding legislative privilege; participate in same (0.8); participate in discovery conference with Defendants (0.9); confer with legal team regarding same (0.4); email with legal team regarding same and outstanding discovery issues raised by both Defendants and intervenors (0.6); email with legal team regarding calling witnesses (0.3); research various discovery issues (0.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
332	Roberts, Rachel M.	3/27/2015	1.90	\$125.00	\$237.50	\$125.00		\$237.50			Review documents produced responsive to FOIA request for unitization project (1.5); discuss same with I. Balom and A. Branch (.4);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
333	Spear, Ryan M.	3/27/2015	4.40	\$500.00	\$2,200.00	\$410.00		\$1,804.00			Prepare for conference and confer with A. Khanna and intervenors' counsel regarding legislative privilege and scheduling issues (1.5); review and respond to emails with A. Khanna and intervenors' counsel regarding same (0.6); confer with K. Hamilton regarding same (0.2); prepare for conference and confer with K. Hamilton, A. Khanna, A. Branch, and defendants' counsel regarding discovery disputes (2.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
334	Elias, Marc E.	3/28/2015	0.70	\$735.00	\$514.50	\$575.00		\$402.50			Email regarding discovery issues (.5); review same (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
335	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/28/2015	1.00	\$620.00	\$620.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Review email exchange regarding discovery issues (.7); review file memorandum regarding interviews (.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
336	Khanna, Abha	3/28/2015	0.60	\$500.00	\$300.00	\$410.00		\$246.00			Telephone conference and email with M. Elias regarding witness interviews;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
337	Spear, Ryan M.	3/28/2015	0.90	\$500.00	\$450.00	\$410.00		\$369.00			Prepare file memorandum regarding witness interview;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
338	Branch, Aria C.	3/29/2015	3.10	\$380.00	\$1,178.00	\$345.00		\$1,069.50			Draft letter to Defendants regarding discovery conference (1.1); draft email summarizing action items from discovery conference (2.0);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
339	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/29/2015	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review and respond to email regarding discovery disputes (.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
340	Khanna, Abha	3/29/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Email with R. Spear regarding case background (0.1); review email and draft discovery letter circulated by A. Branch (0.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
341	Spear, Ryan M.	3/29/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Review and respond to emails with A. Khanna regarding discovery issues;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
342	Spiva, Bruce V.	3/29/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Read and comment on discovery issue concerning statement made in Complaint;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
343	Branch, Aria C.	3/30/2015	1.00	\$380.00	\$380.00	\$345.00		\$345.00			Review intervenors' discovery requests;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
344	Elias, Marc E.	3/30/2015	0.50	\$735.00	\$367.50	\$575.00		\$287.50			Email and telephone conference regarding discovery responses;	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
345	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/30/2015	1.10	\$475.00	\$522.50	\$390.00		\$429.00			Emails with A. Khanna, A. Branch, K. Hamilton, M. Elias, B. Spiva, and R. Spear regarding discovery issues (.5); review draft letter to Defendants regarding discovery responses (.3); telephone conference with L. Stoney regarding discovery (.2); emails with A. Khanna, R. Spear, M. Elias, and K. Hamilton regarding legislative privilege (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
346	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/30/2015	2.50	\$620.00	\$1,550.00	\$575.00		\$1,437.50			Review and respond to email regarding response to interrogatory number 7 (1.5); telephone conference with litigation team regarding potential issues with respect to defendants and intervenor-defendant discovery responses (1.0);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
347	Khanna, Abha	3/30/2015	5.40	\$500.00	\$2,700.00	\$410.00		\$2,214.00			Review and revise letter to Defendants regarding discovery dispute (1.3); email and confer with legal team regarding same (1.7); review emails with Intervenor's counsel regarding legislative privilege issue and discovery dispute (.2); email and confer with legal team regarding same (.9); draft letter to delegates regarding legislative privilege (.7); email and confer with legal team regarding same (.6);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
348	Roberts, Rachel M.	3/30/2015	2.85	\$125.00	\$356.25	\$125.00		\$356.25			Discuss database and management of produced documents with R. Caling and I. Balom and request that records create paper files for discovery documents and media (2.2); unitize documents from defendant's production and sent to R. Caling for processing (.4); email team about FOIA documents and itemization/processing for vendor (.25);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
349	Spear, Ryan M.	3/30/2015	4.30	\$500.00	\$2,150.00	\$410.00		\$1,763.00			Review and respond to emails with J. Walrath regarding letter to delegates (0.3); confer with A. Khanna regarding same (0.2); review and revise draft letter to delegates (0.2); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding witness interviews (0.3); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding intervenors' discovery requests (0.4); prepare for interview and interview witness (1.8); prepare for interview and interview witness (1.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
350	Branch, Aria C.	3/31/2015	2.00	\$380.00	\$760.00	\$345.00		\$690.00			Review Intervenor's objections to discovery;	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
351	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/31/2015	3.60	\$620.00	\$2,232.00	\$575.00		\$2,070.00			Review and respond to email regarding potential discovery disputes with defendants and intervenor-defendants (1.5); conference with team regarding response to discovery and deposition strategy (1.2); review and respond to email regarding witness identification and proposed maps (.9);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
352	Khanna, Abha	3/31/2015	3.20	\$500.00	\$1,600.00	\$410.00		\$1,312.00			Email with A. Branch regarding document review memo (.2); review same (.4); email and leave telephone message with Defendants' counsel regarding discovery dispute (.3); email with Intervenor's counsel regarding legislative privilege letter (.4); review and revise same (.6); email and confer with legal team regarding same (.6); review A. Branch analysis of issues with Intervenor's discovery objections (.4); confer with R. Spear regarding same (.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
353	Spear, Ryan M.	3/31/2015	2.50	\$500.00	\$1,250.00	\$410.00		\$1,025.00			Confer with A. Khanna regarding discovery issues (0.5); review and revise letter to delegates (0.4); review and respond to emails with A. Khanna regarding same (0.3); review and respond to emails with J. Walrath regarding letter to delegates and other discovery issues (0.8); confer with J. Walrath regarding same (0.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
354	Branch, Aria C.	4/1/2015	2.40	\$380.00	\$912.00	\$345.00		\$828.00			Meeting regarding maps (1.0); manage discovery (1.4);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
355	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/1/2015	1.40	\$620.00	\$868.00	\$575.00		\$805.00			Review materials relating to J. Morgan analysis (.9); conference with A. Khanna regarding J. Morgan (.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
356	Khanna, Abha	4/1/2015	1.60	\$500.00	\$800.00	\$410.00		\$656.00			Confer with R. Spear regarding legislative privilege issues (0.3); email with legal team regarding same (0.2); telephone interview with Del. James (0.6); draft and circulate file memo regarding same (0.3); draft and circulate email to legal team assigning witness interviews (0.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
357	Roberts, Rachel M.	4/1/2015	5.75	\$125.00	\$718.75	\$125.00		\$718.75			Unitized documents from VA Attorney General's Office responsive to FOIA request;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
358	Roche, John K.	4/1/2015	0.20	\$535.00	\$107.00	\$465.00		\$93.00			Review and file joint status report regarding discovery and exchange emails with A. Khanna regarding same;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
359	Spear, Ryan M.	4/1/2015	2.50	\$500.00	\$1,250.00	\$410.00		\$1,025.00			Review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding witness interviews (0.2); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding litigation tasks (0.3); review and respond to emails with J. Walrath regarding letter to delegates (0.2); review and revise letter to delegates (0.3); review and respond to emails with A. Khanna regarding status of document production (0.1); prepare interview memoranda for interviews with potential witnesses (1.4);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
360	Branch, Aria C.	4/2/2015	4.20	\$380.00	\$1,596.00	\$345.00		\$1,449.00			Review Page case and finalize document review protocols (2.0); manage discovery (2.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
361	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/2/2015	3.30	\$620.00	\$2,046.00	\$575.00		\$1,897.50			Review witness interview memoranda (.9); review witness lists and potential depositions (.5); prepare for and conference with A. Khanna and R. Spear regarding deposition scheduling, expert reports and related issues (1.9);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
362	Khanna, Abha	4/2/2015	1.60	\$500.00	\$800.00	\$410.00		\$656.00			Confer with K. Hamilton and R. Spear regarding witness interviews, depositions, and case strategy (1.3); follow up conference with R. Spear regarding same and scheduling logistics (0.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
363	Roberts, Rachel M.	4/2/2015	3.65	\$125.00	\$456.25	\$125.00		\$456.25			Unitize documents from VA Attorney General's Office response to FOIA request (2.95); discuss paralegal support of discovery and trial with E. Gonzales (.5); Discuss document pick-up with I. Balom (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
364	Roche, John K.	4/2/2015	0.20	\$535.00	\$107.00	\$465.00		\$93.00			Exchange emails with R. Spear regarding issuance of expert subpoenas and deposition notices;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
365	Spear, Ryan M.	4/2/2015	2.30	\$500.00	\$1,150.00	\$410.00		\$943.00			Prepare for conference and confer with K. Hamilton and A. Khanna regarding depositions and document review issues (1.2); confer with A. Khanna regarding discovery issues and deadlines (0.2); review and respond to emails with J. Roche regarding deposition notices and subpoenas (0.2); review examples of same (0.2); review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton regarding defendants' subpoena to Department of Justice (0.1); review and revise case calendar (0.4);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
366	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/3/2015	1.30	\$620.00	\$806.00	\$575.00		\$747.50			Review and respond to email regarding investigation and deposition scheduling (.9); exchange email with the team regarding same (.4);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
367	Khanna, Abha	4/3/2015	0.70	\$500.00	\$350.00	\$410.00		\$287.00			Email with opposing counsel to set up call regarding deposition scheduling (0.2); email and confer with R. Spear regarding same and case strategy (0.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
368	Roberts, Rachel M.	4/3/2015	1.10	\$125.00	\$137.50	\$125.00		\$137.50			Write email re: number of documents in FOIA request boxes (.2); read document review email (.1); review draft of vendor specifications for processing of FOIA documents (.1); correspond with I. Balom re: same (.1); coordinate pick-up of boxes (.2); discuss Concordance database set-up with A. Branch and R. Caling (.4);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
369	Spear, Ryan M.	4/3/2015	2.50	\$500.00	\$1,250.00	\$410.00		\$1,025.00			Review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding witness interviews (0.3); research and attempt to contact potential witness (0.5); review email message from R. Ingram regarding legislative privilege (0.1); review and respond to emails with A. Khanna regarding same (0.1); review email message from M. Cole regarding legislative privilege (0.1); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding document review (0.2); email opposing counsel with proposals for deposition scheduling and review and respond to emails regarding same (0.7); email defendants' counsel regarding request for copies of documents produced in response to subpoena to Department of Justice (0.2); email intervenors' counsel regarding questions regarding search terms and search protocols (0.2); confer with A. Khanna regarding same (0.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
370	Branch, Aria C.	4/4/2015	0.30	\$380.00	\$114.00	\$345.00		\$103.50			Manage discovery (0.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
371	Spear, Ryan M.	4/4/2015	2.10	\$500.00	\$1,050.00	\$410.00		\$861.00			Review parties' discovery requests, objections, and responses (2.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
372	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/5/2015	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Review and respond to email regarding deposition scheduling (.9);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
373	Branch, Aria C.	4/6/2015	0.70	\$380.00	\$266.00	\$345.00		\$241.50			Review key documents;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
374	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/6/2015	0.80	\$620.00	\$496.00	\$575.00		\$460.00			Exchange email regarding discussions with delegates (.8);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
375	Khanna, Abha	4/6/2015	2.10	\$500.00	\$1,050.00	\$410.00		\$861.00			Review emails with opposing counsel regarding deposition scheduling and legislative privilege assertions (0.2); conduct witness interview regarding 2011 redistricting process (0.5); prepare for same (0.3); draft and circulate file memo regarding same (0.9); confer with R. Spear regarding concerns with attorney-client privilege notations on Intervenor's privilege log (0.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
376	Spear, Ryan M.	4/6/2015	4.00	\$500.00	\$2,000.00	\$410.00		\$1,640.00			Review and respond to emails with J. Walrath regarding email retention policies, search terms, and responses to letters to delegates (0.4); confer with opposing counsel regarding scheduling of depositions and other discovery issues (0.6); prepare summary email regarding same (0.4); prepare spreadsheet of potential witnesses (1.0); confer with A. Khanna regarding same (0.3); prepare deposition notices and subpoenas for expert witnesses (0.2); review and respond to emails with J. Bickford regarding same (0.3); review and respond to emails with opposing counsel regarding subpoena to DOJ (0.2); update K. Hamilton regarding same (0.1); review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton and A. Khanna regarding intervenors' requested clawback of inadvertently produced document (0.3); review and respond to emails with A. Khanna regarding interview with witness (0.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
377	Branch, Aria C.	4/7/2015	1.00	\$380.00	\$380.00	\$345.00		\$345.00			manage discovery (1.0);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
378	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/7/2015	1.40	\$620.00	\$868.00	\$575.00		\$805.00			Conference with A. Khanna regarding staffing, discovery responses and potential depositions (.7); review table of potential witnesses and draft discovery plan (.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
379	Khanna, Abha	4/7/2015	1.40	\$500.00	\$700.00	\$410.00		\$574.00			Email with legal team regarding deposition scheduling (0.1); confer with R. Spear regarding issues with attorney-client privilege notations on Intervenor's privilege log (0.6); review and revise document requests attached to deposition subpoenas, and circulate revisions to R. Spear (0.7);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
380	Roberts, Rachel M.	4/7/2015	0.40	\$125.00	\$50.00	\$125.00		\$50.00			Email R. Caling regarding batch coding documents for custodians in database (.1); email A. Branch regarding new document production (.1); Review witness interview memo sent by B. Spiva (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
381	Spear, Ryan M.	4/7/2015	3.00	\$500.00	\$1,500.00	\$410.00		\$1,230.00			Review and respond to emails with J. Walrath regarding inadvertent disclosure and proposed Rule 502 order (0.3); review and respond to emails with J. Massie (0.1); review and respond to emails with K. Cox (0.1); review and respond to emails with J. Walrath regarding waiver of privilege by J. McClellan and J. Joannou (0.2); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding scheduling of depositions and other discovery issues (0.5); review and respond to emails with J. Bickford regarding notices of deposition and subpoenas (0.6); review same (0.8); confer with A. Khanna regarding intervenors' privilege log (0.4);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
382	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/7/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Confer with team regarding deposition scheduling;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
383	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/7/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Review interview notes of witness;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
384	Spear, Ryan M.	4/8/2015	1.20	\$500.00	\$600.00	\$410.00		\$492.00			Review and respond to emails with A. Khanna regarding service of notices of deposition and subpoenas (0.2); review and revise notices and subpoenas (0.7); review and respond to emails with J. Bickford regarding service and witness fees (0.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
385	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/8/2015	0.60	\$600.00	\$360.00	\$575.00		\$345.00			Correspond with R. Spear regarding depositions and with team about legislative privilege;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
386	Branch, Aria C.	4/9/2015	2.70	\$380.00	\$1,026.00	\$345.00		\$931.50			Draft letter to opposing counsel regarding discovery and revise requests for admission (1.20); manage discovery (1.50);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
387	Frost, Elisabeth C.	4/9/2015	0.30	\$475.00	\$142.50	\$390.00		\$117.00			Emails with B. Spiva regarding legislative privilege issues (.1); review of research regarding legislative privilege in the 4th Circuit (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
388	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/9/2015	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review and respond to email regarding legislative privilege and depositions (.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
389	Khanna, Abha	4/9/2015	0.60	\$500.00	\$300.00	\$410.00		\$246.00			Review and revise document requests attached to fact witness subpoenas (0.2); email with R. Spear regarding same (0.2); confer with R. Spear regarding witness list, including who to call and who to depose (0.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
390	Roberts, Rachel M.	4/9/2015	1.00	\$125.00	\$125.00	\$125.00		\$125.00			Save deposition notices and subpoenas to file (.4); email B. Spiva re: getting Docketing Department on ECF notifications (.1); discuss new document production with R. Caling (.3); locate and deliver disc of produced materials to R. Caling (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
391	Spear, Ryan M.	4/9/2015	4.30	\$500.00	\$2,150.00	\$410.00		\$1,763.00			Confer with A. Branch regarding supplemental discovery requests and responses (0.3); review draft letter regarding same (0.2); prepare spreadsheet of potential fact witnesses (1.0); prepare discovery requests for potential fact witnesses (0.8); review and respond to emails with A. Khanna regarding same (0.2); review and respond to emails with J. Bickford regarding preparation of notices of deposition and subpoenas for fact witnesses (0.6); research issues regarding same (0.4); review and revise notices and subpoenas (0.5); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding scheduling of fact witness depositions (0.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
392	Branch, Aria C.	4/10/2015	0.35	\$380.00	\$133.00	\$345.00		\$120.75			Manage discovery;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
393	Khanna, Abha	4/10/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Email with legal team regarding deposition subpoenas (0.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
394	Roberts, Rachel M.	4/10/2015	1.10	\$125.00	\$137.50	\$125.00		\$137.50			Deliver discs from Attorney General's production to R. Caling (.2); discussed load files with R. Caling and I. Balom (.5); email A. Branch re: defendant-intervenor's production expected today (.2); collect document production and deliver to R. Caling for processing (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
395	Spear, Ryan M.	4/10/2015	1.30	\$500.00	\$650.00	\$410.00		\$533.00			Review intervenors deposition notices and subpoenas (0.3); review intervenors' supplemental privilege log (0.5); review and respond to emails with J. Bickford regarding service of deposition notices and subpoenas for fact witnesses (0.3); review and respond to emails with J. Walrath and D. Glass regarding response to letter by L. Spruill (0.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
396	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/12/2015	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Review and respond to email regarding deposition schedule, motion to compel, and discovery planning (.9);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
397	Spear, Ryan M.	4/12/2015	0.40	\$500.00	\$200.00	\$410.00		\$164.00			Review and respond to emails with J. Walrath regarding supplemental production of items on privilege log and proposed agreement regarding depositions of delegates (0.4);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
398	Branch, Aria C.	4/13/2015	0.80	\$380.00	\$304.00	\$345.00		\$276.00			Manage discovery;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
399	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/13/2015	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Review deposition scheduling, document review, and related discovery planning;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
400	Khanna, Abha	4/13/2015	0.40	\$500.00	\$200.00	\$410.00		\$164.00			Prepare for call with potential witness (0.1); call and leave message with potential witness's assistant (0.1); review deposition subpoenas served by Intervenor's counsel (0.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
401	Roche, John K.	4/13/2015	0.20	\$535.00	\$107.00	\$465.00		\$93.00			Exchange emails with R. Spear regarding deposition of Delegate McClellan;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
402	Roche, John K.	4/13/2015	1.20	\$535.00	\$642.00	\$465.00		\$558.00			Review and revise motion to compel documents withheld based on legislative privilege and attorney-client privilege (1.0); exchange emails with R. Spear and J. Starr regarding same (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
403	Spear, Ryan M.	4/13/2015	1.50	\$500.00	\$750.00	\$410.00		\$615.00			attempt to contact potential witnesses (0.5); confer with J. Walrath regarding discovery issues (0.3); confer with potential witness regarding deposition scheduling (0.5); confer with A. Khanna regarding intervenors' noticing of depositions (0.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
404	Branch, Aria C.	4/14/2015	3.70	\$380.00	\$1,406.00	\$345.00		\$1,276.50			Review key documents (1.9); create chart summarizing key documents (1.8);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
405	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/14/2015	2.10	\$620.00	\$1,302.00	\$575.00		\$1,207.50			Telephone conference with R. Spear regarding delegate interviews (.4); review witness interview file memoranda (.9); review and respond to correspondence regarding deposition scheduling (.8);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
406	Khanna, Abha	4/14/2015	2.90	\$500.00	\$1,450.00	\$410.00		\$1,189.00			Telephone conference with potential witness (0.9); review notes in preparation for same (0.2); draft and circulate file memo regarding same (0.8); review summary of key documents (0.5); email with legal team regarding same (0.3); email with R. Spear regarding upcoming depositions (0.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
407	Roberts, Rachel M.	4/14/2015	4.20	\$125.00	\$525.00	\$125.00		\$525.00			Review scanned document production from Attorney General's office for quality control (3.5); correspond with I. Balom and R. Caling re: same (.4); Discuss review of documents tagged as relevant with A. Branch (.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
408	Spear, Ryan M.	4/14/2015	2.40	\$500.00	\$1,200.00	\$410.00		\$984.00			Attempt to contact potential witnesses (0.6); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding scheduling of fact witness depositions (0.2); review and respond to emails with J. Bickford regarding service of notices of deposition and subpoenas (0.2); review and respond to emails with J. Walrath regarding proposed Rule 502 order (0.2); review letter from Delegate regarding legislative privilege (0.1); review summary of documents from document review from A. Branch (0.5); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding same (0.2); review and respond to emails with A. Khanna regarding depositions, including potential stipulation for additional depositions (0.2); confer with A. Khanna regarding interviews of potential witness (0.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
409	Frost, Elisabeth C.	4/15/2015	0.30	\$475.00	\$142.50	\$390.00		\$117.00			Email from A. Branch summarizing key documents in discovery (.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
410	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/15/2015	1.80	\$620.00	\$1,116.00	\$575.00		\$1,035.00			Review key documents and exchange email regarding original transcript of floor debates (1.8);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
411	Khanna, Abha	4/15/2015	1.00	\$500.00	\$500.00	\$410.00		\$410.00			Email with R. Spear regarding calling witnesses and deposition scheduling/covering (0.5); call and leave message for potential witness (0.1); research potential witness in preparation for interview (0.2); review file memos on interviews with potential witnesses (2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
412	Roberts, Rachel M.	4/15/2015	0.30	\$125.00	\$37.50	\$125.00		\$37.50			Discuss unitization of color maps and loading documents from VA Attorney General into database with R. Caling (.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
413	Spear, Ryan M.	4/15/2015	6.60	\$500.00	\$3,300.00	\$410.00		\$2,706.00			Review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton and A. Khanna regarding contacting potential witnesses (0.7); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding potential stipulation regarding additional depositions (0.3); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding staffing fact witness depositions and prepare table regarding same (1.0); review and respond to emails with J. Walrath regarding providing notice of motion to compel to affected legislators (0.2); review and respond to emails with J. Walrath regarding confirming dates and locations of depositions (0.2); interview potential witness (0.8); prepare and circulate memorandum regarding interview of potential witness (1.1); prepare and circulate memorandum regarding interview with potential witness (0.8); interview potential witness (0.7); prepare and circulate memorandum regarding interview of potential witness (0.8);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
414	Branch, Aria C.	4/16/2015	1.50	\$380.00	\$570.00	\$345.00		\$517.50			Review key documents (.5); create chart of key documents (1.0);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
415	Frost, Elisabeth C.	4/16/2015	0.10	\$475.00	\$47.50	\$390.00		\$39.00			Emails from R. Spear and B. Spiva regarding fact witnesses and depositions (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
416	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/16/2015	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review witness interview memoranda (.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
417	Khanna, Abha	4/16/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Review interview memo re: potential witness (0.2); email with legal team regarding follow up to same (0.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
418	Roberts, Rachel M.	4/16/2015	2.50	\$125.00	\$312.50	\$125.00		\$312.50			Locate transcript that corresponding to 4/5/11 summary per A. Branch (.2); pull key docs to assemble into binder (.9); review 4/5/11 floor debate transcript and compare to summary (1.4);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
419	Spear, Ryan M.	4/16/2015	4.60	\$500.00	\$2,300.00	\$410.00		\$1,886.00			Attempt to contact potential witnesses (0.6); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding same (0.2); review and respond to emails with J. Walrath and D. Glass regarding depositions (0.5); review key documents (1.0); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding same (0.1); update litigation team regarding same (0.7); confer with A. Khanna regarding issues regarding theory of the case and expert discovery (0.6); review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton and B. Spiva regarding staffing fact witness depositions and deposition of J. Katz (0.5); review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton regarding potential additional discovery requests (0.2); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding discovery issues (0.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
420	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/16/2015	0.70	\$600.00	\$420.00	\$575.00		\$402.50			Correspond with R. Spear about depositions;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
421	Branch, Aria C.	4/17/2015	1.20	\$380.00	\$456.00	\$345.00		\$414.00			Review key documents (.5); create chart identifying key documents (.7);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
422	Roberts, Rachel M.	4/17/2015	4.80	\$125.00	\$600.00	\$125.00		\$600.00			Review relevant documents from first-level review sheets and select key passage per A. Branch (4.4); Read emails re: production database from R. Caling (.4);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
423	Spear, Ryan M.	4/17/2015	1.70	\$500.00	\$850.00	\$410.00		\$697.00			Attempt to contact potential witnesses (0.3); confer with J. Walrath regarding discovery issues (0.6); prepare and send follow-up message to J. Walrath regarding same (0.5); confer with A. Branch regarding supplemental discovery responses and requests (0.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
424	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/17/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Correspond with R. Spear about depositions;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
425	Spear, Ryan M.	4/18/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Develop list of potential additional fact witnesses to depose (0.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
426	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/19/2015	0.70	\$600.00	\$420.00	\$575.00		\$402.50			Review summaries of interviews with delegates;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
427	Frost, Elisabeth C.	4/20/2015	0.40	\$475.00	\$190.00	\$390.00		\$156.00			Telephone conference with R. Spear regarding potential delegate witness (.3); email from R. Spear regarding proposed additional fact witnesses (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
428	Roberts, Rachel M.	4/20/2015	2.75	\$125.00	\$343.75	\$125.00		\$343.75			Review documents coded as relevant and related to partisanship during first level review (2.25); summarize same for A. Branch (.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
429	Spear, Ryan M.	4/20/2015	1.70	\$500.00	\$850.00	\$410.00		\$697.00			review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding additional fact witnesses (.3); prepare table reflecting deposition schedule (.4); review and respond to emails with J. Bickford regarding additional fact witness deposition notices and subpoenas (.4); review and revise same (.6);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
430	Branch, Aria C.	4/21/2015	3.65	\$380.00	\$1,387.00	\$345.00		\$1,259.25			Review key documents (2.00); update chart of key documents (0.65); conference call (1.00);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
431	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/21/2015	1.10	\$620.00	\$682.00	\$575.00		\$632.50			Conference with litigation team regarding scheduling depositions (1.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
432	Khanna, Abha	4/21/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Review Intervenor's opposition to Motion to Compel Production of Documents (0.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
433	Roberts, Rachel M.	4/21/2015	2.00	\$125.00	\$250.00	\$125.00		\$250.00			Discuss document review process with A. Branch (.2); Discuss discovery tracking with R. Caling (.3); Code key documents in Concordance and generate spreadsheet of key documents for attorney use (1.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
434	Spear, Ryan M.	4/21/2015	7.00	\$500.00	\$3,500.00	\$410.00		\$2,870.00			Review and respond to emails with opposing counsel regarding deposition scheduling (.2); confer with opposing counsel regarding same (.5); review opposition to motion to compel (.4); confer and exchange emails regarding potential delegate witness (.6); update litigation team regarding same (.1); review and revise deposition notices and subpoenas for fact witnesses (.6); circulate notices and subpoenas to opposing counsel (.2); coordinate service of notices and subpoenas (.2); review and respond to emails with J. Bickford regarding same and regarding deposition locations (.5); confer with litigation team regarding status and strategy, including motion to compel, expert reports, and discovery (1.1); review and revise supplemental written discovery responses and requests (.5); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding same (.2); send supplemental responses and requests to J. Walrath (.2); review report regarding documents from A. Branch (.4); prepare and circulate updated task list for litigation team (.6); prepare and circulate master schedule of depositions and staffing (.5); confer with K. Hamilton regarding same (.1); review and respond to emails with B. Spiva regarding same (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
435	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/21/2015	0.90	\$600.00	\$540.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Telephone conference with team about depositions and other case planning issues;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
436	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/21/2015	0.50	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Correspond with team about depositions and other discovery issues;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
437	Roberts, Rachel M.	4/22/2015	0.10	\$125.00	\$12.50	\$125.00		\$12.50			Email R. Spear re: deposition logistics (.05); discuss tracking of newly received discovery with K. Guity (.05);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
438	Spear, Ryan M.	4/22/2015	1.20	\$500.00	\$600.00	\$410.00		\$492.00			Review and respond to emails with J. Bickford regarding deposition scheduling (0.3); review and respond to emails with B. Stafford regarding document review and witness calls (.2); confer with J. Walrath and J. Brundage regarding deposition scheduling (.5); review and respond to emails regarding same (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
439	Branch, Aria C.	4/23/2015	1.00	\$380.00	\$380.00	\$345.00		\$345.00			Review key documents identified by discovery attorneys;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
440	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/23/2015	2.10	\$620.00	\$1,302.00	\$575.00		\$1,207.50			Conference with B. Spiva and R. Spear regarding deposition scheduling (1.1); review deposition scheduling and coordinate logistics (.6); review proposed exhibits and staffing support (.4);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
441	Marino, Patricia	4/23/2015	4.90	\$220.00	\$1,078.00	\$190.00		\$931.00			Telephone conference with A. Branch regarding discovery / deposition preparation action items (.6); review/search database regarding same (2.8); telephone conference with R. Caling regarding document database export / tagging issues (.8); telephone conference with I. Balom regarding document review status and related coding issues (.7);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
442	Roberts, Rachel M.	4/23/2015	0.90	\$125.00	\$112.50	\$125.00		\$112.50			Correspond with B. Spiva and R. Spear re: deposition logistics (.4); Correspond with R. Caling re: discovery tracking and software (.2); Discuss newest document production with R. Caling (.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
443	Spear, Ryan M.	4/23/2015	3.20	\$500.00	\$1,600.00	\$410.00		\$1,312.00			Attempt to contact potential fact witnesses (.3); confer with B. Spiva and K. Hamilton regarding discovery issues and staffing (.3); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding deposition scheduling and coordinate scheduling and logistics (.8); review and respond to emails with D. Glass and J. Walrath regarding deposition scheduling and logistics (.5); review and respond to emails with B. Stafford regarding witness interviews (.1); review key documents (.7); confer with R. Roberts regarding deposition scheduling and resources (.3); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding deposition preparation (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
444	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/23/2015	0.90	\$600.00	\$540.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Telephone conference with K. Hamilton and R. Spear about depositions;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
445	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/23/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with E. Frost about deposition preparation;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
446	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/23/2015	0.50	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Correspond with R. Spear about deposition preparation and scheduling;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
447	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/23/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Confer with R. Roberts about depositions;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
448	Branch, Aria C.	4/24/2015	0.80	\$380.00	\$304.00	\$345.00		\$276.00			Review documents in preparation for deposition;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
449	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/24/2015	0.60	\$620.00	\$372.00	\$575.00		\$345.00			Review deposition schedule and conference call with B. Spiva, R. Spear and C. Anderson regarding same (.6);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
450	Marino, Patricia	4/24/2015	1.80	\$220.00	\$396.00	\$190.00		\$342.00			Communications with PTS regarding document review status and technical issue documents (.4); review/search database in anticipation of attorney deposition preparation requests and additional document coding field requirements (1.0); conference with R. Spear regarding deposition preparation action items/review (.4);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
451	Roberts, Rachel M.	4/24/2015	0.80	\$125.00	\$100.00	\$125.00		\$100.00			Discuss Concordance search results with A. Branch (.1); Discuss key docs and larger discovery tracking chart with R. Caling and A. Branch (.2); work on deposition logistics (.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
452	Spear, Ryan M.	4/24/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Review and respond to emails with J. Walrath regarding J. McClellan deposition (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
453	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/24/2015	0.70	\$600.00	\$420.00	\$575.00		\$402.50			Prepare for depositions;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
454	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/24/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with R. Spear and A. Callais about depositions;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
455	Khanna, Abha	4/26/2015	0.10	\$500.00	\$50.00	\$410.00		\$41.00			Email with legal team regarding legislative privilege brief and Pretrial Schedule A;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
456	Branch, Aria C.	4/27/2015	1.60	\$380.00	\$608.00	\$345.00		\$552.00			Review documents in preparation for deposition; (0.80) conference call (0.80)	Fact Discovery - First Trial
457	Callais, Amanda R.	4/27/2015	5.70	\$380.00	\$2,166.00	\$345.00		\$1,966.50			Read and review Complaint, McClellan interview notes, and Page case to prepare background outline for McClellan deposition (2.5); Call with K. Hamilton, R. Spear, B. Spiva and team about case scheduling, tasks, and deposition prep/follow-up meeting with B. Spiva about deposition prep for McClellan deposition (1.5); Call with R. Spear about McClellan deposition prep (.4); Read and review documents for McClellan deposition (1.2)	Fact Discovery - First Trial
458	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/27/2015	1.50	\$620.00	\$930.00	\$575.00		\$862.50			Prepare for and conference with R. Spear and litigation team regarding litigation strategy and depositions (1.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
459	Marino, Patricia	4/27/2015	2.70	\$220.00	\$594.00	\$190.00		\$513.00			Review/search database coding and technical document issues (1.2); revise/update database coding (.6); telephone conference/emails with R. Caling regarding document database export protocol and related deposition preparation action items (.9);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
460	Roberts, Rachel M.	4/27/2015	2.10	\$125.00	\$262.50	\$125.00		\$262.50			Discuss deposition logistics with J. Bickford (.3); work on reserving space and court reporters for same (1.8);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
461	Spear, Ryan M.	4/27/2015	1.30	\$500.00	\$650.00	\$410.00		\$533.00			Confer with J. McClellan regarding deposition scheduling and logistics, including document production (.3); review and respond to emails with A. Callais regarding deposition preparation (.3); confer with A. Callais regarding same (.2); review and respond to emails with J. Walrath and D. Glass regarding deposition scheduling (.2); confer with B. Spiva regarding deposition of J. McClellan (.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
462	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/27/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Worked on deposition scheduling;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
463	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/27/2015	0.80	\$600.00	\$480.00	\$575.00		\$460.00			Confer with R. Spear and A. Callais about deposition preparation and worked on same;	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
464	Branch, Aria C.	4/28/2015	5.70	\$380.00	\$2,166.00	\$345.00		\$1,966.50			Attend two conference calls regarding preparation for McClellan deposition (0.80); prepare DVD for transcription (0.80); run searches for Benson documents (2.00); prepare for depositions (2.10);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
465	Callais, Amanda R.	4/28/2015	8.60	\$380.00	\$3,268.00	\$345.00		\$2,967.00			Research Delegate McClellan's background to draft deposition outline for B. Spiva (1.2); Call with A. Branch and R. Spear to discuss next steps in preparing for depositions and document review (.6); Read, review, and respond to correspondence with R. Spear and Perkins team regarding logistics for deposition preparation and document production (.3); Call with Perkins team regarding logistic for deposition preparation and next steps (1); Review McClellan documents for relevance and inclusion in deposition (4.5); Review notes on McClellan interview and document notes and draft outline for deposition (1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
466	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/28/2015	4.20	\$620.00	\$2,604.00	\$575.00		\$2,415.00			Prepare for deposition of Del. Jones (2.4); conference with R. Spear regarding deposition preparation and identification of exhibits (.9); coordinate scheduling of depositions and related logistics (.9);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
467	Marino, Patricia	4/28/2015	7.50	\$220.00	\$1,650.00	\$190.00		\$1,425.00			Review/search database in preparation of litigation team call regarding deposition preparation action items; telephone conference with litigation team regarding database overview/searches and deposition preparation action items; run deponent name searches in database per attorney instruction; summarize search results regarding same; revise/update database coding; follow-up communications with PTS regarding database issues;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
468	Roberts, Rachel M.	4/28/2015	4.90	\$125.00	\$612.50	\$125.00		\$612.50			Locate DVD of 4/5/11 redistricting floor debate (.8); discuss same with A. Branch and Service Desk to arrange for viewing/copying (.7); discuss deposition prep with A. Callais and R. Caling (1.5); email T. Marino re: same (.8); attend conference call re: deposition prep and exhibits (1.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
469	Spear, Ryan M.	4/28/2015	3.40	\$500.00	\$1,700.00	\$410.00		\$1,394.00			Confer with A. Branch and A. Callais regarding J. McClellan deposition preparation (.5); review documents regarding same (.2); confer with R. Roberts regarding deposition scheduling and logistics (.4); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding deposition scheduling, including J. Katz scheduling (.6); review and respond to emails with J. Walrath regarding deposition scheduling (.2); review and respond to emails with D. Glass regarding same (.1); review and respond to emails with M. Spain regarding deposition scheduling (.2); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding amended notices of deposition (.3); prepare amended notices (.2); confer with litigation team regarding document review and exhibit list (.5); review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton regarding location of C. Jones deposition (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
470	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/28/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Prepare for depositions;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
471	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/28/2015	0.40	\$600.00	\$240.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Correspond with R. Spear and team about depositions;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
472	Branch, Aria C.	4/29/2015	2.30	\$380.00	\$874.00	\$345.00		\$793.50			Preparation for depositions;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
473	Callais, Amanda R.	4/29/2015	7.40	\$380.00	\$2,812.00	\$345.00		\$2,553.00			Draft deposition outline for Delegate McClellan (3.6); preview McClellan documents for deposition prep (1.1); conduct background research for McClellan deposition (1.0); confer with B. Spiva regarding key points of McClellan deposition (1.5); confer with R. Roberts about logistics and document collection and production (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
474	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/29/2015	2.30	\$620.00	\$1,426.00	\$575.00		\$1,322.50			Review transcripts and discovery material in preparation for Del. Jones deposition (2.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
475	Marino, Patricia	4/29/2015	8.10	\$220.00	\$1,782.00	\$190.00		\$1,539.00			Respond to attorney requests for information/documents; conduct database searches per attorney instruction regarding deposition preparation (7.5); conference with R. Spear regarding concordance database document review/coding issues; compile case background materials for attorney review (.2); follow-up communications with PTS regarding database and technical document issues (.4);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
476	Roberts, Rachel M.	4/29/2015	7.30	\$125.00	\$912.50	\$125.00		\$912.50			Work on deposition logistics (.9); locate maps of districts at issue in case (.8); discuss same with A. Callais and B. Spiva (.5); check for families within documents relevant to McClellan deposition (.9); unitize documents defendants produced as single 5,000+ page PDF (4.0); discuss same with R. Caling and A. Branch (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
477	Spear, Ryan M.	4/29/2015	1.50	\$500.00	\$750.00	\$410.00		\$615.00			Review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding scheduling of J. McClellan deposition (.1); review proposed stipulation regarding additional depositions (.2); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding same (.1); review and respond to emails with J. Walrath regarding same (.1); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding C. Bensen (.3); confer with K. Hamilton regarding same (.2); review privilege logs regarding same (.2); review and respond to emails with J. McClellan regarding deposition scheduling (.1); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding transcript preparation (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
478	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/29/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Review materials on deponents;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
479	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/29/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Review stipulation to depositions and correspond with R. Spear about same;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
480	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/29/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Correspond with team about depositions;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
481	Branch, Aria C.	4/30/2015	1.70	\$380.00	\$646.00	\$345.00		\$586.50			Prepare DVDs for transcription and send to transcription service (0.50); prepare for depositions (1.20);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
482	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/30/2015	3.60	\$620.00	\$2,232.00	\$575.00		\$2,070.00			Review and revise draft deposition outline for Del. Jones (1.3); review potential deposition exhibits (.9); conference with A. Branch regarding legislative hearing transcript (.5); coordinate logistics for depositions (.9);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
483	Marino, Patricia	4/30/2015	11.00	\$220.00	\$2,420.00	\$190.00		\$2,090.00			Respond to attorney requests for information/documents; conduct database searches per attorney instruction regarding deposition preparation (8.0); telephone conference with K. Hamilton, R. Spear and R. Partin regarding deposition and trial support/logistics (.8); communications with PTS regarding database/document issues (.5); compile/organize selected C. Jones deposition preparation materials for attorneys' further evaluation (1.7);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
484	Roberts, Rachel M.	4/30/2015	0.30	\$125.00	\$37.50	\$125.00		\$37.50			Locate transcripts for hearing summaries marked hot (.2); discuss same with A. Branch (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
485	Spear, Ryan M.	4/30/2015	6.80	\$500.00	\$3,400.00	\$410.00		\$2,788.00			Review documents for C. Jones deposition preparation (3.2); prepare C. Jones deposition outline (1.9); update K. Hamilton regarding same (.1); confer with T. Marino regarding preparation of materials, including binder of exhibits (.3); review K. Hamilton deposition schedule (.4); review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton and C. Anderson regarding same (.3); review and respond to emails with A. Callais regarding deposition preparation (.2); gather information regarding same (.1); review fax from B. Rigney regarding L. Spruill deposition (.1); review and respond to emails with opposing counsel regarding same (.1); review and respond to emails with opposing counsel regarding J. McClellan deposition (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
486	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/30/2015	1.20	\$600.00	\$720.00	\$575.00		\$690.00			Review McClellan deposition outline and documents and confer with A. Callais about same;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
487	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/30/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with K. Hamilton about deposition strategy;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
488	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/30/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with team about depositions;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
489	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/30/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Confer with A. Callais about preparation for expert depositions;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
490	Branch, Aria C.	5/1/2015	3.60	\$380.00	\$1,368.00	\$345.00		\$1,242.00			Prepare for depositions;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
491	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/1/2015	6.80	\$620.00	\$4,216.00	\$575.00		\$3,910.00			Prepare for Del. Jones deposition (2.3); review and revise draft deposition outline (1.2); review potential deposition exhibits and conference with T. Marino regarding same (.9); prepare for J. Morgan deposition (1.9); conference with J. Devaney regarding same (.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
492	Khanna, Abha	5/1/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Email with legal team regarding house floor testimony on partisan intent (.1); review key document summary regarding same (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
493	Marino, Patricia	5/1/2015	10.00	\$220.00	\$2,200.00	\$190.00		\$1,900.00			Review/search database (.5); respond to attorneys requests for information/documents (.5); compile/organize C. Jones and J. Morgan deposition preparation materials for attorneys' further evaluation (7.8); telephone conference with R. Caling regarding document/database issues (.6); communications with P. Sutton (McCandlish Holton paralegal) regarding deposition preparation/logistics (.3); telephone conference with R. Roberts regarding deposition preparation/document issues (.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
494	Roberts, Rachel M.	5/1/2015	3.40	\$125.00	\$425.00	\$125.00		\$425.00			Reviewed discs of floor debate video for length and other details (3.0); corresponded with A. Branch and I. Balom re: same (.1); set up coding chart for attorney review of House of Delegates floor debate videos (.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
495	Spear, Ryan M.	5/1/2015	4.80	\$500.00	\$2,400.00	\$410.00		\$1,968.00			Review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton regarding C. Jones deposition outline (.1); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding transcriptions (.2); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding supplemental production (.3); review and respond to emails with opposing counsel regarding same (.1); review documents regarding C. Jones deposition (1.5); review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton regarding same (.2); review and respond to emails with B. Spiva and A. Callais regarding deposition preparation (.1); prepare amended notice of deposition for C. Jones and serve on opposing counsel (.3); review and respond to emails with J. Bickford regarding service of subpoenas (.1); review documents for J. Morgan deposition (1.4); review and respond to emails with T. Marino regarding same (.2); confer with T. Marino regarding potential exhibits for C. Jones deposition (.2); review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton regarding same (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
496	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/2/2015	4.40	\$620.00	\$2,728.00	\$575.00		\$2,530.00			Review hearing transcripts on floor of general assembly and committee hearings in both house and the senate (2.5); review produced documents to identify deposition exhibits (1.9);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
497	Spear, Ryan M.	5/2/2015	2.40	\$500.00	\$1,200.00	\$410.00		\$984.00			Review and revise C. Jones deposition outline (.8); review documents regarding C. Jones deposition (1.1); review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton regarding same (.3); review and respond to emails with A. Callais and A. Branch regarding J. McClellan deposition preparation (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
498	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/2/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with team about Morgan deposition;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
499	Callais, Amanda R.	5/3/2015	4.20	\$380.00	\$1,596.00	\$345.00		\$1,449.00			Review Marston documents for Marston deposition preparation (2.0); Review Senate and House transcripts for general deposition preparation (2.0); Draft emails to B. Spiva regarding use of same (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
500	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/3/2015	3.30	\$620.00	\$2,046.00	\$575.00		\$1,897.50			Review potential deposition exhibits (1.3); prepare for and participate in telephone conference with R. Spear regarding deposition exhibits and related deposition outline (2.0);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
501	Marino, Patricia	5/3/2015	6.00	\$220.00	\$1,320.00	\$190.00		\$1,140.00			Compile/organize C. Jones and J. Morgan deposition preparation materials for attorneys' further evaluation (6.0);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
502	Spear, Ryan M.	5/3/2015	2.00	\$500.00	\$1,000.00	\$410.00		\$820.00			Confer with K. Hamilton regarding C. Jones deposition (1.1); review and revise deposition outline for C. Jones deposition (.9);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
503	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/3/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with A. Callais about preparation for depositions;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
504	Branch, Aria C.	5/4/2015	0.70	\$380.00	\$266.00	\$345.00		\$241.50			Correspond with transcription service to modify and receive transcripts of legislative floor debates;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
505	Callais, Amanda R.	5/4/2015	3.90	\$380.00	\$1,482.00	\$345.00		\$1,345.50			Meet with R. Roberts to discuss timeline for preparing deposition outlines and binders, Marston exhibits, and McClellan exhibits (.2); Call with R. Caling to discuss Marston documents and Hofeller documents (.2); Call with R. Spear to discuss Marston, McClellan, and Hofeller depositions; Meet with B. Spiva to discuss McClellan outline and changes to outline; Review, edit, and update McClellan deposition outline in keeping with changes from R. Spear and B. Spiva (3.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
506	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/4/2015	11.30	\$620.00	\$7,006.00	\$575.00		\$6,497.50			Prepare for deposition of Del. Jones (6.9); review potential deposition exhibits for Del. Jones deposition (2.5); review and revise draft deposition outline (1.9);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
507	Khanna, Abha	5/4/2015	0.60	\$500.00	\$300.00	\$410.00		\$246.00			Telephone conference with K. Hamilton and B. Stafford regarding C. Jones deposition preparation; draft and circulate deposition questions regarding same;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
508	Marino, Patricia	5/4/2015	7.10	\$220.00	\$1,562.00	\$190.00		\$1,349.00			Compile/organize C. Jones and J. Morgan deposition preparation materials for attorneys' further evaluation (5.7); telephone conference with P. Sutton regarding deposition/logistics (.4); communications with PTS regarding database issues (1.0);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
509	Roberts, Rachel M.	5/4/2015	0.90	\$125.00	\$112.50	\$125.00		\$112.50			Review emails re: deposition preparation; discuss same with A. Callais (.9);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
510	Spear, Ryan M.	5/4/2015	7.20	\$500.00	\$3,600.00	\$410.00		\$2,952.00			Confer with A. Callais regarding preparation for C. Marston deposition (.5); gather materials regarding same (.3); review documents for preparation for J. Morgan deposition (3.5); review and respond to emails with T. Marino regarding same (.1); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding deposition transcripts (.2); review deposition transcripts (.7); review and revise C. Jones deposition outline (1.2); gather materials regarding same (.5); review and respond to emails with opposing counsel regarding stipulation regarding additional depositions (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
511	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/4/2015	0.90	\$600.00	\$540.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Prepare for McClellan deposition and edit deposition outline;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
512	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/4/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Confer with A. Callais about McClellan deposition;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
513	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/4/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Review Jones deposition outline;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
514	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/4/2015	0.90	\$600.00	\$540.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Review documents and summaries of same to prepare for depositions;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
515	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/4/2015	0.40	\$600.00	\$240.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Correspond with team about depositions and documents;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
516	Branch, Aria C.	5/5/2015	0.50	\$380.00	\$190.00	\$345.00		\$172.50			Manage discovery;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
517	Callais, Amanda R.	5/5/2015	0.20	\$380.00	\$76.00	\$345.00		\$69.00			Review emails regarding case documents and depositions (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
518	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/5/2015	9.50	\$620.00	\$5,890.00	\$575.00		\$5,462.50			Review and organize deposition exhibits for Del. Jones deposition (2.5); review and revise draft deposition outline (5.6); prepare for and conference with R. Spear regarding deposition outline (1.2); conference with B. Spiva regarding same (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
519	Marino, Patricia	5/5/2015	7.40	\$220.00	\$1,628.00	\$190.00		\$1,406.00			Compile/organize J. Morgan deposition preparation materials (4.8); telephone conference with R. Roberts regarding deposition/document issues (.3); telephone conference with R. Calling and I. Balom regarding technical document/database issues (.8); review/search database in response to attorneys' requests for information/documents (1.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
520	Roberts, Rachel M.	5/5/2015	3.00	\$125.00	\$375.00	\$125.00		\$375.00			Call with T. Marino re: dep prep logistics (1.1); discuss printing and assembling of deposition exhibits with A. Callais (.4); start printing documents for depositions (.3) email T. Marino re: follow-up items on videos and maps from call (.6); email court reporter re; standing transcript order and instructions to email self and T. Marino (.6);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
521	Spear, Ryan M.	5/5/2015	5.90	\$500.00	\$2,950.00	\$410.00		\$2,419.00			Review and revise outline for C. Jones deposition (1.2); confer with K. Hamilton regarding same (.3); review exhibits regarding same (.5); review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton regarding exhibits (.7); gather information regarding same (.3); review transcripts of public hearings and debates (.9); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding same (.1); review email from J. Walrath regarding subpoenas to C. Jones, J. Morgan, and C. Marston (.2); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding same and recommended response to same (.3); review and respond to emails with J. Walrath regarding R. Tyler deposition (.1); review and respond to emails with assistant to R. Tyler regarding same (.1); review draft law review article about racial gerrymandering (.2); review draft outline for J. McClellan deposition (.5); review and respond to emails with A. Callais regarding same (.1); review Intervenor's responses and objections to subpoena to C. Jones (.2); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding same (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
522	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/5/2015	0.50	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Prepare for depositions;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
523	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/5/2015	0.50	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Confer with A. Callais about deposition preparation;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
524	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/5/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Correspond with R. Spear about documents and depositions;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
525	Branch, Aria C.	5/6/2015	0.70	\$380.00	\$266.00	\$345.00		\$241.50			Conference call regarding C. Jones deposition;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
526	Callais, Amanda R.	5/6/2015	1.30	\$380.00	\$494.00	\$345.00		\$448.50			Review and edits McClellan deposition outline with edits from R. Spear (.3); Confer with R. Roberts about preparation of deposition binders (.1); Status and next steps call regarding depositions and case with attorney team (.9);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
527	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/6/2015	10.90	\$620.00	\$6,758.00	\$575.00		\$6,267.50			Prepare for and take deposition of Del. Jones (7.5); conference with legal team regarding Del. Jones deposition and related issues (2.5 hours); review materials in preparation for J. Morgan deposition (.9);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
528	Marino, Patricia	5/6/2015	2.80	\$220.00	\$616.00	\$190.00		\$532.00			Telephone conference with K. Hamilton, R. Spear, B. Spiva and A. Branch regarding discovery action items (1.0); prepare documents for production per attorney instruction (1.0); review/search database (.3); telephone conference with R. Calling and R. Roberts regarding document/database issues (.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
529	Roberts, Rachel M.	5/6/2015	2.55	\$125.00	\$318.75	\$125.00		\$318.75			Discuss deposition prep with A. Callais (.3); assemble and organize expert deposition materials (.3); read email summary of Jones deposition (.2); discuss deposition logistics with J. Winovich (.2); review email re: production of video transcripts and respond to same (.2); call with T. Marino and R. Caling re: video review, discuss same with I. Balom (.6); reconcile videos loaded into review database with produced discs in office, email I. Balom and R. Caling re: same (.75)	Fact Discovery - First Trial
530	Spear, Ryan M.	5/6/2015	7.30	\$500.00	\$3,650.00	\$410.00		\$2,993.00			Confer with B. Tavenner regarding notice of deposition and subpoena (.6); confer with litigation team regarding C. Jones deposition, upcoming depositions, and related strategy issues (.8); review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton regarding additional depositions (.2); review and respond to emails with A. Khanna regarding initial disclosures (.2); review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton regarding rough transcript of C. Jones deposition and potential additional questions (.6); prepare outline for J. Morgan deposition (2.9); prepare exhibits regarding same (1.1); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding Plaintiffs' FOIA request to Division of Legislative Services (.2); confer with B. Stafford regarding scheduling of depositions (.1); coordinate production of transcripts created by Perkins Coie (.3); review and respond to emails with J. Walrath regarding same (.1); coordinate meeting with J. Walrath and D. Glass regarding upcoming depositions (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
531	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/6/2015	2.10	\$600.00	\$1,260.00	\$575.00		\$1,207.50			Prepare for depositions (1.5); telephone conference with team about depositions and schedule (.6);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
532	Callais, Amanda R.	5/7/2015	4.40	\$380.00	\$1,672.00	\$345.00		\$1,518.00			Confer with R. Roberts about scheduling of McClellan deposition and preparation of deposition exhibit binders (.4); Review Marston documents in preparation for deposition (4);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
533	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/7/2015	12.40	\$620.00	\$7,688.00	\$575.00		\$7,130.00			Prepare for J. Morgan deposition (4.8); conference with J. Devaney regarding J. Morgan deposition (.5); review J. Morgan deposition and trial testimony in Page litigation (2.5); review and revise draft deposition outline (2.2); review and organize potential deposition exhibits (1.8); conference with R. Spear regarding deposition outline (.6);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
534	Marino, Patricia	5/7/2015	9.20	\$220.00	\$2,024.00	\$190.00		\$1,748.00			Compile/organize potential deposition / trial preparation materials for attorneys' further evaluation (5.6); draft index (.8); telephone conference with R. Calling regarding document/database issues (.8); emails with R. Roberts regarding document database/production issues (.5); respond to attorney requests for information/documents (.7); review/evaluate selected technical issue documents summarized by PTS requiring potential follow-up (.8);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
535	Roberts, Rachel M.	5/7/2015	4.65	\$125.00	\$581.25	\$125.00		\$581.25			Discuss deposition prep with A. Callais and J. Winovich (.4); Discuss issues with video uploads and review in Concordance with R. Caling and I. Balom, update chart re: same (1.45); Review selected documents related to Marston deposition for family relationships within Concordance (.4); write email re: rescheduling McClellan deposition, discuss same with R. Spear and A. Callais (.7); save transcribed House of Delegates hearings to case file (.2); work on production of videos of House of Delegates sessions and transcripts of same (1.25); Update deposition calendar and circulate to team (.25);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
536	Spear, Ryan M.	5/7/2015	6.30	\$500.00	\$3,150.00	\$410.00		\$2,583.00			Prepare for conference with J. Walrath and D. Glass regarding deposition scheduling (.6); confer with J. Walrath and D. Glass regarding same (.5); prepare and send follow-up message confirming conference results to J. Walrath and D. Glass (.4); confer with K. Hamilton regarding same (.3); review and respond to emails with R. Roberts regarding deposition scheduling and logistics (.2); review and respond to emails with T. Marino regarding document review and review of videos (.3); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding review of draft maps and custodians of draft maps (.1); review materials and revise outline regarding J. Morgan deposition (1.0); review objections to subpoenas to C. Marston and J. Morgan (.4); review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton regarding same (.2); review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton regarding supplemental production (.2); coordinate and send supplemental production (.6); prepare list of tasks for litigation team and coordinate team meeting (1.0); review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton regarding potential witness (.2);review deposition transcript of C. Jones (.6);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
537	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/7/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Correspond with R. Spear about tomorrow's meeting and deposition schedule (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
538	Branch, Aria C.	5/8/2015	3.80	\$380.00	\$1,444.00	\$345.00		\$1,311.00			Call with R. Roberts regarding production of DVDs of legislative floor debates (0.1); call with I. Balom regarding review of technical issue documents (0.2); conference call with legal team regarding deposition strategy (1.2); review and edit draft letter regarding production of DVDs of legislative floor debates (0.2); manage discovery and technical issue documents (2.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
539	Callais, Amanda R.	5/8/2015	2.10	\$380.00	\$798.00	\$345.00		\$724.50			Participate in strategy call with team regarding depositions and follow-up meeting with B. Spiva and K. Hamilton regarding preparation for Marston deposition (2.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
540	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/8/2015	11.20	\$620.00	\$6,944.00	\$575.00		\$6,440.00			Prepare for and take deposition of J. Morgan (7.9); report to litigation team regarding deposition (.9); prepare for and participate in conference call with litigation team regarding delegate depositions (1.9); related discussion with M. Elias regarding same (.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
541	Khanna, Abha	5/8/2015	0.50	\$500.00	\$250.00	\$410.00		\$205.00			Telephone conference with R. Spear regarding upcoming fact and expert depositions and document production (0.4); email with R. Spear regarding same (0.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
542	Marino, Patricia	5/8/2015	8.40	\$220.00	\$1,848.00	\$190.00		\$1,596.00			Compile/organize potential deposition / trial preparation materials for attorneys' further evaluation (4.8); draft index (1.2); review PTS index of technical issue documents (.5); telephone conference with K. Hamilton, R. Spear, B. Spiva, and A. Branch regarding discovery/trial strategy/action items (.6); respond to attorney requests for information/documents (.5); conduct supplemental database witness searches per attorney requests (.8);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
543	Roberts, Rachel M.	5/8/2015	3.90	\$125.00	\$487.50	\$125.00		\$487.50			Set up final logistics for Morgan deposition (.4); call court reporter about scheduling updates for Hofeller and Hood depositions; review emails re: same (.3); Prepare copies of DVDs of House floor debates for production and draft cover letter, discuss same with A. Branch (1.2); Locate attachments to selected emails for Marston deposition (1.0); discuss upload of house of delegates videos and transcripts with R. Caling (.7); discuss deposition preparations and logistics with J. Winovich and K. Hamilton (.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
544	Spear, Ryan M.	5/8/2015	2.50	\$500.00	\$1,250.00	\$410.00		\$1,025.00			Prepare for conference with litigation team regarding cancellation of depositions and other strategy issues (0.5); confer with litigation team regarding same (1.1); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding review of draft maps and custodians of draft maps (.2); review and respond to emails with T. Marino regarding document review (.2); review and respond to email messages with R. Roberts regarding deposition scheduling and logistics (.1); coordinate meeting with J. Walrath and D. Glass regarding deposition scheduling (.1); review and revise letter to opposing counsel (.2); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding same (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
545	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/8/2015	0.50	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Met with K. Hamilton about depositions (.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
546	Stafford, William B.	5/8/2015	0.20	\$495.00	\$99.00	\$405.00		\$81.00			Draft correspondence to R. Spear regarding potential additional depositions;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
547	Elias, Marc E.	5/9/2015	0.50	\$735.00	\$367.50	\$575.00		\$287.50			Telephone conference and review issues regarding discovery;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
548	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/9/2015	1.90	\$620.00	\$1,178.00	\$575.00		\$1,092.50			Prepare for and telephone conference with M. Elias regarding delegate depositions (.5); exchange email with R. Spear regarding delegate depositions and related issues (1.2); call with R. Spear regarding same (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
549	Marino, Patricia	5/9/2015	4.50	\$220.00	\$990.00	\$190.00		\$855.00			Compile/organize potential deposition / trial preparation materials for attorneys' further evaluation (3.0); draft index (1.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
550	Spear, Ryan M.	5/9/2015	0.40	\$500.00	\$200.00	\$410.00		\$164.00			Confer with K. Hamilton regarding depositions and other strategy issues (.4);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
551	Spear, Ryan M.	5/10/2015	0.50	\$500.00	\$250.00	\$410.00		\$205.00			Review and respond to emails with T. Marino regarding document review (.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
552	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/10/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Correspond with team about depositions;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
553	Branch, Aria C.	5/11/2015	4.30	\$380.00	\$1,634.00	\$345.00		\$1,483.50			Manage discovery;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
554	Roberts, Rachel M.	5/11/2015	4.25	\$125.00	\$531.25	\$125.00		\$531.25			Finalize production of transcribed DVDs (.3); Finalize deposition exhibits and correspond with B. Spiva and A. Callais re: same (3.15); prepare a copy of the exhibits to be sent to K. Hamilton in Seattle (.5); Discuss review of technical issue documents with A. Branch (.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
555	Spear, Ryan M.	5/11/2015	2.30	\$500.00	\$1,150.00	\$410.00		\$943.00			Prepare for conference with litigation team regarding depositions, document review, exhibit lists, and other strategy issues (.3); confer with litigation team regarding same (.9); confer with potential witness regarding deposition (.5); review email from J. McClellan regarding deposition scheduling (.1); review and respond to emails with T. Marino and A. Branch regarding review of documents (.3); review and respond to emails with B. Stafford and R. Roberts regarding deposition of potential witness (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
556	Marino, Patricia	5/12/2015	5.00	\$220.00	\$1,100.00	\$190.00		\$950.00			Compile/organize potential deposition / trial preparation materials for attorneys' further evaluation and update index (4.7); conference with R. Spear regarding database/supplemental witness searches (.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
557	Roberts, Rachel M.	5/12/2015	3.10	\$125.00	\$387.50	\$125.00		\$387.50			Discuss upload of videos to Concordance with R. Caling (.2); locate document families within Marston Dep Prep documents as identified by A. Callais (2.4); Start creating production log (.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
558	Spear, Ryan M.	5/12/2015	1.70	\$500.00	\$850.00	\$410.00		\$697.00			Confer with T. Marino regarding document review (.2); review and respond to emails with A. Khanna regarding deposition of C. Jones (.1); review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton regarding same (.2); coordinate deposition scheduling, including scheduling of W. Armstrong deposition (.8); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding analysis of alternative maps (.2); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding review of technical issue documents (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
559	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/12/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Correspond with R. Spear about depositions;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
560	Branch, Aria C.	5/13/2015	0.60	\$380.00	\$228.00	\$345.00		\$207.00			Resolve technical issue documents;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
561	Callais, Amanda R.	5/13/2015	2.90	\$380.00	\$1,102.00	\$345.00		\$1,000.50			Draft Marston deposition outline (2.9);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
562	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/13/2015	1.50	\$620.00	\$930.00	\$575.00		\$862.50			Exchange email regarding staffing for upcoming depositions and related issues (1.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
563	Marino, Patricia	5/13/2015	3.80	\$220.00	\$836.00	\$190.00		\$722.00			Review/compile/organize potential deposition / trial preparation materials for attorneys' further evaluation and update index (3.8);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
564	Roberts, Rachel M.	5/13/2015	5.50	\$125.00	\$687.50	\$125.00		\$687.50			Work on production log (3.5); review flash drives of newly produced documents and discuss same with R. Caling and A. Branch (.7); work on deposition logistics for the week starting 5/18 and update calendar to reflect same (.9); locate document families for potential exhibits in Marston Deposition and discuss same with A. Callais (.4);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
565	Spear, Ryan M.	5/13/2015	2.20	\$500.00	\$1,100.00	\$410.00		\$902.00			Review and respond to emails with J. Walrath regarding documents of delegates who waived legislative privilege (.2); coordinate deposition scheduling for R. Tyler and coordinate logistics and staffing for various depositions (.8); review and respond to emails with J. Walrath regarding same (.1); review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton regarding resolution of discovery disputes (.2); gather information regarding same (.1); review and respond to emails with D. Glass regarding same (.1); prepare and serve amended notice of deposition for W. Armstrong (.3); review and respond to emails with J. Walrath regarding production of documents regarding delegates who waived legislative privilege (.2); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding document review (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
566	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/13/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with team about Armstrong and other depositions;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
567	Stafford, William B.	5/13/2015	2.00	\$495.00	\$990.00	\$405.00		\$810.00			Prepare deposition materials for R. Tyler deposition (1.7); finalize W. Armstrong deposition preparation (.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
568	Branch, Aria C.	5/14/2015	0.60	\$380.00	\$228.00	\$345.00		\$207.00			Review discovery attorney comments regarding video review and review video (0.6);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
569	Callais, Amanda R.	5/14/2015	11.90	\$380.00	\$4,522.00	\$345.00		\$4,105.50			Draft Marston deposition outline (10.8); Update McClellan deposition outline (.8); Confer with B. Spiva, R. Spear, and R. Roberts about deposition prep schedule (.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
570	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/14/2015	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Conference with R. Spear regarding deposition scheduling and related (.9);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
571	Marino, Patricia	5/14/2015	8.00	\$220.00	\$1,760.00	\$190.00		\$1,520.00			Review/compile/organize potential deposition / trial preparation materials for attorneys' further evaluation (7.7); conference with B. Stafford regarding R. Tyler deposition preparation and related follow-up (.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
572	Roberts, Rachel M.	5/14/2015	6.10	\$125.00	\$762.50	\$125.00		\$762.50			Prepare deposition exhibits and attorney notebooks for Hood and Marston and discuss same with A. Callais and J. Winovich (2.5); Work on production log (2.4); Arrange logistics for depositions taking place next week (.5); review video files in Concordance to ensure completeness of upload and discuss same with R. Caling (.7);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
573	Spear, Ryan M.	5/14/2015	3.20	\$500.00	\$1,600.00	\$410.00		\$1,312.00			Review supplemental subpoena responses and objections by J. Morgan and C. Marston (.2); coordinate scheduling of W. Armstrong deposition (.3); review and respond to emails with B. Spiva regarding discovery issues (.2); review and respond to emails with A. Callais regarding R. Dance deposition (.1); prepare and serve amended notices of deposition for R. Tyler, R. Dance, and J. McClellan (.5); review and respond to emails with opposing counsel regarding same (.2); review and respond to emails with opposing counsel regarding R. Tyler, R. Dance, and J. McClellan depositions (.2); review and respond to emails with W. Armstrong regarding deposition (.1); prepare and serve amended notice of deposition for W. Armstrong (.3); update litigation team regarding deposition scheduling and staffing (.2); review and respond to emails with J. Walrath regarding supplemental production and supplemental privilege logs (.1); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding loading and review of supplemental production (.1); review supplemental production (.7);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
574	Stafford, William B.	5/14/2015	3.50	\$495.00	\$1,732.50	\$405.00		\$1,417.50			Prepare deposition materials for R. Tyler and R. Dance depositions;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
575	Callais, Amanda R.	5/15/2015	2.40	\$380.00	\$912.00	\$345.00		\$828.00			Confer with R. Roberts about changes to Marston deposition outline and documents (1); Review and edit Marston deposition outline (1.1); Read, review, and respond to emails about additional documents produced for Marston deposition (.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
576	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/15/2015	2.40	\$620.00	\$1,488.00	\$575.00		\$1,380.00			Conference with R. Spear regarding delegate depositions and related issues (1.2); review staffing and preparation for coming depositions (.9); coordinate with M. Elias regarding same (.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
577	Marino, Patricia	5/15/2015	4.50	\$220.00	\$990.00	\$190.00		\$855.00			Review/compile/organize potential deposition / trial preparation materials regarding witnesses R. Tyler and W. Armstrong per attorney direction (4.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
578	Roberts, Rachel M.	5/15/2015	12.60	\$125.00	\$1,575.00	\$125.00		\$1,575.00			Prepare Marston deposition exhibits (11.4); discuss issues with video upload to Concordance with R. Caling (.5); Update deposition schedule and discuss same with J. Winovich (.4); Confirm logistics for next week's depositions with court reporters and law firms (.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
579	Spear, Ryan M.	5/15/2015	5.00	\$500.00	\$2,500.00	\$410.00		\$2,050.00			Review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding production of Division of Legislative Services documents (.2); review and respond to emails with A. Callais regarding J. McClellan deposition preparation (.2); review and respond to emails with B. Stafford regarding R. Tyler deposition preparation (.1); review and respond to emails with R. Roberts regarding deposition staffing and logistics (.2); review and revise R. Tyler deposition outline (.9); review exhibits regarding same (.9); review documents for W. Armstrong deposition (1.2); prepare binder regarding same (.2); review and respond to emails with R. Dance regarding deposition (.1); review and respond to emails from W. Armstrong regarding deposition (.1); review and respond to emails with opposing counsel regarding deposition of C. Marston (.1); prepare and circulate memorandum regarding House's supplemental production (.7); review and respond to emails with R. Roberts regarding letters withdrawing notices of deposition (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
580	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/15/2015	1.20	\$600.00	\$720.00	\$575.00		\$690.00			Prepare for Marston deposition;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
581	Stafford, William B.	5/15/2015	3.40	\$495.00	\$1,683.00	\$405.00		\$1,377.00			Draft deposition outline for R. Tyler deposition and exchange correspondence with R. Spear regarding same (2.4); review documents for purposes of R. Dance deposition preparation (1.0);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
582	Marino, Patricia	5/16/2015	0.80	\$220.00	\$176.00	\$190.00		\$152.00			Compile/organize supplemental witness preparation materials per attorney instruction (.8);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
583	Spear, Ryan M.	5/16/2015	2.10	\$500.00	\$1,050.00	\$410.00		\$861.00			Prepare R. Tyler deposition outline (1.6); review exhibits regarding same (.2); review and respond to emails with B. Stafford regarding same (.2); review and respond to emails with B. Stafford regarding R. Dance deposition preparation (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
584	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/16/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Prepare for Marston deposition;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
585	Stafford, William B.	5/16/2015	1.30	\$495.00	\$643.50	\$405.00		\$526.50			Prepare deposition materials for R. Tyler deposition and exchange correspondence with R. Spear regarding same (.8); prepare materials for R. Dance deposition (.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
586	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/17/2015	4.10	\$620.00	\$2,542.00	\$575.00		\$2,357.50			Review recently produced materials and email B. Spiva and R. Spear regarding follow up (1.5); draft and circulate email regarding delegate depositions (.9); draft and circulate email to B. Spiva regarding Marston deposition (.9); review and respond to email regarding privilege assertions during delegate depositions (.8);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
587	Marino, Patricia	5/17/2015	0.20	\$220.00	\$44.00	\$190.00		\$38.00			Respond to attorney requests for information/documents (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
588	Roberts, Rachel M.	5/17/2015	0.40	\$125.00	\$50.00	\$125.00		\$50.00			Review and respond to emails re: preparing for Marston deposition (.4);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
589	Spear, Ryan M.	5/17/2015	1.50	\$500.00	\$750.00	\$410.00		\$615.00			Review and respond to emails with T. Marino regarding R. Tyler deposition preparation (.1); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding delegate depositions (.2); review and respond to emails with B. Stafford regarding maps (.1); review finalized stipulation regarding excluded witnesses (.1); review and respond to emails with J. Walrath regarding same (.1); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding deposition staffing (.1); email M. Spain regarding withdrawn deposition (.1); email R. Tavenner regarding withdrawn deposition (.1); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding review of videos (.1); review notes of document reviewers (.1); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding C. Marston deposition (.1); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding missing email attachments (.1); review and respond to emails with B. Spiva and K. Hamilton regarding potential privilege objections at depositions (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
590	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/17/2015	7.00	\$600.00	\$4,200.00	\$575.00		\$4,025.00			Prepare for Marston deposition;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
591	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/17/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with R. Spear about privilege assertions;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
592	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/17/2015	0.40	\$600.00	\$240.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Correspond with team about depositions;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
593	Branch, Aria C.	5/18/2015	1.00	\$380.00	\$380.00	\$345.00		\$345.00			Resolve supplemental production issues (0.4); watch floor debate to determine whether to get a transcript (.6);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
594	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/18/2015	2.50	\$620.00	\$1,550.00	\$575.00		\$1,437.50			Conference with R. Spear regarding preparation for delegate depositions and review related outlines (1.6); review and respond to email regarding discovery and remaining depositions (.9);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
595	Marino, Patricia	5/18/2015	2.00	\$220.00	\$440.00	\$190.00		\$380.00			Compile/organize documents in response to attorneys requests regarding R. Dance and R. Tyler deposition preparation (2.0);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
596	Roberts, Rachel M.	5/18/2015	4.30	\$125.00	\$537.50	\$125.00		\$537.50			Finalize preparations for Marston Deposition (1.45); Work on preparations for McClellan deposition (1); Discuss Tavenner production with R. Caling and A. Branch (.3); Work on deposition logistics (.8); get copies of DVD made for transcription (.3); Update production log (.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
597	Spear, Ryan M.	5/18/2015	7.40	\$500.00	\$3,700.00	\$410.00		\$3,034.00			Prepare for deposition of R. Tyler (2.5); review documents regarding same (1.2); review and respond to emails with B. Stafford regarding same (.2); prepare for deposition of W. Armstrong (2.3); review and respond to emails with J. Walrath regarding missing attachments to produced emails (.2); review and respond to emails with R. Roberts regarding cancellation of depositions (.3); review and respond to emails with J. Starr regarding communications with B. Rigney (.1); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding document review (.1); review and respond to emails with J. Walrath regarding scheduling of R. Dance deposition (.2); review and respond to emails with R. Dance regarding same (.1); review letters regarding cancelled depositions (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
598	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/18/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with R. Spear about missing documents/privilege issues;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
599	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/18/2015	4.50	\$600.00	\$2,700.00	\$575.00		\$2,587.50			Take Marston deposition;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
600	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/18/2015	4.00	\$600.00	\$2,400.00	\$575.00		\$2,300.00			Prepare for Marston deposition;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
601	Stafford, William B.	5/18/2015	1.80	\$495.00	\$891.00	\$405.00		\$729.00			Prepare notice of deposition and subpoena for Dr. Katz deposition (.9); prepare stipulation regarding extension of discovery to allow Dr. Katz deposition (.9);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
602	Callais, Amanda R.	5/19/2015	0.30	\$380.00	\$114.00	\$345.00		\$103.50			Review and collect documents for McClellan deposition (.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
603	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/19/2015	2.70	\$620.00	\$1,674.00	\$575.00		\$1,552.50			Conference with R. Spear regarding delegate depositions (1.2); review and respond to email regarding response to subpoena and related document production (.9); coordinate deposition logistics in Los Angeles (.6);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
604	Marino, Patricia	5/19/2015	5.20	\$220.00	\$1,144.00	\$190.00		\$988.00			Compile/organize R. Dance deposition preparation and potential trial exhibit materials for attorneys' further evaluation (5.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
605	Roberts, Rachel M.	5/19/2015	4.00	\$125.00	\$500.00	\$125.00		\$500.00			Prepare exhibits for McClellan deposition and send to R. Spear in Richmond (3); Finalize and send letters to witnesses re: canceled depositions (.5); discuss newly produced documents with R. Caling (.1); Work on deposition logistics (.4);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
606	Spear, Ryan M.	5/19/2015	8.90	\$500.00	\$4,450.00	\$410.00		\$3,649.00			Prepare for deposition of R. Tyler (2.0); depose R. Tyler (3.5); prepare for deposition of W. Armstrong (1.8); review documents regarding same (1.1); review and respond to emails with R. Roberts regarding exhibits for J. McClellan deposition (.1); review and respond to emails with T. Marino regarding exhibits for R. Dance deposition (.1); prepare update for litigation team regarding R. Tyler deposition (.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
607	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/19/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with R. Spear about depositions;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
608	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/19/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Review and sign correspondence to canceled deponents;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
609	Stafford, William B.	5/19/2015	3.20	\$495.00	\$1,584.00	\$405.00		\$1,296.00			Prepare deposition materials for R. Dance deposition and exchange correspondence with R. Spear and T. Marino regarding same (3.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
610	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/20/2015	1.20	\$620.00	\$744.00	\$575.00		\$690.00			Review and respond to email regarding delegate depositions and related issues (1.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
611	Marino, Patricia	5/20/2015	0.70	\$220.00	\$154.00	\$190.00		\$133.00			Review PTS index/summary of technical document issues and related follow-up (.7);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
612	Roberts, Rachel M.	5/20/2015	3.10	\$125.00	\$387.50	\$125.00		\$387.50			Work on production log (2.8); Discuss Tavenner flash drives with R. Caling (.2); Transmit deposition calendar to T. Marino (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
613	Spear, Ryan M.	5/20/2015	11.00	\$500.00	\$5,500.00	\$410.00		\$4,510.00			Prepare for deposition of W. Armstrong (.9); depose W. Armstrong (3.8); prepare for deposition of R. Dance (3.2); review documents regarding same (0.9); prepare for deposition of J. McClellan (1.8); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding missing attachments (.1); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding document production (.2); email J. Walrath regarding production of delegates' communications (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
614	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/21/2015	2.00	\$620.00	\$1,240.00	\$575.00		\$1,150.00			Telephone conference with R. Spear regarding delegate depositions (.8); review and respond to email regarding delegate depositions and related issues (1.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
615	Marino, Patricia	5/21/2015	0.80	\$220.00	\$176.00	\$190.00		\$152.00			Telephone conference with R. Calling and I. Balom regarding document database issues and related follow-up (.8);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
616	Roberts, Rachel M.	5/21/2015	2.40	\$125.00	\$300.00	\$125.00		\$300.00			Coordinate with R. Caling to get new production of email attachments uploaded, email legal team re: same (.8); write and transmit cover letter for courtesy copies of consent order (.6); receive and log disc of produced Marston documents, take same to R. Caling for upload (.5); Correspond with legal team about matching of newly produced attachments with parent emails, discuss same with R. Caling (.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
617	Spear, Ryan M.	5/21/2015	11.10	\$500.00	\$5,550.00	\$410.00		\$4,551.00			Prepare for deposition of R. Dance (2.3); review documents regarding same (.5); depose R. Dance (6.1); prepare for deposition of J. McClellan (1.7); confer with K. Hamilton and B. Spiva regarding R. Dance deposition and strategy issues (.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
618	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/21/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with R. Spear and K. Hamilton about Dance and McClellan depositions;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
619	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/21/2015	0.80	\$600.00	\$480.00	\$575.00		\$460.00			Telephone conference with K. Hamilton and R. Spear about depositions;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
620	Stafford, William B.	5/21/2015	0.30	\$495.00	\$148.50	\$405.00		\$121.50			Prepare deposition exhibits for R. Spear (.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
621	Branch, Aria C.	5/22/2015	0.60	\$380.00	\$228.00	\$345.00		\$207.00			Manage new discovery;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
622	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/22/2015	1.90	\$620.00	\$1,178.00	\$575.00		\$1,092.50			Review and respond to email from R. Spear and B. Spiva regarding delegate depositions and related issues (1.5); review R. Spear report on delegate depositions (.4);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
623	Marino, Patricia	5/22/2015	0.50	\$220.00	\$110.00	\$190.00		\$95.00			Respond to attorneys requests for information/documents (.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
624	Roberts, Rachel M.	5/22/2015	1.60	\$125.00	\$200.00	\$125.00		\$200.00			Work on production log (.5); Discuss loading of Tavenner production and newly produced email attachments with R. Caling and A. Branch (.4); Match up newly produced attachments with Marston emails (.7);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
625	Spear, Ryan M.	5/22/2015	7.10	\$500.00	\$3,550.00	\$410.00		\$2,911.00			Prepare for deposition of J. McClellan (0.8); review documents regarding same (.7); depose J. McClellan (5.2); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding objections and responses to subpoenas to C. Jones, C. Marston, and J. Morgan (.2); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding potential research projects (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
626	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/22/2015	0.40	\$600.00	\$240.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Review and revise letters to Intervenor and correspond with K. Hamilton about same;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
627	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/22/2015	0.40	\$600.00	\$240.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Confer with A. Callais about letters to Intervenor regarding documents;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
628	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/22/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with R. Spear about letters to Intervenor;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
629	Marino, Patricia	5/23/2015	1.30	\$220.00	\$286.00	\$190.00		\$247.00			Process deposition transcript materials and compile attorney working materials/file (1.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
630	Marino, Patricia	5/26/2015	2.80	\$220.00	\$616.00	\$190.00		\$532.00			Process deposition transcript materials and update attorney working materials/ litigation file (1.2); review/audit J. McClellan production of supplemental electronic documents and coordinate processing of data with PTS (1.6);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
631	Roberts, Rachel M.	5/26/2015	1.55	\$125.00	\$193.75	\$125.00		\$193.75			Email A. Branch re: production log (.25); discuss production database with R. Caling (.2); update production log (.8); email J. Bickford re: invoices for process service and discuss same with K. Guity (.3)	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
632	Spear, Ryan M.	5/26/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding review of J. McClellan documents (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
633	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/26/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Correspond with R. Spear and B. Stafford about Court's decision on motion to compel;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
634	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/26/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Review Court's decision on motion to compel;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
635	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/26/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Correspond with R. Roberts about deposition transcripts;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
636	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/27/2015	0.60	\$620.00	\$372.00	\$575.00		\$345.00			Review and respond to email regarding delegate depositions (.6);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
637	Roberts, Rachel M.	5/27/2015	1.10	\$125.00	\$137.50	\$125.00		\$137.50			File discovery and update production log with physical file locations (.9); discuss uploads to production database with R. Caling (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
638	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/27/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Correspond with J. Walrath about documents;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
639	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/27/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Correspond with R. Spear and A. Callais about documents;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
640	Stafford, William B.	5/27/2015	0.50	\$495.00	\$247.50	\$405.00		\$202.50			Exchange correspondence regarding dispositive motion deadline and discovery matters;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
641	Marino, Patricia	5/28/2015	1.00	\$220.00	\$220.00	\$190.00		\$190.00			Process deposition transcript materials and revise/update index/attorney working materials and litigation file (1.0);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
642	Roberts, Rachel M.	5/28/2015	4.90	\$125.00	\$612.50	\$125.00		\$612.50			Locate Murray email in Concordance and send to B. Spiva for review (.75);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
643	Spear, Ryan M.	5/28/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Review and respond to emails regarding review of J. McClellan documents (.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
644	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/28/2015	1.50	\$600.00	\$900.00	\$575.00		\$862.50			Read Court's order and opinion on legislative and attorney-client privilege issues;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
645	Branch, Aria C.	5/29/2015	1.00	\$380.00	\$380.00	\$345.00		\$345.00			Call regarding document review (0.2); review and draft email regarding producing FOIA documents (0.8);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
646	Marino, Patricia	5/29/2015	1.60	\$220.00	\$352.00	\$190.00		\$304.00			Respond to attorney requests for information/documents (1.0); process deposition transcript materials and update attorney working materials and litigation file (.6);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
647	Roberts, Rachel M.	5/29/2015	0.50	\$125.00	\$62.50	\$125.00		\$62.50			Transmit copies of deposition transcripts to trial team (.1); discuss uploading of new documents to Concordance with R. Caling (.2); update production log (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
648	Spear, Ryan M.	5/29/2015	0.40	\$500.00	\$200.00	\$410.00		\$164.00			Confer with document review team regarding review of J. McClellan documents (.3); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding production of documents (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
649	Spear, Ryan M.	5/30/2015	0.50	\$500.00	\$250.00	\$410.00		\$205.00			Review spreadsheet describing recently produced documents (.3); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding same (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
650	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/30/2015	0.40	\$600.00	\$240.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Review deposition;	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
651	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/31/2015	0.80	\$600.00	\$480.00	\$575.00		\$460.00			Review deposition transcripts;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
652	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/31/2015	0.90	\$600.00	\$540.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Review Marston documents and correspond with R. Roberts and A. Callais regarding same;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
653	Branch, Aria C.	6/1/2015	1.60	\$380.00	\$608.00	\$345.00		\$552.00			Manage discovery regarding production of FOIA documents to opposing counsel (1.0); manage other discovery (0.6);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
654	Marino, Patricia	6/1/2015	2.30	\$220.00	\$506.00	\$190.00		\$437.00			Respond to attorneys requests for information/documents and review/search database regarding same (1.0); process deposition transcripts and update attorneys' working materials/index and litigation file (.8); communications with PTS regarding database/document issues (.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
655	Roberts, Rachel M.	6/1/2015	1.40	\$125.00	\$175.00	\$125.00		\$175.00			Discuss production of FOIA documents to opposing counsel with A. Branch (.2); update production log (1.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
656	Spear, Ryan M.	6/1/2015	1.50	\$500.00	\$750.00	\$410.00		\$615.00			Review Tyler deposition transcript (.4); email team regarding same (.3); review and respond to emails with litigation team and court reporter regarding expedited deposition transcripts (.2); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding review of documents from Division of Legislative Services, Delegate McClellan, and Intervenor-Defendants (.6);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
657	Stafford, William B.	6/1/2015	0.50	\$495.00	\$247.50	\$405.00		\$202.50			Exchange correspondence with litigation team regarding discovery matters;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
658	Marino, Patricia	6/2/2015	3.20	\$220.00	\$704.00	\$190.00		\$608.00			Respond to attorneys requests for information/documents and review/search database regarding same (2.2); process deposition transcripts and update attorneys' working materials/index and litigation file (1.0);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
659	Roberts, Rachel M.	6/2/2015	1.60	\$125.00	\$200.00	\$125.00		\$200.00			Process invoices for service of subpoenas (.6); receive and log new document production (.75); Discuss locating email attachments in Concordance with A. Callais (.25);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
660	Spear, Ryan M.	6/2/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding review of supplemental production by Intervenor (.2); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding review of supplemental privilege logs from Intervenor (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
661	Callais, Amanda R.	6/3/2015	0.20	\$380.00	\$76.00	\$345.00		\$69.00			Draft email to R. Spear updating on results of document review;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
662	Marino, Patricia	6/3/2015	0.70	\$220.00	\$154.00	\$190.00		\$133.00			Compile/organize selected documents for attorneys further review/evaluation (.7);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
663	Roberts, Rachel M.	6/3/2015	0.55	\$125.00	\$68.75	\$125.00		\$68.75			Assemble binder of deposition transcripts for use by A. Branch (.55);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
664	Spear, Ryan M.	6/3/2015	0.60	\$500.00	\$300.00	\$410.00		\$246.00			Confer with B. Stafford regarding status and strategy, including deadlines for discovery (.3); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding same (.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
665	Marino, Patricia	6/4/2015	1.70	\$220.00	\$374.00	\$190.00		\$323.00			Respond to attorneys requests for information/documents (1.5); communications with PTS regarding document database issues (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
666	Roberts, Rachel M.	6/4/2015	0.55	\$125.00	\$68.75	\$125.00		\$68.75			Coordinate with court reporter and Seattle office to ensure copies of exhibits for Tyler and Dance depositions are complete (.55);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
667	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/4/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Correspond with R. Roberts about scheduling issues;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
668	Branch, Aria C.	6/5/2015	1.80	\$380.00	\$684.00	\$345.00		\$621.00			Manage document review (0.8); review Dance deposition transcript (1.0);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
669	Roberts, Rachel M.	6/5/2015	0.65	\$125.00	\$81.25	\$125.00		\$81.25			Save and log newly received discovery, email legal team and R. Caling re: upload and review of same (.65);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
670	Spear, Ryan M.	6/5/2015	1.00	\$500.00	\$500.00	\$410.00		\$410.00			Review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding new production (.2); confer with A. Branch regarding production of documents received from FOIA requests (.5); review materials regarding same (.1); review and respond to emails with B. Stafford regarding same (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
671	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/7/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Review deposition exhibits;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
672	Spear, Ryan M.	6/8/2015	2.40	\$500.00	\$1,200.00	\$410.00		\$984.00			Review new privilege logs (1.2); confer with A. Khanna regarding same (.2); confer with J. Walrath regarding same (.2); confer with J. Walrath regarding supplemental productions and response to proposed preliminary exhibits (.4); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding production of FOIA documents (.2); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding supplemental discovery responses by Intervenor (1); email T. Marino regarding background check on potential new plaintiff (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
673	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/8/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Review deposition exhibits;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
674	Marino, Patricia	6/9/2015	0.50	\$220.00	\$110.00	\$190.00		\$95.00			Process deposition transcript materials and update litigation file; (.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
675	Spear, Ryan M.	6/9/2015	1.80	\$500.00	\$900.00	\$410.00		\$738.00			Review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding supplemental discovery responses (.1); review supplemental discovery responses (.2); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding W. Armstrong (.2); review and respond to emails with B. Stafford regarding supplemental productions (.1); update litigation team regarding same (.1); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding production of videos (.2); coordinate production of same (.4); review background information on potential plaintiff (.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
676	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/9/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Correspond with team about documents produced pursuant to Judge Payne's order;	Fact Discovery - First Trial
677	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/10/2015	4.30	\$620.00	\$2,666.00	\$575.00		\$2,472.50			Review deposition transcript of Delegate McClellan (3.5); exchange email with R. Spear regarding same (.8);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
678	Marino, Patricia	6/10/2015	1.00	\$220.00	\$220.00	\$190.00		\$190.00			Coordinate processing/preparation of McClellan document production and related follow-up with PTS (1.0);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
679	Roberts, Rachel M.	6/10/2015	1.45	\$125.00	\$181.25	\$125.00		\$181.25			Order transcript of hearing (.2); confer with T. Marino, R. Caling, and A. Branch re: production of documents to opposing counsel (.4); prepare documents and videos to be produced (.85);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
680	Spear, Ryan M.	6/10/2015	0.60	\$500.00	\$300.00	\$410.00		\$246.00			Coordinate production of documents produced by J. McClellan (.3); coordinate production of miscellaneous documents to opposing counsel (.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
681	Roberts, Rachel M.	6/11/2015	5.30	\$125.00	\$662.50	\$125.00		\$662.50			Prepare and finalize production of 4/25/11 video and transcripts as well as McClellan documents, transmit same to opposing counsel (5.3);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
682	Spear, Ryan M.	6/11/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Review and respond to emails with opposing counsel regarding production of miscellaneous documents (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
683	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/12/2015	3.70	\$620.00	\$2,294.00	\$575.00		\$2,127.50			Review deposition of Delegate Dance and related email (2.2); review deposition of J. Morgan and related email (1.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
684	Roberts, Rachel M.	6/12/2015	0.70	\$125.00	\$87.50	\$125.00		\$87.50			Update production tracking log (.7);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
685	Spear, Ryan M.	6/12/2015	0.50	\$500.00	\$250.00	\$410.00		\$205.00			Review and respond to emails with W. Armstrong regarding production of documents (.1); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding same (.1); review Intervenor's letter to R. Dance (.1); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding same (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
686	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/13/2015	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Draft letter to court reporter correcting transcript of Morgan deposition (.4); review notes from delegate depositions (.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
687	Spear, Ryan M.	6/13/2015	0.10	\$500.00	\$50.00	\$410.00		\$41.00			Review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding document review (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
688	Marino, Patricia	6/14/2015	1.70	\$220.00	\$374.00	\$190.00		\$323.00			Process/organize deposition transcript materials and update litigation file (1.2); compile replacement deposition exhibit copies per court reporter request (.4); communications with PTS regarding database/export issue (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
689	Roberts, Rachel M.	6/15/2015	1.50	\$125.00	\$187.50	\$125.00		\$187.50			Correspond with T. Marino and R. Caling re: video production and resolves issues re: file copies of same (1.0); update production log (.5);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
690	Roberts, Rachel M.	6/18/2015	0.20	\$125.00	\$25.00	\$125.00		\$25.00			Draft email per R. Spear detailing discs produced on 6/11/15 (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
691	Spear, Ryan M.	6/18/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Review and respond to emails with J. Walrath regarding request for information about document production (.2);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
692	Marino, Patricia	6/26/2015	0.10	\$220.00	\$22.00	\$190.00		\$19.00			Communications with court reporters regarding deposition transcript materials (.1);	Fact Discovery - First Trial
693			1100.70		\$455,976.00			\$402,826.00				SUBTOTAL for Fact Discovery - First Trial
694	Khanna, Abha	2/10/2015	0.60	\$500.00	\$300.00	\$410.00		\$246.00			Telephone conference with S. Ansolabehere (.6);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
695	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/13/2015	0.10	\$475.00	\$47.50	\$390.00		\$39.00			Emails with A. Khanna and B. Stafford regarding expert deadlines;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
696	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/18/2015	0.10	\$475.00	\$47.50	\$390.00		\$39.00			Email from A. Khanna regarding expert report (.1);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
697	Hamilton, Kevin J.	2/18/2015	0.60	\$620.00	\$372.00	\$575.00		\$345.00			Review and respond to email regarding experts and related analysis (.6);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
698	Khanna, Abha	2/18/2015	0.50	\$500.00	\$250.00	\$410.00		\$205.00			Confer with S. Ansolabehere regarding expert report (.5);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
699	Khanna, Abha	2/25/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Confer with S. Ansolabehere regarding expert schedule (.1); send data to S. Ansolabehere in preparation for expert report (.1);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
700	Khanna, Abha	3/2/2015	0.60	\$500.00	\$300.00	\$410.00		\$246.00			Email and telephone conference with S. Ansolabehere regarding expert report (.2); review email from Defendants regarding designated experts (.2); email with legal team regarding same (.2);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
701	Khanna, Abha	3/4/2015	5.30	\$500.00	\$2,650.00	\$410.00		\$2,173.00			Review and revise draft expert report (5.0); telephone conferences with S. Ansolabehere regarding same (.3);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
702	Khanna, Abha	3/5/2015	3.40	\$500.00	\$1,700.00	\$410.00		\$1,394.00			Review and revise draft expert report (3.0); telephone conferences with S. Ansolabehere regarding same (.2); email with legal team regarding same (.2);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
703	Khanna, Abha	3/6/2015	0.80	\$500.00	\$400.00	\$410.00		\$328.00			Telephone conference with S. Ansolabehere regarding draft report (.8);	Expert Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
704	Khanna, Abha	3/9/2015	4.40	\$500.00	\$2,200.00	\$410.00		\$1,804.00			Email with S. Ansolabehere regarding draft expert report (.3); review and revise draft report (3.0); incorporate edits from B. Stafford (.8); email with B. Stafford regarding same (.2); email with S. Ansolabehere regarding edits and comments to draft report (.1);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
705	Stafford, William B.	3/9/2015	1.90	\$495.00	\$940.50	\$405.00		\$769.50			Review and revise expert report (1.7); exchange correspondence with A. Khanna regarding same (.2);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
706	Khanna, Abha	3/10/2015	6.20	\$500.00	\$3,100.00	\$410.00		\$2,542.00			Telephone conferences with S. Ansolabehere regarding draft report (1.0); review and revise latest draft (4.0); circulate comments and edits regarding same (.4); incorporate comments and edits from B. Stafford regarding same (.8);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
707	Stafford, William B.	3/10/2015	1.80	\$495.00	\$891.00	\$405.00		\$729.00			Conference with A. Khanna regarding expert report and revise same (1.8);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
708	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/11/2015	1.40	\$620.00	\$868.00	\$575.00		\$805.00			Conference with A. Khanna regarding discovery responses, expert report and related issues (.9); review draft expert report (.3); review related email (.2);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
709	Khanna, Abha	3/11/2015	5.90	\$500.00	\$2,950.00	\$410.00		\$2,419.00			Review, revise, and finalize expert report and all attendant documentd (5.0); email and telephone conferences with S. Ansolabehere regarding same (.3); circulate same to all counsel (.3); confer with K. Hamilton regarding expert report, case strategy, and staffing (.3);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
710	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/12/2015	0.30	\$475.00	\$142.50	\$390.00		\$117.00			Review of expert report (.2); emails with K. Hamilton, A. Khanna, M. Elias, A. Branch, B. Stafford, J. Kaul and B. Spiva regarding expert witness (.1);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
711	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/12/2015	1.30	\$620.00	\$806.00	\$575.00		\$747.50			Review draft expert report and exchange related email (1.3);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
712	Khanna, Abha	3/12/2015	1.20	\$500.00	\$600.00	\$410.00		\$492.00			Review proposed revisions by S. Ansolabehere to expert report (.5); telephone conference with him regarding same (.7);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
713	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/13/2015	1.40	\$620.00	\$868.00	\$575.00		\$805.00			Review draft expert report and conference with A. Khanna regarding same (1.4);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
714	Roberts, Rachel M.	3/16/2015	2.00	\$125.00	\$250.00	\$125.00		\$250.00			Assembled expert report binder (2.0);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
715	Khanna, Abha	3/17/2015	1.60	\$500.00	\$800.00	\$410.00		\$656.00			Review emails with testifying expert to determine discoverable communications (0.8); telephone conference with S. Ansolabehere regarding same (0.5); email with E. Gonzalez regarding same and production of documents (0.3)	Expert Discovery - First Trial
716	Khanna, Abha	3/18/2015	0.40	\$500.00	\$200.00	\$410.00		\$164.00			Email with S. Ansolabehere regarding deposition availability (0.1); email with legal team regarding same (0.1); research location of all named experts from all parties (0.2);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
717	Khanna, Abha	3/24/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Review S. Ansolabehere invoice (.1); telephone S. Ansolabehere regarding same (.1);	Expert Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
718	Khanna, Abha	4/1/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Email with Intervenor's counsel and S. Ansolabehere regarding deposition scheduling (0.2);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
719	Spear, Ryan M.	4/4/2015	1.40	\$500.00	\$700.00	\$410.00		\$574.00			Review plaintiffs' expert report (1.4);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
720	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/5/2015	0.60	\$620.00	\$372.00	\$575.00		\$345.00			Review and respond to email regarding expert reports (.6);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
721	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/6/2015	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Review and respond to email regarding expert depositions and reports (.9);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
722	Khanna, Abha	4/7/2015	0.10	\$500.00	\$50.00	\$410.00		\$41.00			Email with R. Spear regarding J. Katz background materials (0.1);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
723	Spear, Ryan M.	4/7/2015	0.40	\$500.00	\$200.00	\$410.00		\$164.00			Gather materials regarding expert witness J. Katz (0.3); review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton regarding same (0.1);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
724	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/8/2015	1.90	\$620.00	\$1,178.00	\$575.00		\$1,092.50			Review expert reports (1.2); exchange email regarding same (.7);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
725	Khanna, Abha	4/8/2015	0.90	\$500.00	\$450.00	\$410.00		\$369.00			Review and revise expert deposition subpoenas and document requests (0.5); email and confer with R. Spear regarding same and regarding privilege issues with Intervenor's (0.4);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
726	Spear, Ryan M.	4/8/2015	0.50	\$500.00	\$250.00	\$410.00		\$205.00			Review notice of deposition for S. Ansolabehere (0.1); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding same (0.2); serve notices and subpoenas for expert witnesses on opposing counsel (0.2);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
727	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/9/2015	1.20	\$620.00	\$744.00	\$575.00		\$690.00			Review and respond to email regarding expert deposition scheduling and division of responsibilities (1.2);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
728	Roberts, Rachel M.	4/9/2015	0.30	\$125.00	\$37.50	\$125.00		\$37.50			Update B. Spiva calendar with expert deposition dates (.3);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
729	Spear, Ryan M.	4/9/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Review and respond to emails with opposing counsel regarding scheduling of J. Katz expert deposition (0.1); email K. Hamilton regarding same (0.1); email S. Ansolabehere regarding notice of deposition (0.1);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
730	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/9/2015	1.10	\$600.00	\$660.00	\$575.00		\$632.50			Correspond with team about expert depositions and legislative privilege;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
731	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/10/2015	2.10	\$620.00	\$1,302.00	\$575.00		\$1,207.50			Review and respond to email regarding expert deposition scheduling and division of responsibilities (1.2); review expert reports and initial analysis of the same (.9);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
732	Khanna, Abha	4/10/2015	2.20	\$500.00	\$1,100.00	\$410.00		\$902.00			Review expert report of T. Hofeller (1.2); research and draft email summary of response to same and circulate to legal team (1.0);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
733	Spear, Ryan M.	4/10/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Review A. Khanna analysis regarding T. Hofeller expert report (0.3);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
734	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/11/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Read Ansolabehere expert report;	Expert Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
735	Khanna, Abha	4/12/2015	2.10	\$500.00	\$1,050.00	\$410.00		\$861.00			Telephone conference with S. Ansolabehere regarding Defendants' and intervenors' expert reports (0.3); review expert report of Dr. Hood (1.3); draft email summary of response to same (0.5);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
736	Khanna, Abha	4/13/2015	1.80	\$500.00	\$900.00	\$410.00		\$738.00			Review J. Katz report (1.2); draft and circulate email to legal team regarding response to same (0.4); telephone conference with S. Ansolabehere regarding same (0.2);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
737	Spear, Ryan M.	4/13/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Review and respond to emails with opposing counsel regarding scheduling of J. Katz deposition (0.2);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
738	Khanna, Abha	4/14/2015	1.60	\$500.00	\$800.00	\$410.00		\$656.00			Telephone conference with S. Ansolabehere regarding reply expert report (1.1); review summaries of opposing expert reports in preparation for same (0.5);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
739	Khanna, Abha	4/16/2015	1.00	\$500.00	\$500.00	\$410.00		\$410.00			Draft summary outline for reply expert report and circulate to legal team (0.8); email with legal team regarding communications with expert (0.2);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
740	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/17/2015	0.80	\$620.00	\$496.00	\$575.00		\$460.00			Review email from A. Khanna regarding reply expert reports (.5); exchange email with S. Ansolabehere (.3);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
741	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/20/2015	2.30	\$620.00	\$1,426.00	\$575.00		\$1,322.50			Conference with A. Khanna regarding expert reports (.8); prepare for and participate in telephone conference with S. Ansolabehere regarding reply report (1.5);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
742	Khanna, Abha	4/20/2015	4.00	\$500.00	\$2,000.00	\$410.00		\$1,640.00			Telephone conferences with S. Ansolabehere regarding draft expert report (1.1); review and provide suggested edits and comments to S. Ansolabehere draft report (2.6); confer with K. Hamilton and R. Spear regarding same (0.3);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
743	Spear, Ryan M.	4/20/2015	1.40	\$500.00	\$700.00	\$410.00		\$574.00			Confer with E. Frost regarding contacting Delegate (.2); confer with K. Hamilton, A. Khanna, and expert regarding reply expert report (1.0); review and respond to emails with D. Glass regarding scheduling J. Katz deposition (.2);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
744	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/21/2015	0.80	\$620.00	\$496.00	\$575.00		\$460.00			Review expert witness reports (.5); review expert scheduling (.3);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
745	Khanna, Abha	4/21/2015	1.50	\$500.00	\$750.00	\$410.00		\$615.00			Review and provide edits and comments to S. Ansolabehere draft rebuttal report (1.3); draft cover email and circulate same (0.2);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
746	Marino, Patricia	4/21/2015	2.90	\$220.00	\$638.00	\$190.00		\$551.00			Review/search concordance databases (1.4); draft protocol for export of hot documents from database (.7); telephone conference with R. Caling regarding database documents/coding and collection issues (.8);	Expert Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
747	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/22/2015	3.40	\$620.00	\$2,108.00	\$575.00		\$1,955.00			Review Ansolebehere report (1.2); review analysis of Ansolebehere report from A. Khanna (.4); review notes for preparation of reply report (.5); review draft of reply report (1.3);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
748	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/23/2015	2.90	\$620.00	\$1,798.00	\$575.00		\$1,667.50			Review S. Ansolebehere expert report and draft reply report (1.5); review comments regarding same (.9); exchange email with S. Ansolebehere regarding same (.5);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
749	Spear, Ryan M.	4/23/2015	0.90	\$500.00	\$450.00	\$410.00		\$369.00			confer with K. Hamilton regarding expert reply report (.2); review same (.5); research issues regarding service deadline for expert reply report (.2);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
750	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/24/2015	4.70	\$620.00	\$2,914.00	\$575.00		\$2,702.50			Review and revise draft Ansolebehere reply report (1.4); conference with R. Spear regarding revisions to reply report (.9); prepare for and telephone conference with S. Ansolebehere regarding reply report edits (1.2); organize expert reports and analysis of same in preparation for depositions (1.2);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
751	Spear, Ryan M.	4/24/2015	3.30	\$500.00	\$1,650.00	\$410.00		\$1,353.00			Review and revise expert reply report (2.7); confer with K. Hamilton and S. Ansolabehere regarding same (.5); serve same on opposing counsel (.1);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
752	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/25/2015	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review and respond to email from S. Ansolebehere regarding expert report and invoice (.5);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
753	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/26/2015	0.10	\$600.00	\$60.00	\$575.00		\$57.50			Correspond with R. Spear about reply expert report;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
754	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/26/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Review our expert's reply report;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
755	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/29/2015	1.20	\$620.00	\$744.00	\$575.00		\$690.00			Review expert reports in preparation for expert depositions (1.2);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
756	Callais, Amanda R.	4/30/2015	4.80	\$380.00	\$1,824.00	\$345.00		\$1,656.00			Read and analyze expert reports to prepare deposition outline and documents for T. Hofeller and T. Hood;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
757	Khanna, Abha	4/30/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Email with legal team regarding production of expert related documents;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
758	Spear, Ryan M.	4/30/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding production of S. Ansolabehere materials (.3);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
759	Callais, Amanda R.	5/1/2015	5.60	\$380.00	\$2,128.00	\$345.00		\$1,932.00			Read and review Hofeller expert report and outline questions for deposition (3.5); Read and review Hofeller documents and tag for deposition (1.6); Discussions with B. Spiva regarding deposition questions and outline preparation (.5);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
760	Roberts, Rachel M.	5/1/2015	0.40	\$125.00	\$50.00	\$125.00		\$50.00			Located Hofeller transcripts for B. Spiva review discussed same with A. Callais (.4);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
761	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/1/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with R. Roberts about Hofeller preparation;	Expert Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
762	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/1/2015	0.40	\$600.00	\$240.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Confer with J. Kaul and A. Callais about Hofeller testimony in other cases and protective orders;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
763	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/1/2015	0.90	\$600.00	\$540.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Confer with A. Callais about preparing for Hofeller deposition;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
764	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/1/2015	0.50	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review Hofeller deposition transcript;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
765	Callais, Amanda R.	5/2/2015	6.80	\$380.00	\$2,584.00	\$345.00		\$2,346.00			Review documents for Hofeller and Marston deposition prep (3.5); Review previous testimony of Hofeller and Hofeller report to draft questions for deposition outlines (3.3);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
766	Spear, Ryan M.	5/2/2015	0.50	\$500.00	\$250.00	\$410.00		\$205.00			Review expert report of T. Hofeller (.5);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
767	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/2/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Prepared for Hofeller deposition;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
768	Callais, Amanda R.	5/4/2015	4.70	\$380.00	\$1,786.00	\$345.00		\$1,621.50			Review Hofeller exhibits and report and begin drafting deposition outline (4.5); Meet with B. Spiva to discuss strategy on Hofeller deposition (.2);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
769	Callais, Amanda R.	5/5/2015	11.70	\$380.00	\$4,446.00	\$345.00		\$4,036.50			Prepare deposition outline (review expert reports and exhibits, review related caselaw, review underlying documents supporting expert report, draft questions) (9.3); confer with B. Spiva about deposition outline and questions (2); correspondence and meetings with R. Robertson about preparation of deposition binders for McClellan and Hofeller depositions (.4);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
770	Spear, Ryan M.	5/5/2015	0.10	\$500.00	\$50.00	\$410.00		\$41.00			Review and respond to emails with J. Walrath regarding scheduling of expert depositions (.1);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
771	Callais, Amanda R.	5/6/2015	7.80	\$380.00	\$2,964.00	\$345.00		\$2,691.00			Draft outline for Hofeller expert deposition (7.8);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
772	Callais, Amanda R.	5/7/2015	5.20	\$380.00	\$1,976.00	\$345.00		\$1,794.00			Draft Hofeller deposition outline (4.8); Read Hood expert report to prepare deposition outline (.4);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
773	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/7/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with A. Callais about Hofeller deposition (.3);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
774	Callais, Amanda R.	5/8/2015	5.40	\$380.00	\$2,052.00	\$345.00		\$1,863.00			Organize and prepare Hofeller deposition prep. exhibits for B. Spiva (1.3); Read, review, and analyze Hood expert report and Ansolabehere Reply to prepare Hood deposition outline (3.1); Draft deposition outline for Hood (1);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
775	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/8/2015	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Review notes for expert depositions (.9);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
776	Roberts, Rachel M.	5/8/2015	1.50	\$125.00	\$187.50	\$125.00		\$187.50			Prepare documents and potential exhibits for Hofeller deposition, discuss same with A. Callais (1.5);	Expert Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
777	Spear, Ryan M.	5/8/2015	4.40	\$500.00	\$2,200.00	\$410.00		\$1,804.00			Gather and analyze materials for S. Ansolabehere deposition preparation (3.6); review and respond to emails with J. Devaney, A. Khanna, and E. Frost regarding same (.5); review and respond to emails with B. Spiva and A. Callais regarding deposition of T. Hofeller (.1); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding cancellation of J. Katz deposition (.2);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
778	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/8/2015	3.20	\$600.00	\$1,920.00	\$575.00		\$1,840.00			Prepare for Hofeller deposition (3); correspond with S. Ansolabehere about questions for Hofeller deposition (.2);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
779	Callais, Amanda R.	5/9/2015	4.10	\$380.00	\$1,558.00	\$345.00		\$1,414.50			Drafted Hood deposition outline (4.1);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
780	Marino, Patricia	5/9/2015	0.50	\$220.00	\$110.00	\$190.00		\$95.00			Communications with R. Spear regarding S. Ansolabehere deposition preparation materials (.5);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
781	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/9/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Correspond with S. Ansolabehere;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
782	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/9/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Prepare for Hofeller deposition;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
783	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/9/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Correspond with A. Callais about Hofeller deposition;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
784	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/9/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Correspond with team about Katz being withdrawn and about depositions;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
785	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/10/2015	1.00	\$620.00	\$620.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Review Ansolabehere deposition preparation materials;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
786	Spear, Ryan M.	5/10/2015	1.60	\$500.00	\$800.00	\$410.00		\$656.00			Review and respond to emails with B. Spiva and K. Hamilton regarding cancellation of J. Katz deposition (.4); review J. Katz expert report regarding same (.6); review and respond to emails with B. Spiva and K. Hamilton regarding T. Hood expert report (.3); review and respond to emails with A. Khanna regarding S. Ansolabehere deposition (.3);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
787	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/10/2015	4.50	\$600.00	\$2,700.00	\$575.00		\$2,587.50			Prepare for Hofeller deposition;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
788	Callais, Amanda R.	5/11/2015	9.00	\$380.00	\$3,420.00	\$345.00		\$3,105.00			Draft Hood Deposition Outline (4.5); Call with S. Ansolabehere to discuss Hofeller Deposition (1); Follow-up call with B. Spiva to discuss finalizing deposition outline for Hofeller and exhibits (.5); Confer with R. Roberts about updated exhibits for Hofeller Deposition and map exhibits (1); Draft updated questions and topics for Hofeller Deposition outline (2);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
789	Callais, Amanda R.	5/11/2015	1.00	\$380.00	\$380.00	\$345.00		\$345.00			Read and analyze article drafted by T. Hofeller in preparation for his deposition;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
790	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/11/2015	8.90	\$620.00	\$5,518.00	\$575.00		\$5,117.50			Prepare for deposition of S. Ansolabehere (5.9); review expert reports (2.5); exchange email regarding preparation materials and outline (.5);	Expert Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
791	Khanna, Abha	5/11/2015	0.60	\$500.00	\$300.00	\$410.00		\$246.00			Email with legal team and R. Spear individually regarding S. Ansolabehere deposition preparation (0.4); review past hearing transcript and emails regarding use of J. Katz as testifying expert and email with legal team regarding same (0.2);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
792	Marino, Patricia	5/11/2015	9.80	\$220.00	\$2,156.00	\$190.00		\$1,862.00			Compile/organize potential deposition / trial preparation materials for attorneys' further evaluation and /update index (6.5); telephone conference with R. Spear, B. Stafford, A. Branch and B. Spiva regarding deposition/discovery action items and related follow-up (.9); telephone conference with I. Balom and R. Calling regarding database/technical document issues and related follow-up (1.0); respond to attorneys requests for information/documents and conduct supplemental database/deposition preparation searches for attorneys' further evaluation (1.4);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
793	Roberts, Rachel M.	5/11/2015	0.10	\$125.00	\$12.50	\$125.00		\$12.50			Confirm court reporter for Hofeller Deposition (.1);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
794	Spear, Ryan M.	5/11/2015	5.60	\$500.00	\$2,800.00	\$410.00		\$2,296.00			Confer with J. Walrath and D. Glass regarding deposition scheduling and status of expert witness J. Katz (.5); update litigation team regarding same (.5); confer with K. Hamilton regarding same (.3); review S. Ansolabehere deposition preparation materials for K. Hamilton (0.9); review and respond to emails with T. Marino regarding same (.1); prepare memorandum regarding S. Ansolabehere deposition for K. Hamilton (1.2); research issues regarding 2010 amendments to expert disclosure rules (1.5); prepare memorandum regarding same for K. Hamilton (.6);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
795	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/11/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with team about Katz cancellation;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
796	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/11/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Telephone conference with S. Ansolabehere about Hofeller deposition;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
797	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/11/2015	0.50	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Correspond with A. Callais about Hofeller deposition;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
798	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/11/2015	7.00	\$600.00	\$4,200.00	\$575.00		\$4,025.00			Prepare for Dr. Hofeller deposition;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
799	Callais, Amanda R.	5/12/2015	6.70	\$380.00	\$2,546.00	\$345.00		\$2,311.50			Confer with B. Spiva about T. Hofeller deposition and deposition strategy (2.5); Prepare B. Spiva for T. Hofeller deposition (1); Draft Hood Deposition outline (1.1); Review Hood documents for potential deposition exhibits (1.8); Draft and send email to R. Spear regarding deposition staffing (.3);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
800	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/12/2015	10.50	\$620.00	\$6,510.00	\$575.00		\$6,037.50			Deposition preparation with S. Ansolabehere;	Expert Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
801	Roberts, Rachel M.	5/12/2015	1.95	\$125.00	\$243.75	\$125.00		\$243.75			Finalize preparations for Hofeller deposition (1.65); research court reporter availability in Martinsville, VA (.3);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
802	Spear, Ryan M.	5/12/2015	0.50	\$500.00	\$250.00	\$410.00		\$205.00			Review draft deposition outline for T. Hofeller (.3); review and respond to emails with B. Spiva regarding same (.1); review and respond to emails with J. Walrath regarding T. Hood materials (.1);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
803	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/12/2015	0.10	\$600.00	\$60.00	\$575.00		\$57.50			Review M. Braden correspondence about Katz deposition;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
804	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/12/2015	0.80	\$600.00	\$480.00	\$575.00		\$460.00			Confer with A. Callais about Hofeller deposition;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
805	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/12/2015	5.00	\$600.00	\$3,000.00	\$575.00		\$2,875.00			Deposed Hofeller;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
806	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/12/2015	4.00	\$600.00	\$2,400.00	\$575.00		\$2,300.00			Prepare for Hofeller deposition;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
807	Callais, Amanda R.	5/13/2015	4.10	\$380.00	\$1,558.00	\$345.00		\$1,414.50			Review Hood articles for deposition preparation (.4); Draft Hood deposition outline (3.2); Draft email update to attorney team recapping Hofeller deposition (.5);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
808	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/13/2015	11.00	\$620.00	\$6,820.00	\$575.00		\$6,325.00			Prepare for and defend S. Ansolabehere deposition (8.0); conference with S. Ansolabehere regarding follow up items and deposition (1.5); report to team regarding Ansolabehere deposition (1.5);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
809	Roberts, Rachel M.	5/13/2015	0.90	\$125.00	\$112.50	\$125.00		\$112.50			Assemble and organize Hood deposition exhibits and discuss same with A. Callais (.9);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
810	Spear, Ryan M.	5/13/2015	0.70	\$500.00	\$350.00	\$410.00		\$287.00			Review emails with B. Spiva regarding T. Hofeller deposition (.1); review rough transcript of S. Ansolabehere deposition (.3); review case law regarding deposition of retained expert (.2); review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton and B. Spiva regarding same (.1);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
811	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/13/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Review and respond to emails concerning Katz;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
812	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/13/2015	1.50	\$600.00	\$900.00	\$575.00		\$862.50			Prepare for Hood deposition;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
813	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/13/2015	0.40	\$600.00	\$240.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Revise and send summary of Hofeller deposition to team;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
814	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/13/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Confer with A. Callais about Hood deposition;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
815	Callais, Amanda R.	5/14/2015	2.50	\$380.00	\$950.00	\$345.00		\$862.50			Draft and update Hood deposition outline (2); Call with S. Ansolabehere to discuss Hood deposition (.5);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
816	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/14/2015	2.00	\$620.00	\$1,240.00	\$575.00		\$1,150.00			Review and respond to various emails regarding discovery dispute over J. Katz deposition (.9); compile information in preparation for J. Katz deposition (1.1);	Expert Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
817	Spear, Ryan M.	5/14/2015	1.10	\$500.00	\$550.00	\$410.00		\$451.00			Review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding J. Katz and potential motion in limine (.3); confer with J. Walrath regarding J. Katz (.2); review deposition outline for T. Hood (.5); email B. Spiva and A. Callais regarding same (.1);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
818	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/14/2015	7.00	\$600.00	\$4,200.00	\$575.00		\$4,025.00			Prepare for T. Hood deposition;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
819	Elias, Marc E.	5/15/2015	0.50	\$735.00	\$367.50	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review Katz deposition issue and objections to same (.4); email regarding same (.1);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
820	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/15/2015	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Exchange related email regarding Katz deposition and deposition preparation (.9);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
821	Spear, Ryan M.	5/15/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding discovery dispute regarding J. Katz (.1); review transcript of hearing regarding same (.2);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
822	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/15/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with team about Katz hearing;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
823	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/15/2015	0.40	\$600.00	\$240.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Review transcript of hearing on Katz;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
824	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/15/2015	2.00	\$600.00	\$1,200.00	\$575.00		\$1,150.00			Prepare to depose T. Hood;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
825	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/15/2015	4.00	\$600.00	\$2,400.00	\$575.00		\$2,300.00			Depose T. Hood;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
826	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/16/2015	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review and organize material for J. Katz deposition;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
827	Spear, Ryan M.	5/17/2015	0.10	\$500.00	\$50.00	\$410.00		\$41.00			Review and respond to emails with J. Walrath regarding scheduling of J. Katz deposition (.1);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
828	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/18/2015	2.40	\$620.00	\$1,488.00	\$575.00		\$1,380.00			Review expert reports and prepare for expert depositions (1.5); exchange email regarding scheduling of Dr. Katz deposition (.9);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
829	Spear, Ryan M.	5/18/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Review and respond to emails with opposing counsel regarding scheduling of deposition of J. Katz (.1); review and respond to emails with B. Stafford regarding amended notice of deposition for J. Katz (.1);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
830	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/18/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Correspond with K. Hamilton and R. Spear about Katz deposition;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
831	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/19/2015	1.20	\$620.00	\$744.00	\$575.00		\$690.00			Review and respond to email regarding Dr. Katz deposition (1.2);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
832	Roberts, Rachel M.	5/19/2015	0.20	\$125.00	\$25.00	\$125.00		\$25.00			Send Katz materials to K. Hamilton in Seattle (.2);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
833	Spear, Ryan M.	5/19/2015	0.10	\$500.00	\$50.00	\$410.00		\$41.00			Review and respond to emails with B. Stafford regarding scheduling of J. Katz deposition (.1);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
834	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/20/2015	5.20	\$620.00	\$3,224.00	\$575.00		\$2,990.00			Review Katz expert report in preparation for deposition (2.5); review Ansolabehere reply report in preparation for Katz deposition (1.9); review and respond to email regarding Katz deposition scheduling and related issues (.8);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
835	Roberts, Rachel M.	5/20/2015	0.20	\$125.00	\$25.00	\$125.00		\$25.00			Cancel room and court reporter for Katz deposition (.2);	Expert Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
836	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/20/2015	1.20	\$600.00	\$720.00	\$575.00		\$690.00			Review Hofeller transcript and advise regarding same;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
837	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/20/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Review K. Hamilton email regarding experts;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
838	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/21/2015	0.60	\$620.00	\$372.00	\$575.00		\$345.00			Compile material for Katz deposition (.6);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
839	Callais, Amanda R.	5/22/2015	3.00	\$380.00	\$1,140.00	\$345.00		\$1,035.00			Read and review responses to requests for production and deposition transcripts for Hofeller, Hood, Jones, and Morgan to determine if additional discovery requests necessary (.7); confer with B. Spiva and R. Spear regarding same (.1); draft discovery letter for Hofeller and Hood (1.1); read and respond to email correspondence regarding status of discovery letter (.2);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
840	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/22/2015	2.40	\$620.00	\$1,488.00	\$575.00		\$1,380.00			Review Katz report in preparation for deposition (.5); draft examination outline for Katz deposition (1.5); coordinate meeting with S. Ansolabehere (.4);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
841	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/22/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Correspond with B. Stafford about Katz;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
842	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/22/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Correspond with K. Hamilton about Katz deposition;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
843	Stafford, William B.	5/22/2015	2.30	\$495.00	\$1,138.50	\$405.00		\$931.50			Draft correspondence regarding Dr. Katz (.4); draft factual stipulation (1.0); research ecological inference/regression case law and prepare summary for K. Hamilton (.9);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
844	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/23/2015	1.00	\$620.00	\$620.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Review and respond to email regarding expert witness deposition of J. Katz (.5); review related materials (.5);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
845	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/26/2015	4.60	\$620.00	\$2,852.00	\$575.00		\$2,645.00			Conference with S. Ansolabehere regarding Katz deposition and related issues (3.2); outline Katz deposition (.5); identify potential exhibits for Katz deposition (.9);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
846	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/27/2015	9.80	\$620.00	\$6,076.00	\$575.00		\$5,635.00			Review order granting motion to compel (2.1); prepare for and telephone conference with litigation team regarding motion to compel, Katz deposition, and related trial preparation activities (1.5 hours); prepare for deposition of J. Katz (6.2);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
847	Khanna, Abha	5/27/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Email with legal team in preparation for J. Katz deposition;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
848	Spear, Ryan M.	5/27/2015	2.30	\$500.00	\$1,150.00	\$410.00		\$943.00			Confer with K. Hamilton and B. Spiva regarding status and strategy issues, including J. Katz deposition (.3); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding same (.2); review and respond to emails with opposing counsel regarding J. Katz deposition (.1); review J. Katz production (1.1); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding same (.2); review J. Katz deposition outline (.4);	Expert Discovery - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
849	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/28/2015	6.50	\$620.00	\$4,030.00	\$575.00		\$3,737.50			Prepare for and take deposition of J. Katz (4.6); telephone conference with litigation team regarding deposition of J. Katz (1.9);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
850	Spear, Ryan M.	5/28/2015	0.40	\$500.00	\$200.00	\$410.00		\$164.00			Review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton and B. Stafford regarding J. Katz deposition (.2); review and respond to emails with review team regarding review of documents produced by experts (.2);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
851	Stafford, William B.	5/28/2015	2.80	\$495.00	\$1,386.00	\$405.00		\$1,134.00			Prepare additional analysis of Dr. Katz' EI data for purposes of Dr. Katz' deposition and conference with K. Hamilton, R. Spear, and S. Ansolabehere regarding same (2.8);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
852	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/29/2015	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Review notes from J. Katz deposition (.5); conference with M. Elias regarding deposition of J. Katz (.4);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
853	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/2/2015	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review S. Ansolabehere report (.5);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
854	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/8/2015	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Email with S. Ansolabehere regarding Page decision (.9);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
855	Roberts, Rachel M.	6/12/2015	0.15	\$125.00	\$18.75	\$125.00		\$18.75			Follow-up with Planet Depos re: Katz deposition transcript (.15);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
856	Spear, Ryan M.	6/12/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Review and respond to emails with opposing counsel regarding J. Katz deposition (.2);	Expert Discovery - First Trial
857	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/18/2015	0.40	\$600.00	\$240.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Review corrected Hofeller report and exhibit;	Expert Discovery - First Trial
858			340.80		\$171,273.50			\$154,530.50				SUBTOTAL for Expert Discovery - First Trial
859	Roberts, Rachel M.	3/18/2015	1.25	\$125.00	\$156.25	\$125.00		\$156.25			Research Department of Justice retrogression regulations per A. Branch (.75); review exhibits from Page v. Virginia State Board of Elections for documents relevant to retrogression (.5);	Document Review - First Trial
860	Khanna, Abha	4/2/2015	0.50	\$500.00	\$250.00	\$410.00		\$205.00			Review and revise document review memo circulated A. Branch (0.4); email with A. Branch regarding same and document review protocols (0.1);	Document Review - First Trial
861	Branch, Aria C.	4/3/2015	4.60	\$380.00	\$1,748.00	\$345.00		\$1,587.00			Finalize document review protocols (1.0); manage discovery (3.6);	Document Review - First Trial
862	Branch, Aria C.	4/4/2015	0.40	\$380.00	\$152.00	\$345.00		\$138.00			Finalize document review protocols (0.4);	Document Review - First Trial
863	Branch, Aria C.	4/7/2015	1.20	\$380.00	\$456.00	\$345.00		\$414.00			Prepare for document review launch call (0.4); document review launch call (0.8);	Document Review - First Trial
864	Foster, Molly L.	4/7/2015	0.70	\$125.00	\$87.50	\$125.00		\$87.50			Participate in conference with review team regarding matter overview and document review logistics;	Document Review - First Trial
865	Grimm, Lisa C.	4/7/2015	0.70	\$125.00	\$87.50	\$125.00		\$87.50			Participate in conference with review team regarding matter overview and document review logistics;	Document Review - First Trial
866	Harrison, Paul A.	4/7/2015	0.80	\$125.00	\$100.00	\$125.00		\$100.00			Participate in conference with review team regarding matter overview and document review logistics (0.8);	Document Review - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
867	Hegstrom, Donald	4/7/2015	0.70	\$125.00	\$87.50	\$125.00		\$87.50			Participate in conference with review team regarding document review procedures;	Document Review - First Trial
868	Lindstrom, Margret R.	4/7/2015	0.80	\$125.00	\$100.00	\$125.00		\$100.00			Participate in conference with review team regarding document review procedures;	Document Review - First Trial
869	Moore, Clinton J.	4/7/2015	1.50	\$125.00	\$187.50	\$125.00		\$187.50			Participate in conference with review team regarding matter overview and document review logistics (1.0); review background materials (.5);	Document Review - First Trial
870	Nye, Travis R.	4/7/2015	0.70	\$125.00	\$87.50	\$125.00		\$87.50			Participate in conference with review team regarding matter overview and document review logistics;	Document Review - First Trial
871	Ramirez, Jeanette L.	4/7/2015	1.00	\$125.00	\$125.00	\$125.00		\$125.00			Participate in conference with review team regarding matter overview and document review logistics (.6); review background materials (.4);	Document Review - First Trial
872	Schneider, Ariel L.	4/7/2015	1.20	\$125.00	\$150.00	\$125.00		\$150.00			Review background materials (0.3); participate in conference with review team regarding document review procedures (0.6);participate in conference with review team regarding matter overview and document review logistics (0.3);	Document Review - First Trial
873	Spear, Ryan M.	4/7/2015	0.50	\$500.00	\$250.00	\$410.00		\$205.00			Confer with document review team regarding document review parameters (0.5);	Document Review - First Trial
874	Stemmler, Alexandra	4/7/2015	0.70	\$125.00	\$87.50	\$125.00		\$87.50			Participate in conference with review team regarding matter overview and document review logistics.	Document Review - First Trial
875	Wolfe, Nicole E.	4/7/2015	0.70	\$125.00	\$87.50	\$125.00		\$87.50			Participate in conference with review team regarding matter overview and document review logistics;	Document Review - First Trial
876	Grimm, Lisa C.	4/8/2015	0.60	\$125.00	\$75.00	\$125.00		\$75.00			Review background materials;	Document Review - First Trial
877	Harrison, Paul A.	4/8/2015	2.10	\$125.00	\$262.50	\$125.00		\$262.50			Review background materials (2.1);	Document Review - First Trial
878	Moore, Clinton J.	4/8/2015	1.50	\$125.00	\$187.50	\$125.00		\$187.50			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
879	Nye, Travis R.	4/8/2015	0.80	\$125.00	\$100.00	\$125.00		\$100.00			Review background materials;	Document Review - First Trial
880	Wolfe, Nicole E.	4/8/2015	0.60	\$125.00	\$75.00	\$125.00		\$75.00			Review background materials;	Document Review - First Trial
881	Foster, Molly L.	4/9/2015	5.80	\$125.00	\$725.00	\$125.00		\$725.00			Review background materials (.7); review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment (5.1);	Document Review - First Trial
882	Grimm, Lisa C.	4/9/2015	8.60	\$125.00	\$1,075.00	\$125.00		\$1,075.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
883	Harrison, Paul A.	4/9/2015	10.00	\$125.00	\$1,250.00	\$125.00		\$1,250.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment (10.0);	Document Review - First Trial
884	Lindstrom, Margret R.	4/9/2015	5.90	\$125.00	\$737.50	\$125.00		\$737.50			Review background materials (0.8); review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment (5.1);	Document Review - First Trial
885	Moore, Clinton J.	4/9/2015	10.00	\$125.00	\$1,250.00	\$125.00		\$1,250.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
886	Nye, Travis R.	4/9/2015	8.00	\$125.00	\$1,000.00	\$125.00		\$1,000.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
887	Ramirez, Jeanette L.	4/9/2015	6.00	\$125.00	\$750.00	\$125.00		\$750.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
888	Schneier, Ariel L.	4/9/2015	6.80	\$125.00	\$850.00	\$125.00		\$850.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
889	Stemmler, Alexandra	4/9/2015	6.50	\$125.00	\$812.50	\$125.00		\$812.50			Review background materials (1.0); review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment (5.5);	Document Review - First Trial
890	Wolfe, Nicole E.	4/9/2015	8.10	\$125.00	\$1,012.50	\$125.00		\$1,012.50			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
891	Foster, Molly L.	4/10/2015	2.90	\$125.00	\$362.50	\$125.00		\$362.50			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
892	Grimm, Lisa C.	4/10/2015	6.90	\$125.00	\$862.50	\$125.00		\$862.50			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
893	Lindstrom, Margret R.	4/10/2015	8.40	\$125.00	\$1,050.00	\$125.00		\$1,050.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
894	Moore, Clinton J.	4/10/2015	2.00	\$125.00	\$250.00	\$125.00		\$250.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
895	Nye, Travis R.	4/10/2015	8.00	\$125.00	\$1,000.00	\$125.00		\$1,000.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
896	Ramirez, Jeanette L.	4/10/2015	10.00	\$125.00	\$1,250.00	\$125.00		\$1,250.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
897	Schneier, Ariel L.	4/10/2015	6.00	\$125.00	\$750.00	\$125.00		\$750.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
898	Stemmler, Alexandra	4/10/2015	6.00	\$125.00	\$750.00	\$125.00		\$750.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
899	Wolfe, Nicole E.	4/10/2015	10.00	\$125.00	\$1,250.00	\$125.00		\$1,250.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
900	Moore, Clinton J.	4/11/2015	6.00	\$125.00	\$750.00	\$125.00		\$750.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
901	Harrison, Paul A.	4/12/2015	7.00	\$125.00	\$875.00	\$125.00		\$875.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment (7.0);	Document Review - First Trial
902	Nye, Travis R.	4/12/2015	5.00	\$125.00	\$625.00	\$125.00		\$625.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
903	Wolfe, Nicole E.	4/12/2015	4.20	\$125.00	\$525.00	\$125.00		\$525.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
904	Harrison, Paul A.	4/13/2015	10.00	\$125.00	\$1,250.00	\$125.00		\$1,250.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment (10.0);	Document Review - First Trial
905	Lindstrom, Margret R.	4/13/2015	7.00	\$125.00	\$875.00	\$125.00		\$875.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
906	Moore, Clinton J.	4/13/2015	6.00	\$125.00	\$750.00	\$125.00		\$750.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
907	Nye, Travis R.	4/13/2015	5.50	\$125.00	\$687.50	\$125.00		\$687.50			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
908	Spear, Ryan M.	4/13/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding status of document review (0.3);	Document Review - First Trial
909	Wolfe, Nicole E.	4/13/2015	8.50	\$125.00	\$1,062.50	\$125.00		\$1,062.50			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
910	Lindstrom, Margret R.	4/14/2015	3.50	\$125.00	\$437.50	\$125.00		\$437.50			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
911	Nye, Travis R.	4/14/2015	0.50	\$125.00	\$62.50	\$125.00		\$62.50			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
912	Ramirez, Jeanette L.	4/14/2015	0.50	\$125.00	\$62.50	\$125.00		\$62.50			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
913	Wolfe, Nicole E.	4/14/2015	6.70	\$125.00	\$837.50	\$125.00		\$837.50			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
914	Branch, Aria C.	4/15/2015	1.30	\$380.00	\$494.00	\$345.00		\$448.50			Review key documents (.5); create chart of key documents (.8);	Document Review - First Trial
915	Frost, Elisabeth C.	4/15/2015	0.20	\$475.00	\$95.00	\$390.00		\$78.00			Review memo of interview with potential witness;	Document Review - First Trial
916	Roberts, Rachel M.	4/15/2015	0.80	\$125.00	\$100.00	\$125.00		\$100.00			Read emails related to document review (.3); begin review of first level review logs per: A. Branch (.5);	Document Review - First Trial
917	Khanna, Abha	4/16/2015	0.70	\$500.00	\$350.00	\$410.00		\$287.00			Review transcripts forwarded by A. Branch regarding 55% BVAP threshold and disavowal of partisan purpose (0.7);	Document Review - First Trial
918	Foster, Molly L.	4/23/2015	5.70	\$125.00	\$712.50	\$125.00		\$712.50			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
919	Grimm, Lisa C.	4/23/2015	7.50	\$125.00	\$937.50	\$125.00		\$937.50			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
920	Hegstrom, Donald	4/23/2015	7.00	\$125.00	\$875.00	\$125.00		\$875.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
921	Nye, Travis R.	4/23/2015	3.20	\$125.00	\$400.00	\$125.00		\$400.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
922	Schneier, Ariel L.	4/23/2015	4.20	\$125.00	\$525.00	\$125.00		\$525.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
923	Foster, Molly L.	4/24/2015	7.00	\$125.00	\$875.00	\$125.00		\$875.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
924	Grimm, Lisa C.	4/24/2015	4.90	\$125.00	\$612.50	\$125.00		\$612.50			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
925	Hegstrom, Donald	4/24/2015	5.00	\$125.00	\$625.00	\$125.00		\$625.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
926	Schneier, Ariel L.	4/24/2015	6.00	\$125.00	\$750.00	\$125.00		\$750.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
927	Spear, Ryan M.	4/29/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Review and respond to emails with T. Marino and document review team regarding document review logistics (.2);	Document Review - First Trial
928	Spear, Ryan M.	4/30/2015	0.40	\$500.00	\$200.00	\$410.00		\$164.00			Review and respond to emails with document review team regarding technical issue documents (.4);	Document Review - First Trial
929	Foster, Molly L.	5/6/2015	10.00	\$125.00	\$1,250.00	\$125.00		\$1,250.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
930	Grimm, Lisa C.	5/6/2015	8.80	\$125.00	\$1,100.00	\$125.00		\$1,100.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
931	Hegstrom, Donald	5/6/2015	10.00	\$125.00	\$1,250.00	\$125.00		\$1,250.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
932	Foster, Molly L.	5/7/2015	1.70	\$125.00	\$212.50	\$125.00		\$212.50			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
933	Grimm, Lisa C.	5/7/2015	1.50	\$125.00	\$187.50	\$125.00		\$187.50			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
934	Hegstrom, Donald	5/7/2015	1.60	\$125.00	\$200.00	\$125.00		\$200.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
935	Moore, Clinton J.	5/15/2015	1.00	\$125.00	\$125.00	\$125.00		\$125.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
936	Foster, Molly L.	5/19/2015	8.30	\$125.00	\$1,037.50	\$125.00		\$1,037.50			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
937	Grimm, Lisa C.	5/19/2015	7.50	\$125.00	\$937.50	\$125.00		\$937.50			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
938	Hegstrom, Donald	5/19/2015	4.70	\$125.00	\$587.50	\$125.00		\$587.50			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
939	Foster, Molly L.	5/20/2015	7.00	\$125.00	\$875.00	\$125.00		\$875.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
940	Grimm, Lisa C.	5/20/2015	5.40	\$125.00	\$675.00	\$125.00		\$675.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
941	Hegstrom, Donald	5/20/2015	4.10	\$125.00	\$512.50	\$125.00		\$512.50			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
942	Nye, Travis R.	5/28/2015	3.50	\$125.00	\$437.50	\$125.00		\$437.50			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment (3); review background materials (.5);	Document Review - First Trial
943	Nye, Travis R.	5/29/2015	8.00	\$125.00	\$1,000.00	\$125.00		\$1,000.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment (7.8); participate in conference with review team regarding document review procedures (0.2);	Document Review - First Trial
944	Nye, Travis R.	6/1/2015	7.00	\$125.00	\$875.00	\$125.00		\$875.00			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
945	Nye, Travis R.	6/2/2015	6.50	\$125.00	\$812.50	\$125.00		\$812.50			Review and analyze documents for categorization and assessment;	Document Review - First Trial
946	Stafford, William B.	6/2/2015	2.60	\$495.00	\$1,287.00	\$405.00		\$1,053.00			Review documents produced by Intervenor in response to motion to compel (2.6);	Document Review - First Trial
947	Spear, Ryan M.	6/18/2015	0.10	\$500.00	\$50.00	\$410.00		\$41.00			Review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding document review (.1);	Document Review - First Trial
948			383.55		\$51,900.75			\$51,144.25				SUBTOTAL for Document Review - First Trial
949	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/2/2015	0.10	\$475.00	\$47.50	\$390.00		\$39.00			Emails with K. Hamilton and M. Elias regarding preparation for court telephone conference (.1);	Court Conferences - First Trial
950	Hamilton, Kevin J.	2/2/2015	2.30	\$620.00	\$1,426.00	\$575.00		\$1,322.50			Prepare for and participate in telephone conference with court (1.7); conference with A. Khanna regarding same (.3); report to litigation team regarding same (.3);	Court Conferences - First Trial
951	Khanna, Abha	2/2/2015	1.40	\$500.00	\$700.00	\$410.00		\$574.00			Review all pleadings in preparation for conference call with Court, confer with K. Hamilton regarding same, and participate in conference call with Court (1.4);	Court Conferences - First Trial
952	Khanna, Abha	2/4/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Confer with M. Elias in preparation for conference call with Court (.2); email with legal team regarding same (.1);	Court Conferences - First Trial
953	Roche, John K.	2/4/2015	0.30	\$535.00	\$160.50	\$465.00		\$139.50			Exchange emails with opposing counsel and Perkins team regarding chambers' request for telephone conference to discuss discovery schedule;	Court Conferences - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
954	Hamilton, Kevin J.	2/5/2015	3.40	\$620.00	\$2,108.00	\$575.00		\$1,955.00			Review and respond to email regarding case scheduling conference with court (.8); review Elias report regarding same (.4); telephone conference with B. Stafford and A. Khanna regarding trial schedule and related conference (1.0); follow up regarding same (1.2);	Court Conferences - First Trial
955	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/23/2015	0.20	\$475.00	\$95.00	\$390.00		\$78.00			Emails with M. Elias regarding scheduling conference (.2);	Court Conferences - First Trial
956	Hamilton, Kevin J.	2/23/2015	0.80	\$620.00	\$496.00	\$575.00		\$460.00			Review email regarding call with the court regarding procedural issues (.4); review notes from the call (.2); participate in follow up conference call (.2);	Court Conferences - First Trial
957	Khanna, Abha	2/23/2015	1.20	\$500.00	\$600.00	\$410.00		\$492.00			Email and confer with legal team in preparation for conference call with Court (.4); review scheduling order in preparation for same (.3); coordinate conference call with all parties and Court (.5);	Court Conferences - First Trial
958	Roche, John K.	2/23/2015	0.20	\$535.00	\$107.00	\$465.00		\$93.00			Exchange emails with A. Khanna regarding chambers' request for telephone conference;	Court Conferences - First Trial
959	Branch, Aria C.	2/24/2015	0.60	\$380.00	\$228.00	\$345.00		\$207.00			Conference call with judge;	Court Conferences - First Trial
960	Hamilton, Kevin J.	2/24/2015	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Follow up with team regarding call with the court (.3); exchange related email (.2);	Court Conferences - First Trial
961	Khanna, Abha	2/24/2015	2.60	\$500.00	\$1,300.00	\$410.00		\$1,066.00			Prepare for and participate in telephonic conference with Court (1.7); draft and circulate comprehensive email summary of same to legal team (.7); email and telephone conference with Judge Payne's chambers (Michael Parsons) regarding pretrial scheduling order in light of same (.2);	Court Conferences - First Trial
962	Khanna, Abha	2/25/2015	1.20	\$500.00	\$600.00	\$410.00		\$492.00			Participate in conference call with legal team to discuss call with Court and next steps (.7); draft and circulate email regarding action items (.2); confer with T. Marino about participation as paralegal (.1); email with E. Gonzalez regarding same (.1); email with K. Hamilton regarding same (.1);	Court Conferences - First Trial
963	Stafford, William B.	2/25/2015	0.70	\$495.00	\$346.50	\$405.00		\$283.50			Conference call with litigation team to discuss case scheduling in light of scheduling conference with court;	Court Conferences - First Trial
964	Khanna, Abha	2/27/2015	1.10	\$500.00	\$550.00	\$410.00		\$451.00			Review transcript of this week's hearing (.9); circulate same to legal team and for invoice processing (.2);	Court Conferences - First Trial
965	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/2/2015	1.00	\$620.00	\$620.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Prepare for potential conference with court regarding same (1.0);	Court Conferences - First Trial
966	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/30/2015	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Review transcript from telephonic hearing with court (.9);	Court Conferences - First Trial
967	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/1/2015	2.00	\$620.00	\$1,240.00	\$575.00		\$1,150.00			Prepare for and participate in telephone conference with J. Payne (.5); draft and circulate summary of call with Judge Payne to legal team (1.5);	Court Conferences - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
968	Stafford, William B.	4/2/2015	0.30	\$495.00	\$148.50	\$405.00		\$121.50			Attend conference with Court regarding case schedule and status;	Court Conferences - First Trial
969	Callais, Amanda R.	5/14/2015	0.10	\$380.00	\$38.00	\$345.00		\$34.50			Participate in call with court regarding Katz deposition (.1);	Court Conferences - First Trial
970	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/14/2015	1.00	\$620.00	\$620.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Telephone conference regarding discovery dispute over J. Katz deposition (.5); review report from B. Spiva regarding hearing with the court (.5);	Court Conferences - First Trial
971	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/14/2015	0.90	\$600.00	\$540.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Correspond with team about call with the Court;	Court Conferences - First Trial
972	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/14/2015	0.50	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Telephone conference with K. Hamilton and R. Spear about same;	Court Conferences - First Trial
973	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/14/2015	0.40	\$600.00	\$240.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Prepare for hearing with Court;	Court Conferences - First Trial
974	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/14/2015	0.80	\$600.00	\$480.00	\$575.00		\$460.00			Telephone conference with the Court regarding Katz;	Court Conferences - First Trial
975	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/17/2015	0.80	\$620.00	\$496.00	\$575.00		\$460.00			Review transcript of phone call with court on Katz deposition and exchange related email (.8);	Court Conferences - First Trial
976	Branch, Aria C.	5/21/2015	0.50	\$380.00	\$190.00	\$345.00		\$172.50			Conference call with J. Payne regarding scheduling (.3); discussion with B. Spiva, A. Callais and K. Hamilton (0.2);	Court Conferences - First Trial
977	Callais, Amanda R.	5/21/2015	0.60	\$380.00	\$228.00	\$345.00		\$207.00			Participate in status conference with Court regarding pretrial and trial preparations and confer with B. Spiva and K. Hamilton about strategy and next steps in regard to directions given by Court in call;	Court Conferences - First Trial
978	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/21/2015	2.40	\$620.00	\$1,488.00	\$575.00		\$1,380.00			prepare and participate in telephone conference with court regarding scheduling (1.0); follow up report to the team with commentary and proposed action steps (1.4);	Court Conferences - First Trial
979	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/21/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with team about call with court and new deadlines;	Court Conferences - First Trial
980	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/21/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Contacted all counsel about court call;	Court Conferences - First Trial
981	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/21/2015	0.50	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Participate in call with the Court about scheduling;	Court Conferences - First Trial
982	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/28/2015	0.40	\$620.00	\$248.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Follow up on email regarding proposed stipulation and topics for June fourth call with the court (.4);	Court Conferences - First Trial
983	Spear, Ryan M.	5/28/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Review and respond to emails with opposing counsel regarding conference call regarding pretrial conference (.2);	Court Conferences - First Trial
984	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/29/2015	0.40	\$620.00	\$248.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Exchange email regarding proposed conference call with opposing counsel to discuss topics for June fourth call with the court (.4);	Court Conferences - First Trial
985	Spear, Ryan M.	5/29/2015	0.10	\$500.00	\$50.00	\$410.00		\$41.00			Review and respond to emails with opposing counsel regarding conference call regarding pretrial conference (.1);	Court Conferences - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
986	Spear, Ryan M.	5/31/2015	0.10	\$500.00	\$50.00	\$410.00		\$41.00			Review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding meeting regarding pretrial conference (.1);	Court Conferences - First Trial
987	Branch, Aria C.	6/1/2015	0.60	\$380.00	\$228.00	\$345.00		\$207.00			Attend conference call with opposing counsel regarding pretrial conference (0.6);	Court Conferences - First Trial
988	Spear, Ryan M.	6/1/2015	1.60	\$500.00	\$800.00	\$410.00		\$656.00			Confer with opposing counsel regarding pretrial conference (.5); confer with K. Hamilton regarding same (.2); prepare joint submission to Court regarding pretrial conference (.8); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding same (.1);	Court Conferences - First Trial
989	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/1/2015	0.80	\$600.00	\$480.00	\$575.00		\$460.00			Telephone conference with team and defense counsel regarding pretrial conference and call with court (.80);	Court Conferences - First Trial
990	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/2/2015	0.60	\$620.00	\$372.00	\$575.00		\$345.00			Review court order and prepare for pretrial conference (.6);	Court Conferences - First Trial
991	Spear, Ryan M.	6/2/2015	1.10	\$500.00	\$550.00	\$410.00		\$451.00			Revise draft "theory of the case" document in preparation for pretrial conference (.3); identify relevant deposition transcript passages regarding same (.8);	Court Conferences - First Trial
992	Stafford, William B.	6/2/2015	0.80	\$495.00	\$396.00	\$405.00		\$324.00			Exchange correspondence regarding pretrial hearing and strategic approach for same (.8);	Court Conferences - First Trial
993	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/3/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Correspond with all counsel regarding tomorrow's call with the Court;	Court Conferences - First Trial
994	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/3/2015	0.40	\$600.00	\$240.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Correspond with team about tomorrow's hearing with the Court;	Court Conferences - First Trial
995	Branch, Aria C.	6/4/2015	2.40	\$380.00	\$912.00	\$345.00		\$828.00			Attend pretrial conference (1.2); conference call regarding pretrial conference (1.2);	Court Conferences - First Trial
996	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/4/2015	4.50	\$620.00	\$2,790.00	\$575.00		\$2,587.50			Prepare for and participate in pretrial conference with court (2.5); follow up telephone conference with legal team regarding pretrial conference (1.5); conference with B. Spiva regarding related issues (.5);	Court Conferences - First Trial
997	Khanna, Abha	6/4/2015	1.20	\$500.00	\$600.00	\$410.00		\$492.00			Participate in conference call with legal team regarding pretrial conference, trial strategy, and next steps;	Court Conferences - First Trial
998	Spear, Ryan M.	6/4/2015	0.80	\$500.00	\$400.00	\$410.00		\$328.00			Attend pretrial conference (.4); confer with litigation team regarding same (.4);	Court Conferences - First Trial
999	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/4/2015	0.70	\$600.00	\$420.00	\$575.00		\$402.50			Telephone conference with team to debrief about call with Court and next steps;	Court Conferences - First Trial
1000	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/4/2015	0.40	\$600.00	\$240.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Telephone conference with K. Hamilton regarding call with the Court;	Court Conferences - First Trial
1001	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/4/2015	1.70	\$600.00	\$1,020.00	\$575.00		\$977.50			Prepare for and participate in phone pre-trial conference with Court;	Court Conferences - First Trial
1002	Stafford, William B.	6/4/2015	1.20	\$495.00	\$594.00	\$405.00		\$486.00			Assist in preparation for pretrial conference call with Court (.6); discuss pretrial conference and resulting action items with litigation team (.6);	Court Conferences - First Trial
1003	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/5/2015	1.20	\$620.00	\$744.00	\$575.00		\$690.00			Follow up from pretrial conference with R. Spear and implications for case in chief (1.2);	Court Conferences - First Trial
1004	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/8/2015	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Review note from pretrial conference and coordinate scheduling and trial strategy (.9);	Court Conferences - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1005	Elias, Marc E.	6/23/2015	0.50	\$735.00	\$367.50	\$575.00		\$287.50			Email and meeting regarding court teleconference;	Court Conferences - First Trial
1006	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/26/2015	0.50	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Confer with team about court conference;	Court Conferences - First Trial
1007			53.50		\$29,898.50			\$26,909.50				SUBTOTAL for Court Conferences - First Trial
1008	Frost, Elisabeth C.	1/5/2015	0.70	\$475.00	\$332.50	\$390.00		\$273.00			Emails with L. Bull regarding pro hac vice motions (.1); prepare pro hac vice motions (.2); email to J. Roche attaching pro hac vice motions (.1); file pro hac vice motions (.3);	General Briefing - First Trial
1009	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/27/2015	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Exchange email regarding motion to intervene and related issues;	General Briefing - First Trial
1010	Frost, Elisabeth C.	1/29/2015	0.20	\$475.00	\$95.00	\$390.00		\$78.00			Telephone conference with M. Elias and T. Troy regarding time to answer complaint (.2);	General Briefing - First Trial
1011	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/7/2015	0.30	\$475.00	\$142.50	\$390.00		\$117.00			Emails with A. Khanna regarding substituting parties (.2); email to A. Branch regarding preparing amended complaint substituting parties (.1);	General Briefing - First Trial
1012	Khanna, Abha	2/8/2015	1.70	\$500.00	\$850.00	\$410.00		\$697.00			Review Court's Pretrial Schedule A; draft proposed Initial Scheduling and Pretrial Order based on same and on Rule 26(f) conference;	General Briefing - First Trial
1013	Elias, Marc E.	2/9/2015	0.50	\$735.00	\$367.50	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review proposed scheduling order;	General Briefing - First Trial
1014	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/9/2015	0.40	\$475.00	\$190.00	\$390.00		\$156.00			Email from A. Khanna regarding proposed scheduling order and review proposed scheduling order (.4);	General Briefing - First Trial
1015	Khanna, Abha	2/9/2015	1.20	\$500.00	\$600.00	\$410.00		\$492.00			Review and revise draft initial Pretrial and Scheduling Order (1.0); email with legal team regarding same (.2);	General Briefing - First Trial
1016	Stafford, William B.	2/9/2015	0.30	\$495.00	\$148.50	\$405.00		\$121.50			Review proposed scheduling order (.2); conference with A. Khanna regarding same (.1);	General Briefing - First Trial
1017	Hamilton, Kevin J.	2/10/2015	1.20	\$620.00	\$744.00	\$575.00		\$690.00			Review and respond to email with A. Khanna regarding proposed pretrial schedule (.8); exchange email with opposing counsel regarding same (.4);	General Briefing - First Trial
1018	Khanna, Abha	2/10/2015	1.70	\$500.00	\$850.00	\$410.00		\$697.00			Email with legal team regarding proposed scheduling order (.4); telephone conference with K. Hamilton regarding same (.4); review and revise same (.4); email with opposing counsel regarding same (.2); research rules regarding substitution of defendants (.2); email with A. Branch regarding same (.1);	General Briefing - First Trial
1019	Elias, Marc E.	2/11/2015	0.50	\$735.00	\$367.50	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review comments on joint status report (.4); email regarding same (.1);	General Briefing - First Trial
1020	Hamilton, Kevin J.	2/11/2015	1.30	\$620.00	\$806.00	\$575.00		\$747.50			Exchange email regarding proposed pretrial schedule (.5); conference with A. Khanna regarding same (.8);	General Briefing - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1021	Khanna, Abha	2/11/2015	2.50	\$500.00	\$1,250.00	\$410.00		\$1,025.00			Review edits and comments to proposed scheduling order from opposing counsel (.8); email and confer with legal team regarding same; review Federal Rules of Civil Procedure in relation to same (1.0); revise draft proposed scheduling order and draft cover email to all counsel (.6); circulate same to opposing counsel (.1);	General Briefing - First Trial
1022	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/12/2015	0.80	\$475.00	\$380.00	\$390.00		\$312.00			Emails with A. Khanna, M. Elias and K. Hamilton regarding proposed scheduling order (.1); emails with K. McKnight and M. Braden regarding proposed scheduling order (.1); prepare certificate of service, and finalize and file proposed scheduling order (.6);	General Briefing - First Trial
1023	Khanna, Abha	2/12/2015	1.10	\$500.00	\$550.00	\$410.00		\$451.00			Email with opposing counsel regarding proposed scheduling order (.4); revise same and prepare for filing (.5); email with legal team regarding substitution of parties (.1); review rule regarding same (.1);	General Briefing - First Trial
1024	Khanna, Abha	2/13/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Email with opposing counsel regarding Rule 25(d) substitution (.3);	General Briefing - First Trial
1025	Hamilton, Kevin J.	2/25/2015	1.80	\$620.00	\$1,116.00	\$575.00		\$1,035.00			Follow up on discovery and litigation strategy in light of call with the court (1.5); exchange related email (.3);	General Briefing - First Trial
1026	Khanna, Abha	3/13/2015	1.00	\$500.00	\$500.00	\$410.00		\$410.00			Research legislative privilege issue in preparation for motion to compel (1.0);	General Briefing - First Trial
1027	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/16/2015	0.20	\$475.00	\$95.00	\$390.00		\$78.00			Emails with B. Spiva regarding PHV motion (.2);	General Briefing - First Trial
1028	Roberts, Rachel M.	3/16/2015	1.00	\$125.00	\$125.00	\$125.00		\$125.00			Work on B. Spiva pro hac vice motion (1.0);	General Briefing - First Trial
1029	Spiva, Bruce V.	3/16/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Work on pro hac vice motion;	General Briefing - First Trial
1030	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/17/2015	0.30	\$475.00	\$142.50	\$390.00		\$117.00			Finalize and file pro hac vice motion for B. Spiva (.3);	General Briefing - First Trial
1031	Roche, John K.	3/18/2015	0.30	\$535.00	\$160.50	\$465.00		\$139.50			Revise consent motion and consent order to amend scheduling order and exchange emails with A. Khanna and opposing counsel regarding same;	General Briefing - First Trial
1032	Khanna, Abha	3/19/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Email with opposing counsel regarding submission of consent motion and order (0.3);	General Briefing - First Trial
1033	Roche, John K.	3/19/2015	0.70	\$535.00	\$374.50	\$465.00		\$325.50			Revise and file consent motion to amend scheduling order and exchange emails with A. Khanna and opposing counsel regarding consent order (.5); review and file pro hac vice motion for B. Stafford (.2);	General Briefing - First Trial
1034	Khanna, Abha	3/27/2015	0.40	\$500.00	\$200.00	\$410.00		\$164.00			Draft and circulate consent motion and consent order (0.4);	General Briefing - First Trial
1035	Roche, John K.	3/27/2015	0.40	\$535.00	\$214.00	\$465.00		\$186.00			Review and file consent motion to extend time to file motions regarding privilege issues and exchange emails with R. Spear and A. Khanna regarding same;	General Briefing - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1036	Spear, Ryan M.	3/27/2015	0.40	\$500.00	\$200.00	\$410.00		\$164.00			Confer with A. Khanna and J. Roche regarding filing of consent order to extend deadlines (0.1); prepare pro hac vice motion (0.3);	General Briefing - First Trial
1037	Khanna, Abha	3/30/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Email and telephone conference with Defendants' counsel regarding filing of consent order (.2);	General Briefing - First Trial
1038	Spear, Ryan M.	3/30/2015	0.10	\$500.00	\$50.00	\$410.00		\$41.00			Review and respond to emails with J. Roche regarding pro hac vice motion (0.1);	General Briefing - First Trial
1039	Spear, Ryan M.	4/1/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Review draft joint status report (0.2); review and respond to emails with A. Khanna regarding same (0.1);	General Briefing - First Trial
1040	Stafford, William B.	4/7/2015	0.70	\$495.00	\$346.50	\$405.00		\$283.50			Conference with A. Khanna regarding strategic approach to Alabama briefing;	General Briefing - First Trial
1041	Spear, Ryan M.	4/8/2015	0.60	\$500.00	\$300.00	\$410.00		\$246.00			Review and respond to emails with J. Walrath regarding meeting regarding intervenors' claims of attorney-client privilege (0.4); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding intervenors' proposal to waive right to oppose waiver (0.2);	General Briefing - First Trial
1042	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/9/2015	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review and respond to email regarding objection to standing and request for stipulation regarding same (.5);	General Briefing - First Trial
1043	Khanna, Abha	4/9/2015	0.40	\$500.00	\$200.00	\$410.00		\$164.00			Review and revise Intervenor's proposed Rule 502 motion/order (0.2); email and confer with R. Spear regarding same (0.2);	General Briefing - First Trial
1044	Spear, Ryan M.	4/9/2015	1.00	\$500.00	\$500.00	\$410.00		\$410.00			Confer with A. Khanna regarding draft Rule 502 order (0.2); review draft order (0.3); research issues regarding same (0.3); review and respond to emails with J. Bickford regarding procedural requirements regarding motions to compel (0.2);	General Briefing - First Trial
1045	Stafford, William B.	4/9/2015	0.40	\$495.00	\$198.00	\$405.00		\$162.00			Review and revise Alabama briefing;	General Briefing - First Trial
1046	Spear, Ryan M.	4/10/2015	5.60	\$500.00	\$2,800.00	\$410.00		\$2,296.00			Prepare motion to compel regarding privilege issues (2.1); research issues regarding same (3.5);	General Briefing - First Trial
1047	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/10/2015	0.10	\$600.00	\$60.00	\$575.00		\$57.50			Correspond with R. Spear about Motion to Compel;	General Briefing - First Trial
1048	Spear, Ryan M.	4/11/2015	6.20	\$500.00	\$3,100.00	\$410.00		\$2,542.00			Prepare motion to compel regarding privilege issues (4.3); research issues regarding same (1.9);	General Briefing - First Trial
1049	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/12/2015	2.80	\$620.00	\$1,736.00	\$575.00		\$1,610.00			Review and revise draft motion to compel (1.9); review and respond to email regarding motion to compel (.9);	General Briefing - First Trial
1050	Khanna, Abha	4/12/2015	0.60	\$500.00	\$300.00	\$410.00		\$246.00			Review and revise Motion to Compel Production of Documents (0.5); email with legal team regarding same (0.1);	General Briefing - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1051	Spear, Ryan M.	4/12/2015	7.20	\$500.00	\$3,600.00	\$410.00		\$2,952.00			Review and respond to emails with J. Bickford and A. Branch regarding research regarding motion to compel (0.2); review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton, M. Elias, and A. Khanna regarding revisions to motion to compel (0.3); review motion to compel (6.7);	General Briefing - First Trial
1052	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/12/2015	0.90	\$600.00	\$540.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Review and comment on motion to compel documents regarding legislative privilege;	General Briefing - First Trial
1053	Khanna, Abha	4/13/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Confer and email with R. Spear regarding motion to compel and other outstanding issues (0.3);	General Briefing - First Trial
1054	Spear, Ryan M.	4/13/2015	3.70	\$500.00	\$1,850.00	\$410.00		\$1,517.00			Review and revise motion to compel (1.3); research issues regarding same (1.1); review and respond to emails with J. Bickford regarding same (0.4); prepare declaration and exhibits in support of motion to compel (0.9);	General Briefing - First Trial
1055	Frost, Elisabeth C.	4/20/2015	0.10	\$475.00	\$47.50	\$390.00		\$39.00			Telephone conference with A. Branch regarding research related to standing argument (.1);	General Briefing - First Trial
1056	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/20/2015	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Review motion to compel (.3);	General Briefing - First Trial
1057	Spear, Ryan M.	4/23/2015	1.20	\$500.00	\$600.00	\$410.00		\$492.00			Confer with K. Hamilton regarding reply in support of motion to compel (.3); research issues regarding same (.9);	General Briefing - First Trial
1058	Spear, Ryan M.	4/24/2015	1.80	\$500.00	\$900.00	\$410.00		\$738.00			Prepare reply in support of motion to compel (1.0); research issues regarding same (.8);	General Briefing - First Trial
1059	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/25/2015	0.80	\$620.00	\$496.00	\$575.00		\$460.00			Review briefing in support of and opposition to motion to compel (.8);	General Briefing - First Trial
1060	Spear, Ryan M.	4/25/2015	6.40	\$500.00	\$3,200.00	\$410.00		\$2,624.00			Prepare reply in support of motion to compel (5.3); research issues regarding same (1.1);	General Briefing - First Trial
1061	Frost, Elisabeth C.	4/26/2015	0.60	\$475.00	\$285.00	\$390.00		\$234.00			Emails with R. Spear regarding reply in support of motion to compel (.1); review docket regarding filing deadlines (.1); review draft reply in support of motion to compel (.4);	General Briefing - First Trial
1062	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/26/2015	3.90	\$620.00	\$2,418.00	\$575.00		\$2,242.50			Review and revise draft reply brief in support of motion to compel (3.1); review and respond to related email (.8);	General Briefing - First Trial
1063	Roche, John K.	4/26/2015	0.70	\$535.00	\$374.50	\$465.00		\$325.50			Review reply in support of motion to compel documents withheld on privilege grounds and draft email to R. Spear regarding same;	General Briefing - First Trial
1064	Spear, Ryan M.	4/26/2015	3.60	\$500.00	\$1,800.00	\$410.00		\$1,476.00			Prepare reply in support of motion to compel (2.3); research issues regarding same (.6); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding revisions to reply and logistical issues (.5); research issues regarding filing deadlines (.2);	General Briefing - First Trial
1065	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/26/2015	1.50	\$600.00	\$900.00	\$575.00		\$862.50			Review draft motion to compel reply brief;	General Briefing - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1066	Frost, Elisabeth C.	4/27/2015	0.30	\$475.00	\$142.50	\$390.00		\$117.00			Emails with R. Spear, K. Hamilton, M. Elias, B. Stafford, A. Branch and B. Spiva regarding reply in support of motion to compel (.1); prepare cover letter to accompany courtesy copies of reply in support of motion to compel to Judge Payne's chambers (.1); email to J. Medile regarding messengering courtesy copies to Judge Payne's chambers (.1)	General Briefing - First Trial
1067	Spear, Ryan M.	4/27/2015	1.10	\$500.00	\$550.00	\$410.00		\$451.00			Review and revise reply in support of motion to compel (.8); confer with K. Hamilton regarding same (.3);	General Briefing - First Trial
1068	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/27/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with R. Spear about motion to compel;	General Briefing - First Trial
1069	Spear, Ryan M.	4/28/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Coordinate service of courtesy copies of reply in support of motion to compel (.2);	General Briefing - First Trial
1070	Spear, Ryan M.	5/7/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Review briefing on motion to compel regarding same (.3);	General Briefing - First Trial
1071	Spear, Ryan M.	5/13/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Confer with J. Tyler regarding Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 45 as relevant to potential motion to quash (.2); review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton regarding same (.1);	General Briefing - First Trial
1072	Branch, Aria C.	5/14/2015	0.80	\$380.00	\$304.00	\$345.00		\$276.00			Conference call regarding motion to quash subpoena of expert witness (0.8);	General Briefing - First Trial
1073	Spear, Ryan M.	5/14/2015	1.40	\$500.00	\$700.00	\$410.00		\$574.00			Confer with K. Hamilton and B. Spiva regarding hearing and briefing schedule on motion to quash subpoena (.3); review and revise draft stipulation regarding excluded witnesses (.5); review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton and B. Spiva regarding same (.2); confer with J. Walrath regarding same (.4);	General Briefing - First Trial
1074	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/14/2015	0.40	\$600.00	\$240.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Review draft stipulation regarding witness and commented on same;	General Briefing - First Trial
1075	Spear, Ryan M.	5/15/2015	1.10	\$500.00	\$550.00	\$410.00		\$451.00			Review and revise draft stipulation regarding excluded witnesses (.5); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding same (.3); confer with opposing counsel regarding same (.3);	General Briefing - First Trial
1076	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/15/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with K. Hamilton and R. Spear regarding witness stipulation;	General Briefing - First Trial
1077	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/19/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Review and comment on Consent Motion regarding Katz;	General Briefing - First Trial
1078	Stafford, William B.	5/19/2015	0.80	\$495.00	\$396.00	\$405.00		\$324.00			Prepare consent motion and order for Dr. Katz deposition and exchange correspondence with opposing counsel regarding same (.8);	General Briefing - First Trial
1079	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/20/2015	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Draft proposed stipulation regarding evidence (.5);	General Briefing - First Trial
1080	Roberts, Rachel M.	5/20/2015	0.55	\$125.00	\$68.75	\$125.00		\$68.75			File consent motion re: Katz deposition (.55)	General Briefing - First Trial
1081	Stafford, William B.	5/20/2015	0.40	\$495.00	\$198.00	\$405.00		\$162.00			Exchange correspondence regarding consent motion and order for Dr. Katz (.4);	General Briefing - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1082	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/21/2015	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Conference with B. Stafford regarding proposed exhibit stipulation (.5);	General Briefing - First Trial
1083	Spear, Ryan M.	5/21/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding motion to extend discovery deadlines (.2);	General Briefing - First Trial
1084	Stafford, William B.	5/21/2015	0.30	\$495.00	\$148.50	\$405.00		\$121.50			Exchange correspondence regarding motion to extend discovery to conduct Katz deposition and deposition arrangements for Dr. Katz (.3);	General Briefing - First Trial
1085	Spear, Ryan M.	5/26/2015	1.50	\$500.00	\$750.00	\$410.00		\$615.00			Review court order granting in part and denying in part motion to compel (1.2); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding same (.3);	General Briefing - First Trial
1086	Stafford, William B.	5/26/2015	0.30	\$495.00	\$148.50	\$405.00		\$121.50			Review and prepare summary of order on Motion to Compel (.3);	General Briefing - First Trial
1087	Branch, Aria C.	6/11/2015	0.60	\$380.00	\$228.00	\$345.00		\$207.00			Draft consent motion and order (0.6);	General Briefing - First Trial
1088	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/11/2015	4.20	\$620.00	\$2,604.00	\$575.00		\$2,415.00			Review draft amended complaint and exchange email regarding same (2.2); review and respond to email regarding proposed stipulated motion (1.2); review draft stipulated motion to amend complaint and approve (.8);	General Briefing - First Trial
1089	Roche, John K.	6/11/2015	0.10	\$535.00	\$53.50	\$465.00		\$46.50			Exchange emails with R. Spear regarding procedure for consent motion to add plaintiff;	General Briefing - First Trial
1090	Spear, Ryan M.	6/11/2015	1.90	\$500.00	\$950.00	\$410.00		\$779.00			Prepare amended complaint (.4); prepare joint motion to allow filing of amended complaint (.6); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding same (.4); review and respond to emails with opposing counsel regarding same (.5);	General Briefing - First Trial
1091	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/12/2015	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Review and respond to email regarding motion to amend complaint (.9);	General Briefing - First Trial
1092	Roberts, Rachel M.	6/12/2015	1.20	\$125.00	\$150.00	\$125.00		\$150.00			Finalize and send proposed order on motion to amend to local counsel for filing (1.2);	General Briefing - First Trial
1093	Roche, John K.	6/12/2015	0.10	\$535.00	\$53.50	\$465.00		\$46.50			Exchange emails with R. Spear regarding consent motion to add plaintiff;	General Briefing - First Trial
1094	Spear, Ryan M.	6/12/2015	0.70	\$500.00	\$350.00	\$410.00		\$287.00			Review and respond to emails with P. Sutton and litigation team regarding motion to amend (.2); review and respond to emails with opposing counsel regarding same (.2); coordinate filing of motion (.3);	General Briefing - First Trial
1095	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/12/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Review and comment on joint motion to amend Complaint and switch plaintiffs;	General Briefing - First Trial
1096	Branch, Aria C.	6/15/2015	0.50	\$380.00	\$190.00	\$345.00		\$172.50			File amended complaint (0.5);	General Briefing - First Trial
1097	Roberts, Rachel M.	6/15/2015	0.70	\$125.00	\$87.50	\$125.00		\$87.50			File pro hac vice motions for B. Spiva and M. Elias and discuss same with K. Guilty (.7);	General Briefing - First Trial
1098	Spear, Ryan M.	6/15/2015	0.60	\$500.00	\$300.00	\$410.00		\$246.00			Review amended complaint (.2); coordinate filing of amended complaint (.3); review and respond to emails with P. Sutton regarding joint motion to amend complaint (.1);	General Briefing - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1099	Spear, Ryan M.	6/16/2015	0.10	\$500.00	\$50.00	\$410.00		\$41.00			Review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding amended corrected complaint (.1);	General Briefing - First Trial
1100			98.35		\$50,579.25			\$43,275.25				SUBTOTAL for General Briefing - First Trial
1101	Hamilton, Kevin J.	2/13/2015	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Review email regarding proposed stipulated pretrial order (.4); exchange email with A. Khanna regarding same (.5);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1102	Spear, Ryan M.	5/15/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding potential motion in limine (.2);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1103	Spear, Ryan M.	5/19/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Email litigation team regarding potential motions in limine (.2);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1104	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/22/2015	1.90	\$620.00	\$1,178.00	\$575.00		\$1,092.50			Draft proposed factual stipulation (1.0); conference with B. Stafford regarding issues with the same (.9);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1105	Marino, Patricia	5/22/2015	1.20	\$220.00	\$264.00	\$190.00		\$228.00			Revise/edit preliminary trial exhibit list and compile documents for attorneys' further evaluation (1.2);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1106	Stafford, William B.	5/25/2015	0.50	\$495.00	\$247.50	\$405.00		\$202.50			Prepare factual stipulation;	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1107	Spear, Ryan M.	5/26/2015	0.60	\$500.00	\$300.00	\$410.00		\$246.00			Review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding scheduling issues and potential extension of motion in limine deadline (.3); confer with J. Walrath and J. Brundage regarding potential extension of motion in limine deadline (.3);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1108	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/26/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Correspond with R. Spear about motions in limine;	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1109	Spear, Ryan M.	5/27/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Review and respond to emails with opposing counsel regarding potential extension of deadline to file motions in limine (.1); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding dispositive motions (.1);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1110	Spear, Ryan M.	5/28/2015	1.80	\$500.00	\$900.00	\$410.00		\$738.00			Prepare joint motion regarding extension of motion in limine deadline and proposed order (1.0); review and respond to emails with opposing counsel regarding same (.3); coordinate filing of same (.5);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1111	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/28/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Review motion to extend motion in limine deadline;	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1112	Spear, Ryan M.	5/29/2015	0.50	\$500.00	\$250.00	\$410.00		\$205.00			Finalize and coordinate filing of joint motion to extend motion in limine deadline (.5);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1113	Roberts, Rachel M.	6/1/2015	0.80	\$125.00	\$100.00	\$125.00		\$100.00			Draft, finalize and send cover letter for motion to extend motions in limine deadline (.8);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1114	Spear, Ryan M.	6/1/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Prepare cover letter for submission of original signatures on proposed order for motion to extend deadline for motions in limine (.2);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1115	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/1/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Review and comment on pretrial filing;	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1116	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/2/2015	1.50	\$620.00	\$930.00	\$575.00		\$862.50			Conference with R. Spear regarding trial briefing, identification of exhibits and motions in limine (1.5);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1117	Roche, John K.	6/2/2015	0.10	\$535.00	\$53.50	\$465.00		\$46.50			Revise Joint Response to May 22, 2015 Order and draft email to R. Spear regarding same;	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1118	Spear, Ryan M.	6/2/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Review and respond to emails with P. Sutton regarding coordination of filing of court copies of proposed order on motion to extend deadline for motions in limine (.1); review and respond to emails with opposing counsel regarding same (.2);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1119	Spear, Ryan M.	6/3/2015	0.10	\$500.00	\$50.00	\$410.00		\$41.00			Coordinate filing of proposed order on motions in limine (.1);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1120	Spear, Ryan M.	6/4/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Review draft factual stipulation (.2); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding same (.1);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1121	Spear, Ryan M.	6/5/2015	0.60	\$500.00	\$300.00	\$410.00		\$246.00			prepare trial brief outline (.6);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1122	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/5/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Review and comment on revised stipulations;	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1123	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/5/2015	0.40	\$600.00	\$240.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Review and revise draft stipulations;	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1124	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/5/2015	0.40	\$600.00	\$240.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Correspond with team about draft stipulations;	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1125	Stafford, William B.	6/5/2015	0.80	\$495.00	\$396.00	\$405.00		\$324.00			Analyze potential motions in limine and draft correspondence to team regarding same (.4); prepare proposed factual stipulation (.4);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1126	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/8/2015	0.60	\$600.00	\$360.00	\$575.00		\$345.00			Correspond with team about motions in limine and substitute plaintiff;	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1127	Stafford, William B.	6/8/2015	0.10	\$495.00	\$49.50	\$405.00		\$40.50			Draft correspondence regarding motions in limine (.1);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1128	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/9/2015	2.30	\$620.00	\$1,426.00	\$575.00		\$1,322.50			Review and respond to email regarding proposed factual stipulation (.8); review and respond to email regarding proposed stipulation regarding trial exhibits and related issues (1.5);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1129	Spear, Ryan M.	6/11/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Confer with K. Hamilton regarding trial brief (.3);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1130	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/12/2015	0.80	\$620.00	\$496.00	\$575.00		\$460.00			Review and respond to email regarding proposed factual stipulation (.8);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1131	Stafford, William B.	6/12/2015	0.80	\$495.00	\$396.00	\$405.00		\$324.00			Review factual stipulation revisions by opposing counsel and draft analysis of same (.8);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1132	Spear, Ryan M.	6/14/2015	2.70	\$500.00	\$1,350.00	\$410.00		\$1,107.00			Review prior briefing as relevant to preparing trial brief (1.9); research issues regarding trial brief (.8);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1133	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/15/2015	2.50	\$620.00	\$1,550.00	\$575.00		\$1,437.50			Review and revise draft trial brief (2.5);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1134	Khanna, Abha	6/15/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Telephone call with R. Spear regarding trial brief;	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1135	Spear, Ryan M.	6/15/2015	7.60	\$500.00	\$3,800.00	\$410.00		\$3,116.00			Prepare trial brief (3.2); research issues regarding same (2.1); review discovery documents and other record information regarding same (1.4); confer with A. Khanna regarding trial brief (.4); confer with K. Hamilton regarding same (.5);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1136	Stafford, William B.	6/15/2015	0.40	\$495.00	\$198.00	\$405.00		\$162.00			Prepare factual stipulation (.4);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1137	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/16/2015	3.20	\$620.00	\$1,984.00	\$575.00		\$1,840.00			Review and revise draft trial brief and forward comments to R. Spear (3.2);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1138	Spear, Ryan M.	6/16/2015	7.70	\$500.00	\$3,850.00	\$410.00		\$3,157.00			Prepare trial brief (6.5); review discovery documents and other record information regarding same (1.0); review comments of B. Stafford regarding same (.2);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1139	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/17/2015	4.70	\$620.00	\$2,914.00	\$575.00		\$2,702.50			Review and revise draft trial brief (3.5); conference with R. Spear regarding same (1.2);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1140	Spear, Ryan M.	6/17/2015	10.00	\$500.00	\$5,000.00	\$410.00		\$4,100.00			Prepare trial brief (5.3); research issues regarding same (2.3); review discovery documents and other record information regarding same (2.4);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1141	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/17/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Review draft trial brief;	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1142	Stafford, William B.	6/17/2015	0.50	\$495.00	\$247.50	\$405.00		\$202.50			Conference with K. Hamilton regarding trial brief (.5);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1143	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/18/2015	6.10	\$620.00	\$3,782.00	\$575.00		\$3,507.50			Review and revise draft trial brief (4.2); conference with B. Spiva, R. Spear and B. Stafford regarding trial brief and related issues (1.9);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1144	Khanna, Abha	6/18/2015	1.20	\$500.00	\$600.00	\$410.00		\$492.00			Review and revise draft trial brief (1.1); email with legal team regarding same (0.1);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1145	Spear, Ryan M.	6/18/2015	11.00	\$500.00	\$5,500.00	\$410.00		\$4,510.00			Prepare trial brief (7.7); research issues regarding same (1.5); review discovery documents and other record information regarding same (1.2); review and respond to emails with A. Khanna regarding same (.2); review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton regarding same (.2); review and respond to emails with B. Spiva regarding same (.2);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1146	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/18/2015	0.80	\$600.00	\$480.00	\$575.00		\$460.00			Correspond with team about trial brief;	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1147	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/18/2015	4.00	\$600.00	\$2,400.00	\$575.00		\$2,300.00			Review and comment on trial brief;	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1148	Branch, Aria C.	6/19/2015	1.40	\$380.00	\$532.00	\$345.00		\$483.00			Review trial brief (1.0); file trial brief (0.4);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1149	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/19/2015	2.90	\$620.00	\$1,798.00	\$575.00		\$1,667.50			Review, revise and finalize trial brief (2.9);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1150	Roberts, Rachel M.	6/19/2015	2.00	\$125.00	\$250.00	\$125.00		\$250.00			Edit pretrial brief per B. Spiva instructions (.4); Check cites to exhibits in pretrial brief (1); Finalize and file pretrial brief and exhibit list with A. Branch (.6);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1151	Roche, John K.	6/19/2015	0.50	\$535.00	\$267.50	\$465.00		\$232.50			Review trial brief and exchange emails with R. Spear and A. Branch regarding filing of same;	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1152	Spear, Ryan M.	6/19/2015	3.20	\$500.00	\$1,600.00	\$410.00		\$1,312.00			Prepare trial brief (2.5); review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton and A. Branch regarding same (.2); confer with K. Hamilton and B. Spiva regarding same (.2); coordinate filing of same (.3);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1153	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/19/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Review and revise trial brief;	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1154	Elias, Marc E.	6/20/2015	1.50	\$735.00	\$1,102.50	\$575.00		\$862.50			Review trial briefs;	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1155	Spear, Ryan M.	6/23/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Review factual stipulation (.2); review and respond to emails with B. Stafford regarding same (.1);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1156	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/24/2015	1.90	\$620.00	\$1,178.00	\$575.00		\$1,092.50			Review and revise draft objections memorandum (1.9);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1157	Spear, Ryan M.	6/24/2015	0.60	\$500.00	\$300.00	\$410.00		\$246.00			Confer with opposing counsel regarding proposed factual stipulation and objections to exhibits (.6);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1158	Stafford, William B.	6/24/2015	1.50	\$495.00	\$742.50	\$405.00		\$607.50			Revise factual stipulation (1.5);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1159	Branch, Aria C.	6/25/2015	0.30	\$380.00	\$114.00	\$345.00		\$103.50			Edit factual stipulation (0.3);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1160	Spear, Ryan M.	6/25/2015	0.60	\$500.00	\$300.00	\$410.00		\$246.00			Review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding factual stipulation (.1); prepare stipulation regarding exhibits (.4); review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton regarding same (.1);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1161	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/25/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with R. Spear about objection revisions;	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1162	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/25/2015	1.20	\$600.00	\$720.00	\$575.00		\$690.00			Review objections to intervenors' trial exhibits;	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1163	Stafford, William B.	6/25/2015	0.80	\$495.00	\$396.00	\$405.00		\$324.00			Review and revise objections to Intervenor's proposed trial exhibits;	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1164	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/26/2015	2.00	\$600.00	\$1,200.00	\$575.00		\$1,150.00			Review and revise objection to deposition designations and declaration supporting same;	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1165	Roberts, Rachel M.	6/29/2015	0.40	\$125.00	\$50.00	\$125.00		\$50.00			File exhibit to stipulated facts (.4);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1166	Stafford, William B.	6/29/2015	0.40	\$495.00	\$198.00	\$405.00		\$162.00			Review intervenors' revisions to proposed exhibit stipulation and exchange correspondence regarding same (.2); finalize and coordinate filing of factual stipulation (.2);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1167	Stafford, William B.	6/30/2015	0.30	\$495.00	\$148.50	\$405.00		\$121.50			Conference with opposing counsel regarding to exhibit stipulation (.2); revise and coordinate filing of same (.1);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1168	Roberts, Rachel M.	7/1/2015	1.00	\$125.00	\$125.00	\$125.00		\$125.00			Finalize and file exhibit stipulation, circulate same to team (1);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1169	Spear, Ryan M.	7/2/2015	5.70	\$500.00	\$2,850.00	\$410.00		\$2,337.00			Prepare reply in support of Plaintiffs' objections to proposed trial exhibits (4.4); research issues regarding same (1.3);	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1170	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/2/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Review and comment on reply in support of objections;	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1171	Stafford, William B.	7/2/2015	1.30	\$495.00	\$643.50	\$405.00		\$526.50			Revise reply in support of evidentiary objections;	Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1172			115.10		\$60,585.50			\$52,859.00				SUBTOTAL for Pretrial Briefing - First Trial
1173	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/15/2015	1.10	\$620.00	\$682.00	\$575.00		\$632.50			Conference with B. Spiva regarding trial logistics, division of responsibilities, and upcoming depositions (.6); exchange email with R. Spear regarding same (.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1174	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/16/2015	2.40	\$620.00	\$1,488.00	\$575.00		\$1,380.00			Review and respond to email regarding staffing for trial and paralegal support (.5); conference with B. Spiva regarding same (.5); conference with A. Brown regarding same (.4); conference with M. Elias regarding staffing and related issues (1.0);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1175	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/17/2015	2.20	\$620.00	\$1,364.00	\$575.00		\$1,265.00			Review and respond to email regarding paralegal staffing, preparation of trial exhibits, potential illustrative exhibits and related issues (1.2); conference with M. Elias regarding staffing (.5); exchange email with B. Spiva regarding staffing (.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1176	Spear, Ryan M.	4/19/2015	1.20	\$500.00	\$600.00	\$410.00		\$492.00			Review key documents (1.0); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding same and preliminary exhibit list (0.2);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1177	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/21/2015	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review logistics for identifying trial exhibits (.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1178	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/24/2015	0.60	\$620.00	\$372.00	\$575.00		\$345.00			Coordinate trial logistics with M. Rhoads (.6);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1179	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/26/2015	0.10	\$600.00	\$60.00	\$575.00		\$57.50			Review correspondence regarding local counsel;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1180	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/27/2015	2.70	\$620.00	\$1,674.00	\$575.00		\$1,552.50			Review potential exhibits (.8); review transcript of legislative hearing and coordinate transcription (1.9);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1181	Spear, Ryan M.	4/27/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding potential stipulations to seek (.2);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1182	Spear, Ryan M.	4/29/2015	0.80	\$500.00	\$400.00	\$410.00		\$328.00			Coordinate meeting with local counsel (.1); review exhibits from Page case (.7);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1183	Stafford, William B.	4/29/2015	1.00	\$495.00	\$495.00	\$405.00		\$405.00			Review documents for potential use as trial exhibits;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1184	Spear, Ryan M.	4/30/2015	0.60	\$500.00	\$300.00	\$410.00		\$246.00			Confer with local counsel and K. Hamilton regarding scheduling, logistics, and trial strategy (.5); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding trial exhibits (.1);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1185	Stafford, William B.	4/30/2015	0.80	\$495.00	\$396.00	\$405.00		\$324.00			Review documents for potential use as trial exhibits;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1186	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/3/2015	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Exchange email with B. Stafford regarding exhibits from Page litigation and potential use of DOJ submission (.9);	Trial Preparation - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1187	Stafford, William B.	5/3/2015	0.70	\$495.00	\$346.50	\$405.00		\$283.50			Review Page exhibits for potential use in Bethune-Hill;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1188	Marino, Patricia	5/4/2015	0.60	\$220.00	\$132.00	\$190.00		\$114.00			Telephone conference with Judge Lee judicial clerk regarding trial logistics and related follow-up (.6);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1189	Spear, Ryan M.	5/4/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding trial location and logistics (.3);.	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1190	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/4/2015	0.50	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review floor debates on HB5005;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1191	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/4/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with team about trial planning;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1192	Stafford, William B.	5/4/2015	0.40	\$495.00	\$198.00	\$405.00		\$162.00			Finalize identification of Page trial exhibits for purposes of Bethune-Hill;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1193	Spear, Ryan M.	5/5/2015	0.50	\$500.00	\$250.00	\$410.00		\$205.00			Confer with B. Stafford regarding exhibit lists and other discovery issues (.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1194	Stafford, William B.	5/5/2015	1.30	\$495.00	\$643.50	\$405.00		\$526.50			Identify potential Page trial exhibits for Bethune-Hill (1.0); exchange correspondence with R. Spear and T. Marino regarding same (.3);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1195	Marino, Patricia	5/6/2015	5.70	\$220.00	\$1,254.00	\$190.00		\$1,083.00			Compile/organize potential deposition / trial preparation materials for attorneys' further evaluation (4.2); draft index (1.0); conference with R. Spear and B. Stafford regarding trial exhibit action items (.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1196	Spear, Ryan M.	5/6/2015	0.80	\$500.00	\$400.00	\$410.00		\$328.00			Confer with B. Stafford and and T. Marino regarding exhibit lists, potential exhibit stipulations, and other discovery issues (.8);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1197	Stafford, William B.	5/6/2015	3.00	\$495.00	\$1,485.00	\$405.00		\$1,215.00			Meet with R. Spear and T. Marino to discuss approach for identifying potential trial exhibits for stipulation with opposing counsel (.8); review key documents to identify potential trial exhibits (2.2);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1198	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/8/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Telephone conference with team about trial planning and depositions (1);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1199	Stafford, William B.	5/10/2015	1.50	\$495.00	\$742.50	\$405.00		\$607.50			Identify and review documents for inclusion on exhibit list;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1200	Branch, Aria C.	5/12/2015	0.50	\$380.00	\$190.00	\$345.00		\$172.50			Review Page exhibits;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1201	Marino, Patricia	5/12/2015	0.40	\$220.00	\$88.00	\$190.00		\$76.00			Conference with B. Stafford regarding trial exhibits (.4);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1202	Spear, Ryan M.	5/12/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Review and respond to emails with B. Stafford and A. Branch regarding trial exhibits (.2);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1203	Stafford, William B.	5/12/2015	1.70	\$495.00	\$841.50	\$405.00		\$688.50			Review key documents in database for potential inclusion on exhibit list and draft correspondence to T. Marino regarding same;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1204	Spear, Ryan M.	5/14/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Review and respond to emails with D. Glass regarding pretrial scheduling order (.2);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1205	Spear, Ryan M.	5/15/2015	0.10	\$500.00	\$50.00	\$410.00		\$41.00			Review and respond to emails with B. Stafford regarding exhibit list (.1);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1206	Spear, Ryan M.	5/19/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding preliminary exhibit list (.2);	Trial Preparation - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1207	Marino, Patricia	5/20/2015	4.00	\$220.00	\$880.00	\$190.00		\$760.00			Respond to attorneys' requests regarding preliminary trial exhibits and draft/update index regarding same (4.0);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1208	Stafford, William B.	5/20/2015	1.20	\$495.00	\$594.00	\$405.00		\$486.00			Review potential trial exhibits to prepare preliminary exhibit list and draft correspondence to T. Marino regarding creation of same (1.2);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1209	Marino, Patricia	5/21/2015	1.20	\$220.00	\$264.00	\$190.00		\$228.00			Respond to attorneys' requests regarding preliminary trial exhibits and draft index (1.2);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1210	Stafford, William B.	5/21/2015	0.90	\$495.00	\$445.50	\$405.00		\$364.50			Review and revise preliminary trial exhibit list (.9);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1211	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/22/2015	2.30	\$620.00	\$1,426.00	\$575.00		\$1,322.50			Draft, revise and finalize cover letter enclosing proposed stipulations as to exhibits (.9); conference with B. Stafford regarding proposed stipulated exhibit list (.9); review revised exhibit list and conference with B. Stafford regarding same (.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1212	Spear, Ryan M.	5/22/2015	0.10	\$500.00	\$50.00	\$410.00		\$41.00			Review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding preliminary exhibit list (.1);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1213	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/22/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Review list of exhibits;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1214	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/22/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Review Court's order about pre trial conference;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1215	Stafford, William B.	5/22/2015	0.70	\$495.00	\$346.50	\$405.00		\$283.50			Review and finalize preliminary exhibit list (.7);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1216	Marino, Patricia	5/23/2015	7.70	\$220.00	\$1,694.00	\$190.00		\$1,463.00			Review/compile potential trial exhibits for attorneys' further evaluation and revise/update index regarding same (7.7);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1217	Marino, Patricia	5/24/2015	6.50	\$220.00	\$1,430.00	\$190.00		\$1,235.00			Review/compile potential trial exhibits for attorneys' further evaluation and revise/update index regarding same (6.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1218	Marino, Patricia	5/25/2015	3.20	\$220.00	\$704.00	\$190.00		\$608.00			Review/compile potential trial exhibits for attorneys' further evaluation and revise/update index regarding same (3.2);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1219	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/26/2015	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Review initial trial exhibit list and respond to related email (.9);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1220	Marino, Patricia	5/26/2015	1.80	\$220.00	\$396.00	\$190.00		\$342.00			Revise/update potential trial exhibit index/ materials (1.8);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1221	Stafford, William B.	5/26/2015	5.10	\$495.00	\$2,524.50	\$405.00		\$2,065.50			Review documents for potential inclusion on trial exhibit list (5.1);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1222	Marino, Patricia	5/27/2015	2.50	\$220.00	\$550.00	\$190.00		\$475.00			Compile/organize potential trial exhibit materials for attorneys' further evaluation and update index (2.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1223	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/27/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with R. Roberts about documents and trial;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1224	Marino, Patricia	5/28/2015	1.00	\$220.00	\$220.00	\$190.00		\$190.00			Compile/organize potential trial exhibit materials for attorneys' further evaluation (1.0);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1225	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/28/2015	2.90	\$600.00	\$1,740.00	\$575.00		\$1,667.50			Read depositions to prepare for trial;	Trial Preparation - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1226	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/29/2015	0.70	\$620.00	\$434.00	\$575.00		\$402.50			Review email regarding trial logistics (.5); conference with B. Spiva regarding same (.2);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1227	Marino, Patricia	5/29/2015	0.80	\$220.00	\$176.00	\$190.00		\$152.00			Compile/organize potential trial exhibit materials for attorneys' further evaluation (.5); communications/coordination regarding trial logistics (.3);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1228	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/29/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Correspond with M. Elias regarding trial logistics;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1229	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/29/2015	0.80	\$600.00	\$480.00	\$575.00		\$460.00			Correspond with T. Marino and team about logistics;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1230	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/30/2015	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Review and respond to email regarding trial logistics and scheduling issues;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1231	Marino, Patricia	5/30/2015	3.70	\$220.00	\$814.00	\$190.00		\$703.00			Respond to attorneys' requests for information documents (1.2); compile/organize potential trial exhibits and revise/update indices (2.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1232	Spear, Ryan M.	5/30/2015	0.70	\$500.00	\$350.00	\$410.00		\$287.00			Review and respond to emails regarding exhibits (.4); review and respond to emails with B. Spiva regarding potential exhibits (.2); review and respond to emails with C. Gilbert regarding research projects (.1);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1233	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/30/2015	0.50	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review potential exhibit from Virginia's Section 5 filing and correspond with team regarding same;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1234	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/30/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with T. Marino regarding logistics;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1235	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/30/2015	0.40	\$600.00	\$240.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Correspond with team about exhibits;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1236	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/31/2015	1.70	\$620.00	\$1,054.00	\$575.00		\$977.50			Review and respond to email regarding trial logistics (.9); exchange email with S. Ansolabehere regarding trial scheduling (.3); exchange email with T. Marino regarding equipment for trial war room in hotel and related logistical issues (.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1237	Marino, Patricia	5/31/2015	2.80	\$220.00	\$616.00	\$190.00		\$532.00			Respond to attorney requests for information/documents and trial preparations (.5); revise/update potential trial exhibit list and process deposition transcript materials for attorneys further review (2.3);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1238	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/31/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Review multiple emails about trial preparation;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1239	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/31/2015	0.10	\$600.00	\$60.00	\$575.00		\$57.50			Correspond with R. Spear about call;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1240	Callais, Amanda R.	6/1/2015	0.20	\$380.00	\$76.00	\$345.00		\$69.00			Review supplemental McClellan production for relevancy and use in trial;	Trial Preparation - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1241	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/1/2015	6.50	\$620.00	\$4,030.00	\$575.00		\$3,737.50			Review transcript of deposition of C. Marston (1.5); outline "theory of the case" presentation for court hearing on Thursday and circulate for comment (1.2); identify potential trial exhibits and conference with trial team regarding same (.9); identify trial witnesses and likely defense witnesses and assign responsibility and related discussion (2.9);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1242	Marino, Patricia	6/1/2015	0.80	\$220.00	\$176.00	\$190.00		\$152.00			Communications/coordinate trial logistics (.8);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1243	Roberts, Rachel M.	6/1/2015	0.80	\$125.00	\$100.00	\$125.00		\$100.00			Research vendor for copies/demonstratives at trial, send correspondence re: same (.50); review correspondence re: trial logistics (.3);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1244	Spear, Ryan M.	6/1/2015	0.60	\$500.00	\$300.00	\$410.00		\$246.00			Review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton and T. Marino regarding exhibits (.1); confer with C. Gilbert regarding research project (.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1245	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/1/2015	1.20	\$600.00	\$720.00	\$575.00		\$690.00			Review materials for trial;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1246	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/1/2015	0.50	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Correspond with K. Hamilton about witness sequencing;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1247	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/1/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			confer with team regarding trial(.20);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1248	Callais, Amanda R.	6/2/2015	1.70	\$380.00	\$646.00	\$345.00		\$586.50			Review subset of documents produced for relevance and potential trial use (1.1); Search document database for attachments to potentially relevant documents to determine potential use of documents in trial (.3); Confer with R. Roberts about attachment searches (.1); Confer with B. Spiva about potential use of relevant attachments in trial (.2);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1249	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/2/2015	1.90	\$620.00	\$1,178.00	\$575.00		\$1,092.50			Conference with B. Spiva and legal team regarding trial responsibilities and related issues (1.9);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1250	Spear, Ryan M.	6/2/2015	0.70	\$500.00	\$350.00	\$410.00		\$287.00			Confer with T. Marino regarding production of potential exhibits to opposing counsel and other discovery-related issues (.3); review and respond to emails with opposing counsel regarding joint response to court order (.2); confer with N. Crown regarding potential research project (.2);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1251	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/2/2015	2.40	\$600.00	\$1,440.00	\$575.00		\$1,380.00			Review depositions and documents to prepare for trial;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1252	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/2/2015	0.50	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review documents and correspond with team about same;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1253	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/2/2015	0.40	\$600.00	\$240.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Review and comment on theory of case document;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1254	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/2/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Confer with A. Branch about witness preparation;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1255	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/2/2015	0.40	\$600.00	\$240.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Telephone conference with K. Hamilton about witnesses;	Trial Preparation - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1256	Branch, Aria C.	6/3/2015	0.50	\$380.00	\$190.00	\$345.00		\$172.50			Conference call regarding analysis of maps;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1257	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/3/2015	2.90	\$620.00	\$1,798.00	\$575.00		\$1,667.50			Prepare for and participate in telephone conference regarding alternative maps (1.2); telephone conference with R. Spear regarding related issues (.5); review and respond to decisional email regarding same (.5); prepare for pretrial conference with court;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1258	Spear, Ryan M.	6/3/2015	0.50	\$500.00	\$250.00	\$410.00		\$205.00			Confer with N. Crown regarding research assignment (.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1259	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/3/2015	0.80	\$600.00	\$480.00	\$575.00		\$460.00			Correspond with team about alternative maps and review emails regarding same;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1260	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/3/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Telephone conference with team regarding alternative maps;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1261	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/3/2015	0.40	\$600.00	\$240.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Review preliminary list of exhibits;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1262	Stafford, William B.	6/3/2015	1.60	\$495.00	\$792.00	\$405.00		\$648.00			Prepare for and participate in conference call regarding alternative maps (1.0); conference with R. Spear regarding strategy for alternative maps (.6);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1263	Marino, Patricia	6/4/2015	4.30	\$220.00	\$946.00	\$190.00		\$817.00			Compile/organize potential trial exhibits and revise/update index per attorney instruction (4.3);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1264	Spear, Ryan M.	6/4/2015	0.50	\$500.00	\$250.00	\$410.00		\$205.00			Review exhibit list (.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1265	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/4/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with team about trial preparation;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1266	Stafford, William B.	6/4/2015	1.20	\$495.00	\$594.00	\$405.00		\$486.00			Prepare exhibit list (1.2);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1267	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/5/2015	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Conference with M. Elias regarding staffing and related strategy issues (.4); review and respond to email regarding exhibits, witnesses and trial planning (.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1268	Marino, Patricia	6/5/2015	6.30	\$220.00	\$1,386.00	\$190.00		\$1,197.00			Respond to attorneys requests for information/documents and compile/update potential trial exhibits/index per attorney instruction (6.3);	Trial Preparation - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1269	Spear, Ryan M.	6/5/2015	4.40	\$500.00	\$2,200.00	\$410.00		\$1,804.00			Confer with C. Gilbert regarding research project regarding Voting Rights Act (.5); review decision in Page v. Va. St. Bd. of Elections (1.1); confer with K. Hamilton regarding same (.3); review and respond to emails with B. Stafford and T. Marino regarding transfer of proposed exhibits (.2); confer with B. Stafford regarding motions in limine and exhibits (.2); gather potential exhibits (.7); confer with K. Hamilton regarding potential exhibits (.1); prepare updated to-do list and circulate to litigation team (1.0); review and respond to emails with T. Marino regarding contact for logistical arrangements at Alexandria courthouse (.1); review and respond to emails with opposing counsel regarding review of proposed exhibits (.2);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1270	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/5/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Met with summer associates about research;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1271	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/5/2015	0.50	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Confer with A. Callais about research concerning use of race as proxy and remedies;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1272	Stafford, William B.	6/5/2015	2.00	\$495.00	\$990.00	\$405.00		\$810.00			Prepare supplemental list of potential trial exhibits (.5); identify additional documents for inclusion on trial exhibit list (1.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1273	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/6/2015	1.50	\$620.00	\$930.00	\$575.00		\$862.50			Review and respond to email regarding witness assignments, exhibits, and trial logistical issues;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1274	Marino, Patricia	6/6/2015	9.70	\$220.00	\$2,134.00	\$190.00		\$1,843.00			Review/compile/organize potential trial exhibits and revise/update index for attorneys' further evaluation (9.7);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1275	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/6/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Correspond with team about blow-up exhibits;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1276	Marino, Patricia	6/7/2015	2.00	\$220.00	\$440.00	\$190.00		\$380.00			Review//compile/organize potential trial exhibits and revise/update index for attorneys' further evaluation (1.5); communications/further coordination regarding trial logistics (.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1277	Branch, Aria C.	6/8/2015	1.00	\$380.00	\$380.00	\$345.00		\$345.00			Trial preparation activity;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1278	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/8/2015	4.00	\$620.00	\$2,480.00	\$575.00		\$2,300.00			Conference with B. Stafford and R. Spear regarding trial brief, witness outlines and trial exhibits (1.5); review and designate potential trial exhibits from deposition transcripts (2.5)	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1279	Marino, Patricia	6/8/2015	4.60	\$220.00	\$1,012.00	\$190.00		\$874.00			Review/compile/organize potential trial exhibits and confer with attorney regarding same (4.0); communications/coordination regarding trial logistics (.6)	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1280	Spear, Ryan M.	6/8/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding Intervenor's response to proposed preliminary exhibits (.1); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding alternative map analysis (.2);	Trial Preparation - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1281	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/8/2015	0.40	\$600.00	\$240.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Correspond with R. Spear about map call and exhibits;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1282	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/8/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with team about limiting defense experts;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1283	Stafford, William B.	6/8/2015	0.10	\$495.00	\$49.50	\$405.00		\$40.50			Exchange correspondence regarding exhibit list (.1);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1284	Branch, Aria C.	6/9/2015	6.70	\$380.00	\$2,546.00	\$345.00		\$2,311.50			Trial preparation;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1285	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/9/2015	1.60	\$620.00	\$992.00	\$575.00		\$920.00			Review Ansolabehere expert reports and preparation for testimony (.9); exchange email regarding witness examination and coordination (.7);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1286	Marino, Patricia	6/9/2015	4.80	\$220.00	\$1,056.00	\$190.00		\$912.00			Respond to attorneys requests for information/documents (1.0); review//compile/organize potential trial exhibits and revise/update index (3.8);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1287	Roberts, Rachel M.	6/9/2015	0.15	\$125.00	\$18.75	\$125.00		\$18.75			Email B. Stafford re: origin of potential trial exhibits (.15);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1288	Spear, Ryan M.	6/9/2015	1.40	\$500.00	\$700.00	\$410.00		\$574.00			Confer with K. Hamilton regarding map analysis (.3); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding same (.5); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding engagement letter (.1); prepare response to J. Walrath regarding exhibits (.3); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding witness preparation (.2);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1289	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/9/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Review potential exhibits for trial and correspond with team about same;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1290	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/9/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with team about meeting regarding exhibits;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1291	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/9/2015	0.40	\$600.00	\$240.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Correspond with A. Branch about local counsel role and about witnesses;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1292	Stafford, William B.	6/9/2015	1.50	\$495.00	\$742.50	\$405.00		\$607.50			Exchange correspondence and meet with K. Hamilton and team to discuss exhibits (.9); participate in call to discuss alternative map (.6);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1293	Branch, Aria C.	6/10/2015	2.00	\$380.00	\$760.00	\$345.00		\$690.00			Trial preparation;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1294	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/10/2015	1.20	\$620.00	\$744.00	\$575.00		\$690.00			Review and respond to email from litigation team regarding trial subpoenas, trial logistics and related issues (1.2);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1295	Marino, Patricia	6/10/2015	12.30	\$220.00	\$2,706.00	\$190.00		\$2,337.00			Prepare/ finalize plaintiffs' preliminary stipulated trial exhibits per attorney instruction for opposing counsel review (3.5); review//compile/organize potential trial exhibits and revise/update index for attorneys' further evaluation (8.80);	Trial Preparation - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1296	Spear, Ryan M.	6/10/2015	3.40	\$500.00	\$1,700.00	\$410.00		\$1,394.00			Review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding production of preliminary exhibits (.3); review and respond to emails with opposing counsel regarding same (.2); confer with N. Crown regarding research project and gather materials regarding same (.1); review J. McClellan documents and identify potential exhibits (1.1); review transcript of April 25, 2011 hearing in order to identify potential exhibits (.4); review exhibits from depositions in order to identify potential exhibits (.9); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding trial subpoenas (.2); review trial subpoenas (.2);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1297	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/10/2015	0.90	\$600.00	\$540.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Review potential exhibits (from Hofeller deposition) and correspond with team about same;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1298	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/10/2015	1.20	\$600.00	\$720.00	\$575.00		\$690.00			Review caselaw regarding purpose of alternative maps;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1299	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/10/2015	0.80	\$600.00	\$480.00	\$575.00		\$460.00			Telephone conference with B. Stafford and R. Spear about maps;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1300	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/10/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with K. Hamilton about allegations in new suit concerning racially polarized voting in Virginia;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1301	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/10/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Correspond with A. Branch about witnesses;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1302	Stafford, William B.	6/10/2015	1.30	\$495.00	\$643.50	\$405.00		\$526.50			Conference with R. Spear regarding trial exhibits and factual issue to resolve prior to trial (.5); conference with R. Spear and B. Spiva regarding strategy concerning alternative map (.8);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1303	Branch, Aria C.	6/11/2015	6.00	\$380.00	\$2,280.00	\$345.00		\$2,070.00			Review Dance deposition and other trial preparation (5.0); Draft trial subpoenas and set up delivery (1.0);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1304	Marino, Patricia	6/11/2015	15.00	\$220.00	\$3,300.00	\$190.00		\$2,850.00			Respond to attorneys requests for information/documents and database search issues (1.0); review//compile/organize potential trial exhibits and revise/update index for attorneys' further evaluation (14.0);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1305	Roche, John K.	6/11/2015	0.20	\$535.00	\$107.00	\$465.00		\$93.00			Review trial subpoenas, research local rules, and exchange emails with A. Branch regarding revisions to subpoenas;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1306	Spear, Ryan M.	6/11/2015	3.30	\$500.00	\$1,650.00	\$410.00		\$1,353.00			Gather potential exhibits (1.7); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding witness preparation (.2); review and respond to emails with N. Crown and C. Gilbert regarding research projects (.2); review documents produced by J. Katz in order to identify potential exhibits (1.2);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1307	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/11/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Review draft trial subpoenas and correspond with A. Branch regarding same;	Trial Preparation - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1308	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/11/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Correspond with E. Hogin about memo regarding research;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1309	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/11/2015	0.40	\$600.00	\$240.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Correspond with R. Spear about substitution of plaintiff and about Commission maps;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1310	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/11/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Correspond with team regarding exhibits;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1311	Stafford, William B.	6/11/2015	1.30	\$495.00	\$643.50	\$405.00		\$526.50			Conference with T. Marino and R. Spear regarding preparation of final exhibit list and review potential trial exhibits for inclusion on exhibit list;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1312	Branch, Aria C.	6/12/2015	1.50	\$380.00	\$570.00	\$345.00		\$517.50			Trial preparation;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1313	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/12/2015	2.50	\$620.00	\$1,550.00	\$575.00		\$1,437.50			Prepare for and telephone conference with S. Ansolabehere regarding preparation for direct testimony and preparation of related exhibits (1.5); review and respond to email regarding subpoenas to delegate-witnesses and related document production (.7); review and respond to email regarding witness preparation scheduling issues (.3);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1314	Marino, Patricia	6/12/2015	7.50	\$220.00	\$1,650.00	\$190.00		\$1,425.00			Review//compile/organize potential trial exhibits and revise/update index for attorneys' further evaluation (7.3); respond to attorney requests for information/documents (.2);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1315	Spear, Ryan M.	6/12/2015	0.90	\$500.00	\$450.00	\$410.00		\$369.00			Review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding trial subpoenas (.1); review and respond to emails with C. Gilbert regarding research memorandum (.1); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding follow-up on subpoenas to R. Dance and R. Tyler (.2); review Intervenor's letter regarding exhibits (.1); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding same (.2); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding potential deposition designations (.2);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1316	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/12/2015	0.50	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review emails regarding various trial preparation topics;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1317	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/12/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Correspond with R. Spear about Marston designations and trial testimony;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1318	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/12/2015	0.10	\$600.00	\$60.00	\$575.00		\$57.50			Correspond with T. Marino regarding exhibits;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1319	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/12/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Confer with A. Branch about Dance & McClellan preparation;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1320	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/12/2015	0.40	\$600.00	\$240.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Review memo regarding race as proxy;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1321	Stafford, William B.	6/12/2015	0.40	\$495.00	\$198.00	\$405.00		\$162.00			Conference with T. Marino regarding preparation of trial exhibits (.4);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1322	Branch, Aria C.	6/13/2015	1.20	\$380.00	\$456.00	\$345.00		\$414.00			Review deposition transcript in preparation for trial;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1323	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/13/2015	0.60	\$620.00	\$372.00	\$575.00		\$345.00			Review and respond to email regarding exhibit list analysis (.6);	Trial Preparation - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1324	Marino, Patricia	6/13/2015	12.00	\$220.00	\$2,640.00	\$190.00		\$2,280.00			Review//compile/organize potential trial exhibits and revise/update index for attorneys' further evaluation (12.0);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1325	Spear, Ryan M.	6/13/2015	1.20	\$500.00	\$600.00	\$410.00		\$492.00			Review C. Gilbert research memorandum (.5); review N. Crown research memorandum (.6); review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton regarding summer associate research project (.1);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1326	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/13/2015	0.50	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review potential trial exhibits;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1327	Stafford, William B.	6/13/2015	0.70	\$495.00	\$346.50	\$405.00		\$283.50			Exchange correspondence regarding exhibit list (.30); prepare same in advance of meeting to make final determinations on exhibit list (.40);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1328	Branch, Aria C.	6/14/2015	4.30	\$380.00	\$1,634.00	\$345.00		\$1,483.50			Conference call regarding trial exhibits (2.8); review deposition transcript in preparation for trial (1.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1329	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/14/2015	5.50	\$620.00	\$3,410.00	\$575.00		\$3,162.50			Prepare for and participate in review of proposed trial exhibits and related discussion (4.5); follow up regarding coordination of finalization of trial exhibits (.5); review outstanding trial preparation work (.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1330	Marino, Patricia	6/14/2015	4.00	\$220.00	\$880.00	\$190.00		\$760.00			Review/search database in response to attorney request for information/documents (.4); revise/update potential trial exhibits per attorney instruction (3.6);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1331	Spear, Ryan M.	6/14/2015	1.70	\$500.00	\$850.00	\$410.00		\$697.00			Review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding deposition designation (.2); confer with litigation team regarding exhibits (1.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1332	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/14/2015	3.80	\$600.00	\$2,280.00	\$575.00		\$2,185.00			Confer with team about trial exhibits;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1333	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/14/2015	1.50	\$600.00	\$900.00	\$575.00		\$862.50			Review potential trial exhibits;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1334	Stafford, William B.	6/14/2015	5.20	\$495.00	\$2,574.00	\$405.00		\$2,106.00			Participate in meeting to make final exhibit determinations for trial exhibit list (4.5); prepare correspondence summarizing outstanding tasks after meeting to finalize same (.4); conduct additional research regarding certain exhibits (.3);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1335	Branch, Aria C.	6/15/2015	7.30	\$380.00	\$2,774.00	\$345.00		\$2,518.50			Schedule trial prep sessions (1.0); review W. Armstrong deposition transcript (2.0); trial preparation (4.3);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1336	Callais, Amanda R.	6/15/2015	2.30	\$380.00	\$874.00	\$345.00		\$793.50			Confer with B. Spiva about deposition designations (.2); Read and review Marston Deposition to select trial designations (2.1);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1337	Elias, Marc E.	6/15/2015	0.50	\$735.00	\$367.50	\$575.00		\$287.50			Email regarding map issues (.4); review same (.1);	Trial Preparation - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1338	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/15/2015	4.40	\$620.00	\$2,728.00	\$575.00		\$2,530.00			review potential trial exhibits and conference regarding same (3.1); review potential demonstrative exhibits (.5); conference with T. Marino regarding blow ups for trial (.5); review and respond to email regarding witness preparation (.3);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1339	Marino, Patricia	6/15/2015	11.30	\$220.00	\$2,486.00	\$190.00		\$2,147.00			Review//compile/organize potential trial exhibits and revise/update index for attorneys' further evaluation (10.0); respond to attorneys' requests for information/documents (1.0); further coordination regarding trial logistics (.3);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1340	Roberts, Rachel M.	6/15/2015	0.45	\$125.00	\$56.25	\$125.00		\$56.25			Correspond with T. Marino and B. Stafford re: maps to use as potential trial exhibits (.45);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1341	Spear, Ryan M.	6/15/2015	1.30	\$500.00	\$650.00	\$410.00		\$533.00			Confer with litigation team regarding potential alternative maps and other strategy issues (.4); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding discovery and deposition designations (.2); review and respond to emails with B. Spiva and K. Hamilton regarding same (.2); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding letter to R. Dance (.1); confer with C. Gilbert regarding research regarding fact witnesses (.3); review and respond to emails with B. Stafford regarding request for copies of Intervenor's exhibits (.1);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1342	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/15/2015	0.50	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Deposition designations;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1343	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/15/2015	0.50	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Confer with A. Branch regarding witness preparation;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1344	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/15/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Confer with team about exhibits;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1345	Stafford, William B.	6/15/2015	0.60	\$495.00	\$297.00	\$405.00		\$243.00			Prepare exhibit list (.6);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1346	Branch, Aria C.	6/16/2015	7.10	\$380.00	\$2,698.00	\$345.00		\$2,449.50			Review Tyler deposition transcript for designations (1.5); review discovery materials for designations (0.8); review Tavenner documents (2.0); draft email to opposing counsel regarding discovery designations (0.2); trial preparation (2.6);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1347	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/16/2015	3.80	\$620.00	\$2,356.00	\$575.00		\$2,185.00			Review and revise draft exhibit list (1.9); conference with B. Stafford regarding exhibit lists (1.5); review deposition transcripts (.4);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1348	Marino, Patricia	6/16/2015	2.70	\$220.00	\$594.00	\$190.00		\$513.00			Respond to attorneys requests for information/documents (.7); compile defendant-intervenor proposed stipulated trial exhibits for attorneys review and compare with plaintiffs exhibits (1.5); communications with PTS and vendor regarding trial logistics (.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1349	Roberts, Rachel M.	6/16/2015	0.80	\$125.00	\$100.00	\$125.00		\$100.00			Follow-up on transcript order from pretrial conference (.7); circulate copy of same to team (.1);	Trial Preparation - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1350	Spear, Ryan M.	6/16/2015	1.30	\$500.00	\$650.00	\$410.00		\$533.00			Review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding discovery and deposition designations (.3); coordinate exchange of same (.1); review letter to R. Dance (.1); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding same (.1); confer with C. Gilbert regarding research project regarding fact witnesses (.2); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding alternative maps (.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1351	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/16/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Confer with team about trial preparation, alternative maps, and relief;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1352	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/16/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Confer with A. Callais about research;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1353	Stafford, William B.	6/16/2015	1.20	\$495.00	\$594.00	\$405.00		\$486.00			Exchange correspondence regarding defendants' requested addition to factual stipulation (.2); review and further revise 2nd cut of plaintiffs' exhibit list and exchange correspondence with T. Marino, K. Hamilton, and opposing counsel regarding exhibit list and related exchange issues (1.0);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1354	Branch, Aria C.	6/17/2015	6.00	\$380.00	\$2,280.00	\$345.00		\$2,070.00			Review Page trial transcript (3.5); review McClellan deposition transcript (1.5); organize binders of expert reports for submission to court (1.0);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1355	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/17/2015	3.10	\$620.00	\$1,922.00	\$575.00		\$1,782.50			Review email regarding call from the court regarding submission of expert reports and related email and phone calls regarding logistics (1.2); review second cut at proposed exhibit list and related documents (1.9);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1356	Marino, Patricia	6/17/2015	9.50	\$220.00	\$2,090.00	\$190.00		\$1,805.00			Communications/conference with B. Stafford regarding plaintiffs' trial exhibits (.7); revise/update potential plaintiffs' trial exhibits per attorneys instruction and update index regarding same (8.5); respond to attorneys' requests for information/documents (.3);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1357	Roberts, Rachel M.	6/17/2015	1.85	\$125.00	\$231.25	\$125.00		\$231.25			Assemble courtesy copies of expert reports to send to court;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1358	Spear, Ryan M.	6/17/2015	0.40	\$500.00	\$200.00	\$410.00		\$164.00			Coordinate delivery of expert reports to judges' chambers (.1); review and respond to emails with B. Stafford regarding exchange of exhibits (.1); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding objections to Intervenor's proposed exhibits (.2);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1359	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/17/2015	0.50	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Correspond with team regarding experts;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1360	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/17/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Prepare for trial;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1361	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/17/2015	0.50	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review exhibits;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1362	Stafford, William B.	6/17/2015	2.50	\$495.00	\$1,237.50	\$405.00		\$1,012.50			Exchange correspondence regarding and work to finalize trial exhibit list (2.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1363	Branch, Aria C.	6/18/2015	5.50	\$380.00	\$2,090.00	\$345.00		\$1,897.50			Highlight transcripts (1.5); prepare binders of expert reports to send (1.5); review deposition transcripts for trial (2.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1364	Callais, Amanda R.	6/18/2015	0.30	\$380.00	\$114.00	\$345.00		\$103.50			Confer with B. Spiva about research regarding potential remedies in redistricting cases for trial preparation;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1365	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/18/2015	1.70	\$620.00	\$1,054.00	\$575.00		\$977.50			Review draft exhibit list (.9); conference with T. Marino and B. Stafford regarding same (.8);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1366	Marino, Patricia	6/18/2015	13.20	\$220.00	\$2,904.00	\$190.00		\$2,508.00			Revise/update plaintiffs' trial exhibits and index per attorneys' instruction (10.5); revise/edit appendix to plaintiffs' trial brief and compile supporting exhibits in preparation of filing (2.5); trial logistics coordination (.2);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1367	Roberts, Rachel M.	6/18/2015	0.20	\$125.00	\$25.00	\$125.00		\$25.00			Verify due date for objections to proposed exhibits (.2);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1368	Spear, Ryan M.	6/18/2015	0.80	\$500.00	\$400.00	\$410.00		\$328.00			Confer with K. Hamilton and B. Stafford regarding exhibits (.5); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding potential additional exhibits (.3);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1369	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/18/2015	1.50	\$600.00	\$900.00	\$575.00		\$862.50			Prepare for trial;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1370	Stafford, William B.	6/18/2015	1.70	\$495.00	\$841.50	\$405.00		\$688.50			Create final version of exhibit list (1.3); conference with K. Hamilton regarding objections to Intervenor's preliminary exhibit list (.4);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1371	Branch, Aria C.	6/19/2015	5.60	\$380.00	\$2,128.00	\$345.00		\$1,932.00			Meet with B. Spiva regarding direct examination preparation (1.2); review Page trial transcript (2.0); review depositions in preparation for trial (2.4);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1372	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/19/2015	4.90	\$620.00	\$3,038.00	\$575.00		\$2,817.50			review, revise and finalize trial exhibits (1.5); exchange related email (.5); review Intervenor's trial brief (1.5); conference with R. Spear regarding same (.9); exchange email with M. Elias regarding same (.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1373	Marino, Patricia	6/19/2015	9.00	\$220.00	\$1,980.00	\$190.00		\$1,710.00			Review/revise/finalize plaintiffs' trial exhibits /index and appendix to plaintiffs' trial brief per attorneys' instruction (8.0); respond to attorneys' requests for information/documents (1.0);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1374	Spear, Ryan M.	6/19/2015	2.50	\$500.00	\$1,250.00	\$410.00		\$1,025.00			prepare witness and exhibit list for filing (.5); confer with K. Hamilton regarding same (.2); coordinate filing of witness and exhibit list (.3); review and respond to emails with T. Marino regarding appendix (.1); review appendix (.4); review Intervenor's trial brief (.2); review Defendants' trial brief (.2); confer with K. Hamilton regarding other parties' trial briefs (.6);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1375	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/19/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Meet with A. Branch about witness preparation;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1376	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/19/2015	2.00	\$600.00	\$1,200.00	\$575.00		\$1,150.00			Prepare for trial;	Trial Preparation - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1377	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/19/2015	0.50	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review witness and exhibit list;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1378	Stafford, William B.	6/19/2015	0.30	\$495.00	\$148.50	\$405.00		\$121.50			Exchange correspondence regarding finalization of witness and exhibit lists;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1379	Branch, Aria C.	6/20/2015	6.20	\$380.00	\$2,356.00	\$345.00		\$2,139.00			Prepare for Dance direct examination;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1380	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/20/2015	4.90	\$620.00	\$3,038.00	\$575.00		\$2,817.50			Review defendants' trial brief and circulate comments on legal theories (2.2); review deposition transcript of Delegate Jones and outline potential cross examination (1.4); review deposition transcript of J. Katz and exchange email regarding potential cross examination (1.2); exchange related email (.1);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1381	Marino, Patricia	6/20/2015	9.00	\$220.00	\$1,980.00	\$190.00		\$1,710.00			Assemble/organize/update attorney working materials and courtroom trial exhibit materials (9.0);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1382	Spear, Ryan M.	6/20/2015	0.10	\$500.00	\$50.00	\$410.00		\$41.00			Review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton regarding Intervenor's exhibit lists (.1);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1383	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/20/2015	2.00	\$600.00	\$1,200.00	\$575.00		\$1,150.00			Prepare for trial;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1384	Branch, Aria C.	6/21/2015	5.50	\$380.00	\$2,090.00	\$345.00		\$1,897.50			Draft Dance and Armstrong direct examination outlines;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1385	Marino, Patricia	6/21/2015	2.80	\$220.00	\$616.00	\$190.00		\$532.00			Assemble/organize/update attorney working materials and courtroom trial exhibit materials (2.8);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1386	Spear, Ryan M.	6/21/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding trial strategy (.2);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1387	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/21/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Prepare for trial;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1388	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/21/2015	0.50	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Correspond with team regarding witness order and trial;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1389	Branch, Aria C.	6/22/2015	9.30	\$380.00	\$3,534.00	\$345.00		\$3,208.50			Outline Dance examination (3.0); draft objections to Intervenor's exhibits (1.5); review Armstrong deposition (2.0); begin outline of Armstrong examination (1.2); trial preparation (1.6);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1390	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/22/2015	5.90	\$620.00	\$3,658.00	\$575.00		\$3,392.50			Review intervenor-defendants' trial brief (.9); conference with litigation team regarding assignment of responsibilities and trial exhibits (1.5); review and revise draft objections to trial exhibits (1.3); conference with R. Spear regarding potential poster board and other illustrative exhibits (1.6); conference with T. Marino regarding trial logistics (.6);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1391	Marino, Patricia	6/22/2015	8.30	\$220.00	\$1,826.00	\$190.00		\$1,577.00			Compile/organize litigation trial materials (5.5); respond to attorneys' requests for information/documents and trial logistical issues (1.0); review/evaluate defendant-intervenor's trial exhibit list per attorney instruction and revise/update indices (1.8);	Trial Preparation - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1392	Roberts, Rachel M.	6/22/2015	0.30	\$125.00	\$37.50	\$125.00		\$37.50			Locate copies of 4/6/11 House of Delegates video cited by Defendant-Intervenors, email A. Branch re: same;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1393	Spear, Ryan M.	6/22/2015	3.80	\$500.00	\$1,900.00	\$410.00		\$1,558.00			Review deposition of S. Ansolabehere and exhibits (1.5); confer with K. Hamilton regarding trial exhibits and demonstrative exhibits (1.2); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding trials subpoenas (.2); review witness and exhibit lists of Defendants (.2); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding same (.1); review trial exhibits from previous trials as relevant to upcoming trial (.6);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1394	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/22/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with experts;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1395	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/22/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Prepare for trial;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1396	Stafford, William B.	6/22/2015	0.30	\$495.00	\$148.50	\$405.00		\$121.50			Exchange correspondence with opposing counsel regarding exchange of exhibits and factual stipulation;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1397	Branch, Aria C.	6/23/2015	7.00	\$380.00	\$2,660.00	\$345.00		\$2,415.00			Trial prep;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1398	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/23/2015	5.50	\$620.00	\$3,410.00	\$575.00		\$3,162.50			Conference with R. Spear and B. Stafford regarding objections to intervenors' trial exhibits (.9); review trial exhibits for potential objections (1.9); conference with R. Spear regarding poster board and other illustrative exhibits (1.5); review trial strategy and brainstorm potential issues with R. Spear (.8); review deposition designations and potential counter-designations (.4);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1399	Marino, Patricia	6/23/2015	9.50	\$220.00	\$2,090.00	\$190.00		\$1,805.00			Process/organize defendant-intervenors' trial exhibits for attorneys' further evaluation and revise/update indices (8.0); respond to attorney requests for information/documents (.5); communications/further coordination regarding trial logistics (1.0);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1400	Roberts, Rachel M.	6/23/2015	1.90	\$125.00	\$237.50	\$125.00		\$237.50			Review Dance Examination outline and insert cites to deposition transcript per A. Branch (1.9);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1401	Spear, Ryan M.	6/23/2015	10.00	\$500.00	\$5,000.00	\$410.00		\$4,100.00			Prepare objections to Intervenors' exhibits (3.3); research issues regarding same (2.1); review Intervenors' exhibits (.6); prepare notice of rebuttal witnesses (.5); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding same (.2); review trial subpoena for J. Morgan (.1); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding same (.1); prepare illustrative exhibits (.7); review deposition of S. Ansolabehere and exhibits (1.1); review parties' trial briefs (1.3);	Trial Preparation - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1402	Stafford, William B.	6/23/2015	3.10	\$495.00	\$1,534.50	\$405.00		\$1,255.50			Review intervenors' trial exhibits and determine objections to exhibit (1.9); review expert reports to assist K. Hamilton in trial preparation (1.0); facilitate review of articles by S. Ansolabehere listed on intervenors' exhibit list (.2);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1403	Branch, Aria C.	6/24/2015	4.00	\$380.00	\$1,520.00	\$345.00		\$1,380.00			Draft trial subpoena for J. Morgan (0.7); review Defendant-Intervenors' exhibit list (2.0); review deposition transcripts (1.3);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1404	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/24/2015	3.70	\$620.00	\$2,294.00	\$575.00		\$2,127.50			Review intervenors exhibits with B. Stafford regarding objections (1.5); review issues involving designations and counter-designations and conference with A. Branch regarding same (.7); review and revise draft illustrative exhibits and potential poster boards (1.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1405	Marino, Patricia	6/24/2015	6.70	\$220.00	\$1,474.00	\$190.00		\$1,273.00			Compile/organize trial exhibit/attorney working materials (4.2); respond to attorneys requests for information/documents (.5); further coordination regarding trial logistics (.5); conference with J. Pollack/PTS regarding trial director and related follow-up (1.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1406	Roberts, Rachel M.	6/24/2015	3.75	\$125.00	\$468.75	\$125.00		\$468.75			Review and edit outline of Dance examination per A. Branch and fill in cites to deposition/trial exhibits (3.5); update notebooks of trial exhibits (.15)	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1407	Spear, Ryan M.	6/24/2015	7.20	\$500.00	\$3,600.00	\$410.00		\$2,952.00			Prepare objections to Intervenors' proposed trial exhibits (4.2); research issues regarding same (1.7); confer with C. Anderson and C. Knowlden regarding poster boards for trial (.4); prepare message to court clerk regarding electronic devices for trial (.5); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding potential use of video at trial (.2); review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton regarding objections to counterdesignations (.2);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1408	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/24/2015	1.20	\$600.00	\$720.00	\$575.00		\$690.00			Telephone conference with team and opposing counsel regarding exhibits;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1409	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/24/2015	0.50	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Telephone conference with team regarding trial prep and exhibits;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1410	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/24/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Telephone conference with B. Stafford about exhibits;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1411	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/24/2015	2.00	\$600.00	\$1,200.00	\$575.00		\$1,150.00			Trial preparation;	Trial Preparation - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1412	Stafford, William B.	6/24/2015	5.80	\$495.00	\$2,871.00	\$405.00		\$2,349.00			Prepare itinerary for discussion with opposing counsel regarding trial exhibits and participate in conference call with opposing counsel to discuss objections to intervenors' trial exhibits with litigation team (3); draft objections to certain of intervenors' trial exhibits (1.9); draft correspondence to opposing counsel regarding trial exhibits (.5); prepare comprehensive list of exhibits to which plaintiffs object (.4);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1413	Branch, Aria C.	6/25/2015	10.90	\$380.00	\$4,142.00	\$345.00		\$3,760.50			Review objections to Intervenor's exhibit list (2.5); review discovery designations (1.0); review errata sheet (0.40); Draft Armstrong and McClellan examination outlines (7.0);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1414	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/25/2015	5.50	\$620.00	\$3,410.00	\$575.00		\$3,162.50			Review, revise and finalize objections to intervenors exhibits (1.9); conference with team regarding objections to counter-designations and related issues (.9); review potential illustrative exhibits and poster boards and exchange related email (1.2); organize materials for preparation of S. Ansolabehere direct examination (1.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1415	Marino, Patricia	6/25/2015	10.50	\$220.00	\$2,310.00	\$190.00		\$1,995.00			Respond to attorneys requests for information/documents and prepare/finalize exhibits in support of plaintiffs' objections to Intervenor's exhibits (4.5); compile/update attorneys working trial materials and revise/update indices (5.5); further coordination regarding trial logistics (.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1416	Roberts, Rachel M.	6/25/2015	1.10	\$125.00	\$137.50	\$125.00		\$137.50			Contact judge's chambers for courtesy copy filing instructions per A. Branch (1.10);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1417	Spear, Ryan M.	6/25/2015	8.70	\$500.00	\$4,350.00	\$410.00		\$3,567.00			Prepare and file objections to Intervenor's proposed trial exhibits (4.5); research issues regarding same (.9); prepare exhibits regarding same (.7); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding same, including briefing schedule (.4); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding witness preparation (.2); prepare and revise demonstrative exhibits (1.2); review and respond to emails with C. Knowlden and K. Hamilton regarding same (.2); review and respond to emails with J. Walrath regarding message to court clerk regarding electronic devices for trial (.2); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding trial subpoenas (.1); update litigation team regarding upcoming deadlines (.3);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1418	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/25/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Worked on trial preparation;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1419	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/25/2015	1.50	\$600.00	\$900.00	\$575.00		\$862.50			Worked on deposition counter designations;	Trial Preparation - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1420	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/25/2015	0.40	\$600.00	\$240.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Correspond with team regarding various trial preparation issues;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1421	Branch, Aria C.	6/26/2015	7.30	\$380.00	\$2,774.00	\$345.00		\$2,518.50			Review Defendant-intervenor's counterdesignations (1.0); conference call regarding trial preparations (1.5); discuss with opposing counsel and draft objection to Intervenor's counterdesignation (2.0); prepare Dance examination outline (2.8);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1422	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/26/2015	7.80	\$620.00	\$4,836.00	\$575.00		\$4,485.00			Review and revise potential illustrative exhibits and poster boards (1.9); prepare for and conference with legal team regarding legal strategy, illustrative exhibits, and related issues (1.5); exchange email with M. Elias regarding staffing and witness assignments (.9); review, revise and finalize objection to counter-designations to Marston deposition (1.2); begin to outline S. Ansolabehere direct examination (2.3);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1423	Marino, Patricia	6/26/2015	4.70	\$220.00	\$1,034.00	\$190.00		\$893.00			Telephone conference with attorney litigation team regarding trial prep/action items and related follow-up (1.3); compile/update attorneys working trial materials and revise/update indices (1.7); conference with PTS/J. Pollack regarding trial director /electronic evidence presentation and related follow-up (1.5); further coordination regarding trial logistics and communications judge's clerk (.2);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1424	Roberts, Rachel M.	6/26/2015	2.70	\$125.00	\$337.50	\$125.00		\$337.50			Prepare courtesy copies and cover letter for sending to judge's chambers (.65); send original deposition transcripts to T. Marino (.4); file stipulation of facts (.3); prepare exhibits to deposition objections and finalize brief for filing (.5); compress pdf files of deposition designations to be emailed (.4);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1425	Spear, Ryan M.	6/26/2015	5.40	\$500.00	\$2,700.00	\$410.00		\$2,214.00			Confer with litigation team regarding pretrial issues (1.6); prepare poster boards for trial (3.2); review and respond to emails with C. Knowlden regarding same (.2); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding same (.3); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding objections to counterdesignations (.1);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1426	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/26/2015	0.50	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review poster boards;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1427	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/26/2015	0.90	\$600.00	\$540.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Telephone conference with team about trial preparation and objections;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1428	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/26/2015	0.50	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Confer with A. Branch about designation objections;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1429	Stafford, William B.	6/26/2015	1.20	\$495.00	\$594.00	\$405.00		\$486.00			Meet with K. Hamilton, R. Spear, and B. Spiva to discuss demonstrative exhibits;	Trial Preparation - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1430	Branch, Aria C.	6/27/2015	7.70	\$380.00	\$2,926.00	\$345.00		\$2,656.50			Draft McClellan direct examination outline;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1431	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/27/2015	5.90	\$620.00	\$3,658.00	\$575.00		\$3,392.50			Review expert reports and prepare examination outline for S. Ansolabehere (3.9); prepare for and telephone conference with S. Ansolabehere regarding trial exhibits and related analysis (1.2); exchange email with B. Spiva regarding witness outlines and trial strategy (.8);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1432	Spear, Ryan M.	6/27/2015	0.10	\$500.00	\$50.00	\$410.00		\$41.00			Review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton regarding trial preparation (.1);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1433	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/27/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with R. Spear about Jones;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1434	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/27/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with K. Hamilton about Jones cross;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1435	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/27/2015	0.50	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Correspond with team about various trial issues;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1436	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/27/2015	2.00	\$600.00	\$1,200.00	\$575.00		\$1,150.00			Prepare for trial (witness outlines and exhibits);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1437	Branch, Aria C.	6/28/2015	8.30	\$380.00	\$3,154.00	\$345.00		\$2,863.50			Review additional deposition transcripts (4.0); prepare for witness prep sessions (4.3);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1438	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/28/2015	3.20	\$620.00	\$1,984.00	\$575.00		\$1,840.00			Review and revise draft witness examination outline for S. Ansolabehere (2.5); review and respond to related email (.3); exchange email regarding cross examination of other experts and coordination (.4);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1439	Marino, Patricia	6/28/2015	6.50	\$220.00	\$1,430.00	\$190.00		\$1,235.00			Compile/update attorneys working /trial materials (5.6); review/audit documents loaded into trial director and follow-up communications with PTS regarding same (.7); respond to attorney requests regarding witness preparation/exhibit slide (.2) ;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1440	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/28/2015	4.00	\$600.00	\$2,400.00	\$575.00		\$2,300.00			Prepare for trial (worked on witness outlines, review exhibits and depositions);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1441	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/28/2015	0.40	\$600.00	\$240.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Correspond with A. Branch regarding revising witness outlines;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1442	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/28/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with K. Hamilton about cross examinations;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1443	Branch, Aria C.	6/29/2015	11.50	\$380.00	\$4,370.00	\$345.00		\$3,967.50			Prepare for witness prep sessions (2.5); travel to Richmond, VA and conduct witness prep sessions (9.0)	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1444	Callais, Amanda R.	6/29/2015	0.40	\$380.00	\$152.00	\$345.00		\$138.00			Research remedies available in redistricting cases (.4);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1445	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/29/2015	5.90	\$620.00	\$3,658.00	\$575.00		\$3,392.50			Review and revise draft cross examination outline for Dr. Katz (2.8); conference with litigation team regarding scheduling and coordination of preparation sessions with witnesses (1.2); conference with T. Marino regarding courtroom logistics and blow ups (.9); finalize courtroom blowups (1.0);	Trial Preparation - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1446	Marino, Patricia	6/29/2015	5.00	\$220.00	\$1,100.00	\$190.00		\$950.00			Compile/organize attorney working /trial materials (3.4); review emails and respond to attorney requests for information/documents (.5); review/audit documents loaded into trial director and follow-up conference with PTS regarding same (.6); respond to attorney requests regarding demonstratives / witness exhibit slides (.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1447	Spear, Ryan M.	6/29/2015	3.40	\$500.00	\$1,700.00	\$410.00		\$1,394.00			Review and finalize poster boards for trial (2.0); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding same (.3); prepare demonstrative exhibits (1.0); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding trial subpoenas (.1);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1448	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/29/2015	2.00	\$600.00	\$1,200.00	\$575.00		\$1,150.00			Prepare for trial (witness outlines, review exhibits);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1449	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/29/2015	0.90	\$600.00	\$540.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Telephone conference with K. Hamilton regarding trial preparation;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1450	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/29/2015	2.50	\$600.00	\$1,500.00	\$575.00		\$1,437.50			Confer with A. Branch about preparing witnesses to testify;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1451	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/29/2015	5.00	\$600.00	\$3,000.00	\$575.00		\$2,875.00			Prepare witnesses to testify;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1452	Branch, Aria C.	6/30/2015	4.30	\$380.00	\$1,634.00	\$345.00		\$1,483.50			Review Armstrong exhibits (1.3); trial prep (3.0)	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1453	Callais, Amanda R.	6/30/2015	5.20	\$380.00	\$1,976.00	\$345.00		\$1,794.00			Research potential remedies for redistricting cases (4.5); Confer with B. Spiva regarding scope of research and desired remedy (.2); Draft email to B. Spiva discussing preliminary results of remedies research (.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1454	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/30/2015	4.90	\$620.00	\$3,038.00	\$575.00		\$2,817.50			Review and revise draft cross outline for Dr. Katz (1.9); conference with R. Spear regarding witness outline for Delegate Jones (.5); conference with team regarding evidentiary objections (.8); conference with B. Stafford regarding evidentiary issues (1.2); exchange email regarding witness outlines for delegate testimony (.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1455	Marino, Patricia	6/30/2015	12.20	\$220.00	\$2,684.00	\$190.00		\$2,318.00			Conference with PTS and tech support regarding trial director/equipment issues and follow-up (1.0); compile/organize attorney working /trial materials (7.0); telephone conference/email with vendor regarding finalized demonstrative boards for use at trial (.5); prepare/conform parties' highlighted deposition designations per attorney instruction (1.5); respond to requests for information/documents (.4); prepare supplemental documents for loading into trial and other logistics coordination (1.8);	Trial Preparation - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1456	Spear, Ryan M.	6/30/2015	5.40	\$500.00	\$2,700.00	\$410.00		\$2,214.00			Review research regarding remedies (.5); confer with T. Marino regarding logistical issues regarding trial (.3); prepare outline regarding cross-examination of C. Jones (4.5); confer with K. Hamilton regarding same (.1);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1457	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/30/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with R. Spear about cross examination;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1458	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/30/2015	5.00	\$600.00	\$3,000.00	\$575.00		\$2,875.00			Prepare for trial (witness outlines and review exhibits);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1459	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/30/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Correspond with A. Branch about objection resolution;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1460	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/30/2015	0.90	\$600.00	\$540.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Confer with A. Callais about relief timing and review research regarding same;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1461	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/30/2015	0.40	\$600.00	\$240.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Review exhibits and correspond with team about same;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1462	Branch, Aria C.	7/1/2015	11.50	\$380.00	\$4,370.00	\$345.00		\$3,967.50			Trial preparation (including preparing witness outlines, reviewing expert reports and deposition transcripts, etc.);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1463	Callais, Amanda R.	7/1/2015	6.00	\$380.00	\$2,280.00	\$345.00		\$2,070.00			Research potential remedies for redistricting cases (5.8); Confer with B. Spiva regarding research (.2);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1464	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/1/2015	5.50	\$620.00	\$3,410.00	\$575.00		\$3,162.50			Outline cross examination of Dr. Katz (2.2); review related exhibits (.9); prepare potential illustrative exhibits (1.2); conference with R. Spear and B. Spiva regarding same (.8); exchange related email (.4);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1465	Marino, Patricia	7/1/2015	14.70	\$220.00	\$3,234.00	\$190.00		\$2,793.00			Compile/organize litigation team trial preparation materials and related logistics/coordination (11.0); telephone conference with litigation team regarding trial strategy/action items (1.2); further revise/conform deposition designations in preparation of filing per attorney instruction (.8); respond to requests for information/documents (.7); conference with PTS regarding trial director presentation and technical issues/follow-up (1.0);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1466	Roberts, Rachel M.	7/1/2015	1.00	\$125.00	\$125.00	\$125.00		\$125.00			Create clean copies of deposition designations (1);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1467	Spear, Ryan M.	7/1/2015	6.90	\$500.00	\$3,450.00	\$410.00		\$2,829.00			Prepare agenda for litigation team meeting (.5); confer with litigation team regarding status and strategy (1.1); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding W. Armstrong trial testimony (.2); review Intervenor's opposition to Plaintiffs' objections to proposed trial exhibits (.6); confer with litigation team regarding same (.5); prepare reply in support of Plaintiffs' objections (2.8); review and respond to emails with B. Stafford regarding same (.2); research issues regarding same (1.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1468	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/1/2015	1.20	\$600.00	\$720.00	\$575.00		\$690.00			Telephone conference with team about trial preparation;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1469	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/1/2015	8.80	\$600.00	\$5,280.00	\$575.00		\$5,060.00			Prepare for trial (witness outlines, review exhibits and depositions);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1470	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/1/2015	0.80	\$600.00	\$480.00	\$575.00		\$460.00			Confer with team about remedy and review research about same;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1471	Stafford, William B.	7/1/2015	3.60	\$495.00	\$1,782.00	\$405.00		\$1,458.00			Prepare for and participate in conference call regarding pretrial matters (.80); research and draft reply in support of exhibit objections (2.80);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1472	Stafford, William B.	7/1/2015	0.50	\$495.00	\$247.50	\$405.00		\$202.50			Respond to exhibit issue;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1473	Branch, Aria C.	7/2/2015	4.70	\$380.00	\$1,786.00	\$345.00		\$1,621.50			Trial preparation (including preparing witness outlines, reviewing expert reports and deposition transcripts, etc.);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1474	Callais, Amanda R.	7/2/2015	7.30	\$380.00	\$2,774.00	\$345.00		\$2,518.50			Draft memo discussing results of research on remedies;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1475	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/2/2015	6.20	\$620.00	\$3,844.00	\$575.00		\$3,565.00			Review and revise outline for cross examination of Dr. Katz (3.9); conference with T. Marino regarding shipping materials, exhibits, and related issues (1.5); conference with B. Spiva and A. Branch regarding delegate testimony outlines and exhibits (.8);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1476	Marino, Patricia	7/2/2015	8.00	\$220.00	\$1,760.00	\$190.00		\$1,520.00			Compile/organize litigation team trial preparation materials and related follow-up (7.0); respond to requests for information/documents (.3); conference with PTS regarding trial director/equipment and technical issues (.7);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1477	Roberts, Rachel M.	7/2/2015	7.20	\$125.00	\$900.00	\$125.00		\$900.00			Prepare trial witness notebooks for B. Spiva (4); finalize and file designated discovery, proof of service of subpoenas, and reply in support of objections to defendant-intervenors' proposed exhibits (1.5); call court reporter re: sealed transcript copies and research necessity of same (.5); prepare courtesy copies of designated discovery to be sent to court (1.2);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1478	Spear, Ryan M.	7/2/2015	0.40	\$500.00	\$200.00	\$410.00		\$164.00			Review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding trial transcripts and post-trial briefing (.2); review new demonstrative exhibits from K. Hamilton (.1); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding same (.1);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1479	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/2/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Telephone conference with W. Armstrong;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1480	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/2/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Telephone conference with witness;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1481	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/2/2015	8.40	\$600.00	\$5,040.00	\$575.00		\$4,830.00			Prepare for trial (prepared witness outlines, exhibits);	Trial Preparation - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1482	Branch, Aria C.	7/3/2015	6.10	\$380.00	\$2,318.00	\$345.00		\$2,104.50			Trial preparation (including preparing witness outlines, reviewing expert reports and deposition transcripts, etc.);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1483	Callais, Amanda R.	7/3/2015	1.50	\$380.00	\$570.00	\$345.00		\$517.50			Review and edit remedies research memo (1.4); Draft email to B. Spiva regarding same (.1);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1484	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/3/2015	6.50	\$620.00	\$4,030.00	\$575.00		\$3,737.50			Review witness outlines (2.1); review key racial gerrymandering decisions (3.4); exchange related email with trial team (.5); review hotel logistics (.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1485	Marino, Patricia	7/3/2015	11.00	\$220.00	\$2,420.00	\$190.00		\$2,090.00			Compile/organize litigation team trial preparation materials (10.0); respond to attorneys' requests for information/documents and trial logistic issues (1.0);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1486	Spear, Ryan M.	7/3/2015	4.60	\$500.00	\$2,300.00	\$410.00		\$1,886.00			Prepare outline for cross-examination of C. Jones (3.6); research issues regarding same (1.0);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1487	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/3/2015	0.80	\$600.00	\$480.00	\$575.00		\$460.00			Review research memo on remedies;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1488	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/3/2015	9.70	\$600.00	\$5,820.00	\$575.00		\$5,577.50			Prepare for trial (drafted witness outlines, reviewed exhibits);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1489	Stafford, William B.	7/3/2015	0.30	\$495.00	\$148.50	\$405.00		\$121.50			Exchange correspondence with opposing counsel and T. Marino regarding logistics for trial;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1490	Branch, Aria C.	7/4/2015	10.00	\$380.00	\$3,800.00	\$345.00		\$3,450.00			Trial preparation (including preparing witness outlines, reviewing expert reports and deposition transcripts, etc.);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1491	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/4/2015	10.50	\$620.00	\$6,510.00	\$575.00		\$6,037.50			Review key racial gerrymandering decisions (4.2); exchange related email with trial team (2.4); review and revise witness examination outlines (3.5); review notes on additions to Ansolabehere witness outline (.4);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1492	Khanna, Abha	7/4/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Email with legal team regarding racial gerrymandering case law and trial strategy (0.2);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1493	Spear, Ryan M.	7/4/2015	2.10	\$500.00	\$1,050.00	\$410.00		\$861.00			Review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding post-trial briefing (.6); review deposition transcripts in preparation for review of examination outlines (1.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1494	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/4/2015	1.90	\$600.00	\$1,140.00	\$575.00		\$1,092.50			Correspond with team about legal issues and remedy and reviewed research about same;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1495	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/4/2015	1.50	\$600.00	\$900.00	\$575.00		\$862.50			Prepare for trial;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1496	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/4/2015	0.90	\$600.00	\$540.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Correspond with team about Jones and other matters;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1497	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/4/2015	1.50	\$600.00	\$900.00	\$575.00		\$862.50			Review and revise Jones outline;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1498	Branch, Aria C.	7/5/2015	8.00	\$380.00	\$3,040.00	\$345.00		\$2,760.00			Prepare for trial;	Trial Preparation - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1499	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/5/2015	12.00	\$620.00	\$7,440.00	\$575.00		\$6,900.00			Prepare, revise and circulate proposed demonstrative exhibits (3.5); draft, revise and circulate proposed opening statement and exchange related email (3.0); revise Ansolebehere direct examination outline and telephone conference with S. Ansolabehere regarding same (1.8); review and revise draft Katz cross examination outline (1.2); conference with T. Marino regarding courtroom logistics (2.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1500	Khanna, Abha	7/5/2015	2.50	\$500.00	\$1,250.00	\$410.00		\$1,025.00			Telephone conference with K. Hamilton regarding witness prep and trial strategy (1.2); review and revise draft opening statement (0.3); review and revise cross-examination outline for C. Jones (0.9); email with legal team regarding same (0.1);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1501	Marino, Patricia	7/5/2015	12.50	\$220.00	\$2,750.00	\$190.00		\$2,375.00			Organize war room, attorney trial/witness preparation materials and respond to requests for information/documents in preparation of trial (12.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1502	Spear, Ryan M.	7/5/2015	5.20	\$500.00	\$2,600.00	\$410.00		\$2,132.00			Prepare outline for cross-examination of C. Jones (2.5); research issues regarding same (1.2); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding same (.2); confer with B. Spiva regarding same (.4); review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton regarding demonstrative exhibit (.1); review and revise draft opening statement (.6); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding same (.2);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1503	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/5/2015	0.60	\$600.00	\$360.00	\$575.00		\$345.00			Review and comment on opening statement;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1504	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/5/2015	0.50	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review demonstrative exhibits;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1505	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/5/2015	9.30	\$600.00	\$5,580.00	\$575.00		\$5,347.50			Prepare for trial (witness outlines);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1506	Branch, Aria C.	7/6/2015	10.00	\$380.00	\$3,800.00	\$345.00		\$3,450.00			Prepare for trial;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1507	Callais, Amanda R.	7/6/2015	0.70	\$380.00	\$266.00	\$345.00		\$241.50			Read, review and analyze article by defense expert and draft email to B. Spiva regarding use of article on cross;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1508	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/6/2015	12.50	\$620.00	\$7,750.00	\$575.00		\$7,187.50			Final trial preparation regarding outline, revise and finalize opening statement (2.0); revise and finalize outline for S. Ansolabehere (1.9); witness preparation with S. Ansolabehere (4.9); revise and finalize outline for Dr. Katz cross examination (2.5); conference with trial team regarding organization and coordination (1.2);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1509	Khanna, Abha	7/6/2015	0.10	\$500.00	\$50.00	\$410.00		\$41.00			Review additions to opening statement regarding alternative map and email with legal team regarding same;	Trial Preparation - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1510	Marino, Patricia	7/6/2015	16.50	\$220.00	\$3,630.00	\$190.00		\$3,135.00			Attend courtroom electronic technology orientation and coordinate logistics/delivery of trial exhibits and attorney working materials (3.0); respond to attorneys' requests for information/documents and further revise/update witness preparation materials, powerpoint slides and other trial related/follow-up tasks (13.5);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1511	Spear, Ryan M.	7/6/2015	5.10	\$500.00	\$2,550.00	\$410.00		\$2,091.00			Review and respond to emails with T. Marino regarding exhibits (.1); review draft outline for S. Ansolabehere examination (.4); review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton regarding same (.1); review draft outline for T. Hofeller examination (.5); review and respond to emails with B. Spiva regarding same (.2); review draft outline regarding T. Hood examination (.3); review and respond to emails with B. Spiva regarding same (.1); review draft outline for R. Dance examination (.6); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding same (.2); review draft outline for W. Armstrong examination (.4); review and respond to emails with A. Branch regarding same (.1); confer with A. Branch regarding same (.2); review and respond to emails with B. Spiva regarding draft outline for C. Jones examination (.2); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding alternative maps (.2); confer with B. Stafford regarding same (.2); research issues regarding post-trial brief (1.3);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1512	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/6/2015	9.50	\$600.00	\$5,700.00	\$575.00		\$5,462.50			Prepare for trial;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1513	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/6/2015	1.50	\$600.00	\$900.00	\$575.00		\$862.50			Meet with K. Hamilton, A. Branch and T. Marino about trial preparation;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1514	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/6/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Meet with court technology personnel at courthouse;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1515	Stafford, William B.	7/6/2015	0.90	\$495.00	\$445.50	\$405.00		\$364.50			Draft section of opening statement regarding alternative maps (.7); draft correspondence to court providing electronic copies of expert reports (.2);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1516	Stafford, William B.	7/8/2015	1.20	\$495.00	\$594.00	\$405.00		\$486.00			Provide support for trial team by providing various factual detail regarding issues arising during trial;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1517	Elias, Marc E.	7/10/2015	0.50	\$735.00	\$367.50	\$575.00		\$287.50			Draft portion of closing for review by K. Hamilton;	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1518	Khanna, Abha	7/10/2015	0.10	\$500.00	\$50.00	\$410.00		\$41.00			Email with legal team regarding closing argument strategy (0.1);	Trial Preparation - First Trial
1519			1016.00		\$422,133.00			\$379,702.00				SUBTOTAL for Trial Preparation - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1520	Frost, Elisabeth C.	12/26/2014	0.20	\$430.00	\$86.00	\$390.00		\$78.00			Emails with J. Roche and M. Elias regarding litigation strategy;	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1521	Frost, Elisabeth C.	12/30/2014	0.30	\$430.00	\$129.00	\$390.00		\$117.00			Emails with A. Khanna and K. Hamilton regarding scheduling litigation strategy meeting (.1); prepare agenda for litigation strategy meeting (.2);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1522	Frost, Elisabeth C.	1/3/2015	0.10	\$475.00	\$47.50	\$390.00		\$39.00			Emails with K. Hamilton and A. Khanna regarding scheduling call to discuss litigation strategy;	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1523	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/3/2015	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Exchange email with L. Frost regarding new state case;	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1524	Frost, Elisabeth C.	1/5/2015	0.10	\$475.00	\$47.50	\$390.00		\$39.00			Emails with K. Hamilton and A. Khanna regarding meeting to discuss litigation strategy (.1);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1525	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/5/2015	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Exchange related email with A. Khanna and L. Frost (.2);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1526	Frost, Elisabeth C.	1/6/2015	0.10	\$475.00	\$47.50	\$390.00		\$39.00			Email to M. Elias regarding litigation strategy;	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1527	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/7/2015	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Prepare for and conference with A. Khanna and L. Frost regarding initial investigation, new maps, and related questions (.5);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1528	Khanna, Abha	1/7/2015	0.60	\$500.00	\$300.00	\$410.00		\$246.00			Confer with K. Hamilton and E. Frost regarding case status, strategy, and next steps (.4); confer with B. Stafford regarding staffing on the case (.1); email with legal team regarding same (.1);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1529	Frost, Elisabeth C.	1/8/2015	0.30	\$475.00	\$142.50	\$390.00		\$117.00			Emails with A. Khanna, K. Hamilton and A. Branch regarding litigation strategy (.1); emails with M. Elias, K. Hamilton, A. Khanna and A. Branch regarding litigation strategy (.1); emails with M. Elias regarding strategy (.1);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1530	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/8/2015	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Exchange email with litigation team on initial strategy, whether to move for appointment of three-judge panel and public records act requests;	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1531	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/9/2015	0.80	\$620.00	\$496.00	\$575.00		\$460.00			Review order appointing three-judge panel (.3); review materials on judges from J. Roche (.5);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1532	Khanna, Abha	1/9/2015	0.10	\$500.00	\$50.00	\$410.00		\$41.00			Review order appointing three-judge panel; email with legal team regarding same;	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1533	Roche, John K.	1/9/2015	0.60	\$535.00	\$321.00	\$465.00		\$279.00			Draft emails to team regarding status of service of complaints and composition of three-judge panel appointed by Fourth Circuit;	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1534	Frost, Elisabeth C.	1/12/2015	0.20	\$475.00	\$95.00	\$390.00		\$78.00			Emails with M. Elias, K. Hamilton, A. Khanna and B. Stafford regarding potential challenge to districts (.2);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1535	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/13/2015	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Exchange email regarding same (.2);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1536	Frost, Elisabeth C.	1/14/2015	0.10	\$475.00	\$47.50	\$390.00		\$39.00			Meet with J. Medile regarding case management (.1);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1537	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/20/2015	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review and respond to email regarding service and litigation schedule;	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1538	Frost, Elisabeth C.	1/26/2015	0.20	\$475.00	\$95.00	\$390.00		\$78.00			Emails with M. Elias regarding media regarding case (.2);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1539	Frost, Elisabeth C.	1/29/2015	0.20	\$475.00	\$95.00	\$390.00		\$78.00			meet with M. Elias regarding litigation strategy (.2);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1540	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/2/2015	0.10	\$475.00	\$47.50	\$390.00		\$39.00			Emails with M. Elias regarding draft maps (.1);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1541	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/7/2015	0.10	\$475.00	\$47.50	\$390.00		\$39.00			Email from A. Khanna summarizing trial deadlines (.1);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1542	Khanna, Abha	2/13/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Coordinate strategy call among legal team (.2);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1543	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/15/2015	0.10	\$475.00	\$47.50	\$390.00		\$39.00			Email to M. Elias regarding alternative maps);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1544	Branch, Aria C.	2/16/2015	0.80	\$380.00	\$304.00	\$345.00		\$276.00			Conference call regarding case strategy;	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1545	Elias, Marc E.	2/16/2015	0.50	\$735.00	\$367.50	\$575.00		\$287.50			Telephone conference regarding lawsuit strategy (.4); review same (.1);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1546	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/16/2015	0.70	\$475.00	\$332.50	\$390.00		\$273.00			Telephone conference with litigation team regarding litigation strategy (.7);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1547	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/17/2015	0.10	\$475.00	\$47.50	\$390.00		\$39.00			Emails with M. Elias regarding litigation strategy (.1);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1548	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/20/2015	0.40	\$475.00	\$190.00	\$390.00		\$156.00			Meet with M. Elias regarding litigation strategy (.2); meet with M. Elias regarding litigation strategy (.2);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1549	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/23/2015	0.30	\$475.00	\$142.50	\$390.00		\$117.00			Emails with litigation team regarding strategy in advance of scheduling conference (.1); telephone conference with M. Elias, A. Khanna and K. Hamilton regarding litigation strategy (.2);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1550	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/24/2015	0.20	\$475.00	\$95.00	\$390.00		\$78.00			Emails with A. Khanna regarding scheduling order (.1); emails with A. Khanna, K. Hamilton, M. Elias and A. Branch regarding litigation strategy and scheduling strategy meeting (.1);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1551	Branch, Aria C.	2/25/2015	0.70	\$380.00	\$266.00	\$345.00		\$241.50			Legal team conference call (.7);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1552	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/25/2015	2.00	\$475.00	\$950.00	\$390.00		\$780.00			Prepare litigation strategy (1.3); telephone conference with K. Hamilton, A. Khanna, B. Stafford and A. Branch (.7);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1553	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/27/2015	0.10	\$475.00	\$47.50	\$390.00		\$39.00			Emails with A. Branch, A. Khanna, K. Hamilton, and M Elias regarding litigation strategy (.1);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1554	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/1/2015	0.20	\$475.00	\$95.00	\$390.00		\$78.00			Emails with K. Hamilton, A. Khanna, M. Elias and A. Branch regarding litigation strategy (.2);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1555	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/5/2015	0.90	\$475.00	\$427.50	\$390.00		\$351.00			Emails with A. Khanna and B. Stafford regarding litigation strategy (.2); telephone conference with A. Khanna, M. Elias, K. Hamilton and B. Stafford regarding litigation strategy (.7);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1556	Khanna, Abha	3/5/2015	0.40	\$500.00	\$200.00	\$410.00		\$164.00			Telephone conference with legal team regarding case strategy and next steps (.4);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1557	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/12/2015	0.30	\$475.00	\$142.50	\$390.00		\$117.00			Telephone conference with A. Khanna regarding litigation strategy (.3);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1558	Khanna, Abha	3/13/2015	1.10	\$500.00	\$550.00	\$410.00		\$451.00			Participate in telephone conference with legal team (0.9); draft agendas and coordinate calls for legal team meetings next week (0.2);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1559	Spiva, Bruce V.	3/13/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Telephone conference with team regarding case strategy, discovery, deadlines and prepare for same;	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1560	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/16/2015	0.80	\$620.00	\$496.00	\$575.00		\$460.00			Prepare for telephone conference with litigation team regarding litigation strategy (.8);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1561	Spiva, Bruce V.	3/16/2015	1.20	\$600.00	\$720.00	\$575.00		\$690.00			Telephone conference with K. Hamilton and A. Khanna regarding scheduling, discovery, and motions;	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1562	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/17/2015	0.60	\$475.00	\$285.00	\$390.00		\$234.00			Meet with A. Khanna, K. Hamilton, and B. Spiva regarding litigation strategy (.6);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1563	Khanna, Abha	3/17/2015	1.00	\$500.00	\$500.00	\$410.00		\$410.00			Participate in conference call with legal team regarding immediate action items and case strategy (1.0);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1564	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/18/2015	0.20	\$475.00	\$95.00	\$390.00		\$78.00			Emails with K. Hamilton, A. Khanna, M. Elias, B. Stafford, B. Spiva and A. Branch regarding litigation strategy;	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1565	Khanna, Abha	3/19/2015	0.50	\$500.00	\$250.00	\$410.00		\$205.00			Confer with K. Hamilton regarding case strategy, staffing, and next steps (0.5);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1566	Khanna, Abha	3/22/2015	1.00	\$500.00	\$500.00	\$410.00		\$410.00			Prepare for and participate in conference call with K. Hamilton and R. Spear regarding case strategy (0.8); draft and circulate agenda for Monday call with legal team (0.2);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1567	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/23/2015	0.60	\$475.00	\$285.00	\$390.00		\$234.00			Litigation strategy session with K. Hamilton, A. Khanna, B. Stafford, B. Spiva, R. Spear and A. Branch (.6);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1568	Khanna, Abha	3/23/2015	1.00	\$500.00	\$500.00	\$410.00		\$410.00			Participate in conference call with legal team regarding tasks and case strategy (1.0);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1569	Spiva, Bruce V.	3/23/2015	0.40	\$600.00	\$240.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Confer with E. Frost about case strategy and prepare for same;	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1570	Spiva, Bruce V.	3/23/2015	0.50	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Prepare for confer with E. Frost;	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1571	Stafford, William B.	3/23/2015	1.40	\$495.00	\$693.00	\$405.00		\$567.00			Prepare for and participate in conference call regarding case strategy;	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1572	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/25/2015	0.20	\$475.00	\$95.00	\$390.00		\$78.00			Prepare for meeting with M. Elias regarding litigation strategy (.1); meet with M. Elias regarding litigation strategy (.1);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1573	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/25/2015	1.10	\$620.00	\$682.00	\$575.00		\$632.50			Exchange email with A. Khanna regarding decision and its implications (.8); exchange related email (.3);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1574	Khanna, Abha	3/25/2015	0.60	\$500.00	\$300.00	\$410.00		\$246.00			Draft and circulate email analysis of implications on this case (0.3); telephone conference with M. Elias regarding same (0.3);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1575	Spear, Ryan M.	3/25/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding same (0.2);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1576	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/28/2015	0.40	\$475.00	\$190.00	\$390.00		\$156.00			Emails with K. Hamilton, M. Elias, A. Khanna, A. Branch, B. Spiva, B. Stafford and R. Spear regarding litigation strategy;	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1577	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/30/2015	0.40	\$475.00	\$190.00	\$390.00		\$156.00			Telephone conference with M. Elias and A. Khanna regarding litigation strategy (.4);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1578	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/31/2015	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Prepare for and conference with A. Khanna regarding litigation strategy (.9);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1579	Khanna, Abha	4/1/2015	0.90	\$500.00	\$450.00	\$410.00		\$369.00			Prepare task list and assignments (0.6); email with legal team regarding same (0.3);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1580	Spear, Ryan M.	4/1/2015	1.20	\$500.00	\$600.00	\$410.00		\$492.00			Prepare for conference and confer with litigation team regarding alternative maps and related strategy issues (1.2);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1581	Stafford, William B.	4/1/2015	0.40	\$495.00	\$198.00	\$405.00		\$162.00			Participate in case strategy call with litigation team;	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1582	Khanna, Abha	4/2/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Email with E. Gonzalez and R. Spear regarding paralegal staffing (0.2);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1583	Khanna, Abha	4/13/2015	0.50	\$500.00	\$250.00	\$410.00		\$205.00			Confer with K. Hamilton and R. Spear regarding cases status and strategy (0.5);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1584	Spear, Ryan M.	4/13/2015	0.50	\$500.00	\$250.00	\$410.00		\$205.00			Confer with K. Hamilton and A. Khanna regarding status and strategy (0.5);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1585	Khanna, Abha	4/16/2015	0.60	\$500.00	\$300.00	\$410.00		\$246.00			Confer with R. Spear regarding all outstanding logistical and case strategy issues in preparation for maternity leave (0.6);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1586	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/16/2015	0.40	\$600.00	\$240.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Confer with K. Hamilton about strategy and staffing;	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1587	Spear, Ryan M.	4/17/2015	1.00	\$500.00	\$500.00	\$410.00		\$410.00			Prepare agenda for team meeting and email litigation team regarding team meeting (0.8); confer with K. Hamilton regarding staffing (0.2);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1588	Stafford, William B.	4/20/2015	0.40	\$495.00	\$198.00	\$405.00		\$162.00			Participate in strategy call with litigation team;	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1589	Khanna, Abha	4/21/2015	0.90	\$500.00	\$450.00	\$410.00		\$369.00			Conference call with legal team (0.9);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1590	Stafford, William B.	4/21/2015	1.00	\$495.00	\$495.00	\$405.00		\$405.00			Prepare for and participate in strategy call with litigation team;	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1591	Frost, Elisabeth C.	4/26/2015	0.10	\$475.00	\$47.50	\$390.00		\$39.00			Emails with R. Spear, B. Spiva, K. Hamilton, M. Elias, A. Branch and A. Khanna regarding litigation strategy (.1);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1592	Spear, Ryan M.	4/27/2015	1.20	\$500.00	\$600.00	\$410.00		\$492.00			Prepare for conference and confer with litigation team regarding status and strategy (1.2);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1593	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/27/2015	0.90	\$600.00	\$540.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Telephone conference with team regarding various tasks and issues;	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1594	Stafford, William B.	4/27/2015	0.80	\$495.00	\$396.00	\$405.00		\$324.00			Participate in strategy call with litigation team;	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1595	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/29/2015	1.80	\$620.00	\$1,116.00	\$575.00		\$1,035.00			Conference with R. Spear regarding litigation strategy questions (.9); exchange email with M. Elias regarding areas of focus (.9);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1596	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/30/2015	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Conference with legal team regarding legal strategy (.5);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1597	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/2/2015	2.00	\$620.00	\$1,240.00	\$575.00		\$1,150.00			Conference with M. Elias regarding litigation strategy (.5); exchange email with litigation team regarding litigation strategy questions (1.5);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1598	Khanna, Abha	5/2/2015	0.10	\$500.00	\$50.00	\$410.00		\$41.00			Email with legal team regarding Section 2 claim with respect to House of Delegates map;	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1599	Spear, Ryan M.	5/2/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding potential Section 2 claim (.2);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1600	Stafford, William B.	5/11/2015	0.70	\$495.00	\$346.50	\$405.00		\$283.50			Participate in conference call with litigation team to discuss case strategy;	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1601	Spear, Ryan M.	5/13/2015	0.10	\$500.00	\$50.00	\$410.00		\$41.00			Review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton and B. Spiva regarding role of D. Oldham (.1);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1602	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/4/2015	0.50	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Correspond with team about whether to seek remedy prior to 2016;	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1603	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/5/2015	1.20	\$620.00	\$744.00	\$575.00		\$690.00			Review Page decision and conference with team regarding implications for Bethune (1.2);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1604	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/5/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with team about Page decision;	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1605	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/8/2015	1.20	\$620.00	\$744.00	\$575.00		\$690.00			Conference with legal team regarding potential strategy issues regarding Page decision (1.2);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1606	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/11/2015	0.20	\$600.00	\$120.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Correspond with E. Frost about article concerning a new lawsuit concerning compactness;	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1607	Stafford, William B.	6/15/2015	0.70	\$495.00	\$346.50	\$405.00		\$283.50			Conference with R. Spear and K. Hamilton regarding case strategy (.7);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1608	Elias, Marc E.	6/16/2015	0.50	\$735.00	\$367.50	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review remedy issues(.30); email regarding same (.2);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1609	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/17/2015	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Conference with M. Elias regarding strategy calls (.2);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1610	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/24/2015	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Review and respond to litigation strategy email (.9);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1611	Spear, Ryan M.	8/6/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding dissent in Page v. Va. St. Board of Elections as relevant to Bethune-Hill v. Va. St. Board of Elections (.2);	General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1612			51.80		\$27,877.50			\$24,283.50				SUBTOTAL for General Strategy Meetings - First Trial
1613	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/5/2015	0.40	\$620.00	\$248.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Review scheduling order (.4);	Case Analysis - First Trial
1614	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/7/2015	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review initial orders (.5);	Case Analysis - First Trial
1615	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/9/2015	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$575.00		\$57.50			Exchange related email (.1);	Case Analysis - First Trial
1616	Elias, Marc E.	1/12/2015	0.50	\$735.00	\$367.50	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review litigation issues;	Case Analysis - First Trial
1617	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/13/2015	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Review North Carolina decision (.9);	Case Analysis - First Trial
1618	Frost, Elisabeth C.	1/26/2015	0.20	\$475.00	\$95.00	\$390.00		\$78.00			Review media regarding case (.2);	Case Analysis - First Trial
1619	Elias, Marc E.	2/4/2015	0.50	\$735.00	\$367.50	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review case issues;	Case Analysis - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1620	Elias, Marc E.	2/5/2015	0.80	\$735.00	\$588.00	\$575.00		\$460.00			Review same (.2); review case status (.6);	Case Analysis - First Trial
1621	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/7/2015	0.20	\$475.00	\$95.00	\$390.00		\$78.00			Prepare trial strategy (.2);	Case Analysis - First Trial
1622	Khanna, Abha	2/18/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Review Answer filed by Defendants and email with legal team regarding same (.3);	Case Analysis - First Trial
1623	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/20/2015	0.10	\$475.00	\$47.50	\$390.00		\$39.00			Emails with J. Roche, B. Stafford and A. Khanna regarding case administration (.1);	Case Analysis - First Trial
1624	Elias, Marc E.	3/12/2015	0.50	\$735.00	\$367.50	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review litigation issues to decide;	Case Analysis - First Trial
1625	Spiva, Bruce V.	3/16/2015	0.80	\$600.00	\$480.00	\$575.00		\$460.00			Review Complaint;	Case Analysis - First Trial
1626	Spear, Ryan M.	3/20/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Review pleadings and case calendar (0.2); review and respond to emails with A. Khanna regarding same (0.1);	Case Analysis - First Trial
1627	Elias, Marc E.	3/23/2015	1.00	\$735.00	\$735.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Review status of case and timeline for next steps;	Case Analysis - First Trial
1628	Elias, Marc E.	3/25/2015	0.70	\$735.00	\$514.50	\$575.00		\$402.50			Review Alabama court decision regarding impact on case;	Case Analysis - First Trial
1629	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/25/2015	0.70	\$475.00	\$332.50	\$390.00		\$273.00			Review court-issued consent order and update litigation calendar (.1); review the Supreme Court's decision in Alabama (.6);	Case Analysis - First Trial
1630	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/25/2015	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Review Alabama decision from supreme court (.9);	Case Analysis - First Trial
1631	Khanna, Abha	3/25/2015	2.70	\$500.00	\$1,350.00	\$410.00		\$1,107.00			Review Alabama opinion re: racial gerrymandering (1.9); draft and circulate email summary of same (0.8);	Case Analysis - First Trial
1632	Spear, Ryan M.	3/25/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Review summary of new Supreme Court case (0.3);	Case Analysis - First Trial
1633	Spiva, Bruce V.	3/25/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Review Supreme Court decision in Alabama case;	Case Analysis - First Trial
1634	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/11/2015	0.50	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Read Page decision;	Case Analysis - First Trial
1635	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/20/2015	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review upcoming deadlines and filing requirements (.5);	Case Analysis - First Trial
1636	Spear, Ryan M.	4/23/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Update case calendar (.2);	Case Analysis - First Trial
1637	Elias, Marc E.	5/11/2015	1.00	\$735.00	\$735.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Review strategic questions regarding discovery and lawsuit;	Case Analysis - First Trial
1638	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/15/2015	1.20	\$620.00	\$744.00	\$575.00		\$690.00			Review and respond to email regarding state's decision not to file motion for protective order (1.2);	Case Analysis - First Trial
1639	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/22/2015	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review orders issued from the court (.5);	Case Analysis - First Trial
1640	Elias, Marc E.	6/2/2015	0.50	\$735.00	\$367.50	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review theory of case doc; email regarding same;	Case Analysis - First Trial
1641	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/5/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Review new Page decision;	Case Analysis - First Trial
1642	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/8/2015	1.50	\$620.00	\$930.00	\$575.00		\$862.50			Review Page decision (1.5);	Case Analysis - First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1643			20.30		\$12,522.50			\$10,823.50				SUBTOTAL for Case Analysis - First Trial
1644	Branch, Aria C.	7/7/2015	11.00	\$380.00	\$4,180.00	\$345.00		\$3,795.00			Attend trial (7.0); prepare for and research issues related to trial (4.0);	First Trial
1645	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/7/2015	15.00	\$620.00	\$9,300.00	\$575.00		\$8,625.00			Prepare for and attend trial (9.0); post-trial discussion (1.0); preparation for continued trial (5.0);	First Trial
1646	Khanna, Abha	7/7/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Email with legal team regarding trial updates and review emails regarding same (0.2); email with legal team regarding Senate RPV analysis (0.1);	First Trial
1647	Marino, Patricia	7/7/2015	20.00	\$220.00	\$4,400.00	\$190.00		\$3,800.00			Provide attorney support at trial and compile witness preparation/cross-examination/potential impeachment materials and other follow-up related tasks;	First Trial
1648	Spear, Ryan M.	7/7/2015	2.10	\$500.00	\$1,050.00	\$410.00		\$861.00			Review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding trial (.6); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding exhibit (.3); review exhibit (.2); review draft outline for C. Jones examination (1.3); review and respond to emails with B. Spiva regarding same (.3);	First Trial
1649	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/7/2015	2.00	\$600.00	\$1,200.00	\$575.00		\$1,150.00			Meet with team about trial;	First Trial
1650	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/7/2015	7.50	\$600.00	\$4,500.00	\$575.00		\$4,312.50			Meet with team about trial;	First Trial
1651	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/7/2015	6.20	\$600.00	\$3,720.00	\$575.00		\$3,565.00			Participate in trial;	First Trial
1652	Stafford, William B.	7/7/2015	1.20	\$495.00	\$594.00	\$405.00		\$486.00			Prepare for trial;	First Trial
1653	Branch, Aria C.	7/8/2015	9.80	\$380.00	\$3,724.00	\$345.00		\$3,381.00			Gather Wilkins v. West expert reports from database and research existence of racially polarized voting analysis conducted in 2011 (1.0); exchange correspondence with K. Hamilton and R. Spear regarding same (.2);	First Trial
1654	Elias, Marc E.	7/8/2015	0.50	\$735.00	\$367.50	\$575.00		\$287.50			Attend trial (7.0); research issues related to trial (2.8); Review Spruill statements; email regarding same;	First Trial
1655	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/8/2015	14.00	\$620.00	\$8,680.00	\$575.00		\$8,050.00			Prepare for and attend trial (9.0); post-trial discussion (1.0); preparation for continued trial (4.0);	First Trial
1656	Khanna, Abha	7/8/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Email with legal team regarding trial updates and trial strategy (0.3);	First Trial
1657	Marino, Patricia	7/8/2015	14.00	\$220.00	\$3,080.00	\$190.00		\$2,660.00			Provide attorney support at trial and compile witness preparation/cross-examination/potential supplemental plaintiffs' trial exhibit materials and related follow-up;	First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1658	Spear, Ryan M.	7/8/2015	3.90	\$500.00	\$1,950.00	\$410.00		\$1,599.00			Review Intervenors' demonstrative exhibits (.2); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding trial testimony, exhibits, and other strategy issues (.8); research issues regarding same (.4); research issues regarding prison populations (1.0); research issues regarding post-trial brief (1.5);	First Trial
1659	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/8/2015	2.00	\$600.00	\$1,200.00	\$575.00		\$1,150.00			Meet with team;	First Trial
1660	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/8/2015	7.50	\$600.00	\$4,500.00	\$575.00		\$4,312.50			Participate in trial;	First Trial
1661	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/8/2015	8.00	\$600.00	\$4,800.00	\$575.00		\$4,600.00			Prepare for trial;	First Trial
1662	Branch, Aria C.	7/9/2015	7.50	\$380.00	\$2,850.00	\$345.00		\$2,587.50			Attend trial;	First Trial
1663	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/9/2015	12.00	\$620.00	\$7,440.00	\$575.00		\$6,900.00			Prepare for and attend trial (9.0); post-trial discussion (1.0); preparation for continued trial (2.0);	First Trial
1664	Marino, Patricia	7/9/2015	11.50	\$220.00	\$2,530.00	\$190.00		\$2,185.00			Provide attorney support at trial and compile witness preparation/cross-examination materials and other related follow-up tasks;	First Trial
1665	Spear, Ryan M.	7/9/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding trial and post-trial scheduling (.2);	First Trial
1666	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/9/2015	7.50	\$600.00	\$4,500.00	\$575.00		\$4,312.50			Participate in trial;	First Trial
1667	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/9/2015	1.90	\$600.00	\$1,140.00	\$575.00		\$1,092.50			Prepare for trial;	First Trial
1668	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/9/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Meet with team about trial;	First Trial
1669	Branch, Aria C.	7/10/2015	3.50	\$380.00	\$1,330.00	\$345.00		\$1,207.50			Trial preparation;	First Trial
1670	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/10/2015	11.10	\$620.00	\$6,882.00	\$575.00		\$6,382.50			Conference with S. Ansolabehere regarding rebuttal case (5.5); outline S. Ansolabehere examination for rebuttal case (3.5); exchange email regarding closing argument (1.0); conference with T. Marino regarding trial materials and related logistics (1.1);	First Trial
1671	Marino, Patricia	7/10/2015	9.00	\$220.00	\$1,980.00	\$190.00		\$1,710.00			Provide attorney support and compile witness preparation/cross-examination/rebuttal materials and other follow-up related tasks and war room logistics;	First Trial
1672	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/10/2015	2.50	\$600.00	\$1,500.00	\$575.00		\$1,437.50			Prepare for trial and commented on closing;	First Trial
1673	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/10/2015	1.20	\$600.00	\$720.00	\$575.00		\$690.00			Correspond with team about trial;	First Trial
1674	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/10/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with K. Hamilton about racially polarized voting exhibit;	First Trial
1675	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/10/2015	0.40	\$600.00	\$240.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Meet with G. Hebert about document;	First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1676	Stafford, William B.	7/10/2015	1.10	\$495.00	\$544.50	\$405.00		\$445.50			Provide various information to trial team to support trial regarding exhibits and evidentiary issues;	First Trial
1677	Branch, Aria C.	7/11/2015	2.50	\$380.00	\$950.00	\$345.00		\$862.50			Provide thoughts on closing statement (1.00); draft paragraph on Wilkens v. West for closing statement (1.50);	First Trial
1678	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/11/2015	8.50	\$620.00	\$5,270.00	\$575.00		\$4,887.50			Draft, revise and circulate rebuttal outline for S. Ansolabehere (2.5); draft, revise and circulate closing argument (5.0); research regarding trial record and closing argument (1.0);	First Trial
1679	Spear, Ryan M.	7/11/2015	1.30	\$500.00	\$650.00	\$410.00		\$533.00			Review draft closing argument (1.0); email with litigation team regarding same (.3);	First Trial
1680	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/11/2015	0.80	\$600.00	\$480.00	\$575.00		\$460.00			Correspond with team about trial and closing argument;	First Trial
1681	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/11/2015	1.40	\$600.00	\$840.00	\$575.00		\$805.00			Prepare for trial;	First Trial
1682	Stafford, William B.	7/11/2015	4.90	\$495.00	\$2,425.50	\$405.00		\$1,984.50			Review and revise closing argument to fill in citations, rearrange, and flesh out arguments (4.6); exchange correspondence with K. Hamilton regarding same (.3);	First Trial
1683	Branch, Aria C.	7/12/2015	1.00	\$380.00	\$380.00	\$345.00		\$345.00			Create list of admitted exhibits;	First Trial
1684	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/12/2015	11.00	\$620.00	\$6,820.00	\$575.00		\$6,325.00			Prepare Ansolabehere rebuttal testimony and work with Dr. Ansolabehere on preparation (3.5); review and revise draft closing argument (6.0); review argument on two exhibits regarding Senate plan (.5); conference with T. Marino regarding logistics (1.0);	First Trial
1685	Khanna, Abha	7/12/2015	2.10	\$500.00	\$1,050.00	\$410.00		\$861.00			Review and revise draft closing argument (1.9); email with legal team regarding same (0.2);	First Trial
1686	Marino, Patricia	7/12/2015	5.00	\$220.00	\$1,100.00	\$190.00		\$950.00			Provide attorney support regarding witness cross-examination/rebuttal expert, closing statement and trial logistics;	First Trial
1687	Spear, Ryan M.	7/12/2015	1.50	\$500.00	\$750.00	\$410.00		\$615.00			Review draft closing argument (0.5); email with litigation team regarding same (.1); review draft rebuttal questioning for S. Ansolabehere (.5); review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton regarding same (.1); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding message to plaintiffs (.3);	First Trial
1688	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/12/2015	1.50	\$600.00	\$900.00	\$575.00		\$862.50			Review and comment on closing argument;	First Trial
1689	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/12/2015	4.00	\$600.00	\$2,400.00	\$575.00		\$2,300.00			Prepare for trial;	First Trial
1690	Stafford, William B.	7/12/2015	1.30	\$495.00	\$643.50	\$405.00		\$526.50			Revise closing argument to shorten (1.1); exchange correspondence with K. Hamilton regarding same (.2);	First Trial
1691	Branch, Aria C.	7/13/2015	8.00	\$380.00	\$3,040.00	\$345.00		\$2,760.00			Attend trial and send emails regarding trial;	First Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1692	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/13/2015	12.00	\$620.00	\$7,440.00	\$575.00		\$6,900.00			Prepare for and attend trial (9.0); conference with A. Branch and S. Ansolabehere regarding trial (1.5); report to litigation team regarding trial day and post-trial briefing issues and exchange related email (1.5);	First Trial
1693	Khanna, Abha	7/13/2015	0.10	\$500.00	\$50.00	\$410.00		\$41.00			Email with legal team regarding trial update;	First Trial
1694	Marino, Patricia	7/13/2015	17.50	\$220.00	\$3,850.00	\$190.00		\$3,325.00			Prepare/provide attorney support at trial (8.5); compile/organize attorneys' trial materials/ courtroom equipment/ logistics (1.5); travel from Alexandria to Seattle (7.5);	First Trial
1695	Spear, Ryan M.	7/13/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding trial status (.3);	First Trial
1696	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/13/2015	2.50	\$600.00	\$1,500.00	\$575.00		\$1,437.50			Prepare for trial;	First Trial
1697	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/13/2015	6.50	\$600.00	\$3,900.00	\$575.00		\$3,737.50			Participate in trial;	First Trial
1698			289.70		\$134,671.00			\$123,532.00				SUBTOTAL for First Trial
1699	Spear, Ryan M.	7/10/2015	3.90	\$500.00	\$1,950.00	\$410.00		\$1,599.00			Review and respond to emails with B. Stafford regarding research assignment (.1); prepare post-trial brief (2.3); research issues regarding same (1.5);	Post First-Trial Work
1700	Spear, Ryan M.	7/11/2015	1.40	\$500.00	\$700.00	\$410.00		\$574.00			Prepare post-trial brief (1.4);	Post First-Trial Work
1701	Spear, Ryan M.	7/12/2015	1.60	\$500.00	\$800.00	\$410.00		\$656.00			Prepare post-trial brief (1.6);	Post First-Trial Work
1702	Spear, Ryan M.	7/13/2015	7.20	\$500.00	\$3,600.00	\$410.00		\$2,952.00			Prepare post-trial brief (4.4); research issues regarding same (2.8);	Post First-Trial Work
1703	Branch, Aria C.	7/14/2015	1.00	\$380.00	\$380.00	\$345.00		\$345.00			Review trial transcript;	Post First-Trial Work
1704	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/14/2015	3.60	\$620.00	\$2,232.00	\$575.00		\$2,070.00			Review notes from trial and loose ends (.9); conference with T. Marino regarding file organization (.5); conference with B. Stafford and R. Spear regarding post-trial briefing and related issues (1.5); conference with M. Elias regarding status of litigation (.7);	Post First-Trial Work
1705	Marino, Patricia	7/14/2015	0.90	\$220.00	\$198.00	\$190.00		\$171.00			Process return of trial materials and update litigation/DMS file(.6); respond to attorney requests for information/documents related to post-trial briefing (.3);	Post First-Trial Work
1706	Spear, Ryan M.	7/14/2015	7.50	\$500.00	\$3,750.00	\$410.00		\$3,075.00			Confer with K. Hamilton and B. Stafford regarding trial and post-trial briefing (.3); prepare post-trial brief (6.1); research issues regarding same (1.1);	Post First-Trial Work
1707	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/14/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with team about remedy;	Post First-Trial Work
1708	Stafford, William B.	7/14/2015	0.40	\$495.00	\$198.00	\$405.00		\$162.00			Meet with K. Hamilton and R. Spear to discuss post-trial brief strategy in light of closing argument;	Post First-Trial Work
1709	Branch, Aria C.	7/15/2015	0.60	\$380.00	\$228.00	\$345.00		\$207.00			Assist with providing materials and citations for post-trial brief;	Post First-Trial Work

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1710	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/15/2015	3.60	\$620.00	\$2,232.00	\$575.00		\$2,070.00			Conference with R. Spear regarding post-trial briefing (1.2); review court order on post-trial briefing and related conference with legal team (.5); conference with T. Marino regarding file organization and related issues (.9); conference with B. Stafford regarding post-trial brief (.5); exchange email regarding district-specific analysis (.5);	Post First-Trial Work
1711	Spear, Ryan M.	7/15/2015	4.00	\$500.00	\$2,000.00	\$410.00		\$1,640.00			Review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton regarding post-trial brief (.2); review and respond to emails with S. Ansolabehere regarding same (.2); prepare post-trial brief (3.6);	Post First-Trial Work
1712	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/15/2015	0.50	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Correspond with team about Court's order about post-trial brief and district-specific evidence;	Post First-Trial Work
1713	Branch, Aria C.	7/16/2015	4.80	\$380.00	\$1,824.00	\$345.00		\$1,656.00			Draft sections on racial predominance in specific districts and on Section 2 compliance as compelling state interest for post-trial brief;	Post First-Trial Work
1714	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/16/2015	3.70	\$620.00	\$2,294.00	\$575.00		\$2,127.50			Review draft post-trial brief (1.1); draft and circulate comments on proposed post-trial brief (1.8); conference with S. Ansolabehere regarding district-specific analysis (.3); conference with A. Branch regarding support for post-trial briefing (.5);	Post First-Trial Work
1715	Khanna, Abha	7/16/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Email with legal team regarding post-trial brief;	Post First-Trial Work
1716	Marino, Patricia	7/16/2015	0.20	\$220.00	\$44.00	\$190.00		\$38.00			Respond to attorney request for information/documents related to post trial briefing;	Post First-Trial Work
1717	Spear, Ryan M.	7/16/2015	7.30	\$500.00	\$3,650.00	\$410.00		\$2,993.00			Prepare post-trial brief (4.3); research issues regarding same (1.0); review and respond to emails with B. Stafford, A. Branch, and N. Crown regarding same (0.9); review and respond to emails with S. Ansolabehere regarding same (.1); review analysis by S. Ansolabehere regarding same (1.0);	Post First-Trial Work
1718	Branch, Aria C.	7/17/2015	3.60	\$380.00	\$1,368.00	\$345.00		\$1,242.00			Legal research regarding Section 2 argument for post trial brief;	Post First-Trial Work
1719	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/17/2015	1.20	\$620.00	\$744.00	\$575.00		\$690.00			Review and respond to email regarding post-trial brief and coordination on review and filing details (1.2);	Post First-Trial Work
1720	Marino, Patricia	7/17/2015	1.00	\$220.00	\$220.00	\$190.00		\$190.00			Respond to attorney request for information/documents related to post trial briefing/trial exhibits and update litigation file;	Post First-Trial Work
1721	Spear, Ryan M.	7/17/2015	11.50	\$500.00	\$5,750.00	\$410.00		\$4,715.00			Prepare post-trial brief (7.9); research issues regarding same (2.1); review and respond to emails with B. Stafford, A. Branch, and N. Crown regarding same (1.0); review and respond to emails with S. Ansolabehere regarding same (.5);	Post First-Trial Work
1722	Stafford, William B.	7/17/2015	4.30	\$495.00	\$2,128.50	\$405.00		\$1,741.50			Research, draft, and revise portions of post-trial brief;	Post First-Trial Work

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1723	Branch, Aria C.	7/18/2015	5.00	\$380.00	\$1,900.00	\$345.00		\$1,725.00			Review post-trial brief (3.00); check citations for post-trial brief (2.00);	Post First-Trial Work
1724	Khanna, Abha	7/18/2015	2.30	\$500.00	\$1,150.00	\$410.00		\$943.00			Review and revise post-trial brief (2.1); telephone conference with R. Spear regarding same (0.2);	Post First-Trial Work
1725	Spear, Ryan M.	7/18/2015	11.40	\$500.00	\$5,700.00	\$410.00		\$4,674.00			Prepare post-trial brief (8.3); research issues regarding same (2.4); review and respond to emails with B. Stafford and A. Branch regarding same (.3); confer with A. Khanna regarding same (.4);	Post First-Trial Work
1726	Stafford, William B.	7/18/2015	2.90	\$495.00	\$1,435.50	\$405.00		\$1,174.50			Research and draft portions of post-trial brief (2.6); exchange correspondence with R. Spear regarding same (.3);	Post First-Trial Work
1727	Branch, Aria C.	7/19/2015	3.80	\$380.00	\$1,444.00	\$345.00		\$1,311.00			Review post trial brief;	Post First-Trial Work
1728	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/19/2015	2.50	\$620.00	\$1,550.00	\$575.00		\$1,437.50			Review and revise draft post trial brief;	Post First-Trial Work
1729	Spear, Ryan M.	7/19/2015	10.50	\$500.00	\$5,250.00	\$410.00		\$4,305.00			Prepare post-trial brief (8.6); research issues regarding same (1.5); review and respond to emails with B. Stafford, A. Branch, and K. Hamilton regarding same (.4);	Post First-Trial Work
1730	Stafford, William B.	7/19/2015	1.70	\$495.00	\$841.50	\$405.00		\$688.50			Revise post trial brief (1.5); exchange correspondence with R. Spear regarding same (.2);	Post First-Trial Work
1731	Branch, Aria C.	7/20/2015	2.80	\$380.00	\$1,064.00	\$345.00		\$966.00			Review post-trial brief;	Post First-Trial Work
1732	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/20/2015	2.50	\$620.00	\$1,550.00	\$575.00		\$1,437.50			Review and revise draft post trial brief;	Post First-Trial Work
1733	Spear, Ryan M.	7/20/2015	3.40	\$500.00	\$1,700.00	\$410.00		\$1,394.00			Finalize and file opening post-trial brief (2.5); review and respond to emails with K. Hamilton, B. Stafford, A. Branch, and S. Ansolabehere regarding same (.9);	Post First-Trial Work
1734	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/20/2015	0.50	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review and comment on new draft post-trial brief;	Post First-Trial Work
1735	Stafford, William B.	7/20/2015	0.40	\$495.00	\$198.00	\$405.00		\$162.00			Revise post-trial brief;	Post First-Trial Work
1736	Branch, Aria C.	7/21/2015	0.40	\$380.00	\$152.00	\$345.00		\$138.00			Assist with finding exhibit citations for post-trial reply brief;	Post First-Trial Work
1737	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/21/2015	1.00	\$620.00	\$620.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Review and respond to email regarding intervenors brief (.5); conference with B. Stafford regarding same (.2); exchange email with R. spear regarding the same (.3);	Post First-Trial Work
1738	Spear, Ryan M.	7/22/2015	2.80	\$500.00	\$1,400.00	\$410.00		\$1,148.00			Gather and prepare images of Challenged Districts for use in post-trial reply brief (1.5); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding same (.5); research issues regarding post-trial reply brief (.8);	Post First-Trial Work
1739	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/22/2015	0.30	\$600.00	\$180.00	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with team about reply brief;	Post First-Trial Work

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1740	Stafford, William B.	7/22/2015	0.20	\$495.00	\$99.00	\$405.00		\$81.00			Exchange correspondence with A. Branch and R. Spear regarding evidence supporting post-hearing reply brief;	Post First-Trial Work
1741	Branch, Aria C.	7/23/2015	2.70	\$380.00	\$1,026.00	\$345.00		\$931.50			Draft individual sections of post-trial reply brief;	Post First-Trial Work
1742	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/23/2015	1.60	\$620.00	\$992.00	\$575.00		\$920.00			Review intervenors' post-trial brief and conference with R. Spear regarding same (1.6);	Post First-Trial Work
1743	Marino, Patricia	7/23/2015	0.50	\$220.00	\$110.00	\$190.00		\$95.00			Organize attorney/litigation team trial materials;	Post First-Trial Work
1744	Spear, Ryan M.	7/23/2015	8.00	\$500.00	\$4,000.00	\$410.00		\$3,280.00			Prepare post-trial reply brief (4.9); research issues regarding same (2.1); confer with A. Khanna regarding same (.3); confer with B. Stafford and A. Branch regarding same (.5); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding same (.2);	Post First-Trial Work
1745	Stafford, William B.	7/23/2015	0.80	\$495.00	\$396.00	\$405.00		\$324.00			Meet with R. Spear and A. Branch regarding post-trial reply brief;	Post First-Trial Work
1746	Branch, Aria C.	7/24/2015	4.40	\$380.00	\$1,672.00	\$345.00		\$1,518.00			Draft sections for post-trial reply brief;	Post First-Trial Work
1747	Spear, Ryan M.	7/24/2015	6.40	\$500.00	\$3,200.00	\$410.00		\$2,624.00			Prepare post-trial reply brief (5.1); research issues regarding same (1.3);	Post First-Trial Work
1748	Stafford, William B.	7/24/2015	5.60	\$495.00	\$2,772.00	\$405.00		\$2,268.00			Research and draft portions of post-trial reply brief;	Post First-Trial Work
1749	Branch, Aria C.	7/25/2015	4.70	\$380.00	\$1,786.00	\$345.00		\$1,621.50			Draft individual sections on racial predominance for post-trial reply brief;	Post First-Trial Work
1750	Spear, Ryan M.	7/25/2015	3.50	\$500.00	\$1,750.00	\$410.00		\$1,435.00			Prepare post-trial reply brief (2.4); research issues regarding same (1.0); review and respond to emails with litigation team regarding same (.1);	Post First-Trial Work
1751	Stafford, William B.	7/25/2015	1.60	\$495.00	\$792.00	\$405.00		\$648.00			Draft and revise post-trial brief;	Post First-Trial Work
1752	Branch, Aria C.	7/26/2015	0.90	\$380.00	\$342.00	\$345.00		\$310.50			Review citations in post-trial reply brief;	Post First-Trial Work
1753	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/26/2015	3.20	\$620.00	\$1,984.00	\$575.00		\$1,840.00			Review and revise draft post-trial reply brief (2.5); exchange related email (.7);	Post First-Trial Work
1754	Spear, Ryan M.	7/26/2015	2.50	\$500.00	\$1,250.00	\$410.00		\$1,025.00			Prepare post-trial reply brief (2.5);	Post First-Trial Work
1755	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/26/2015	1.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Review draft reply brief and commented;	Post First-Trial Work
1756	Stafford, William B.	7/26/2015	1.30	\$495.00	\$643.50	\$405.00		\$526.50			Revise post-trial reply brief;	Post First-Trial Work
1757	Branch, Aria C.	7/27/2015	1.20	\$380.00	\$456.00	\$345.00		\$414.00			Review citations in post-trial reply brief (1.00); file brief (0.20);	Post First-Trial Work
1758	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/27/2015	2.70	\$620.00	\$1,674.00	\$575.00		\$1,552.50			Review and revise draft reply post-trial brief (2.2); exchange related email (.5);	Post First-Trial Work
1759	Spear, Ryan M.	7/27/2015	3.60	\$500.00	\$1,800.00	\$410.00		\$1,476.00			Finalize and file post-trial reply brief (1.9); review and respond to emails with A. Khanna, B. Stafford, and A. Branch regarding same (.6); review Defendant Intervenor's post-trial reply brief (.6); confer with B. Stafford regarding same (.5);	Post First-Trial Work

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1760	Stafford, William B.	7/27/2015	1.50	\$495.00	\$742.50	\$405.00		\$607.50			Revise post-trial reply brief (.9); conference with R. Spear regarding same (.1); review and prepare comments on Intervenor's post-trial reply brief (.5);	Post First-Trial Work
1761	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/3/2015	2.50	\$620.00	\$1,550.00	\$575.00		\$1,437.50			Review post-trial briefs (1.3); conference with R. Spear regarding post-trial briefing and open issues (.7); review email regarding post-trial developments (.5);	Post First-Trial Work
1762	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/4/2015	2.50	\$620.00	\$1,550.00	\$575.00		\$1,437.50			Review and organize materials from trial (1.5); conference with R. Spear regarding post-trial briefing and related issues (1.0);	Post First-Trial Work
1763	Roche, John K.	8/5/2015	0.10	\$535.00	\$53.50	\$465.00		\$46.50			Exchange emails with A. Branch regarding Eastern District of Virginia local rules with respect to timing of discovery;	Post First-Trial Work
1764			191.50		\$94,546.00			\$80,989.50				SUBTOTAL for Post First-Trial Work
1765	Branch, Aria C.	10/22/2015	7.30	\$380.00	\$2,774.00	\$345.00		\$2,518.50			Review opinion and draft summary email;	First Appeal
1766	Elias, Marc E.	10/22/2015	1.00	\$735.00	\$735.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Review court decision; telephone conference regarding appeal;	First Appeal
1767	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/22/2015	3.10	\$620.00	\$1,922.00	\$575.00		\$1,782.50			Review email regarding court decision (.9); exchange related email (1.5); review deadlines for supreme court appeal (.7);	First Appeal
1768	Spiva, Bruce V.	10/22/2015	0.70	\$600.00	\$420.00	\$575.00		\$402.50			Review portion of Court decision;	First Appeal
1769	Stafford, William B.	10/22/2015	0.80	\$495.00	\$396.00	\$405.00		\$324.00			Review court order on merits and verify appeal deadlines and procedure;	First Appeal
1770	Branch, Aria C.	10/23/2015	1.00	\$380.00	\$380.00	\$345.00		\$345.00			Review opinion	First Appeal
1771	Elias, Marc E.	10/23/2015	0.50	\$735.00	\$367.50	\$575.00		\$287.50			Meet with K. Hamilton to discuss appeal etc.;	First Appeal
1772	Frost, Elisabeth C.	10/23/2015	2.80	\$475.00	\$1,330.00	\$390.00		\$1,092.00			Review of panel's opinion (2.0); telephone call with A. Branch regarding litigation strategy, procedure and timing (.1); emails with M. Elias regarding litigation strategy, procedure and timing (.1); meet with A. Branch regarding litigation strategy (.3); emails with M. Elias, K. Hamilton, B. Spiva, R. Spear, A. Khanna, A. Branch and B. Stafford regarding litigation strategy (.3);	First Appeal
1773	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/23/2015	3.10	\$620.00	\$1,922.00	\$575.00		\$1,782.50			Conference with B. Stafford regarding supreme court appellate deadlines (.8); conference with M. Elias regarding staffing and related issues (.9); exchange email with A. Khanna regarding jurisdictional statement (.5); exchange email regarding decision and implications (.9);	First Appeal
1774	Khanna, Abha	10/23/2015	0.30	\$500.00	\$150.00	\$410.00		\$123.00			Review summary of memorandum opinion (0.2); email with legal team regarding next steps (0.1);	First Appeal
1775	Stafford, William B.	10/23/2015	0.40	\$495.00	\$198.00	\$405.00		\$162.00			Review order and prepare outline of jurisdictional statement;	First Appeal
1776	Stafford, William B.	10/24/2015	1.80	\$495.00	\$891.00	\$405.00		\$729.00			Review memorandum opinion and outline major bulletpoints for jurisdictional statement;	First Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1777	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/26/2015	1.00	\$620.00	\$620.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Review decision (.8); review notice of appeal and conference with B. Stafford regarding same (.2);	First Appeal
1778	Stafford, William B.	10/26/2015	0.70	\$495.00	\$346.50	\$405.00		\$283.50			Research and verify timing of notice of appeal and jurisdictional statement (.5); exchange correspondence with M. Elias and K. Hamilton regarding same (.2);	First Appeal
1779	Stafford, William B.	10/27/2015	0.30	\$495.00	\$148.50	\$405.00		\$121.50			Conference with R. Spear and K. Hamilton regarding strategy for appeal;	First Appeal
1780	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/28/2015	1.90	\$620.00	\$1,178.00	\$575.00		\$1,092.50			Conference with A. Khanna regarding analysis of district court opinion (.5); review memorandum on timing of briefing in supreme court (.5); exchange email regarding timing and staffing issues (.4); review district court opinion (.5);	First Appeal
1781	Khanna, Abha	10/28/2015	0.40	\$500.00	\$200.00	\$410.00		\$164.00			Email with legal team regarding appeal timing and strategy;	First Appeal
1782	Stafford, William B.	10/28/2015	1.00	\$495.00	\$495.00	\$405.00		\$405.00			Review opinion and prepare bullet point list of points to address in jurisdictional statement;	First Appeal
1783	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/29/2015	2.90	\$620.00	\$1,798.00	\$575.00		\$1,667.50			Conference with A. Khanna regarding district court opinion (.5); review and analyze district court opinion (2.0);	First Appeal
1784	Khanna, Abha	10/29/2015	6.60	\$500.00	\$3,300.00	\$410.00		\$2,706.00			Review memorandum opinion (5.7); email and confer with legal team regarding same, background on trial, and appellate strategy (0.9);	First Appeal
1785	Stafford, William B.	10/29/2015	0.60	\$495.00	\$297.00	\$405.00		\$243.00			Conference with A. Khanna regarding strategic approach on appeal;	First Appeal
1786	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/30/2015	7.90	\$620.00	\$4,898.00	\$575.00		\$4,542.50			Review and analyze district court opinion (5.9); prepare for and conference with A. Khanna and B. Stafford regarding litigation strategy for supreme court briefing (1.0); exchange related email (1.0);	First Appeal
1787	Khanna, Abha	10/30/2015	7.10	\$500.00	\$3,550.00	\$410.00		\$2,911.00			Review opinion below and begin drafting outline and key questions for further discussion (2.8); email and confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.8); confer with K. Hamilton and B. Stafford regarding same (1.1); review emails from K. Hamilton and B. Stafford outlining thoughts on memorandum opinion and appellate strategy (0.6); review relevant case law (1.8);	First Appeal
1788	Stafford, William B.	10/30/2015	2.50	\$495.00	\$1,237.50	\$405.00		\$1,012.50			Meet with K. Hamilton and A. Khanna to discuss strategic approach to appeal;	First Appeal
1789	Khanna, Abha	10/31/2015	1.00	\$500.00	\$500.00	\$410.00		\$410.00			Review relevant case law in preparation for Jurisdictional Statement;	First Appeal
1790	Khanna, Abha	11/1/2015	1.90	\$500.00	\$950.00	\$410.00		\$779.00			Review relevant case law in preparation for Jurisdictional Statement;	First Appeal
1791	Khanna, Abha	11/2/2015	6.80	\$500.00	\$3,400.00	\$410.00		\$2,788.00			Review case law in preparation for Jurisdictional Statement (2.5); review and outline Memorandum Opinion below in preparation for same (4.3);	First Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1792	Stafford, William B.	11/2/2015	0.70	\$495.00	\$346.50	\$405.00		\$283.50			Prepare appendix to jurisdictional statement;	First Appeal
1793	Hamilton, Kevin J.	11/3/2015	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Review decision and conference with A. Khanna regarding jurisdictional statement;	First Appeal
1794	Khanna, Abha	11/3/2015	6.70	\$500.00	\$3,350.00	\$410.00		\$2,747.00			Review case law and dissenting opinion below in preparation for Jurisdictional Statement (3.6); draft Statement portion of Jurisdictional Statement (3.1)	First Appeal
1795	Khanna, Abha	11/4/2015	6.80	\$500.00	\$3,400.00	\$410.00		\$2,788.00			Draft Jurisdictional Statement argument regarding incorrect legal standard;	First Appeal
1796	Spear, Ryan M.	11/4/2015	2.20	\$500.00	\$1,100.00	\$410.00		\$902.00			Research issues regarding appeal to U.S. Supreme Court;	First Appeal
1797	Stafford, William B.	11/4/2015	0.20	\$495.00	\$99.00	\$405.00		\$81.00			Review proof of appendix on jurisdictional statement;	First Appeal
1798	Khanna, Abha	11/5/2015	7.10	\$500.00	\$3,550.00	\$410.00		\$2,911.00			Draft argument of Jurisdictional Statement (6.0); confer with R. Spear regarding same (0.9); confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.3);	First Appeal
1799	Spear, Ryan M.	11/5/2015	0.70	\$500.00	\$350.00	\$410.00		\$287.00			Confer with A. Khanna regarding research regarding appeal to U.S. Supreme Court (.5); emails with litigation team regarding evidence and arguments at trial (.2);	First Appeal
1800	Stafford, William B.	11/5/2015	0.70	\$495.00	\$346.50	\$405.00		\$283.50			Research and provide citations for jurisdictional statement;	First Appeal
1801	Hamilton, Kevin J.	11/6/2015	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Conference with A. Khanna regarding structure and outline of jurisdictional statement;	First Appeal
1802	Khanna, Abha	11/6/2015	7.00	\$500.00	\$3,500.00	\$410.00		\$2,870.00			Draft and revise argument of Jurisdictional Statement;	First Appeal
1803	Khanna, Abha	11/7/2015	1.20	\$500.00	\$600.00	\$410.00		\$492.00			Continue to draft argument section of Jurisdictional Statement (0.7); review and revise same (0.5);	First Appeal
1804	Hamilton, Kevin J.	11/9/2015	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Conference with A. Khanna regarding jurisdictional statement (.3); review lower court decision (.6);	First Appeal
1805	Khanna, Abha	11/9/2015	6.70	\$500.00	\$3,350.00	\$410.00		\$2,747.00			Draft and revise argument section of Jurisdictional Statement (6.5); email with E. Miller regarding district-specific issues (0.2);	First Appeal
1806	Spear, Ryan M.	11/9/2015	1.30	\$500.00	\$650.00	\$410.00		\$533.00			Confer with A. Khanna regarding research regarding appeal to U.S. Supreme Court (.5); research issues regarding same (.8);	First Appeal
1807	Stafford, William B.	11/9/2015	2.10	\$495.00	\$1,039.50	\$405.00		\$850.50			Review and revise draft jurisdictional statement;	First Appeal
1808	Hamilton, Kevin J.	11/10/2015	1.00	\$620.00	\$620.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Review trial court decision (.8); conference with A. Khanna regarding jurisdictional statement and related issues (.2);	First Appeal
1809	Khanna, Abha	11/10/2015	4.40	\$500.00	\$2,200.00	\$410.00		\$1,804.00			Draft and revise Jurisdictional Statement (4.1); confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.3);	First Appeal
1810	Hamilton, Kevin J.	11/11/2015	1.50	\$620.00	\$930.00	\$575.00		\$862.50			Review lower court opinion (.9); exchange email regarding timing and schedule for filing jurisdictional statement (.6);	First Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1811	Khanna, Abha	11/11/2015	6.60	\$500.00	\$3,300.00	\$410.00		\$2,706.00			Draft and revise argument of Jurisdictional Statement (6.0); confer with R. Spear regarding same (0.4); confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.2);	First Appeal
1812	Spear, Ryan M.	11/11/2015	1.00	\$500.00	\$500.00	\$410.00		\$410.00			Confer with A. Khanna regarding jurisdictional statement (.5); research issues regarding same (.5);	First Appeal
1813	Stafford, William B.	11/11/2015	0.30	\$495.00	\$148.50	\$405.00		\$121.50			Conference with A. Khanna regarding jurisdictional statement strategy;	First Appeal
1814	Khanna, Abha	11/12/2015	9.10	\$500.00	\$4,550.00	\$410.00		\$3,731.00			Draft and revise Jurisdictional Statement (8.6); email and confer with R. Spear and B. Stafford regarding same (0.5);	First Appeal
1815	Spear, Ryan M.	11/12/2015	3.70	\$500.00	\$1,850.00	\$410.00		\$1,517.00			Confer with A. Khanna regarding jurisdictional statement (.4); emails with A. Khanna regarding same (.3); review and revise jurisdictional statement (3.1);	First Appeal
1816	Stafford, William B.	11/12/2015	1.20	\$495.00	\$594.00	\$405.00		\$486.00			Revise jurisdictional statement and conference with A. Khanna regarding same;	First Appeal
1817	Hamilton, Kevin J.	11/13/2015	1.20	\$620.00	\$744.00	\$575.00		\$690.00			Conference with A. Khanna and B. Stafford regarding draft jurisdictional statement and timing for filing;	First Appeal
1818	Khanna, Abha	11/13/2015	11.70	\$500.00	\$5,850.00	\$410.00		\$4,797.00			Draft and revise Jurisdictional Statement (9.7); confer with K. Hamilton regarding same (1.2); confer with R. Spear regarding same (.2); confer with B. Stafford regarding same (.6);	First Appeal
1819	Spear, Ryan M.	11/13/2015	2.90	\$500.00	\$1,450.00	\$410.00		\$1,189.00			Emails with litigation team regarding Supreme Court granting certiorari in Personhubbalah case (.2); review and revise jurisdictional statement (2.7);	First Appeal
1820	Stafford, William B.	11/13/2015	1.80	\$495.00	\$891.00	\$405.00		\$729.00			Review and revise jurisdictional statement and conference with A. Khanna regarding same;	First Appeal
1821	Khanna, Abha	11/14/2015	6.00	\$500.00	\$3,000.00	\$410.00		\$2,460.00			Draft and revise jurisdictional statement;	First Appeal
1822	Spear, Ryan M.	11/14/2015	3.70	\$500.00	\$1,850.00	\$410.00		\$1,517.00			Review and revise jurisdictional statement;	First Appeal
1823	Stafford, William B.	11/14/2015	3.50	\$495.00	\$1,732.50	\$405.00		\$1,417.50			Review and revise jurisdictional statement;	First Appeal
1824	Hamilton, Kevin J.	11/15/2015	2.00	\$620.00	\$1,240.00	\$575.00		\$1,150.00			Review and revise draft jurisdictional statement (1.5); conference with legal team regarding jurisdictional statement and related issues (.5);	First Appeal
1825	Khanna, Abha	11/15/2015	1.00	\$500.00	\$500.00	\$410.00		\$410.00			Review edits and comments to brief from K. Hamilton and M. Elias (0.4); input appendix cites (0.6);	First Appeal
1826	Branch, Aria C.	11/16/2015	2.60	\$380.00	\$988.00	\$345.00		\$897.00			Review jurisdictional statement (1.5); draft email answering questions regarding trial court record (1.1);	First Appeal
1827	Hamilton, Kevin J.	11/16/2015	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$575.00		\$517.50			Review draft jurisdictional statement;	First Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1828	Khanna, Abha	11/16/2015	6.50	\$500.00	\$3,250.00	\$410.00		\$2,665.00			Review and revise brief (5.9); confer with E. Miller regarding filing logistics and relationship to Page (.5); email with legal team regarding same (.1);	First Appeal
1829	Branch, Aria C.	11/17/2015	2.80	\$380.00	\$1,064.00	\$345.00		\$966.00			Review jurisdictional statement (2.0); draft email answering questions regarding trial court record (.8);	First Appeal
1830	Hamilton, Kevin J.	11/17/2015	2.40	\$620.00	\$1,488.00	\$575.00		\$1,380.00			Review and revise draft jurisdictional statement (1.9); exchange related email with A. Khanna and B. Stafford (.5);	First Appeal
1831	Khanna, Abha	11/17/2015	6.90	\$500.00	\$3,450.00	\$410.00		\$2,829.00			Review and revise Jurisdictional Statement (4.8); review and input edits from legal team (1.0); review and input edits from cite check Editor (.5); email draft to publisher (.3); telephone conference with M. Elias and K. Hamilton regarding request for joint consideration with congressional case (.3);	First Appeal
1832	Spear, Ryan M.	11/17/2015	2.40	\$500.00	\$1,200.00	\$410.00		\$984.00			Review and revise draft jurisdictional statement (1.9); confer with A. Khanna regarding same (.5);	First Appeal
1833	Stafford, William B.	11/17/2015	3.00	\$495.00	\$1,485.00	\$405.00		\$1,215.00			Review and revise Supreme Court jurisdictional statement (2.8); conference with A. Khanna regarding same (.2);	First Appeal
1834	Branch, Aria C.	11/18/2015	0.50	\$380.00	\$190.00	\$345.00		\$172.50			Review trial record exhibits;	First Appeal
1835	Khanna, Abha	11/18/2015	4.50	\$500.00	\$2,250.00	\$410.00		\$1,845.00			Review and revise Jurisdictional Statement (3.0); exchange proof drafts with publisher (1.5);	First Appeal
1836	Khanna, Abha	11/19/2015	3.00	\$500.00	\$1,500.00	\$410.00		\$1,230.00			Review and revise proof of Jurisdictional Statement (1.9); cut down words for same (.9); email with publisher regarding same (.2);	First Appeal
1837	Khanna, Abha	11/20/2015	0.40	\$500.00	\$200.00	\$410.00		\$164.00			Review and revise final proof of Jurisdictional Statement (.2); finalize same for filing and service (.1); draft letter to opposing counsel regarding briefing extensions (.1);	First Appeal
1838	Hamilton, Kevin J.	11/23/2015	1.50	\$620.00	\$930.00	\$575.00		\$862.50			Review jurisdictional statement (.3); review supreme court rules for preparation of joint appendix and related deadlines (.5); exchange email regarding consolidation and related strategy decisions (.7);	First Appeal
1839	Hamilton, Kevin J.	11/24/2015	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Conference regarding consolidation and potential implications of delay on 2017 election calendar;	First Appeal
1840	Hamilton, Kevin J.	11/30/2015	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$575.00		\$287.50			Exchange email regarding trial exhibits for appellate record and related issues (.5);	First Appeal
1841	Khanna, Abha	12/2/2015	0.20	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Email with printer regarding holiday deadlines for reply brief (0.1); email with E. Miller regarding distribution schedule before Supreme Court (0.1);	First Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1842	Khanna, Abha	12/8/2015	1.10	\$500.00	\$550.00	\$410.00		\$451.00			Review pleadings below in preparation for response brief (.8); confer with B. Stafford regarding planning and preparation for response brief (.3);	First Appeal
1843	Khanna, Abha	12/14/2015	2.40	\$500.00	\$1,200.00	\$410.00		\$984.00			Review pleadings and opinion in preparation for reply brief (1.2); begin preparing reply brief template (1.2);	First Appeal
1844	Khanna, Abha	12/15/2015	1.30	\$500.00	\$650.00	\$410.00		\$533.00			Review pleadings and opinions in preparation for reply brief;	First Appeal
1845	Khanna, Abha	12/16/2015	1.10	\$500.00	\$550.00	\$410.00		\$451.00			Review pleadings, opinions, and relevant cases in preparation for reply brief;	First Appeal
1846	Stafford, William B.	12/16/2015	0.40	\$495.00	\$198.00	\$405.00		\$162.00			Conference with A. Khanna regarding outlining response to motion to dismiss or affirm;	First Appeal
1847	Khanna, Abha	12/17/2015	1.40	\$500.00	\$700.00	\$410.00		\$574.00			Review pleadings, opinions, and relevant cases in preparation for reply brief;	First Appeal
1848	Khanna, Abha	12/18/2015	1.00	\$500.00	\$500.00	\$410.00		\$410.00			Review pleadings, opinions, and relevant cases in preparation for reply brief;	First Appeal
1849	Hamilton, Kevin J.	12/22/2015	1.90	\$620.00	\$1,178.00	\$575.00		\$1,092.50			Review and revise draft brief in response to motion to affirm or dismiss (1.2); exchange related email (.7);	First Appeal
1850	Khanna, Abha	12/22/2015	3.50	\$500.00	\$1,750.00	\$410.00		\$1,435.00			Review Appellees' motion to dismiss or affirm (2.5); begin outlining reply brief (1.0);	First Appeal
1851	Stafford, William B.	12/22/2015	1.00	\$495.00	\$495.00	\$405.00		\$405.00			Review appellees' motion to dismiss or affirm and draft correspondence to A. Khanna regarding major points in response to same;	First Appeal
1852	Branch, Aria C.	12/23/2015	0.40	\$380.00	\$152.00	\$345.00		\$138.00			Review record and draft email regarding Supreme Court brief;	First Appeal
1853	Khanna, Abha	12/23/2015	10.60	\$500.00	\$5,300.00	\$410.00		\$4,346.00			Research and begin drafting reply brief (9.5); telephone conference with B. Stafford and R. Spear regarding same (1.1);	First Appeal
1854	Spear, Ryan M.	12/23/2015	4.90	\$500.00	\$2,450.00	\$410.00		\$2,009.00			Confer with A. Khanna and B. Stafford regarding response to motion to dismiss (.6); review motion to dismiss (.8); review prior briefing regarding issues regarding response to motion to dismiss (1.1); research issues regarding cases cited in motion to dismiss (1.9); emails with A. Khanna and B. Stafford regarding motion to dismiss (.5);	First Appeal
1855	Stafford, William B.	12/23/2015	5.40	\$495.00	\$2,673.00	\$405.00		\$2,187.00			Prepare for and participate in conference call to discuss strategy on reply brief in Supreme Court (1.1); research and draft section of reply brief and provide discrete research to A. Khanna (4.3);	First Appeal
1856	Branch, Aria C.	12/24/2015	2.00	\$380.00	\$760.00	\$345.00		\$690.00			Review record and draft email regarding Supreme Court brief;	First Appeal
1857	Khanna, Abha	12/24/2015	7.40	\$500.00	\$3,700.00	\$410.00		\$3,034.00			Research and draft reply brief;	First Appeal
1858	Stafford, William B.	12/24/2015	0.30	\$495.00	\$148.50	\$405.00		\$121.50			Review and revise response to motion to dismiss or affirm;	First Appeal
1859	Branch, Aria C.	12/25/2015	1.20	\$380.00	\$456.00	\$345.00		\$414.00			Review record and draft email regarding Supreme Court brief;	First Appeal
1860	Khanna, Abha	12/25/2015	5.90	\$500.00	\$2,950.00	\$410.00		\$2,419.00			Research and draft reply brief;	First Appeal
1861	Khanna, Abha	12/26/2015	6.30	\$500.00	\$3,150.00	\$410.00		\$2,583.00			Research, draft, and revise reply brief;	First Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1862	Spear, Ryan M.	12/26/2015	4.20	\$500.00	\$2,100.00	\$410.00		\$1,722.00			Review and revise response to motion to dismiss (3.3); research issues regarding same (.9);	First Appeal
1863	Stafford, William B.	12/26/2015	3.10	\$495.00	\$1,534.50	\$405.00		\$1,255.50			Review and revise response to motion to dismiss or affirm;	First Appeal
1864	Elias, Marc E.	12/27/2015	0.80	\$735.00	\$588.00	\$575.00		\$460.00			Review Supreme Court brief;	First Appeal
1865	Hamilton, Kevin J.	12/27/2015	2.50	\$620.00	\$1,550.00	\$575.00		\$1,437.50			Review and revise draft Answer to Motion to Affirm or Dismiss (2.0); forward with comments to A. Khanna and M. Elias (.5);	First Appeal
1866	Khanna, Abha	12/27/2015	6.30	\$500.00	\$3,150.00	\$410.00		\$2,583.00			Review edits and comments from B. Stafford and R. Spear (2.5); review and revise reply brief in light of same (1.5); circulate draft of same to legal team (1.5); review and incorporate edits and comments from legal team; send draft to printer (.5); send draft to Editors for cite-checking (.3);	First Appeal
1867	Stafford, William B.	12/27/2015	0.90	\$495.00	\$445.50	\$405.00		\$364.50			Research and revise reply to motion to dismiss or affirm;	First Appeal
1868	Branch, Aria C.	12/28/2015	0.70	\$380.00	\$266.00	\$345.00		\$241.50			Review record to assist with Supreme Court brief;	First Appeal
1869	Elias, Marc E.	12/28/2015	1.00	\$735.00	\$735.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Review Supreme Court brief;	First Appeal
1870	Hamilton, Kevin J.	12/28/2015	1.50	\$620.00	\$930.00	\$575.00		\$862.50			Review and revise Answer to Motion to Affirm (.5); forward with comments to A. Khanna and M. Elias (1.0);	First Appeal
1871	Khanna, Abha	12/28/2015	3.20	\$500.00	\$1,600.00	\$410.00		\$1,312.00			Review and revise reply brief proof (2.2); email with legal team regarding same (1.0);	First Appeal
1872	Spear, Ryan M.	12/28/2015	4.70	\$500.00	\$2,350.00	\$410.00		\$1,927.00			Emails with A. Khanna and B. Stafford regarding reply brief (1.1); review and revise reply brief (2.0); research issues regarding same (1.6);	First Appeal
1873	Stafford, William B.	12/28/2015	2.70	\$495.00	\$1,336.50	\$405.00		\$1,093.50			Review and revise reply to motion to dismiss or affirm;	First Appeal
1874	Khanna, Abha	12/29/2015	1.50	\$500.00	\$750.00	\$410.00		\$615.00			Review and revise reply brief (1.0); email with B. Stafford and R. Spear regarding same (.5);	First Appeal
1875	Stafford, William B.	12/29/2015	2.80	\$495.00	\$1,386.00	\$405.00		\$1,134.00			Revise and proof Reply to Motion to Dismiss or Affirm;	First Appeal
1876	Khanna, Abha	12/30/2015	1.20	\$500.00	\$600.00	\$410.00		\$492.00			Email with publisher and legal team regarding filing of reply brief (.7); telephone conference with publisher regarding same (.5);	First Appeal
1877	Stafford, William B.	12/30/2015	1.20	\$495.00	\$594.00	\$405.00		\$486.00			Finalize and coordinate filing and service of Reply to Motion to Dismiss or Affirm;	First Appeal
1878	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/4/2016	1.20	\$655.00	\$786.00	\$575.00		\$690.00			Review reply briefs on motion to dismiss or affirm (.9); exchange related email (.3);	First Appeal
1879	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/4/2016	0.40	\$655.00	\$262.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Review status of filings and preparation for argument (.4);	First Appeal
1880	Khanna, Abha	1/14/2016	0.20	\$525.00	\$105.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Review letter from Supreme Court requesting record below (0.1); email with E. Miller regarding significance of same (0.1);	First Appeal
1881	Spear, Ryan M.	1/14/2016	0.30	\$525.00	\$157.50	\$410.00		\$123.00			Review request for trial record (.2); emails with A. Khanna and E. Miller regarding same (.1);	First Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1882	Spear, Ryan M.	2/8/2016	2.20	\$525.00	\$1,155.00	\$410.00		\$902.00			Emails with litigation team regarding submission of supplemental authority (.5); review supplemental authority (1.0); research issues regarding rules regarding submission of supplemental authority (.5); emails with A. Khanna and B. Stafford regarding same (.2);	First Appeal
1883	Khanna, Abha	2/17/2016	0.50	\$525.00	\$262.50	\$410.00		\$205.00			Email and confer with legal team regarding supplemental submission (0.3); call and leave detailed voicemail with E. Miller regarding same (0.1); email with printer regarding same (0.1);	First Appeal
1884	Spear, Ryan M.	2/17/2016	2.40	\$525.00	\$1,260.00	\$410.00		\$984.00			Prepare notice of supplemental authority (1.4); research issues regarding same (1.0);	First Appeal
1885	Khanna, Abha	2/18/2016	1.50	\$525.00	\$787.50	\$410.00		\$615.00			Review and revise supplemental brief (0.5); email with legal team regarding same (0.2); review Harris opinion with respect to same (0.7); email with printer regarding same (0.1);	First Appeal
1886	Stafford, William B.	2/18/2016	0.20	\$495.00	\$99.00	\$405.00		\$81.00			Review and revise notice of supplemental authority;	First Appeal
1887	Khanna, Abha	2/19/2016	1.30	\$525.00	\$682.50	\$410.00		\$533.00			Send supplemental brief for cite check (0.1); review and revise three proofs of brief sent by printer (1.1); finalize brief for publication (0.1);	First Appeal
1888	Khanna, Abha	5/27/2016	0.10	\$525.00	\$52.50	\$410.00		\$41.00			Email and confer with legal team regarding SCOTUS re-listing this case for consideration (0.1);	First Appeal
1889	Elias, Marc E.	6/6/2016	0.20	\$765.00	\$153.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Teleconference with A. Khanna regarding argument;	First Appeal
1890	Elias, Marc E.	6/6/2016	0.20	\$765.00	\$153.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Draft questions presented in case (.1); email correspondence with R. Spear, A. Branch, J. Devaney, B. Spiva, E. Frost, K. Hamilton, A. Khanna, B. Stafford, R. Louijeune (.1);	First Appeal
1891	Elias, Marc E.	6/6/2016	0.10	\$765.00	\$76.50	\$575.00		\$57.50			Email correspondence with J. Devaney, B. Spiva, E. Frost, K. Hamilton, A. Khanna, A. Branch, B. Stafford, R. Louijeune regarding preparations for Supreme Court of the United States argument;	First Appeal
1892	Frost, Elisabeth C.	6/6/2016	0.40	\$520.00	\$208.00	\$390.00		\$156.00			Meet with M. Elias regarding SCOTUS strategy (.3); emails with M. Elias, K. Hamilton, A. Khanna regarding litigation strategy (.1);	First Appeal
1893	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/6/2016	1.90	\$655.00	\$1,244.50	\$575.00		\$1,092.50			Review order noting probable jurisdiction (.5); exchange related email concerning scheduling, briefing and related issues (1.4);	First Appeal
1894	Khanna, Abha	6/6/2016	2.10	\$525.00	\$1,102.50	\$410.00		\$861.00			Email with legal team regarding noting of probable jurisdiction by SCOTUS (0.2); review order regarding same (0.2); confer with M. Elias regarding same (0.2); confer with E. Miller regarding logistics of same (0.1); confer with R. Spear regarding same (0.4); confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.4); review jurisdictional statement briefing (0.6);	First Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1895	Stafford, William B.	6/6/2016	1.00	\$495.00	\$495.00	\$405.00		\$405.00			Prepare proposed outline of major issues to address in opening brief on appeal (.9); exchange correspondence with litigation team regarding order noting probable jurisdiction(.1);	First Appeal
1896	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/7/2016	1.90	\$655.00	\$1,244.50	\$575.00		\$1,092.50			Exchange email regarding briefing schedule (1.2); telephone conference with A. Khanna and B. Stafford regarding same (.7);	First Appeal
1897	Khanna, Abha	6/7/2016	0.50	\$525.00	\$262.50	\$410.00		\$205.00			Review SCOTUS briefing;	First Appeal
1898	Elias, Marc E.	6/8/2016	0.10	\$765.00	\$76.50	\$575.00		\$57.50			Email correspondence with A. Khanna regarding timing of oral argument;	First Appeal
1899	Elias, Marc E.	6/8/2016	0.20	\$765.00	\$153.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Meet with R. Louijeune regarding action items to prepare for Supreme Court of the United States;	First Appeal
1900	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/8/2016	0.90	\$655.00	\$589.50	\$575.00		\$517.50			Prepare for and participate in legal team call regarding appeal and various grounds for doing so;	First Appeal
1901	Louijeune, Ruthzee	6/8/2016	0.30	\$320.00	\$96.00	\$320.00		\$96.00			Meet with M. Elias re: tasks for Bethune Hill;	First Appeal
1902	Elias, Marc E.	6/9/2016	0.10	\$765.00	\$76.50	\$575.00		\$57.50			Email correspondence with A. Khanna, B. Spiva, K. Hamilton, E. Frost , B. Stafford regarding proposed schedule;	First Appeal
1903	Frost, Elisabeth C.	6/9/2016	0.30	\$520.00	\$156.00	\$390.00		\$117.00			Telephone call with E. Prelogar regarding briefing schedule (.2); emails with litigation team regarding briefing and argument schedule (.1);	First Appeal
1904	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/9/2016	1.20	\$655.00	\$786.00	\$575.00		\$690.00			Telephone conference with A. Khanna regarding scheduling for argument and briefing (.5); review and comment on proposed briefing schedule and alternatives for argument date (.7);	First Appeal
1905	Khanna, Abha	6/9/2016	0.90	\$525.00	\$472.50	\$410.00		\$369.00			Email and confer with legal team regarding oral argument and briefing schedule (0.5); telephone conference with K. Hamilton regarding same (0.2); telephone conference with M. Elias regarding same (0.2);	First Appeal
1906	Louijeune, Ruthzee	6/9/2016	0.80	\$320.00	\$256.00	\$320.00		\$256.00			Research SCOTUS procedure regarding noting of probable jurisdiction;	First Appeal
1907	Elias, Marc E.	6/10/2016	0.10	\$765.00	\$76.50	\$575.00		\$57.50			Email correspondence with A. Khanna, B. Spiva, K. Hamilton, E. Frost, B. Stafford regarding oral argument timing;	First Appeal
1908	Frost, Elisabeth C.	6/10/2016	0.30	\$520.00	\$156.00	\$390.00		\$117.00			Telephone call regarding amicus strategy with M. Elias;	First Appeal
1909	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/10/2016	0.90	\$655.00	\$589.50	\$575.00		\$517.50			Review report from A. Khanna regarding discussions with Supreme Court Clerk's office regarding scheduling issues (.5); exchange related email (.4);	First Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1910	Khanna, Abha	6/10/2016	0.90	\$525.00	\$472.50	\$410.00		\$369.00			Telephone conference with E. Prelogar at SG's office regarding oral argument scheduling (0.2); telephone conference with Clerk's office regarding same (0.3); email and telephone conference with legal team regarding same (0.1); draft proposed briefing schedule and email with legal team regarding same (0.2); email with M. Elias and E. Frost regarding potential issue with one plaintiff (0.1);	First Appeal
1911	Elias, Marc E.	6/11/2016	0.10	\$765.00	\$76.50	\$575.00		\$57.50			Email correspondence with E. Frost regarding amicus strategy;	First Appeal
1912	Elias, Marc E.	6/11/2016	0.10	\$765.00	\$76.50	\$575.00		\$57.50			Email correspondence with E. Frost, A. Khanna regarding consent to amicus brief from OneVirginia2021 and Virginians for Fair Redistricting;	First Appeal
1913	Elias, Marc E.	6/11/2016	0.10	\$765.00	\$76.50	\$575.00		\$57.50			Email correspondence with E. Frost, A. Khanna regarding follow-up on E. Prelogar question;	First Appeal
1914	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/12/2016	0.90	\$655.00	\$589.50	\$575.00		\$517.50			Exchange email with A. Khanna regarding proposed briefing schedule and call to M. Braden regarding same;	First Appeal
1915	Khanna, Abha	6/12/2016	0.10	\$525.00	\$52.50	\$410.00		\$41.00			Email with legal team regarding briefing schedule;	First Appeal
1916	Elias, Marc E.	6/13/2016	0.10	\$765.00	\$76.50	\$575.00		\$57.50			Email correspondence with K. Hamilton, A. Khanna, B. Stafford, B. Spiva regarding oral argument;	First Appeal
1917	Frost, Elisabeth C.	6/13/2016	0.20	\$520.00	\$104.00	\$390.00		\$78.00			Emails with M. Elias and A. Khanna regarding amicus strategy;	First Appeal
1918	Khanna, Abha	6/13/2016	0.20	\$525.00	\$105.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Email with E. Frost regarding amicus strategy (0.1); email and confer with K. Hamilton regarding proposed briefing schedule and communications with opposing counsel (0.1);	First Appeal
1919	Khanna, Abha	6/14/2016	0.10	\$525.00	\$52.50	\$410.00		\$41.00			Confer with B. Stafford regarding Joint Appendix;	First Appeal
1920	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/15/2016	0.50	\$655.00	\$327.50	\$575.00		\$287.50			Exchange voicemail with M. Braden (.3); report to team regarding same (.2);	First Appeal
1921	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/20/2016	0.70	\$655.00	\$458.50	\$575.00		\$402.50			Prepare for and telephone conference with opposing parties regarding briefing schedule;	First Appeal
1922	Khanna, Abha	6/20/2016	0.20	\$525.00	\$105.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Email with legal team regarding proposed briefing schedule (0.1); exchange voice mails with E. Prelogar (SG's office) regarding same (0.1);	First Appeal
1923	Khanna, Abha	6/21/2016	0.30	\$525.00	\$157.50	\$410.00		\$123.00			Telephone conference with E. Prelogar regarding proposed briefing schedule (0.2); email with legal team regarding same (0.1);	First Appeal
1924	Elias, Marc E.	6/23/2016	0.20	\$765.00	\$153.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Email correspondence with K. Hamilton, A. Khanna, B. Stafford, R. Spear, B. Spiva, E. Frost regarding letter on briefing extension;	First Appeal
1925	Frost, Elisabeth C.	6/23/2016	0.20	\$520.00	\$104.00	\$390.00		\$78.00			Emails with A. Khanna regarding interested amicus (.1); telephone call to A. Khanna regarding amicus (.1);	First Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1926	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/23/2016	0.70	\$655.00	\$458.50	\$575.00		\$402.50			Exchange email regarding potential stipulated briefing schedule;	First Appeal
1927	Louijeune, Ruthzee	6/23/2016	2.30	\$320.00	\$736.00	\$320.00		\$736.00			Research cases for addition to dropbox (.5); Research Bartlett case (1.0), cases it cited and cases that cite to it (.8);	First Appeal
1928	Elias, Marc E.	6/24/2016	0.20	\$765.00	\$153.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Email correspondence with A. Khanna, L. Bull, R. Louijeune, E. Frost, A. Branch regarding preparing for argument;	First Appeal
1929	Frost, Elisabeth C.	6/24/2016	0.20	\$520.00	\$104.00	\$390.00		\$78.00			Emails with A. Khanna regarding letter to Supreme Court regarding briefing schedule (.1); Email from R. Louijeune regarding preparing for briefing and oral argument (.1);	First Appeal
1930	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/24/2016	0.60	\$655.00	\$393.00	\$575.00		\$345.00			Conference with A. Khanna regarding proposed stipulated briefing schedule (.2); calls to S. Raphael and M. Braden regarding proposed briefing schedule (.4);	First Appeal
1931	Khanna, Abha	6/24/2016	0.60	\$525.00	\$315.00	\$410.00		\$246.00			Telephone conference with E. Prelogar regarding documents and schedule (0.2); email and confer with legal team regarding same (0.1); confer with K. Hamilton and S. Raphael regarding letter application to Court (0.2); confer with K. Hamilton and M. Braden regarding same (0.1);	First Appeal
1932	Louijeune, Ruthzee	6/24/2016	0.50	\$320.00	\$160.00	\$320.00		\$160.00			Draft e-mail to Bethune-Hill Oral Argument prep team (.2); prepare items for Bethune-Hill dropbox and pull items (.3);	First Appeal
1933	Khanna, Abha	6/25/2016	0.30	\$525.00	\$157.50	\$410.00		\$123.00			Email with E. Prelogar, finding and sending draft exhibits upon request (0.2); email with S. Raphael regarding letter to Supreme Court (0.1);	First Appeal
1934	Elias, Marc E.	6/27/2016	0.10	\$765.00	\$76.50	\$575.00		\$57.50			Email correspondence with A. Khanna, E. Frost, L. Bull regarding briefing and meeting schedule;	First Appeal
1935	Elias, Marc E.	6/27/2016	0.10	\$765.00	\$76.50	\$575.00		\$57.50			Email correspondence with K. Hamilton, E. Frost, A. Khanna, R. Louijeune regarding questions presented in three-judge panel cases;	First Appeal
1936	Khanna, Abha	6/27/2016	0.40	\$525.00	\$210.00	\$410.00		\$164.00			Email with SG's office regarding documents and scheduling (0.2); email with M. Elias regarding same (0.1); email D. McNerney regarding proposed briefing schedule (0.1);	First Appeal
1937	Louijeune, Ruthzee	6/27/2016	0.10	\$320.00	\$32.00	\$320.00		\$32.00			Make edits to dropbox;	First Appeal
1938	Elias, Marc E.	6/28/2016	0.10	\$765.00	\$76.50	\$575.00		\$57.50			Email correspondence with E. Frost, A. Khanna, L. Bull regarding briefing and meeting schedule;	First Appeal
1939	Branch, Aria C.	7/1/2016	2.20	\$430.00	\$946.00	\$345.00		\$759.00			Prepare for call (1.2); attend call regarding SCOTUS prep (1.0);	First Appeal
1940	Elias, Marc E.	7/1/2016	1.00	\$765.00	\$765.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Teleconference with R. Louijeune, A. Khanna, E. Frost, A. Branch, L. Bull regarding argument prep;	First Appeal
1941	Frost, Elisabeth C.	7/1/2016	0.60	\$520.00	\$312.00	\$390.00		\$234.00			Telephone call with M. Elias, A. Khanna, A. Branch and R. Louijeune regarding preparation for oral argument;	First Appeal
1942	Khanna, Abha	7/1/2016	0.80	\$525.00	\$420.00	\$410.00		\$328.00			Confer with legal team regarding briefing and oral argument preparation;	First Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1943	Khanna, Abha	7/2/2016	0.10	\$525.00	\$52.50	\$410.00		\$41.00			Email with legal team and E. Prelogar re: meeting with SG's office;	First Appeal
1944	Khanna, Abha	7/6/2016	0.40	\$525.00	\$210.00	\$410.00		\$164.00			Email with E. Prelogar regarding SG meeting (0.1); email and telephone conference with potential amicus regarding amicus options (0.3);	First Appeal
1945	Louijeune, Ruthzee	7/6/2016	0.20	\$320.00	\$64.00	\$320.00		\$64.00			Update Dropbox for North Carolina and Virginia;	First Appeal
1946	Khanna, Abha	7/12/2016	0.20	\$525.00	\$105.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Call and leave voicemail for potential amicus regarding potential amicus participation (0.1); review previous correspondence regarding same (0.1);	First Appeal
1947	Khanna, Abha	7/13/2016	3.50	\$525.00	\$1,837.50	\$410.00		\$1,435.00			Review Jurisdictional Statement and relevant exhibits in preparation for drafting opening brief;	First Appeal
1948	Khanna, Abha	7/15/2016	1.00	\$525.00	\$525.00	\$410.00		\$410.00			Confer with third parties regarding amicus possibilities;	First Appeal
1949	Khanna, Abha	7/18/2016	2.10	\$525.00	\$1,102.50	\$410.00		\$861.00			Review underlying briefing in preparation for opening brief (1.9); email with E. Prelogar regarding SG meeting (0.1); email with legal team regarding same and potential amici (0.1);	First Appeal
1950	Frost, Elisabeth C.	7/19/2016	0.70	\$520.00	\$364.00	\$390.00		\$273.00			Telephone call with M. Elias regarding SG meeting (.1); telephone call to A. Khanna regarding same (left voicemail (.1); telephone call with E. Prolager regarding SG meeting (.1); telephone call with A. Khanna regarding same (.4);	First Appeal
1951	Khanna, Abha	7/19/2016	3.70	\$525.00	\$1,942.50	\$410.00		\$1,517.00			Review and revise briefs in preparation for opening brief and SG meeting (3.0); email and confer with E. Frost regarding SG meeting (0.3); draft outline of outstanding issues for further consideration and/or amici (0.4);	First Appeal
1952	Spear, Ryan M.	7/19/2016	0.80	\$525.00	\$420.00	\$410.00		\$328.00			Confer with A. Khanna regarding status and strategy (.3); gather and review prior briefs and papers (.5);	First Appeal
1953	Branch, Aria C.	7/20/2016	3.00	\$430.00	\$1,290.00	\$345.00		\$1,035.00			Prepare for and attend meeting at Solicitor General's office;	First Appeal
1954	Frost, Elisabeth C.	7/20/2016	2.30	\$520.00	\$1,196.00	\$390.00		\$897.00			Emails with M. Elias, A. Khanna and E. Prelogar regarding SG meeting (.1); attend SG meeting, travel to and from same, and meet with A. Khanna and A. Branch regarding same (2.2);	First Appeal
1955	Khanna, Abha	7/20/2016	3.10	\$525.00	\$1,627.50	\$410.00		\$1,271.00			Prepare for and attend by phone meeting with DOJ (2.9); confer with E. Frost regarding same (0.2);	First Appeal
1956	Spear, Ryan M.	7/20/2016	1.10	\$525.00	\$577.50	\$410.00		\$451.00			Confer with A. Khanna regarding status and strategy (.6); research issues regarding opening brief (.5);	First Appeal
1957	Khanna, Abha	7/21/2016	0.20	\$525.00	\$105.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Email with potential amicus (0.1); confer with B. Stafford regarding Joint Appendix (0.1);	First Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1958	Khanna, Abha	7/22/2016	0.60	\$525.00	\$315.00	\$410.00		\$246.00			Confer with R. Spear regarding DOJ meeting and next steps (0.3); email with A. Branch regarding joint appendix (0.2); coordinate call with R. Spear and A. Branch regarding briefing strategy (0.1);	First Appeal
1959	Spear, Ryan M.	7/22/2016	0.60	\$525.00	\$315.00	\$410.00		\$246.00			Confer with A. Khanna regarding status and strategy;	First Appeal
1960	Branch, Aria C.	7/25/2016	5.00	\$430.00	\$2,150.00	\$345.00		\$1,725.00			Create joint appendix (4.0); review briefs in preparation for conference call (1.0);	First Appeal
1961	Khanna, Abha	7/25/2016	0.30	\$525.00	\$157.50	\$410.00		\$123.00			Email with printer regarding deadlines for JA and merits brief (0.1); confer with A. Branch regarding JA designations (0.2);	First Appeal
1962	Spear, Ryan M.	7/25/2016	1.20	\$525.00	\$630.00	\$410.00		\$492.00			Research issues regarding merits brief;	First Appeal
1963	Branch, Aria C.	7/26/2016	2.60	\$430.00	\$1,118.00	\$345.00		\$897.00			Create joint appendix;	First Appeal
1964	Branch, Aria C.	7/27/2016	3.50	\$430.00	\$1,505.00	\$345.00		\$1,207.50			Create joint appendix (1.8); conference call regarding brief preparation (1.2); review briefs (.5);	First Appeal
1965	Khanna, Abha	7/27/2016	2.20	\$525.00	\$1,155.00	\$410.00		\$902.00			Prepare for and lead call with R. Spear and A. Branch regarding Opening Brief substance and strategy (1.2); draft email summary of same, including substantive bullet points and research issues (0.3); telephone conferences with D. McNeerney (SCOTUS) regarding oral argument schedule (0.2); email and confer with M. Elias and L. Bull regarding same (0.3); confer with Z. Jones regarding outstanding research issues (0.2);	First Appeal
1966	Marino, Patricia	7/27/2016	1.90	\$250.00	\$475.00	\$190.00		\$361.00			Respond to attorney request for information/documents (1.0); review record of trial (.5); compile/organize background material in response to DOJ follow-up request for documents (.4);	First Appeal
1967	Spear, Ryan M.	7/27/2016	4.10	\$525.00	\$2,152.50	\$410.00		\$1,681.00			Prepare for conference and confer with A. Khanna and A. Branch regarding Supreme Court briefing and research (3.6); prepare outline for opening brief (.5);	First Appeal
1968	Branch, Aria C.	7/28/2016	1.60	\$430.00	\$688.00	\$345.00		\$552.00			Create joint appendix;	First Appeal
1969	Khanna, Abha	7/28/2016	1.10	\$525.00	\$577.50	\$410.00		\$451.00			Telephone conferences with E. Prelogar regarding oral argument schedule and exhibits (0.3); email with E. Prelogar regarding same (0.2); telephone conference with opposing counsel regarding oral argument schedule and JA (0.2); review JA designations (0.3); email with all counsel regarding same (0.1);	First Appeal
1970	Branch, Aria C.	7/30/2016	3.00	\$430.00	\$1,290.00	\$345.00		\$1,035.00			Review briefs and underlying redistricting case law;	First Appeal
1971	Branch, Aria C.	7/31/2016	3.00	\$430.00	\$1,290.00	\$345.00		\$1,035.00			Review briefs;	First Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1972	Spear, Ryan M.	7/31/2016	1.40	\$525.00	\$735.00	\$410.00		\$574.00			Prepare outline for opening brief (1.2); emails with A. Khanna and A. Branch regarding same (.2);	First Appeal
1973	Branch, Aria C.	8/1/2016	0.80	\$430.00	\$344.00	\$345.00		\$276.00			Review record to find evidence on VTD splits;	First Appeal
1974	Khanna, Abha	8/1/2016	0.70	\$525.00	\$367.50	\$410.00		\$287.00			Review and revise draft outline for merits brief (0.4); consult SCOTUS rules regarding same (0.2); confer with R. Spear regarding same (0.1);	First Appeal
1975	Spear, Ryan M.	8/1/2016	1.00	\$525.00	\$525.00	\$410.00		\$410.00			Confer with A. Khanna regarding status and strategy (.2); research issues regarding opening brief (.8);	First Appeal
1976	Branch, Aria C.	8/3/2016	0.30	\$430.00	\$129.00	\$345.00		\$103.50			Create joint appendix;	First Appeal
1977	Khanna, Abha	8/3/2016	1.50	\$525.00	\$787.50	\$410.00		\$615.00			Review and revise merits brief outline (0.9); email with R. Spear and A. Branch regarding same (0.2); email with A. Branch regarding Joint Appendix and response to DOJ question (0.1); draft case blurb for circulation to potential amici (0.2); email with potential amicus regarding same (0.1);	First Appeal
1978	Spear, Ryan M.	8/3/2016	0.30	\$525.00	\$157.50	\$410.00		\$123.00			Emails with A. Khanna regarding opening brief (.3);	First Appeal
1979	Khanna, Abha	8/4/2016	0.80	\$525.00	\$420.00	\$410.00		\$328.00			Email with E. Prelogar regarding VTD splits (0.2); research and draft opening brief (0.6);	First Appeal
1980	Branch, Aria C.	8/5/2016	3.00	\$430.00	\$1,290.00	\$345.00		\$1,035.00			Review record to add to joint appendix;	First Appeal
1981	Khanna, Abha	8/5/2016	0.10	\$525.00	\$52.50	\$410.00		\$41.00			Exchange voicemails with J. Hirsch regarding potential amicus brief (0.1);	First Appeal
1982	Spear, Ryan M.	8/5/2016	0.30	\$525.00	\$157.50	\$410.00		\$123.00			Emails with A. Khanna and A. Branch regarding research regarding BVAP (.3);	First Appeal
1983	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/8/2016	0.50	\$655.00	\$327.50	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review and respond to email regarding briefing schedule (.3); conference with A. Khanna regarding same (.2);	First Appeal
1984	Khanna, Abha	8/8/2016	0.90	\$525.00	\$472.50	\$410.00		\$369.00			Email with potential amicus about call with potential amici (0.2); exchange voicemails with potential amicus regarding same (0.1); research and draft merits brief (0.6);	First Appeal
1985	Elias, Marc E.	8/9/2016	1.00	\$765.00	\$765.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Teleconference with potential amici (.8); prep for same (.2);	First Appeal
1986	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/9/2016	0.90	\$655.00	\$589.50	\$575.00		\$517.50			Prepare and participate in telephone conference with potential amici support (.7); conference with A. Khanna regarding same (.2);	First Appeal
1987	Khanna, Abha	8/9/2016	2.10	\$525.00	\$1,102.50	\$410.00		\$861.00			Participate in call with potential amici (1.0); prepare for same (0.2); confer with K. Hamilton regarding same (0.3); telephone conferences with potential amicus regarding same (0.6);	First Appeal
1988	Branch, Aria C.	8/10/2016	0.40	\$430.00	\$172.00	\$345.00		\$138.00			Answer questions regarding joint appendix;	First Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
1989	Khanna, Abha	8/10/2016	1.30	\$525.00	\$682.50	\$410.00		\$533.00			Email and confer with A. Branch regarding JA designations (0.2); review JA designations from opposing counsel and cross check against trial record (0.4); review SCOTUS rules regarding JA (0.3); confer with printer regarding costs associated with Defendant-Intervenors' designations (0.2); email with legal team regarding same (0.2);	First Appeal
1990	Marino, Patricia	8/10/2016	1.50	\$250.00	\$375.00	\$190.00		\$285.00			Respond to attorney requests for information/documents regarding record of trial (.8); summarize Defendant-Intervenor proposed list of exhibits for Joint appendix for attorney A. Khanna further evaluation (.7);	First Appeal
1991	Spear, Ryan M.	8/10/2016	0.10	\$525.00	\$52.50	\$410.00		\$41.00			Emails with A. Khanna regarding appendix;	First Appeal
1992	Branch, Aria C.	8/11/2016	0.40	\$430.00	\$172.00	\$345.00		\$138.00			Edit joint appendix;	First Appeal
1993	Khanna, Abha	8/11/2016	1.90	\$525.00	\$997.50	\$410.00		\$779.00			Research issues regarding JA designations (0.4); email with T. Marino regarding admitted exhibits (0.4); research and draft merits brief (1.1);	First Appeal
1994	Marino, Patricia	8/11/2016	1.00	\$250.00	\$250.00	\$190.00		\$190.00			Respond to attorney follow-up requests for information/documents regarding record of trial (.3); compile background materials and draft index of exhibits for attorney further review (.7);	First Appeal
1995	Spear, Ryan M.	8/11/2016	0.20	\$525.00	\$105.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Emails with A. Khanna and A. Branch regarding brief;	First Appeal
1996	Marino, Patricia	8/12/2016	1.00	\$250.00	\$250.00	\$190.00		\$190.00			Conference/emails with R. Spear regarding record of trial/exhibit issues and related follow-up; compile background materials for litigation team further review regarding exhibit issues;	First Appeal
1997	Spear, Ryan M.	8/12/2016	0.70	\$525.00	\$367.50	\$410.00		\$287.00			Confer with T. Marino regarding exhibits (.4); emails with T. Marino regarding exhibits (.3);	First Appeal
1998	Branch, Aria C.	8/15/2016	0.20	\$430.00	\$86.00	\$345.00		\$69.00			Call regarding drafting brief;	First Appeal
1999	Spear, Ryan M.	8/15/2016	1.20	\$525.00	\$630.00	\$410.00		\$492.00			Confer with A. Branch regarding brief (.5); research issues regarding brief (.7);	First Appeal
2000	Khanna, Abha	8/16/2016	1.40	\$525.00	\$735.00	\$410.00		\$574.00			Work with legal team to determine which exhibits are part of the record (0.2); call and leave voicemail for opposing counsel regarding JA (0.1); confer with R. Spear regarding merits brief (0.2); research and draft parts of same (0.9);	First Appeal
2001	Marino, Patricia	8/16/2016	0.80	\$250.00	\$200.00	\$190.00		\$152.00			Respond to attorney request for information/documents regarding joint appendix and related follow-up;	First Appeal
2002	Spear, Ryan M.	8/16/2016	3.60	\$525.00	\$1,890.00	\$410.00		\$1,476.00			Confer with A. Khanna regarding exhibit issues, status, and strategy (.5); emails with A. Branch regarding brief (.2); prepare brief (2.0); review exhibits and help prepare joint appendix (.6); confer with T. Marino regarding exhibits (.3);	First Appeal
2003	Branch, Aria C.	8/17/2016	6.40	\$430.00	\$2,752.00	\$345.00		\$2,208.00			Draft district specific sections of Supreme Court brief;	First Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2004	Khanna, Abha	8/17/2016	2.10	\$525.00	\$1,102.50	\$410.00		\$861.00			Research and draft merits brief (1.5); confer and email with R. Spear and A. Branch regarding same (0.3); confer with K. McKnight (opposing counsel) regarding JA designations (0.3);	First Appeal
2005	Spear, Ryan M.	8/17/2016	6.40	\$525.00	\$3,360.00	\$410.00		\$2,624.00			Confer with A. Khanna regarding brief (.5); prepare brief (3.7); research issues regarding same (2.0); emails with A. Branch regarding brief (.2);	First Appeal
2006	Branch, Aria C.	8/18/2016	5.20	\$430.00	\$2,236.00	\$345.00		\$1,794.00			Draft district specific sections of Supreme Court brief;	First Appeal
2007	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/18/2016	0.40	\$655.00	\$262.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Review and respond to email regarding joint appendix;	First Appeal
2008	Khanna, Abha	8/18/2016	4.10	\$525.00	\$2,152.50	\$410.00		\$1,681.00			Review Covington decision in preparation for merits (2.0); review and revise merits brief in light of same (1.0) confer with R. Spear regarding same (0.4); confer with A. Branch regarding same (0.3); email and confer with S. Ansolabehere regarding same (0.4);	First Appeal
2009	Marino, Patricia	8/18/2016	5.10	\$250.00	\$1,275.00	\$190.00		\$969.00			Respond to attorney requests regarding joint appendix (1.2); review/quality check parties' joint appendix designations per attorney instruction (2.8); revise/update internal tracking index (.5); compile/organize exhibit materials for attorney further review (.3); respond to requests for information regarding data files identified by expert S. Ansolabehere (.3);	First Appeal
2010	Spear, Ryan M.	8/18/2016	6.90	\$525.00	\$3,622.50	\$410.00		\$2,829.00			Prepare brief for U.S. Supreme Court appeal (3.2); research issues regarding same (1.7); review exhibits regarding same (1.0); confer with A. Khanna regarding same (.5); emails with A. Khanna and S. Ansolabehere regarding same (.5);	First Appeal
2011	Spiva, Bruce V.	8/18/2016	0.20	\$655.00	\$131.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Correspond with A. Khanna regarding joint appendix;	First Appeal
2012	Branch, Aria C.	8/19/2016	4.50	\$430.00	\$1,935.00	\$345.00		\$1,552.50			Draft district-specific sections for Supreme Court brief;	First Appeal
2013	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/19/2016	0.90	\$655.00	\$589.50	\$575.00		\$517.50			Exchange email regarding joint appendix and related issues (.7); review briefing schedule (.2);	First Appeal
2014	Khanna, Abha	8/19/2016	3.50	\$525.00	\$1,837.50	\$410.00		\$1,435.00			Research and draft merits brief (2.7); email and confer with R. Spear and A. Branch regarding same (0.3); email with opposing counsel regarding JA designations (0.2); work with support staff to coordinate same (0.3);	First Appeal
2015	Marino, Patricia	8/19/2016	3.00	\$250.00	\$750.00	\$190.00		\$570.00			Respond to attorney requests regarding exhibits/joint appendix (2.0); review/edit tracking index and update exhibit material per attorneys instruction (1.0);	First Appeal
2016	Spear, Ryan M.	8/19/2016	4.50	\$525.00	\$2,362.50	\$410.00		\$1,845.00			Emails with A. Khanna and S. Ansolabehere regarding statistics (.5); review statistics (1.5); prepare Supreme Court brief (2.1); emails with A. Khanna and A. Branch regarding amici (.4);	First Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2017	Branch, Aria C.	8/20/2016	0.45	\$430.00	\$193.50	\$345.00		\$155.25			Create joint appendix;	First Appeal
2018	Khanna, Abha	8/21/2016	0.10	\$525.00	\$52.50	\$410.00		\$41.00			Draft email response to opposing counsel regarding JA and circulate same to legal team;	First Appeal
2019	Branch, Aria C.	8/22/2016	2.40	\$430.00	\$1,032.00	\$345.00		\$828.00			Draft district-specific sections for Supreme Court brief;	First Appeal
2020	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/22/2016	0.50	\$655.00	\$327.50	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review and respond to email regarding Joint Appendix;	First Appeal
2021	Khanna, Abha	8/22/2016	4.20	\$525.00	\$2,205.00	\$410.00		\$1,722.00			Research and draft opening brief (2.7); confer with R. Spear regarding same (0.2); revise and edit draft sections submitted by A. Branch (0.9); coordinate compilation of Joint Appendix and email with opposing counsel and printer regarding same (0.4);	First Appeal
2022	Spear, Ryan M.	8/22/2016	8.30	\$525.00	\$4,357.50	\$410.00		\$3,403.00			Emails with A. Khanna regarding Supreme Court brief (.2); research issues regarding Supreme Court brief (2.6); prepare Supreme Court brief (5.5);	First Appeal
2023	Branch, Aria C.	8/23/2016	5.00	\$430.00	\$2,150.00	\$345.00		\$1,725.00			Draft district-specific sections for Supreme Court brief;	First Appeal
2024	Khanna, Abha	8/23/2016	4.10	\$525.00	\$2,152.50	\$410.00		\$1,681.00			Research and draft opening brief (3.0); confer with R. Spear regarding same (0.4); email with S. Ansolabehere regarding same (0.2); coordinate JA with printer and opposing counsel (0.5);	First Appeal
2025	Spear, Ryan M.	8/23/2016	8.80	\$525.00	\$4,620.00	\$410.00		\$3,608.00			Emails with A. Khanna and A. Branch regarding Supreme Court brief (.5); research issues regarding Supreme Court brief, including potential exhibits for joint appendix (2.6); prepare Supreme Court brief (4.5); confer with A. Branch and S. Ansolabehere regarding data regarding Supreme Court brief (1.2);	First Appeal
2026	Branch, Aria C.	8/24/2016	8.30	\$430.00	\$3,569.00	\$345.00		\$2,863.50			Draft district-specific sections of Supreme Court merits brief;	First Appeal
2027	Khanna, Abha	8/24/2016	3.60	\$525.00	\$1,890.00	\$410.00		\$1,476.00			Research and draft opening brief (3.1); email and confer with R. Spear, A. Branch, and S. Ansolabehere regarding same (0.5);	First Appeal
2028	Spear, Ryan M.	8/24/2016	8.90	\$525.00	\$4,672.50	\$410.00		\$3,649.00			Emails with A. Khanna and A. Branch regarding Supreme Court brief (1.0); emails with S. Ansolabehere regarding data regarding Supreme Court brief (.6); emails with R. Martin regarding research regarding Supreme Court brief (.2); research issues regarding Supreme Court brief (.9); prepare Supreme Court brief (6.2);	First Appeal
2029	Branch, Aria C.	8/25/2016	4.20	\$430.00	\$1,806.00	\$345.00		\$1,449.00			Draft district-specific sections for Supreme Court brief;	First Appeal
2030	Khanna, Abha	8/25/2016	3.50	\$525.00	\$1,837.50	\$410.00		\$1,435.00			Research and draft opening brief;	First Appeal
2031	Spiva, Bruce V.	8/25/2016	0.30	\$655.00	\$196.50	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with A. Khanna and R. Roberts regarding scheduling;	First Appeal
2032	Khanna, Abha	8/26/2016	2.80	\$525.00	\$1,470.00	\$410.00		\$1,148.00			Research and draft opening brief;	First Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2033	Branch, Aria C.	8/27/2016	4.00	\$430.00	\$1,720.00	\$345.00		\$1,380.00			Answer questions regarding record for brief (1.5); review district-specific sections (2.5);	First Appeal
2034	Khanna, Abha	8/27/2016	4.60	\$525.00	\$2,415.00	\$410.00		\$1,886.00			Review and revise portions of draft opening brief drafted by R. Spear and A. Branch (4.4); email with printer regarding Joint Appendix (0.2);	First Appeal
2035	Branch, Aria C.	8/28/2016	0.60	\$430.00	\$258.00	\$345.00		\$207.00			Draft email response to Solicitor General's office regarding inquiry;	First Appeal
2036	Khanna, Abha	8/28/2016	8.20	\$525.00	\$4,305.00	\$410.00		\$3,362.00			Research, draft, and revise opening brief;	First Appeal
2037	Stafford, William B.	8/28/2016	2.70	\$495.00	\$1,336.50	\$405.00		\$1,093.50			Review and revise draft opening brief on merits;	First Appeal
2038	Branch, Aria C.	8/29/2016	4.10	\$430.00	\$1,763.00	\$345.00		\$1,414.50			Work with printer to create joint appendix (1.1); answer questions regarding district-specific section of brief (3.0);	First Appeal
2039	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/29/2016	0.60	\$655.00	\$393.00	\$575.00		\$345.00			Review and respond to email regarding materials to be included in appendix;	First Appeal
2040	Khanna, Abha	8/29/2016	9.20	\$525.00	\$4,830.00	\$410.00		\$3,772.00			Research, draft, and revise opening brief (8.4); email and confer with S. Ansolabehere regarding same (0.3); email and confer with A. Branch regarding same and Joint Appendix (0.3); email with E. Prelogar (DOJ) regarding same (0.2);	First Appeal
2041	Stafford, William B.	8/29/2016	0.20	\$495.00	\$99.00	\$405.00		\$81.00			Conference with A. Khanna regarding issues for opening brief on merits;	First Appeal
2042	Branch, Aria C.	8/30/2016	3.70	\$430.00	\$1,591.00	\$345.00		\$1,276.50			Finalize joint appendix;	First Appeal
2043	Khanna, Abha	8/30/2016	8.10	\$525.00	\$4,252.50	\$410.00		\$3,321.00			Draft, review, and revise Brief for Appellants (7.5); confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.2); email and confer with A. Branch regarding Joint Appendix (0.4);	First Appeal
2044	Spear, Ryan M.	8/30/2016	2.00	\$525.00	\$1,050.00	\$410.00		\$820.00			Review draft Supreme Court brief (1.1); review expert comments on draft Supreme Court brief (.5); emails with A. Khanna regarding draft Supreme Court brief (.4);	First Appeal
2045	Spiva, Bruce V.	8/30/2016	0.20	\$655.00	\$131.00	\$575.00		\$115.00			Correspond with A. Khanna regarding joint appendix;	First Appeal
2046	Stafford, William B.	8/30/2016	4.20	\$495.00	\$2,079.00	\$405.00		\$1,701.00			Review and revise opening brief on the merits;	First Appeal
2047	Branch, Aria C.	8/31/2016	6.10	\$430.00	\$2,623.00	\$345.00		\$2,104.50			Create joint appendix (4.0); cite check brief (2.1);	First Appeal
2048	Frost, Elisabeth C.	8/31/2016	2.20	\$520.00	\$1,144.00	\$390.00		\$858.00			Review draft Supreme Court brief and emails with A. Khanna regarding same;	First Appeal
2049	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/31/2016	0.70	\$655.00	\$458.50	\$575.00		\$402.50			Review and respond to email regarding appendix of materials and related discussion (.4); review and respond to email from A. Khanna regarding merits briefing (.3);	First Appeal
2050	Khanna, Abha	8/31/2016	2.80	\$525.00	\$1,470.00	\$410.00		\$1,148.00			Review and revise draft SCOTUS brief (2.6); circulate same to legal team with cover email (0.2);	First Appeal
2051	Branch, Aria C.	9/1/2016	1.60	\$430.00	\$688.00	\$345.00		\$552.00			Finalize joint appendix;	First Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2052	Frost, Elisabeth C.	9/1/2016	1.10	\$520.00	\$572.00	\$390.00		\$429.00			Review draft Supreme Court brief and emails with A. Khanna regarding same;	First Appeal
2053	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/1/2016	1.50	\$655.00	\$982.50	\$575.00		\$862.50			Review draft merits brief (1.3); conference with A. Khanna regarding same (.2);	First Appeal
2054	Khanna, Abha	9/1/2016	6.80	\$525.00	\$3,570.00	\$410.00		\$2,788.00			Review and revise draft SCOTUS brief (5.8); input Editor's cite check edits (0.6); confer with S. Ansolabehere regarding same (0.3); confer with K. Hamilton regarding same (0.1);	First Appeal
2055	Spear, Ryan M.	9/1/2016	2.00	\$525.00	\$1,050.00	\$410.00		\$820.00			Review and revise Supreme Court brief (1.8); emails with A. Khanna regarding same (.2);	First Appeal
2056	Spiva, Bruce V.	9/1/2016	0.50	\$655.00	\$327.50	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review and comment on draft Supreme Court brief;	First Appeal
2057	Spiva, Bruce V.	9/1/2016	0.30	\$655.00	\$196.50	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with A. Khanna about draft Supreme Court brief;	First Appeal
2058	Stafford, William B.	9/1/2016	1.50	\$495.00	\$742.50	\$405.00		\$607.50			Review and revise Supreme Court brief;	First Appeal
2059	Branch, Aria C.	9/2/2016	0.80	\$430.00	\$344.00	\$345.00		\$276.00			Create joint appendix (.5); cite check brief (.3);	First Appeal
2060	Elias, Marc E.	9/2/2016	1.00	\$765.00	\$765.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Email correspondence with K. Hamilton, J. Devaney, B. Spiva, E. Frost, A. Khanna regarding appeal (.3); review documents regarding same (.7);	First Appeal
2061	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/2/2016	3.40	\$655.00	\$2,227.00	\$575.00		\$1,955.00			Review and revise draft merits briefing (3.2); exchange related email with A. Khanna (.2);	First Appeal
2062	Khanna, Abha	9/2/2016	5.20	\$525.00	\$2,730.00	\$410.00		\$2,132.00			Review and revise draft brief (4.9); review and incorporate K. Hamilton edits (0.3);	First Appeal
2063	Spear, Ryan M.	9/2/2016	1.80	\$525.00	\$945.00	\$410.00		\$738.00			Review and revise Supreme Court brief (1.6); emails with A. Khanna regarding same (.2);	First Appeal
2064	Spiva, Bruce V.	9/2/2016	1.00	\$655.00	\$655.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Review and revise draft Supreme Court brief;	First Appeal
2065	Branch, Aria C.	9/3/2016	3.80	\$430.00	\$1,634.00	\$345.00		\$1,311.00			Insert cites to Joint Appendix in brief;	First Appeal
2066	Khanna, Abha	9/3/2016	0.60	\$525.00	\$315.00	\$410.00		\$246.00			Review edits and comments from B. Spiva and B. Stafford (0.4); email with PS Elevate regarding incorporation of table of contents and table of authorities (0.1); email with opposing counsel regarding JA (0.1);	First Appeal
2067	Spiva, Bruce V.	9/3/2016	0.40	\$655.00	\$262.00	\$575.00		\$230.00			Correspond with A. Khanna regarding revisions;	First Appeal
2068	Spiva, Bruce V.	9/3/2016	5.00	\$655.00	\$3,275.00	\$575.00		\$2,875.00			Review and revise Supreme Court;	First Appeal
2069	Stafford, William B.	9/3/2016	1.60	\$495.00	\$792.00	\$405.00		\$648.00			Review and revise opening brief on the merits;	First Appeal
2070	Elias, Marc E.	9/4/2016	1.00	\$765.00	\$765.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Email correspondence with B. Spiva, A. Khanna, K. Hamilton, A. Branch, R. Spear, B. Stafford regarding draft brief for appellants (.3); review materials regarding same (.7);	First Appeal
2071	Khanna, Abha	9/4/2016	4.50	\$525.00	\$2,362.50	\$410.00		\$1,845.00			Review and revise brief and send same to printer (4.3); email with S. Ansolabehere regarding certain data (0.2);	First Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2072	Khanna, Abha	9/5/2016	0.80	\$525.00	\$420.00	\$410.00		\$328.00			Review and revise proof from printer (0.6); email printer with edits to same (0.2);	First Appeal
2073	Branch, Aria C.	9/6/2016	0.50	\$430.00	\$215.00	\$345.00		\$172.50			Add joint appendix cites to brief;	First Appeal
2074	Elias, Marc E.	9/6/2016	0.50	\$765.00	\$382.50	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review and email regarding amicus briefs;	First Appeal
2075	Khanna, Abha	9/6/2016	6.20	\$525.00	\$3,255.00	\$410.00		\$2,542.00			Review and revise multiple proofs from printer (5.9); submit around two rounds of edits to printer (0.3);	First Appeal
2076	Branch, Aria C.	9/7/2016	1.20	\$430.00	\$516.00	\$345.00		\$414.00			Proofread brief;	First Appeal
2077	Khanna, Abha	9/7/2016	4.50	\$525.00	\$2,362.50	\$410.00		\$1,845.00			Review, revise, and finalize for publishing Brief of Appellants;	First Appeal
2078	Spear, Ryan M.	9/7/2016	2.20	\$525.00	\$1,155.00	\$410.00		\$902.00			Review and revise Supreme Court brief (1.7); confer with A. Khanna regarding same (.5);	First Appeal
2079	Khanna, Abha	9/8/2016	0.20	\$525.00	\$105.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Email with DOJ and amici regarding Brief for Appellants and JA (0.1); email with printer regarding distribution of JA (0.1);	First Appeal
2080	Frost, Elisabeth C.	9/9/2016	0.30	\$520.00	\$156.00	\$390.00		\$117.00			Return call to A. Salarneck regarding consent to amicus brief (left voicemail) (.1); emails with same regarding consent to amicus (.2);	First Appeal
2081	Khanna, Abha	9/9/2016	0.40	\$525.00	\$210.00	\$410.00		\$164.00			Draft blanket amicus consent letter and email with legal team regarding same (0.2); email with DOJ regarding Brief for Appellants (0.2);	First Appeal
2082	Khanna, Abha	9/13/2016	0.10	\$525.00	\$52.50	\$410.00		\$41.00			Email with A. Riggs regarding amicus;	First Appeal
2083	Elias, Marc E.	9/14/2016	1.50	\$765.00	\$1,147.50	\$575.00		\$862.50			Review briefs (1.1); telephone conference and email regarding case (.4);	First Appeal
2084	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/14/2016	1.00	\$655.00	\$655.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Review incoming Supreme Court merits briefing;	First Appeal
2085	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/15/2016	1.20	\$655.00	\$786.00	\$575.00		\$690.00			Review Supreme Court merits briefing;	First Appeal
2086	Frost, Elisabeth C.	9/16/2016	0.90	\$520.00	\$468.00	\$390.00		\$351.00			Review NAACP and lawyer's committee amicus briefs and SG brief;	First Appeal
2087	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/16/2016	0.90	\$655.00	\$589.50	\$575.00		\$517.50			Review Supreme Court merits briefing;	First Appeal
2088	Khanna, Abha	9/16/2016	0.20	\$525.00	\$105.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Confer with R. Spear regarding DOJ position;	First Appeal
2089	Spear, Ryan M.	9/18/2016	1.50	\$525.00	\$787.50	\$410.00		\$615.00			Review amicus briefs;	First Appeal
2090	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/19/2016	1.20	\$655.00	\$786.00	\$575.00		\$690.00			Review briefing and joint appendix;	First Appeal
2091	Khanna, Abha	9/19/2016	0.50	\$525.00	\$262.50	\$410.00		\$205.00			Confer with R. Spear regarding amicus briefs and follow-up research;	First Appeal
2092	Spear, Ryan M.	9/19/2016	5.30	\$525.00	\$2,782.50	\$410.00		\$2,173.00			Review amicus briefs (2.0); research issues regarding same (2.5); confer with A. Khanna regarding same (.3); prepare summary email to A. Khanna and A. Branch regarding same (.5);	First Appeal
2093	Spear, Ryan M.	9/20/2016	1.60	\$525.00	\$840.00	\$410.00		\$656.00			Prepare summary email to A. Khanna and A. Branch regarding amicus briefs (.5); research issues regarding same (1.1);	First Appeal
2094	Branch, Aria C.	9/22/2016	1.00	\$430.00	\$430.00	\$345.00		\$345.00			Answer question regarding deposition designations;	First Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2095	Khanna, Abha	9/22/2016	4.00	\$525.00	\$2,100.00	\$410.00		\$1,640.00			Review amicus briefs (3.0); draft notes and outlines regarding same (0.5); email and confer with R. Spear and A. Branch regarding narrow tailoring analysis in preparation for reply brief (0.5);	First Appeal
2096	Spear, Ryan M.	9/22/2016	2.90	\$525.00	\$1,522.50	\$410.00		\$1,189.00			Research issues regarding Supreme Court reply brief (2.0); emails with A. Khanna and A. Branch regarding same (.5); confer with A. Khanna regarding same (.2); prepare language regarding narrow tailoring argument (.2);	First Appeal
2097	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/23/2016	0.50	\$655.00	\$327.50	\$575.00		\$287.50			Telephone conference with Supreme Court Institute at Georgetown to confirm use of room for moot court (.3); report to the team regarding same (.2);	First Appeal
2098	Khanna, Abha	9/23/2016	3.60	\$525.00	\$1,890.00	\$410.00		\$1,476.00			Review remainder of amicus briefs (2.8); draft notes and summaries of same in preparation for reply brief (0.5); coordinate conference call with R. Spear and A. Branch regarding reply brief (0.1); research timing of Court's conference for purposes of oral argument scheduling and email with legal team regarding same (0.1); email with legal team regarding Georgetown moot (0.1);	First Appeal
2099	Branch, Aria C.	9/25/2016	4.00	\$430.00	\$1,720.00	\$345.00		\$1,380.00			Review amicus briefs;	First Appeal
2100	Branch, Aria C.	9/26/2016	4.40	\$430.00	\$1,892.00	\$345.00		\$1,518.00			Review amicus briefs (3.6); conference call regarding reply brief (.8);	First Appeal
2101	Cherry, Ceridwen B.	9/26/2016	0.40	\$430.00	\$172.00	\$345.00		\$138.00			Confer with A. Khanna regarding research topics for Supreme Court reply brief;	First Appeal
2102	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/26/2016	1.00	\$655.00	\$655.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Review briefing schedule and exchange email with A. Khanna regarding argument schedule (.6); review briefing received to date (.4);	First Appeal
2103	Khanna, Abha	9/26/2016	5.70	\$525.00	\$2,992.50	\$410.00		\$2,337.00			Review Motion to Dismiss/Affirm and take notes on same in preparation for reply brief and conference with legal team regarding same (1.0); review and take notes on case law regarding same (3.1); participate in conference with A. Branch and R. Spear regarding reply brief strategy (0.8); telephone conference and email with C. Cherry regarding research assignments (0.4); email with legal team regarding requested extension for Appellees' Merits Brief (0.2); confer with K. Hamilton regarding same and oral argument schedule (0.2);	First Appeal
2104	Spear, Ryan M.	9/26/2016	3.70	\$525.00	\$1,942.50	\$410.00		\$1,517.00			Review A. Khanna summaries of amicus briefs (.5); review emails with A. Khanna and C. Cherry regarding research questions (.2); emails with A. Khanna and A. Branch regarding status, strategy, and next steps (.5); prepare for conference and confer with A. Khanna and A. Branch regarding amicus briefs and next steps regarding reply brief (2.5);	First Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2105	Cherry, Ceridwen B.	9/27/2016	3.50	\$430.00	\$1,505.00	\$345.00		\$1,207.50			Conduct legal research for reply brief;	First Appeal
2106	Khanna, Abha	9/27/2016	2.40	\$525.00	\$1,260.00	\$410.00		\$984.00			Review cases cited in previous briefing from Appellees (1.8); draft notes to distinguish same (0.4); email with legal team regarding proposed extension of briefing schedule (0.2);	First Appeal
2107	Branch, Aria C.	9/28/2016	0.20	\$430.00	\$86.00	\$345.00		\$69.00			Call regarding scheduling of oral argument;	First Appeal
2108	Khanna, Abha	9/28/2016	1.10	\$525.00	\$577.50	\$410.00		\$451.00			Email with A. Branch and legal team regarding oral argument scheduling (0.2); telephone conference with E. Prelogar (SG's office) (0.4); email with legal team regarding same (0.2); review case law cited by Appellees in previous briefing in preparation for reply brief (0.3);	First Appeal
2109	Spear, Ryan M.	9/28/2016	0.20	\$525.00	\$105.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Emails with A. Khanna regarding oral argument;	First Appeal
2110	Cherry, Ceridwen B.	9/29/2016	0.80	\$430.00	\$344.00	\$345.00		\$276.00			Review lower court's opinion to prepare for research for Supreme Court reply brief;	First Appeal
2111	Khanna, Abha	9/29/2016	1.00	\$525.00	\$525.00	\$410.00		\$410.00			Review case law cited by opposing counsel in previous SCOTUS brief (0.8); draft notes regarding same (0.2);	First Appeal
2112	Cherry, Ceridwen B.	9/30/2016	2.50	\$430.00	\$1,075.00	\$345.00		\$862.50			Conduct legal research for Supreme Court brief;	First Appeal
2113	Khanna, Abha	9/30/2016	0.70	\$525.00	\$367.50	\$410.00		\$287.00			Review letter from opposing counsel regarding extension request (0.1); review case law cited by Appellees in previous SCOTUS briefing (0.6);	First Appeal
2114	Spear, Ryan M.	10/2/2016	0.50	\$525.00	\$262.50	\$410.00		\$205.00			Emails with litigation team regarding request for extension;	First Appeal
2115	Spiva, Bruce V.	10/2/2016	0.30	\$655.00	\$196.50	\$575.00		\$172.50			Correspond with team regarding SG's request for oral argument time;	First Appeal
2116	Cherry, Ceridwen B.	10/3/2016	1.00	\$430.00	\$430.00	\$345.00		\$345.00			Review Intervenor's Motion to Dismiss to prepare for legal research for Supreme Court brief;	First Appeal
2117	Cherry, Ceridwen B.	10/5/2016	2.50	\$430.00	\$1,075.00	\$345.00		\$862.50			Research preserving appeal of exclusion of expert testimony for Supreme Court brief;	First Appeal
2118	Cherry, Ceridwen B.	10/6/2016	4.00	\$430.00	\$1,720.00	\$345.00		\$1,380.00			Conduct legal research for Supreme Court reply brief;	First Appeal
2119	Cherry, Ceridwen B.	10/7/2016	5.30	\$430.00	\$2,279.00	\$345.00		\$1,828.50			Conduct legal research on courts' use of exogenous election data and the reliability of election data from a single election for use in Supreme Court reply brief;	First Appeal
2120	Cherry, Ceridwen B.	10/11/2016	4.20	\$430.00	\$1,806.00	\$345.00		\$1,449.00			Research use of exogenous election data for Supreme Court reply brief (4.2);	First Appeal
2121	Khanna, Abha	10/13/2016	3.00	\$525.00	\$1,575.00	\$410.00		\$1,230.00			Review State's brief in Wittman and case law in preparation for reply brief (2.7); confer with K. Hamilton regarding same and legal strategy (0.3);	First Appeal
2122	Cherry, Ceridwen B.	10/14/2016	1.00	\$430.00	\$430.00	\$345.00		\$345.00			Research Courts' use of exogenous election data (1.0);	First Appeal
2123	Frost, Elisabeth C.	10/14/2016	0.10	\$520.00	\$52.00	\$390.00		\$39.00			Email from A. Khanna regarding oral argument time (1.1);	First Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2124	Khanna, Abha	10/14/2016	0.60	\$525.00	\$315.00	\$410.00		\$246.00			Telephone conference with E. Prelogar regarding oral argument (0.2); email with legal team regarding same (0.1); review cases in preparation for reply brief (0.3);	First Appeal
2125	Khanna, Abha	10/17/2016	0.90	\$525.00	\$472.50	\$410.00		\$369.00			Review Appellees' Brief (0.6); email and confer with R. Spear and A. Branch regarding same (0.3);	First Appeal
2126	Spear, Ryan M.	10/17/2016	0.10	\$525.00	\$52.50	\$410.00		\$41.00			Emails with A. Khanna regarding appellees' brief (.1);	First Appeal
2127	Khanna, Abha	10/18/2016	1.30	\$525.00	\$682.50	\$410.00		\$533.00			Review Appellees' brief (1.3);	First Appeal
2128	Branch, Aria C.	10/19/2016	6.00	\$430.00	\$2,580.00	\$345.00		\$2,070.00			Review brief and take notes;	First Appeal
2129	Khanna, Abha	10/19/2016	2.60	\$525.00	\$1,365.00	\$410.00		\$1,066.00			Review appellees' brief (1.6); draft notes and outline for reply brief (1.0);	First Appeal
2130	Branch, Aria C.	10/20/2016	2.40	\$430.00	\$1,032.00	\$345.00		\$828.00			Review brief; conference call regarding reply brief;	First Appeal
2131	Khanna, Abha	10/20/2016	4.40	\$525.00	\$2,310.00	\$410.00		\$1,804.00			Review and outline Appellees' brief, annotating reply brief notes (1.0); review amicus and other SCOTUS briefing in preparation for reply (1.2); outline reply brief (1.2); confer with R. Spear and A. Branch regarding approach to reply (1.0);	First Appeal
2132	Louijeune, Ruthzee	10/20/2016	1.50	\$320.00	\$480.00	\$320.00		\$480.00			Draft memo re: Supreme Court's current jurisprudence on racial issues;	First Appeal
2133	Spear, Ryan M.	10/20/2016	3.30	\$525.00	\$1,732.50	\$410.00		\$1,353.00			Conference with A. Khanna and A. Branch regarding briefing (1.0); emails with litigation team regarding oral argument (.1); review transcripts regarding issues regarding briefing (2.2);	First Appeal
2134	Louijeune, Ruthzee	10/21/2016	1.60	\$320.00	\$512.00	\$320.00		\$512.00			Draft and edit memo re: Supreme Court's current jurisprudence on racial issues;	First Appeal
2135	Branch, Aria C.	10/22/2016	4.00	\$430.00	\$1,720.00	\$345.00		\$1,380.00			Review district court record;	First Appeal
2136	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/22/2016	2.00	\$655.00	\$1,310.00	\$575.00		\$1,150.00			Review briefing and moot court scheduling (1.8); conference with A. Khanna regarding same (.2);	First Appeal
2137	Branch, Aria C.	10/23/2016	3.00	\$430.00	\$1,290.00	\$345.00		\$1,035.00			Review district court record;	First Appeal
2138	Khanna, Abha	10/24/2016	0.30	\$525.00	\$157.50	\$410.00		\$123.00			Telephone conference with D. Bernstein (Georgetown moots) (0.1); confer with K. Hamilton regarding moot schedule (0.2);	First Appeal
2139	Khanna, Abha	10/26/2016	3.50	\$525.00	\$1,837.50	\$410.00		\$1,435.00			Review amicus briefs and other briefs in preparation for reply brief drafting (3.1); draft email of research questions for C. Cherry (0.4);	First Appeal
2140	Spear, Ryan M.	10/26/2016	0.20	\$525.00	\$105.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Emails with A. Khanna and A. Branch regarding reply brief (.2);	First Appeal
2141	Branch, Aria C.	10/27/2016	2.80	\$430.00	\$1,204.00	\$345.00		\$966.00			Review district court record;	First Appeal
2142	Cherry, Ceridwen B.	10/27/2016	8.40	\$430.00	\$3,612.00	\$345.00		\$2,898.00			Review pre-trial briefs and trial transcript to conduct research for Supreme Court reply brief (8.4);	First Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2143	Khanna, Abha	10/27/2016	3.60	\$525.00	\$1,890.00	\$410.00		\$1,476.00			Review briefs in preparation for reply brief drafting (3.0); begin outlining reply brief (0.3); email and confer with legal team regarding same (0.3);	First Appeal
2144	Marino, Patricia	10/27/2016	0.80	\$250.00	\$200.00	\$190.00		\$152.00			Respond to attorney request for information/documents in response to amici potential use of expert report; review record of trial and motions regarding expert Loewen report and summarize findings for litigation team further evaluation;	First Appeal
2145	Spear, Ryan M.	10/27/2016	1.30	\$525.00	\$682.50	\$410.00		\$533.00			Conference with A. Khanna regarding amicus briefs (.2); conference with A. Khanna regarding request of amicus to submit expert report to Supreme Court (.1); emails with litigation team regarding same (.2); review trial materials regarding same (.5); emails with litigation team regarding reply brief (.3);	First Appeal
2146	Branch, Aria C.	10/28/2016	3.30	\$430.00	\$1,419.00	\$345.00		\$1,138.50			Review amicus briefs;	First Appeal
2147	Cherry, Ceridwen B.	10/28/2016	0.50	\$430.00	\$215.00	\$345.00		\$172.50			Review trial transcript for research for Supreme Court reply brief (0.5);	First Appeal
2148	Khanna, Abha	10/28/2016	4.90	\$525.00	\$2,572.50	\$410.00		\$2,009.00			Review and revise briefs in preparation for reply brief drafting (3.3); draft outline for reply brief (1.3); confer and email with legal team regarding same (0.3);	First Appeal
2149	Spear, Ryan M.	10/28/2016	3.40	\$525.00	\$1,785.00	\$410.00		\$1,394.00			Prepare letter regarding objection to request to lodge non-record evidence (.9), research Supreme Court rules regarding same (1.0); review trial transcript and pre-trial briefing regarding same (.7); emails with litigation team regarding same (.6); conference with A. Khanna regarding same (.2); emails with A. Khanna and A. Branch regarding Supreme Court briefing (.3);	First Appeal
2150	Spiva, Bruce V.	10/28/2016	0.70	\$655.00	\$458.50	\$575.00		\$402.50			Correspond with team regarding objecting to exhibit to amicus brief;	First Appeal
2151	Branch, Aria C.	10/29/2016	8.70	\$430.00	\$3,741.00	\$345.00		\$3,001.50			Draft reply brief;	First Appeal
2152	Spear, Ryan M.	10/29/2016	0.10	\$525.00	\$52.50	\$410.00		\$41.00			Emails with A. Branch regarding Supreme Court briefing (.1);	First Appeal
2153	Branch, Aria C.	10/30/2016	6.80	\$430.00	\$2,924.00	\$345.00		\$2,346.00			Draft reply brief;	First Appeal
2154	Spear, Ryan M.	10/30/2016	0.30	\$525.00	\$157.50	\$410.00		\$123.00			Review letter regarding objection to request to lodge non-record evidence (.2); emails with litigation team regarding same (.1);	First Appeal
2155	Branch, Aria C.	10/31/2016	5.00	\$430.00	\$2,150.00	\$345.00		\$1,725.00			Draft sections of reply brief;	First Appeal
2156	Cherry, Ceridwen B.	10/31/2016	5.70	\$430.00	\$2,451.00	\$345.00		\$1,966.50			Review trial transcripts and expert reports to conduct research for Supreme Court reply brief (5.7);	First Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2157	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/31/2016	0.90	\$655.00	\$589.50	\$575.00		\$517.50			Organize materials and conference with A. Khanna regarding preparation for Supreme Court argument;	First Appeal
2158	Khanna, Abha	10/31/2016	1.90	\$525.00	\$997.50	\$410.00		\$779.00			Draft reply brief (1.9);	First Appeal
2159	Spear, Ryan M.	10/31/2016	1.50	\$525.00	\$787.50	\$410.00		\$615.00			Emails with A. Khanna and A. Branch regarding Supreme Court briefing (.3); review and revise letter regarding objection to request to lodge non-record evidence (.8); finalize and prepare letter for filing and mailing (.4);	First Appeal
2160	Branch, Aria C.	11/1/2016	8.30	\$430.00	\$3,569.00	\$345.00		\$2,863.50			Draft district specific sections of brief;	First Appeal
2161	Cherry, Ceridwen B.	11/1/2016	3.00	\$430.00	\$1,290.00	\$345.00		\$1,035.00			Review expert reports and conduct legal research for Supreme Court reply brief (3.0);	First Appeal
2162	Hamilton, Kevin J.	11/1/2016	0.90	\$655.00	\$589.50	\$575.00		\$517.50			Review and exchange email regarding letter objections regarding amicus brief;	First Appeal
2163	Khanna, Abha	11/1/2016	1.80	\$525.00	\$945.00	\$410.00		\$738.00			Draft reply brief (1.3); review research results from C. Cherry regarding same (0.3); email and confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.2);	First Appeal
2164	Louijeune, Ruthzee	11/1/2016	1.30	\$320.00	\$416.00	\$320.00		\$416.00			Finalize memo on SCOTUS views on race;	First Appeal
2165	Marino, Patricia	11/1/2016	2.20	\$250.00	\$550.00	\$190.00		\$418.00			Respond to attorney request for information/documents; review/search trial exhibit materials per attorney instruction; compile selected documents and summarize findings for attorney further evaluation;	First Appeal
2166	Spear, Ryan M.	11/1/2016	3.10	\$525.00	\$1,627.50	\$410.00		\$1,271.00			Prepare reply brief (2.1); research issues regarding same (.7); emails with A. Khanna regarding objection letter regarding request to lodge non-record materials (.2); emails with opposing counsel regarding objection letter regarding request to lodge non-record materials (.1);	First Appeal
2167	Branch, Aria C.	11/2/2016	7.90	\$430.00	\$3,397.00	\$345.00		\$2,725.50			Review district court record; draft district specific sections of reply brief;	First Appeal
2168	Cherry, Ceridwen B.	11/2/2016	3.50	\$430.00	\$1,505.00	\$345.00		\$1,207.50			Conduct westlaw research for Supreme Court reply brief (3.5);	First Appeal
2169	Hamilton, Kevin J.	11/2/2016	1.10	\$655.00	\$720.50	\$575.00		\$632.50			Exchange email regarding letter objection to amicus brief (.3); conference with A. Khanna regarding moot arguments and related issues (.8);	First Appeal
2170	Khanna, Abha	11/2/2016	3.50	\$525.00	\$1,837.50	\$410.00		\$1,435.00			Draft reply brief (3.3); confer with R. Spear regarding amicus letter (0.2);	First Appeal
2171	Spear, Ryan M.	11/2/2016	4.30	\$525.00	\$2,257.50	\$410.00		\$1,763.00			Emails with A. Khanna and A. Branch regarding reply brief (.3); prepare reply brief (2.8); emails with litigation team regarding objection letter regarding request to lodge non-record materials (.7); conference with D. McNerney regarding same (.2); revise objection letter (.3);	First Appeal
2172	Branch, Aria C.	11/3/2016	2.10	\$430.00	\$903.00	\$345.00		\$724.50			Draft district-specific sections of reply brief;	First Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2173	Cherry, Ceridwen B.	11/3/2016	5.40	\$430.00	\$2,322.00	\$345.00		\$1,863.00			Conduct westlaw research and review Appellees post trial briefing to conduct research for Supreme Court reply brief (0.8);	First Appeal
2174	Hamilton, Kevin J.	11/3/2016	1.20	\$655.00	\$786.00	\$575.00		\$690.00			Organize materials for preparation for moot court; exchange email with Georgetown regarding moot;	First Appeal
2175	Khanna, Abha	11/3/2016	1.90	\$525.00	\$997.50	\$410.00		\$779.00			Draft reply brief (1.9);	First Appeal
2176	Louijeune, Ruthzee	11/3/2016	1.30	\$320.00	\$416.00	\$320.00		\$416.00			Draft and edit memo re: Supreme Court's current jurisprudence on racial issues;	First Appeal
2177	Spear, Ryan M.	11/3/2016	3.50	\$525.00	\$1,837.50	\$410.00		\$1,435.00			Prepare reply brief (3.1); emails with litigation team regarding objection letter regarding request to lodge non-record materials (.2); conference with K. Hamilton regarding same (.2);	First Appeal
2178	Branch, Aria C.	11/4/2016	5.80	\$430.00	\$2,494.00	\$345.00		\$2,001.00			Draft district-specific sections of reply brief;	First Appeal
2179	Cherry, Ceridwen B.	11/4/2016	3.40	\$430.00	\$1,462.00	\$345.00		\$1,173.00			Conduct westlaw research for Supreme Court reply brief (3.4);	First Appeal
2180	Frost, Elisabeth C.	11/4/2016	0.60	\$520.00	\$312.00	\$390.00		\$234.00			Telephone conference with A. Khanna, R. Louijeune, A. Branch, and M. Elias regarding preparation for Supreme Court argument	First Appeal
2181	Khanna, Abha	11/4/2016	4.20	\$525.00	\$2,205.00	\$410.00		\$1,722.00			Draft reply brief (4.2);	First Appeal
2182	Roberts, Rachel M.	11/4/2016	2.50	\$130.00	\$325.00	\$180.00	\$125.00	\$450.00	\$312.50	\$137.50	Pull citations and discussion of legislative intent from briefs and opinions in other cases per: C. Cherry;	First Appeal
2183	Spear, Ryan M.	11/4/2016	5.60	\$525.00	\$2,940.00	\$410.00		\$2,296.00			Prepare reply brief (2.9); emails with S. Ansolabehere regarding map data (.5); research issues regarding same (1.1); revise objection letter regarding request to lodge non-record materials (.3); emails with A. Khanna regarding same (.2); coordinate filing of same (.4); emails with D. McNerney regarding same (.2);	First Appeal
2184	Branch, Aria C.	11/5/2016	5.00	\$430.00	\$2,150.00	\$345.00		\$1,725.00			Draft reply brief;	First Appeal
2185	Cherry, Ceridwen B.	11/5/2016	2.30	\$430.00	\$989.00	\$345.00		\$793.50			Conduct westlaw research for cases relying on legislative intent for Supreme Court reply brief (2.3);	First Appeal
2186	Branch, Aria C.	11/6/2016	5.20	\$430.00	\$2,236.00	\$345.00		\$1,794.00			Draft reply brief;	First Appeal
2187	Khanna, Abha	11/6/2016	1.80	\$525.00	\$945.00	\$410.00		\$738.00			Draft reply brief (1.6); email with Georgetown regarding moots (0.2);	First Appeal
2188	Spear, Ryan M.	11/6/2016	0.20	\$525.00	\$105.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Emails with S. Ansolabehere regarding reply brief;	First Appeal
2189	Branch, Aria C.	11/7/2016	6.20	\$430.00	\$2,666.00	\$345.00		\$2,139.00			Read and review relevant case law;	First Appeal
2190	Khanna, Abha	11/7/2016	4.50	\$525.00	\$2,362.50	\$410.00		\$1,845.00			Draft reply brief (4.5);	First Appeal
2191	Spear, Ryan M.	11/7/2016	2.20	\$525.00	\$1,155.00	\$410.00		\$902.00			Emails with A. Khanna and A. Branch regarding reply brief (.2); review and revise reply brief (2.2);	First Appeal
2192	Branch, Aria C.	11/8/2016	2.50	\$430.00	\$1,075.00	\$345.00		\$862.50			Review trial court record;	First Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2193	Louijeune, Ruthzee	11/8/2016	0.30	\$320.00	\$96.00	\$320.00		\$96.00			Re-read Strickland v. Barlett;	First Appeal
2194	Spear, Ryan M.	11/8/2016	1.10	\$525.00	\$577.50	\$410.00		\$451.00			Emails with litigation team regarding status and strategy (.1); review and revise reply brief (1.0);	First Appeal
2195	Branch, Aria C.	11/9/2016	2.00	\$430.00	\$860.00	\$345.00		\$690.00			Review trial court record;	First Appeal
2196	Khanna, Abha	11/9/2016	5.90	\$525.00	\$3,097.50	\$410.00		\$2,419.00			Draft, review, and revise reply brief (5.9);	First Appeal
2197	Louijeune, Ruthzee	11/9/2016	0.20	\$320.00	\$64.00	\$320.00		\$64.00			Discuss VRA Section 2 issue;	First Appeal
2198	Branch, Aria C.	11/10/2016	7.00	\$430.00	\$3,010.00	\$345.00		\$2,415.00			Work on reply brief; read relevant case law;	First Appeal
2199	Khanna, Abha	11/10/2016	2.50	\$525.00	\$1,312.50	\$410.00		\$1,025.00			Draft, review, and revise reply brief (2.5);	First Appeal
2200	Spear, Ryan M.	11/10/2016	2.90	\$525.00	\$1,522.50	\$410.00		\$1,189.00			Emails with A. Khanna, B. Stafford, and A. Branch regarding reply brief (.5); conference with A. Branch regarding reply brief (.3); review and revise reply brief (2.1);	First Appeal
2201	Stafford, William B.	11/10/2016	0.90	\$495.00	\$445.50	\$405.00		\$364.50			Review and provide edits to proof of reply brief on merits;	First Appeal
2202	Branch, Aria C.	11/11/2016	2.00	\$430.00	\$860.00	\$345.00		\$690.00			Edit reply brief;	First Appeal
2203	Khanna, Abha	11/11/2016	4.10	\$525.00	\$2,152.50	\$410.00		\$1,681.00			Review and revise reply brief (3.9); confer with R. Spear regarding same (0.2);	First Appeal
2204	Louijeune, Ruthzee	11/11/2016	2.00	\$320.00	\$640.00	\$320.00		\$640.00			Read lower court opinion and review case law;	First Appeal
2205	Spear, Ryan M.	11/11/2016	3.50	\$525.00	\$1,837.50	\$410.00		\$1,435.00			Review and revise reply brief (1.5); research issues regarding same (1.2); emails with A. Khanna and A. Branch regarding same (.6); emails with Wilson Epes regarding same (.2);	First Appeal
2206	Stafford, William B.	11/11/2016	0.80	\$495.00	\$396.00	\$405.00		\$324.00			Review and provide edits to proof of reply brief on merits;	First Appeal
2207	Khanna, Abha	11/12/2016	0.30	\$525.00	\$157.50	\$410.00		\$123.00			Review and revise reply brief (0.3);	First Appeal
2208	Spear, Ryan M.	11/12/2016	0.10	\$525.00	\$52.50	\$410.00		\$41.00			Emails with A. Khanna regarding reply brief (.1);	First Appeal
2209	Branch, Aria C.	11/13/2016	3.00	\$430.00	\$1,290.00	\$345.00		\$1,035.00			Proofread and edit brief;	First Appeal
2210	Khanna, Abha	11/13/2016	0.20	\$525.00	\$105.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Email and confer with R. Spear and A. Branch regarding finalization of reply brief (0.2);	First Appeal
2211	Spear, Ryan M.	11/13/2016	5.70	\$525.00	\$2,992.50	\$410.00		\$2,337.00			Review and revise reply brief (4.1); research issues regarding same (1.1); emails with B. Spiva, A. Khanna, and A. Branch regarding same (.5);	First Appeal
2212	Spiva, Bruce V.	11/13/2016	2.00	\$655.00	\$1,310.00	\$575.00		\$1,150.00			Review and comment on Supreme Court reply brief;	First Appeal
2213	Branch, Aria C.	11/14/2016	7.90	\$430.00	\$3,397.00	\$345.00		\$2,725.50			Review reply brief; review relevant case law for Supreme Court argument preparation;	First Appeal
2214	Frost, Elisabeth C.	11/14/2016	2.40	\$520.00	\$1,248.00	\$390.00		\$936.00			Review briefs in preparation for oral argument and emails with J. Medile regarding preparing notebook to guide same;	First Appeal
2215	Khanna, Abha	11/14/2016	2.50	\$525.00	\$1,312.50	\$410.00		\$1,025.00			Review and revise proof of brief (2.0); draft and circulate email summary of edits (0.5);	First Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2216	Roberts, Rachel M.	11/14/2016	2.10	\$130.00	\$273.00	\$180.00	\$125.00	\$378.00	\$262.50	\$115.50	Work on list of majority minority split precincts in districts as issue in case and confer with A. Branch re: same;	First Appeal
2217	Spear, Ryan M.	11/14/2016	4.10	\$525.00	\$2,152.50	\$410.00		\$1,681.00			Emails with litigation team regarding reply brief proof (.1); coordinate review of reply brief proof (.5); edit proof (3.5);	First Appeal
2218	Branch, Aria C.	11/15/2016	9.70	\$430.00	\$4,171.00	\$345.00		\$3,346.50			Review Supreme Court reply brief; review relevant case law for Supreme Court argument preparation;	First Appeal
2219	Frost, Elisabeth C.	11/15/2016	4.00	\$520.00	\$2,080.00	\$390.00		\$1,560.00			Draft outlines and review papers in preparation for oral argument;	First Appeal
2220	Roberts, Rachel M.	11/15/2016	1.50	\$130.00	\$195.00	\$180.00	\$125.00	\$270.00	\$187.50	\$82.50	Work on list of majority minority split precincts in districts as issue in case and confer with A. Branch re: same;	First Appeal
2221	Spear, Ryan M.	11/15/2016	4.80	\$525.00	\$2,520.00	\$410.00		\$1,968.00			Emails with litigation team regarding reply brief (.6); edit proof (3.3); research issues regarding same (.9);	First Appeal
2222	Branch, Aria C.	11/16/2016	7.10	\$430.00	\$3,053.00	\$345.00		\$2,449.50			Review relevant case law and SCOTUS briefing; draft district specific fact sheets;	First Appeal
2223	Frost, Elisabeth C.	11/16/2016	3.30	\$520.00	\$1,716.00	\$390.00		\$1,287.00			Draft outlines and review papers in preparation for oral argument;	First Appeal
2224	Spear, Ryan M.	11/16/2016	2.50	\$525.00	\$1,312.50	\$410.00		\$1,025.00			Edit proof of reply brief (2.0); finalize and approve reply brief (.5);	First Appeal
2225	Branch, Aria C.	11/17/2016	7.50	\$430.00	\$3,225.00	\$345.00		\$2,587.50			Review relevant case law and SCOTUS briefing; draft district specific fact sheets;	First Appeal
2226	Elias, Marc E.	11/17/2016	2.00	\$765.00	\$1,530.00	\$575.00		\$1,150.00			Email correspondence with A. Khanna, E. Frost, R. Louijeune regarding briefs; prep for SCOTUS argument;	First Appeal
2227	Frost, Elisabeth C.	11/17/2016	1.00	\$520.00	\$520.00	\$390.00		\$390.00			Draft outlines and review papers in preparation for oral argument;	First Appeal
2228	Khanna, Abha	11/17/2016	0.70	\$525.00	\$367.50	\$410.00		\$287.00			Confer with R. Spear regarding oral argument preparation (0.3); review as-filed version of reply brief (0.4);	First Appeal
2229	Branch, Aria C.	11/18/2016	5.80	\$430.00	\$2,494.00	\$345.00		\$2,001.00			Review district court transcript;	First Appeal
2230	Elias, Marc E.	11/18/2016	2.00	\$765.00	\$1,530.00	\$575.00		\$1,150.00			Prep for SCOTUS argument;	First Appeal
2231	Frost, Elisabeth C.	11/18/2016	4.60	\$520.00	\$2,392.00	\$390.00		\$1,794.00			Draft outlines and review papers in preparation for oral argument (4.1); emails with A. Khanna, M. Elias, B. Spiva and L. Bull regarding prep sessions (.2); telephone call with A. Khanna regarding same (.3);	First Appeal
2232	Khanna, Abha	11/18/2016	0.90	\$525.00	\$472.50	\$410.00		\$369.00			Review materials for oral argument preparation (0.8); email with SG office regarding reply brief (0.1);	First Appeal
2233	Branch, Aria C.	11/19/2016	4.00	\$430.00	\$1,720.00	\$345.00		\$1,380.00			Review district court transcript;	First Appeal
2234	Elias, Marc E.	11/19/2016	2.50	\$765.00	\$1,912.50	\$575.00		\$1,437.50			Prep for SCOTUS argument;	First Appeal
2235	Louijeune, Ruthzee	11/19/2016	1.80	\$320.00	\$576.00	\$320.00		\$576.00			Review SCOTUS briefs and discuss caselaw;	First Appeal
2236	Louijeune, Ruthzee	11/19/2016	2.30	\$320.00	\$736.00	\$320.00		\$736.00			Review SCOTUS submissions and caselaw;	First Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2237	Branch, Aria C.	11/20/2016	3.00	\$430.00	\$1,290.00	\$345.00		\$1,035.00			Review district court record;	First Appeal
2238	Elias, Marc E.	11/20/2016	1.00	\$765.00	\$765.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Prep for SCOTUS argument;	First Appeal
2239	Elias, Marc E.	11/21/2016	1.00	\$765.00	\$765.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Prep for Supreme Court argument;	First Appeal
2240	Frost, Elisabeth C.	11/21/2016	6.00	\$520.00	\$3,120.00	\$390.00		\$2,340.00			Emails with M. Elias, L. Bull and K. Guity regarding oral argument form (.1); draft long form oral argument outline (5.9);	First Appeal
2241	Khanna, Abha	11/21/2016	0.30	\$525.00	\$157.50	\$410.00		\$123.00			Telephone conference with A. Branch regarding Bethune oral argument prep materials (0.3);	First Appeal
2242	Louijeune, Ruthzee	11/21/2016	1.70	\$320.00	\$544.00	\$320.00		\$544.00			Compile documents to send to Marc in order (0.9); discuss SOCTUS briefs (0.8);	First Appeal
2243	Elias, Marc E.	11/22/2016	2.00	\$765.00	\$1,530.00	\$575.00		\$1,150.00			Prep for Supreme Court argument;	First Appeal
2244	Frost, Elisabeth C.	11/22/2016	2.80	\$520.00	\$1,456.00	\$390.00		\$1,092.00			Review briefs in preparation for oral argument prep and draft long form oral argument outline and circulate same to M. Elias, A. Khanna, A. Branch and R. Louijeune (2.8);	First Appeal
2245	Khanna, Abha	11/22/2016	0.80	\$525.00	\$420.00	\$410.00		\$328.00			Email with Georgetown personnel regarding moot (0.1); email with M. Elias regarding oral argument prep questions (0.7);	First Appeal
2246	Branch, Aria C.	11/23/2016	8.90	\$430.00	\$3,827.00	\$345.00		\$3,070.50			Create district fact sheets;	First Appeal
2247	Elias, Marc E.	11/23/2016	4.00	\$765.00	\$3,060.00	\$575.00		\$2,300.00			Prep for Supreme Court argument;	First Appeal
2248	Frost, Elisabeth C.	11/23/2016	0.20	\$520.00	\$104.00	\$390.00		\$78.00			Emails with M. Elias, A. Khanna, R. Louijeune and A. Branch regarding potential questions for argument	First Appeal
2249	Louijeune, Ruthzee	11/23/2016	1.80	\$320.00	\$576.00	\$320.00		\$576.00			Research question of determining intentional discrimination of legislature;	First Appeal
2250	Elias, Marc E.	11/24/2016	4.00	\$765.00	\$3,060.00	\$575.00		\$2,300.00			Prep for Supreme Court argument;	First Appeal
2251	Elias, Marc E.	11/25/2016	1.00	\$765.00	\$765.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Prep for Supreme Court argument;	First Appeal
2252	Branch, Aria C.	11/26/2016	2.00	\$430.00	\$860.00	\$345.00		\$690.00			Review Supreme Court appellate briefs;	First Appeal
2253	Elias, Marc E.	11/26/2016	2.00	\$765.00	\$1,530.00	\$575.00		\$1,150.00			Prep for Supreme Court argument;	First Appeal
2254	Elias, Marc E.	11/27/2016	1.00	\$765.00	\$765.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Prepare for Supreme Court argument;	First Appeal
2255	Frost, Elisabeth C.	11/27/2016	0.20	\$520.00	\$104.00	\$390.00		\$78.00			Review A. Branch's revisions to long form outline for oral argument;	First Appeal
2256	Elias, Marc E.	11/28/2016	2.00	\$765.00	\$1,530.00	\$575.00		\$1,150.00			Prepare for Supreme Court argument;	First Appeal
2257	Frost, Elisabeth C.	11/28/2016	6.10	\$520.00	\$3,172.00	\$390.00		\$2,379.00			Review and revise long form outline for oral argument (5.3); telephone conference with M. Elias, A. Khanna, R. Louijeune and A. Branch regarding oral argument prep strategy (.8);	First Appeal
2258	Khanna, Abha	11/28/2016	8.50	\$525.00	\$4,462.50	\$410.00		\$3,485.00			Review briefing and prepare oral argument prep materials (7.0); confer with M. Elias regarding oral argument prep questions (1.5);	First Appeal
2259	Louijeune, Ruthzee	11/28/2016	6.00	\$320.00	\$1,920.00	\$320.00		\$1,920.00			Meet for Bethune Hill SCOTUS preparation;	First Appeal
2260	Branch, Aria C.	11/29/2016	9.00	\$430.00	\$3,870.00	\$345.00		\$3,105.00			Draft summary of best predominance arguments in each district; review maps and district-specific information; assist with drafting opening statement;	First Appeal
2261	Elias, Marc E.	11/29/2016	4.00	\$765.00	\$3,060.00	\$575.00		\$2,300.00			Prepare for Supreme Court argument;	First Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2262	Frost, Elisabeth C.	11/29/2016	2.40	\$520.00	\$1,248.00	\$390.00		\$936.00			Oral argument preparation meeting with M. Elias, A. Khanna, R. Louijeune, and A. Branch;	First Appeal
2263	Khanna, Abha	11/29/2016	3.00	\$525.00	\$1,575.00	\$410.00		\$1,230.00			Meet with legal team for oral argument preparation (3.0);	First Appeal
2264	Louijeune, Ruthzee	11/29/2016	5.10	\$320.00	\$1,632.00	\$320.00		\$1,632.00			Participate in Bethune Hill SCOTUS oral argument preparation;	First Appeal
2265	Cherry, Ceridwen B.	11/30/2016	2.90	\$430.00	\$1,247.00	\$345.00		\$1,000.50			Research R. Tyler's elections and opponents in 75th District (2.9);	First Appeal
2266	Elias, Marc E.	11/30/2016	10.00	\$765.00	\$7,650.00	\$575.00		\$5,750.00			Prepare for Supreme Court argument;	First Appeal
2267	Frost, Elisabeth C.	11/30/2016	8.00	\$520.00	\$4,160.00	\$390.00		\$3,120.00			Emails with C. Cherry regarding research project in support of oral argument preparation (.1); draft short form outline for oral argument (.4); oral argument preparation meeting with M. Elias, A. Khanna, R. Louijeune, and A. Branch and attend Georgetown moot (7.5);	First Appeal
2268	Khanna, Abha	11/30/2016	13.80	\$525.00	\$7,245.00	\$410.00		\$5,658.00			Confer with M. Elias and legal team in preparation for oral argument (10.8); attend Georgetown moot regarding same (3.0);	First Appeal
2269	Louijeune, Ruthzee	11/30/2016	8.50	\$320.00	\$2,720.00	\$320.00		\$2,720.00			Participate in SCOTUS preparation for oral argument; attend Georgetown moot;	First Appeal
2270	Roberts, Rachel M.	11/30/2016	1.40	\$130.00	\$182.00	\$180.00	\$125.00	\$252.00	\$175.00	\$77.00	Research R. Dance opponents in 2005 election to house of delegates;	First Appeal
2271	Branch, Aria C.	12/1/2016	7.00	\$430.00	\$3,010.00	\$345.00		\$2,415.00			Assist with Supreme Court oral argument preparation;	First Appeal
2272	Elias, Marc E.	12/1/2016	2.00	\$765.00	\$1,530.00	\$575.00		\$1,150.00			Prepare for Supreme Court argument;	First Appeal
2273	Branch, Aria C.	12/2/2016	2.50	\$430.00	\$1,075.00	\$345.00		\$862.50			Assist with Supreme Court oral argument preparation;	First Appeal
2274	Elias, Marc E.	12/2/2016	5.00	\$765.00	\$3,825.00	\$575.00		\$2,875.00			Prepare for Supreme Court argument;	First Appeal
2275	Frost, Elisabeth C.	12/2/2016	1.20	\$520.00	\$624.00	\$390.00		\$468.00			Revise argument outlines; attend moot courts and feedback sessions; oral argument preparation meeting with M. Elias, A. Khanna, R. Louijeune, and A. Branch;	First Appeal
2276	Hamilton, Kevin J.	12/2/2016	0.50	\$655.00	\$327.50	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review materials in preparation for prep sessions;	First Appeal
2277	Khanna, Abha	12/2/2016	4.50	\$525.00	\$2,362.50	\$410.00		\$1,845.00			Confer with M. Elias and legal team in preparation for oral argument (4.5);	First Appeal
2278	Spiva, Bruce V.	12/2/2016	1.00	\$655.00	\$655.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Participate in moot court;	First Appeal
2279	Spiva, Bruce V.	12/2/2016	1.00	\$655.00	\$655.00	\$575.00		\$575.00			Prepare for moot court;	First Appeal
2280	Branch, Aria C.	12/3/2016	4.40	\$430.00	\$1,892.00	\$345.00		\$1,518.00			Assist with Supreme Court oral argument preparation;	First Appeal
2281	Elias, Marc E.	12/3/2016	6.00	\$765.00	\$4,590.00	\$575.00		\$3,450.00			Prepare for Supreme Court argument;	First Appeal
2282	Frost, Elisabeth C.	12/3/2016	2.70	\$520.00	\$1,404.00	\$390.00		\$1,053.00			Revise argument outlines; participate in moot courts and feedback sessions; oral argument preparation meeting with M. Elias, A. Khanna, R. Louijeune, and A. Branch [split with McCrory case];	First Appeal
2283	Khanna, Abha	12/3/2016	5.00	\$525.00	\$2,625.00	\$410.00		\$2,050.00			Confer with M. Elias and legal team in preparation for oral argument (5.0);	First Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2284	Louijeune, Ruthzee	12/3/2016	4.30	\$320.00	\$1,376.00	\$320.00		\$1,376.00			Prepare for SCOTUS oral argument;	First Appeal
2285	Spiva, Bruce V.	12/3/2016	0.50	\$655.00	\$327.50	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review materials to help prepare;	First Appeal
2286	Spiva, Bruce V.	12/3/2016	1.50	\$655.00	\$982.50	\$575.00		\$862.50			Prepare M. Elias for Supreme Court argument through moot courts and discussion;	First Appeal
2287	Branch, Aria C.	12/4/2016	6.00	\$430.00	\$2,580.00	\$345.00		\$2,070.00			Assist with Supreme Court oral argument preparation;	First Appeal
2288	Elias, Marc E.	12/4/2016	6.00	\$765.00	\$4,590.00	\$575.00		\$3,450.00			Prepare for Supreme Court argument;	First Appeal
2289	Hamilton, Kevin J.	12/4/2016	6.50	\$655.00	\$4,257.50	\$575.00		\$3,737.50			Conference with M. Elias, A. Khanna in preparation for Supreme Court argument (5.0); review related papers (1.5);	First Appeal
2290	Khanna, Abha	12/4/2016	6.50	\$525.00	\$3,412.50	\$410.00		\$2,665.00			Confer with M. Elias and legal team in preparation for oral argument (6.5);	First Appeal
2291	Louijeune, Ruthzee	12/4/2016	5.00	\$320.00	\$1,600.00	\$320.00		\$1,600.00			Help prepare for SCOTUS oral argument;	First Appeal
2292	Spiva, Bruce V.	12/4/2016	2.00	\$655.00	\$1,310.00	\$575.00		\$1,150.00			Prepare M. Elias for Supreme Court arguments;	First Appeal
2293	Elias, Marc E.	12/5/2016	2.00	\$765.00	\$1,530.00	\$575.00		\$1,150.00			Prepare for and conduct Supreme Court argument;	First Appeal
2294	Frost, Elisabeth C.	12/5/2016	2.10	\$520.00	\$1,092.00	\$390.00		\$819.00			Meet with oral argument team in preparation for Supreme Court argument; attend Supreme Court argument [split with McCrory];	First Appeal
2295	Hamilton, Kevin J.	12/5/2016	5.00	\$655.00	\$3,275.00	\$575.00		\$2,875.00			Prepare for and attend argument in Supreme Court (2.5); conference with legal team regarding same (2.5);	First Appeal
2296	Khanna, Abha	12/5/2016	4.00	\$525.00	\$2,100.00	\$410.00		\$1,640.00			Prepare for, attend, and debrief from SCOTUS argument (4.0);	First Appeal
2297	Khanna, Abha	12/6/2016	0.50	\$525.00	\$262.50	\$410.00		\$205.00			Review articles on SCOTUS argument (0.2); email and confer with legal team regarding same (0.3);	First Appeal
2298			1330.95		\$667,177.00			\$539,271.75				SUBTOTAL for First Appeal
2299	Frost, Elisabeth C.	12/7/2016	0.20	\$520.00	\$104.00	\$390.00		\$78.00			Read article by Judge Payne's lawsuit about test applied in case and emails with M. Elias, B. Spiva, A. Khanna, A. Branch, and K. Hamilton regarding same for insight on crafting argument on possible remand;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2300	Hamilton, Kevin J.	12/7/2016	0.50	\$655.00	\$327.50	\$575.00		\$287.50			Review article by Judge Payne law clerk and exchange related email;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2301	Khanna, Abha	12/7/2016	0.20	\$525.00	\$105.00	\$410.00		\$82.00			Review news article from J. Payne's law clerk regarding prospects on remand (0.2);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2302	Elias, Marc E.	3/1/2017	3.50	\$1,050.00	\$3,675.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$2,362.50	\$2,012.50	\$350.00	Review court decision (1.0); various telephone conference regarding next steps (2.5);	Post-Remand Proceedings

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2303	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/1/2017	6.00	\$755.00	\$4,530.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$4,050.00	\$3,450.00	\$600.00	Exchange email regarding Supreme Court decision (1.9); review opinion (1.5); telephone conference with B. Spiva regarding staffing and short term plan for motion to expedite briefing (.5); prepare for and participate in group call regarding next steps (.5); conference with B. Stafford regarding next steps (.5); conference with A. Khanna regarding issuance of mandate, motion to expedite, and related issues (.9); exchange email with M. Elias regarding same (.2);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2304	Khanna, Abha	3/1/2017	0.80	\$620.00	\$496.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$408.00	\$328.00	\$80.00	Email with legal team regarding SCOTUS ruling and next steps (0.2); participate in telephone conference with legal team regarding same (0.6);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2305	Spear, Ryan M.	3/1/2017	1.90	\$620.00	\$1,178.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$969.00	\$779.00	\$190.00	Review Supreme Court decision (.6); emails with litigation team regarding same (.8); conference with litigation team regarding same (.5);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2306	Stafford, William B.	3/1/2017	0.70	\$595.00	\$416.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$353.50	\$283.50	\$70.00	Review Supreme Court decision and prepare analysis of same for litigation team;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2307	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/2/2017	3.50	\$755.00	\$2,642.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$2,362.50	\$2,012.50	\$350.00	Review decision from U.S. Supreme Court and circulate initial analysis (1.5); exchange email regarding motion for expedited briefing schedule (.9); exchange email regarding calls to opposing counsel and form of motion (.9); review email exchange with M. Braden (.2);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2308	Spear, Ryan M.	3/2/2017	0.80	\$620.00	\$496.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$408.00	\$328.00	\$80.00	Emails with litigation team regarding motion for briefing schedule, status, and strategy;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2309	Branch, Aria C.	3/5/2017	3.00	\$650.00	\$1,950.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$1,230.00	\$1,035.00	\$195.00	Draft outline of brief;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2310	Branch, Aria C.	3/6/2017	5.00	\$650.00	\$3,250.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$2,050.00	\$1,725.00	\$325.00	Draft outline of opening brief on remand;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2311	Branch, Aria C.	3/7/2017	0.80	\$650.00	\$520.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$328.00	\$276.00	\$52.00	Draft outline of opening brief on remand;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2312	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/7/2017	5.90	\$755.00	\$4,454.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$3,982.50	\$3,392.50	\$590.00	Review opposition to motion to set scheduling order and exchange related email (1.9); conference with A. Khanna regarding opposition, issuance of mandate and its effect on trial court jurisdiction (.9); conference with A. Branch regarding same (.7); review and revise draft reply brief regarding same (.9); conference with legal team regarding same (.5); conference with opposing counsel regarding issues on remand (.6);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2313	Khanna, Abha	3/20/2017	1.70	\$620.00	\$1,054.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$867.00	\$697.00	\$170.00	Review SCOTUS opinion and draft opening brief applying correct legal standard (1.5); confer with R. Spear regarding same (0.2);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2314	Spear, Ryan M.	3/20/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Conference with A. Khanna regarding status and strategy;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2315	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/21/2017	0.50	\$755.00	\$377.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$337.50	\$287.50	\$50.00	Exchange email regarding remand and follow up proceedings;	Post-Remand Proceedings

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2316	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/27/2017	1.20	\$755.00	\$906.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$810.00	\$690.00	\$120.00	Review email regarding final judgment from Supreme Court in Bethune (.5); exchange related email regarding next steps (.7);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2317	Khanna, Abha	3/31/2017	2.50	\$620.00	\$1,550.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,275.00	\$1,025.00	\$250.00	Draft opening brief (2.5);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2318	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/3/2017	1.20	\$755.00	\$906.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$810.00	\$690.00	\$120.00	Review status of remand (.3); review motion for briefing schedule and exchange related email (.9);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2319	Khanna, Abha	4/3/2017	2.60	\$620.00	\$1,612.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,326.00	\$1,066.00	\$260.00	Draft opening brief on remand (2.5); email with R. Spear and A. Branch regarding same (0.1);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2320	Spear, Ryan M.	4/3/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Emails with litigation team regarding status and strategy;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2321	Spear, Ryan M.	4/3/2017	1.40	\$620.00	\$868.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$714.00	\$574.00	\$140.00	Prepare opening brief (.6); research issues regarding same (.4); conference with A. Khanna regarding same (.2); emails with A. Khanna regarding same (.2);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2322	Stafford, William B.	4/3/2017	0.80	\$595.00	\$476.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$404.00	\$324.00	\$80.00	Research and draft insert of brief on remand regarding remedy;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2323	Branch, Aria C.	4/4/2017	2.50	\$650.00	\$1,625.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$1,025.00	\$862.50	\$162.50	Draft sections of opening brief on remand;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2324	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/4/2017	0.50	\$755.00	\$377.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$337.50	\$287.50	\$50.00	Telephone conference with A. Khanna regarding briefing schedule and status of brief;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2325	Khanna, Abha	4/4/2017	5.90	\$620.00	\$3,658.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$3,009.00	\$2,419.00	\$590.00	Draft opening brief;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2326	Branch, Aria C.	4/5/2017	9.50	\$650.00	\$6,175.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$3,895.00	\$3,277.50	\$617.50	Draft sections of opening brief on remand;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2327	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/5/2017	1.60	\$755.00	\$1,208.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,080.00	\$920.00	\$160.00	Review order from the court requiring filing of Joint Appendix and exchange related email (1.2); review proposed draft response (.2); exchange related email (.2);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2328	Khanna, Abha	4/5/2017	3.20	\$620.00	\$1,984.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,632.00	\$1,312.00	\$320.00	Review Court's order and email and confer with legal team regarding same (0.5); email with opposing counsel regarding same (0.2); draft proposed response to same (0.6); draft, review, and revise opening brief (1.9);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2329	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/5/2017	0.70	\$850.00	\$595.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$472.50	\$402.50	\$70.00	Review court's order and confer with team about responding and complying;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2330	Branch, Aria C.	4/6/2017	0.90	\$650.00	\$585.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$369.00	\$310.50	\$58.50	Draft sections of opening brief on remand;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2331	Frost, Elisabeth C.	4/6/2017	0.30	\$750.00	\$225.00	\$490.00	\$390.00	\$147.00	\$117.00	\$30.00	Meet with B. Spiva regarding current status of litigation (.1); review court order denying motion for briefing (.1); review amicus brief referenced in court order (.1);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2332	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/6/2017	2.40	\$755.00	\$1,812.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,620.00	\$1,380.00	\$240.00	Review order from the court regarding briefing schedule (.9); exchange related email regarding potential responses to same (.9); follow up discussion and email regarding responsive filing (.6);	Post-Remand Proceedings

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2333	Khanna, Abha	4/6/2017	3.00	\$620.00	\$1,860.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,530.00	\$1,230.00	\$300.00	Review order from court (0.1); email and confer with legal team regarding same and proposed next steps (1.1); confer and email with opposing counsel regarding joint filing (0.2); review and revise same (0.2); coordinate and oversee filing of joint appendix (0.9); email and telephone conference with printer to coordinate preparation of hard copy sets of joint appendix (0.3); begin drafting outline of position statement (0.2);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2334	Roche, John K.	4/6/2017	0.40	\$710.00	\$284.00	\$465.00	\$465.00	\$186.00	\$186.00	\$0.00	Review filing in response to court's order for Supreme Court appendix and exchange emails with A. Khanna regarding same;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2335	Spear, Ryan M.	4/6/2017	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$255.00	\$205.00	\$50.00	Review court order regarding case schedule (.2); conference with A. Khanna regarding same (.1); conference with A. Khanna regarding potential research (.2);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2336	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/6/2017	1.00	\$850.00	\$850.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$100.00	Review Judge Payne's Order regarding further proceedings and briefing and correspond with team regarding same (.7); correspond with team regarding order requiring filing of Supreme Court record with district court (.3);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2337	Stafford, William B.	4/6/2017	0.80	\$595.00	\$476.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$404.00	\$324.00	\$80.00	Review scheduling order and review amicus brief cited in order and prepare analysis of same for litigation team (.3); revise submission regarding joint appendix (.2); revise section of remand briefing regarding remedy (.3);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2338	Khanna, Abha	4/7/2017	3.00	\$620.00	\$1,860.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,530.00	\$1,230.00	\$300.00	Review case law regarding in preparation for drafting position statement (2.2); confer with B. Stafford regarding same and position statement strategy (0.3); confer with R. Spear regarding position statement strategy (0.2); communicate with Court and opposing counsel regarding status of printed copies of Joint Appendix (0.2); telephone conference with printer regarding same (0.1);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2339	Stafford, William B.	4/7/2017	0.50	\$595.00	\$297.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$252.50	\$202.50	\$50.00	Review case law regarding procedural considerations for three-judge panels and conference with A. Khanna regarding same;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2340	Branch, Aria C.	4/10/2017	2.50	\$650.00	\$1,625.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$1,025.00	\$862.50	\$162.50	Legal research regarding factual record on remand;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2341	Khanna, Abha	4/10/2017	3.70	\$620.00	\$2,294.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,887.00	\$1,517.00	\$370.00	Review district court memorandum opinion and compile comprehensive list of apparent findings of fact and conclusions of law in preparation for Response to Court Order (3.6); confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.1);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2342	Louijeune, Ruthzee	4/10/2017	2.30	\$550.00	\$1,265.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$966.00	\$736.00	\$230.00	Conduct research on law of the case and the scope of the remand re: factual and legal determinations;	Post-Remand Proceedings

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2343	Khanna, Abha	4/11/2017	4.50	\$620.00	\$2,790.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$2,295.00	\$1,845.00	\$450.00	Finish reviewing Memorandum Opinion and summarizing Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law (0.9); review and revise same (0.2); review research summaries provided by A. Branch and R. Louijeune (0.5); draft comprehensive email summary to legal team of positions to take on key issues, supporting research, and relevant questions (2.8); email with legal team to coordinate call (0.1);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2344	Louijeune, Ruthzee	4/11/2017	3.00	\$550.00	\$1,650.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$1,260.00	\$960.00	\$300.00	Conduct research on Supreme Court remands to support statement to court re: scope of review;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2345	Spear, Ryan M.	4/11/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Emails with litigation team regarding statement of position;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2346	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/11/2017	0.30	\$850.00	\$255.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$202.50	\$172.50	\$30.00	Correspond with team regarding call to discuss State's brief;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2347	Stafford, William B.	4/11/2017	0.50	\$595.00	\$297.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$252.50	\$202.50	\$50.00	Review A. Khanna correspondence regarding statement of position and prepare recommendations regarding same;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2348	Khanna, Abha	4/12/2017	5.40	\$620.00	\$3,348.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$2,754.00	\$2,214.00	\$540.00	Review B. Stafford's notes and comments regarding Statement of Position strategy (0.2); confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.2); telephone conference with legal team regarding Statement of Position strategy (0.7); research, draft, and revise Statement of Position (4.3);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2349	Louijeune, Ruthzee	4/12/2017	1.30	\$550.00	\$715.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$546.00	\$416.00	\$130.00	Conduct legal research on scope of Supreme Court remands to support statement to court on scope of remand (1.3);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2350	Spear, Ryan M.	4/12/2017	0.80	\$620.00	\$496.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$408.00	\$328.00	\$80.00	Prepare for conference and conference with litigation team regarding statement of position (.8);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2351	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/12/2017	1.60	\$850.00	\$1,360.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,080.00	\$920.00	\$160.00	Telephone conference regarding status report brief (1); review memo to A. Khanna to prepare for call (.6);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2352	Stafford, William B.	4/12/2017	1.10	\$595.00	\$654.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$555.50	\$445.50	\$110.00	Prepare for and participate in conference call to discuss statement of position strategy;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2353	Khanna, Abha	4/13/2017	5.30	\$620.00	\$3,286.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$2,703.00	\$2,173.00	\$530.00	Research, draft, and revise Statement of Position (2.7); review case law, evidentiary record, and underlying briefs regarding same (2.4); confer with B. Stafford and R. Spear regarding same (0.2);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2354	Louijeune, Ruthzee	4/13/2017	1.90	\$550.00	\$1,045.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$798.00	\$608.00	\$190.00	Conduct legal research on scope of Supreme Court remand to support statement to court on scope of remand;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2355	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/14/2017	0.50	\$755.00	\$377.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$337.50	\$287.50	\$50.00	Review and respond to email from A. Khanna attaching draft position statement in response to court's order;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2356	Khanna, Abha	4/14/2017	3.80	\$620.00	\$2,356.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,938.00	\$1,558.00	\$380.00	Draft, review and revise Statement of Position (3.3); email and confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.2); review edits/comments from B. Stafford in processing of doing same (0.2); email with legal team regarding same (0.1);	Post-Remand Proceedings

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2357	Spear, Ryan M.	4/14/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Emails with A. Khanna regarding status and strategy;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2358	Stafford, William B.	4/14/2017	1.20	\$595.00	\$714.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$606.00	\$486.00	\$120.00	Review and revise statement of position;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2359	Khanna, Abha	4/16/2017	0.70	\$620.00	\$434.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$357.00	\$287.00	\$70.00	Review edits and comments to Position Statement and revise Position Statement in light of same;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2360	Spear, Ryan M.	4/16/2017	2.00	\$620.00	\$1,240.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,020.00	\$820.00	\$200.00	Emails with litigation team regarding statement of position (.3); review and revise statement of position (1.5); research issues regarding same (.5);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2361	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/16/2017	1.20	\$850.00	\$1,020.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$810.00	\$690.00	\$120.00	Review and comment on statement of position;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2362	Elias, Marc E.	4/17/2017	1.50	\$1,050.00	\$1,575.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,012.50	\$862.50	\$150.00	Review court filings;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2363	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/17/2017	2.00	\$755.00	\$1,510.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,350.00	\$1,150.00	\$200.00	Review order from the court on supplemental briefing (.3); conference with A. Khanna regarding same (.4); review and revise draft brief (1.3);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2364	Khanna, Abha	4/17/2017	4.00	\$620.00	\$2,480.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$2,040.00	\$1,640.00	\$400.00	Review and revise Statement of Position (0.5); review case law regarding same (2.3); review and input citecheck edits regarding same (0.4); email and confer with legal team regarding same (0.3); email with opposing counsel regarding filing of same (0.1); work with administrative staff to finalize filing of same (0.2); review Statements of Position filed by Defendants and Intervenor (0.2);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2365	Spear, Ryan M.	4/17/2017	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$255.00	\$205.00	\$50.00	Conference with A. Khanna regarding statement of position (.1); emails with litigation team regarding defendants' and intervenors' statements of position (.4);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2366	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/17/2017	1.00	\$850.00	\$850.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$100.00	Review and revise statement of position and correspond with team regarding same;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2367	Stafford, William B.	4/17/2017	0.60	\$595.00	\$357.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$303.00	\$243.00	\$60.00	Review and provide analysis of other parties' statements of position;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2368	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/18/2017	1.20	\$755.00	\$906.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$810.00	\$690.00	\$120.00	Review and respond to email regarding supplemental briefing (.7); review supplemental briefing (.5);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2369	Khanna, Abha	4/18/2017	1.60	\$620.00	\$992.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$816.00	\$656.00	\$160.00	Confer with B. Stafford regarding issues for response brief (0.7); email with legal team regarding same (0.1); draft list of research assignments for R. Louijeune and email with R. Louijeune regarding same (0.3); draft outline for response brief (0.5);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2370	Louijeune, Ruthzee	4/18/2017	1.20	\$550.00	\$660.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$504.00	\$384.00	\$120.00	Conduct legal research on scope of Supreme Court remand to support statement to district court on scope of remand;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2371	Roberts, Rachel M.	4/18/2017	1.90	\$180.00	\$342.00	\$180.00	\$125.00	\$342.00	\$237.50	\$104.50	Prepare courtesy copies to be messengered to judges' chambers;	Post-Remand Proceedings

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2372	Spear, Ryan M.	4/18/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Emails with litigation team regarding defendants' and intervenors' statements of position;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2373	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/18/2017	1.00	\$850.00	\$850.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$100.00	Correspond with team regarding courtesy copy to judges (.2); review intervenors' statement of position (.4); review summary of opposing filings from B. Stafford (.4);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2374	Stafford, William B.	4/18/2017	0.80	\$595.00	\$476.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$404.00	\$324.00	\$80.00	Conference with A. Khanna regarding response to other parties' statements of position;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2375	Branch, Aria C.	4/20/2017	0.50	\$650.00	\$325.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$205.00	\$172.50	\$32.50	Send citation examples to R. Louijeune for use in brief;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2376	Louijeune, Ruthzee	4/20/2017	2.50	\$550.00	\$1,375.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$1,050.00	\$800.00	\$250.00	Conduct research for response to Defendant-Intervenor's statement to court on scope of remand;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2377	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/21/2017	0.50	\$755.00	\$377.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$337.50	\$287.50	\$50.00	Review order and related email regarding briefing order;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2378	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/21/2017	0.30	\$850.00	\$255.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$202.50	\$172.50	\$30.00	Correspond with team regarding response to statement of position and intervenor;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2379	Branch, Aria C.	4/22/2017	1.20	\$650.00	\$780.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$492.00	\$414.00	\$78.00	Review statements of position regarding further proceedings;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2380	Louijeune, Ruthzee	4/22/2017	1.90	\$550.00	\$1,045.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$798.00	\$608.00	\$190.00	Conduct research for response to Defendant-Intervenor's statement to court re: Scope of remand, including reviewing transcripts and expert reports (0.8);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2381	Louijeune, Ruthzee	4/23/2017	1.40	\$550.00	\$770.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$588.00	\$448.00	\$140.00	Conduct research for response to Defendant-Intervenor's statement to court on scope of remand;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2382	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/24/2017	0.90	\$755.00	\$679.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$607.50	\$517.50	\$90.00	Exchange email regarding briefing schedule and reopening evidentiary hearing;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2383	Khanna, Abha	4/25/2017	8.10	\$620.00	\$5,022.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$4,131.00	\$3,321.00	\$810.00	Research and draft response to Defendant-Intervenor's Statement of Position (7.9); confer with R. Spear regarding same (0.1); confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.1);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2384	Louijeune, Ruthzee	4/25/2017	7.00	\$550.00	\$3,850.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$2,940.00	\$2,240.00	\$700.00	Conduct research for response to Defendant-Intervenor's statement to district court on scope of Supreme Court remand, including reviewing trial transcript, trial record, and expert reports (7.0);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2385	Khanna, Abha	4/26/2017	6.50	\$620.00	\$4,030.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$3,315.00	\$2,665.00	\$650.00	Research, draft, and revise Response to Defendant-Intervenor's Statement of Position (6.3); email and confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.2);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2386	Branch, Aria C.	4/27/2017	1.00	\$650.00	\$650.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$65.00	Review response to Defendant Intervenor's statement of position regarding a new proceeding (0.50) and insert citations (0.50);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2387	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/27/2017	0.80	\$755.00	\$604.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$540.00	\$460.00	\$80.00	Review Intervenor's briefing (.8);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2388	Khanna, Abha	4/27/2017	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$459.00	\$369.00	\$90.00	Review and revise response brief in light of comments and edits from B. Stafford (0.7); incorporate citations provided by R. Spear (0.2);	Post-Remand Proceedings

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2389	Spear, Ryan M.	4/27/2017	3.10	\$620.00	\$1,922.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,581.00	\$1,271.00	\$310.00	Emails with litigation team regarding statement of position and potential discovery issues (.3); review and revise reply brief (2.5); emails with A. Khanna, B. Stafford, and A. Branch regarding same (.3);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2390	Stafford, William B.	4/27/2017	3.40	\$595.00	\$2,023.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,717.00	\$1,377.00	\$340.00	Research and revise reply to defendant-intervenors' statement of position;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2391	Khanna, Abha	4/28/2017	3.60	\$620.00	\$2,232.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,836.00	\$1,476.00	\$360.00	Review and revise draft response brief (3.4); email and confer with legal team regarding same (0.2);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2392	Louijeune, Ruthzee	4/28/2017	2.00	\$550.00	\$1,100.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$840.00	\$640.00	\$200.00	Conduct research for response to Defendant-Intervenors' statement to district court on scope of Supreme Court remand, including reviewing trial transcript, trial record, and expert reports (1.2); Insert citations (0.8);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2393	Stafford, William B.	4/28/2017	0.10	\$595.00	\$59.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$50.50	\$40.50	\$10.00	Exchange correspondence with A. Khanna regarding reply to position statements;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2394	Louijeune, Ruthzee	4/29/2017	1.30	\$550.00	\$715.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$546.00	\$416.00	\$130.00	Insert citations for response to Defendant-Intervenors' statement to district court on scope of Supreme Court remand (1.3);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2395	Branch, Aria C.	4/30/2017	1.00	\$650.00	\$650.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$65.00	Review response to Defendant-Intervenors' statement of position (0.50); add citations to response (0.50);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2396	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/30/2017	2.50	\$755.00	\$1,887.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,687.50	\$1,437.50	\$250.00	Review and revise draft reply brief (1.9); exchange email regarding same (.6);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2397	Branch, Aria C.	5/1/2017	0.30	\$650.00	\$195.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$123.00	\$103.50	\$19.50	File response to Defendant-Intervenors' statement of position;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2398	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/1/2017	2.00	\$755.00	\$1,510.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,350.00	\$1,150.00	\$200.00	Review and revise draft brief in response to court order (1.5); conference with A. Khanna regarding same (.5);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2399	Khanna, Abha	5/1/2017	5.10	\$620.00	\$3,162.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$2,601.00	\$2,091.00	\$510.00	Review and revise draft brief, inputting legal team's and cite check Editor's edits and comment (4.9); confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.1); email with legal team regarding same (0.1);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2400	Spear, Ryan M.	5/1/2017	0.40	\$620.00	\$248.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$204.00	\$164.00	\$40.00	Emails with litigation team regarding statement of position and potential discovery issues;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2401	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/1/2017	1.80	\$850.00	\$1,530.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,215.00	\$1,035.00	\$180.00	Review and revise statement of position reply brief (1.8);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2402	Stafford, William B.	5/1/2017	3.60	\$595.00	\$2,142.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,818.00	\$1,458.00	\$360.00	Review and revise reply in support of statement of position;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2403	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/2/2017	1.40	\$755.00	\$1,057.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$945.00	\$805.00	\$140.00	Review briefing filed by opposing parties in response to court order (1.2); exchange email regarding further briefing (.2);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2404	Khanna, Abha	5/2/2017	0.40	\$620.00	\$248.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$204.00	\$164.00	\$40.00	Review response brief submitted by Defendant-Intervenors (0.4);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2405	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/3/2017	1.90	\$755.00	\$1,434.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,282.50	\$1,092.50	\$190.00	Exchange correspondence regarding allocated costs of printing costs for joint appendix (.9); prepare new invoice at request of Defendant-Intervenors, proof, and transmit (1.0);	Post-Remand Proceedings

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2406	Khanna, Abha	5/3/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Email with legal team regarding JA hard copy printing fees (0.1);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2407	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/4/2017	0.90	\$755.00	\$679.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$607.50	\$517.50	\$90.00	Review and respond to email regarding briefing in response to court order (.9);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2408	Roberts, Rachel M.	5/4/2017	0.50	\$180.00	\$90.00	\$180.00	\$125.00	\$90.00	\$62.50	\$27.50	Send courtesy copies of filing to chambers;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2409	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/5/2017	2.20	\$755.00	\$1,661.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,485.00	\$1,265.00	\$220.00	Review order from the court requiring filing of "highlighted" opinion and exchange email regarding same (1.4); review draft brief in response to court order and exchange related email (.8);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2410	Spear, Ryan M.	5/5/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Review order regarding further briefing (.1); emails with litigation team regarding same (.2);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2411	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/5/2017	0.60	\$850.00	\$510.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$405.00	\$345.00	\$60.00	Review court order for another round of briefing regarding findings still in effect and correspond with team regarding same;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2412	Stafford, William B.	5/5/2017	0.40	\$595.00	\$238.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$202.00	\$162.00	\$40.00	Review and prepare proposed response to order for further briefing on factual findings and legal conclusions (.4);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2413	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/6/2017	1.50	\$755.00	\$1,132.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,012.50	\$862.50	\$150.00	Review and revise draft brief in response to court order (1.3); conference with A. Khanna regarding same (.2);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2414	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/8/2017	0.90	\$755.00	\$679.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$607.50	\$517.50	\$90.00	Review and respond to email regarding "highlighting" brief and related issues;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2415	Khanna, Abha	5/8/2017	0.40	\$620.00	\$248.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$204.00	\$164.00	\$40.00	Review Memorandum Opinion for highlighting in accordance with Court's May 5 order (0.4);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2416	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/8/2017	0.50	\$850.00	\$425.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$337.50	\$287.50	\$50.00	Review and revise brief on findings of law/fact;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2417	Khanna, Abha	5/10/2017	1.40	\$620.00	\$868.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$714.00	\$574.00	\$140.00	Review memorandum opinion in light of Court's order on highlighting (0.4); confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.2); research case law regarding whether racial predominance is conclusion of law or finding of fact (0.7); email with legal team regarding strategy for highlighting and brief (0.1);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2418	Spear, Ryan M.	5/10/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Emails with litigation team regarding response to order;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2419	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/10/2017	0.90	\$850.00	\$765.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$607.50	\$517.50	\$90.00	Correspond with A. Branch regarding Court's latest order (.4); correspond with team regarding brief in response to Court's order (.5);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2420	Stafford, William B.	5/10/2017	0.60	\$595.00	\$357.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$303.00	\$243.00	\$60.00	Conference with A. Khanna regarding strategic approach to order regarding highlighting of memorandum opinion and accompanying brief;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2421	Branch, Aria C.	5/11/2017	0.40	\$650.00	\$260.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$164.00	\$138.00	\$26.00	Review research on law of the case;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2422	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/11/2017	0.60	\$755.00	\$453.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$405.00	\$345.00	\$60.00	Follow up on status of briefing (.2); exchange email regarding "highlighting" briefing (.4);	Post-Remand Proceedings

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2423	Khanna, Abha	5/11/2017	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$255.00	\$205.00	\$50.00	Review highlights in edited version of Memorandum Opinion provided by administrative staff (0.3); email with A. Branch and C. Weisman regarding research assignment (0.2);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2424	Khanna, Abha	5/12/2017	4.30	\$620.00	\$2,666.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$2,193.00	\$1,763.00	\$430.00	Review and revise highlighting of Memorandum Opinion (0.3); review research summary from C. Weisman and review cases identified in same (2.1); draft brief in support of highlighted Memorandum Opinion (1.7); email and confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.2);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2425	Stafford, William B.	5/13/2017	1.20	\$595.00	\$714.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$606.00	\$486.00	\$120.00	Review and revise brief regarding factual findings and legal conclusions on remand and related appendix;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2426	Khanna, Abha	5/14/2017	1.40	\$620.00	\$868.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$714.00	\$574.00	\$140.00	Review and revise brief in support of highlighted memorandum opinion (1.2); draft cover email to legal team regarding same (and decision points regarding same) (0.2);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2427	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/15/2017	1.50	\$755.00	\$1,132.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,012.50	\$862.50	\$150.00	Review "highlighted" briefs (1.2); conference with B. Stafford and A. Khanna regarding same (.3);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2428	Khanna, Abha	5/15/2017	2.50	\$620.00	\$1,550.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,275.00	\$1,025.00	\$250.00	Review, revise, and finalize brief and highlighted memorandum (2.2); email and confer with legal team regarding same (0.3);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2429	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/15/2017	1.00	\$850.00	\$850.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$100.00	Review and comment on latest draft of brief on findings of law/fact;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2430	Stafford, William B.	5/15/2017	0.60	\$595.00	\$357.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$303.00	\$243.00	\$60.00	Review and revise highlighted copy of opinion and related brief (.5); conference with A. Khanna regarding same (.1);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2431	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/16/2017	0.80	\$755.00	\$604.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$540.00	\$460.00	\$80.00	Exchange email regarding litigation strategy in light of court's orders and timing;	Post-Remand Proceedings
2432	Khanna, Abha	5/16/2017	0.80	\$620.00	\$496.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$408.00	\$328.00	\$80.00	Review and revise brief in support of highlighted text and finalize same for filing (0.4); review Defendants' and Defendant-Intervenors' briefs regarding same (0.4);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2433	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/17/2017	0.60	\$755.00	\$453.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$405.00	\$345.00	\$60.00	Follow up on "highlighted" briefing (.5); conference with B. Stafford regarding same (.1);	Post-Remand Proceedings
2434			238.70		\$156,650.50			\$125,939.00				SUBTOTAL for Post-Remand Proceedings
2435	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/12/2017	1.10	\$755.00	\$830.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$742.50	\$632.50	\$110.00	Prepare for and participate in telephone conference regarding response to court order and amici requests (.6); exchange related email (.5);	Amicus-Related Work
2436	Khanna, Abha	4/12/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Voicemails for and telephone conferences regarding amicus request (0.2); email with legal team regarding same (0.1);	Amicus-Related Work
2437	Spear, Ryan M.	4/12/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Emails with litigation team regarding amicus brief (.2);	Amicus-Related Work

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2438	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/12/2017	0.30	\$850.00	\$255.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$202.50	\$172.50	\$30.00	Correspond with A. Khanna regarding amicus request for consent (.3);	Amicus-Related Work
2439	Spear, Ryan M.	4/13/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Emails with litigation team regarding amicus brief (.1);	Amicus-Related Work
2440	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/13/2017	0.70	\$850.00	\$595.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$472.50	\$402.50	\$70.00	Telephone conference with potential amicus regarding amicus brief (.4); correspond with team regarding same (.3);	Amicus-Related Work
2441	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/14/2017	0.20	\$850.00	\$170.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$135.00	\$115.00	\$20.00	Correspond with potential amicus regarding amicus brief;	Amicus-Related Work
2442	Khanna, Abha	4/17/2017	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$255.00	\$205.00	\$50.00	Review proposed amicus brief from OneVirginia (0.5);	Amicus-Related Work
2443	Branch, Aria C.	4/24/2017	0.20	\$650.00	\$130.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$82.00	\$69.00	\$13.00	Calls regarding proposed amicus brief;	Amicus-Related Work
2444	Branch, Aria C.	4/26/2017	0.90	\$650.00	\$585.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$369.00	\$310.50	\$58.50	Conversations with G. Lucyk regarding One Virginia's amicus brief;	Amicus-Related Work
2445	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/26/2017	0.40	\$850.00	\$340.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$270.00	\$230.00	\$40.00	Correspond with A. Khanna and A. Branch regarding call from amici's counsel, G. Lucyk;	Amicus-Related Work
2446	Khanna, Abha	5/1/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Review advisory filed by One Virginia (0.2);	Amicus-Related Work
2447	Khanna, Abha	5/2/2017	0.40	\$620.00	\$248.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$204.00	\$164.00	\$40.00	Draft outline for response to OneVirginia amicus inclusion (0.2); confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.2);	Amicus-Related Work
2448	Khanna, Abha	5/3/2017	1.30	\$620.00	\$806.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$663.00	\$533.00	\$130.00	Research and draft response to OneVirginia amicus issue (1.3);	Amicus-Related Work
2449	Stafford, William B.	5/3/2017	0.20	\$595.00	\$119.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$101.00	\$81.00	\$20.00	Conference with A. Khanna regarding response to OneVirginia amicus;	Amicus-Related Work
2450	Khanna, Abha	5/4/2017	1.60	\$620.00	\$992.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$816.00	\$656.00	\$160.00	Draft, review, and revise response to OneVirginia Amicus Brief;	Amicus-Related Work
2451	Khanna, Abha	5/5/2017	1.10	\$620.00	\$682.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$561.00	\$451.00	\$110.00	Draft, review and revise response to OneVirginia amicus brief (0.9); email and confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.2);	Amicus-Related Work
2452	Stafford, William B.	5/5/2017	0.50	\$595.00	\$297.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$252.50	\$202.50	\$50.00	Review and revise statement of position on OneVirginia amicus brief (.5);	Amicus-Related Work
2453	Khanna, Abha	5/6/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Review edits and comments from legal team regarding response to OneVirginia Amicus issue (0.2);	Amicus-Related Work
2454	Spear, Ryan M.	5/6/2017	2.00	\$620.00	\$1,240.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,020.00	\$820.00	\$200.00	Review and revise response regarding amicus brief (1.0); research issues regarding same (.8); emails with litigation team regarding same (.2);	Amicus-Related Work
2455	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/6/2017	1.00	\$850.00	\$850.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$100.00	Review response to One Virginia amicus brief and comment;	Amicus-Related Work
2456	Khanna, Abha	5/8/2017	2.30	\$620.00	\$1,426.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,173.00	\$943.00	\$230.00	Research, review and revise response to OneVirginia amicus issue (2.2); email with legal team regarding same (0.1);	Amicus-Related Work
2457	Spear, Ryan M.	5/8/2017	0.40	\$620.00	\$248.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$204.00	\$164.00	\$40.00	Emails with litigation team regarding response regarding amicus brief (.2); conference with A. Khanna regarding same (.2);	Amicus-Related Work
2458			16.10		\$10,744.00			\$8,708.00				SUBTOTAL for Amicus-Related Work

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2459	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/28/2017	0.80	\$755.00	\$604.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$540.00	\$460.00	\$80.00	Exchange email regarding preparation for re-opened discovery (.8);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2460	Spear, Ryan M.	5/2/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Emails with litigation team regarding discovery issues;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2461	Marino, Patricia	6/2/2017	1.50	\$285.00	\$427.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$345.00	\$285.00	\$60.00	Respond to K. Hamilton request for information/documents (.4); review case files and compile/organize selected background materials for litigation/attorney team review (1.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2462	Marino, Patricia	6/3/2017	1.00	\$285.00	\$285.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$40.00	Assemble/organize K. Hamilton and A. Khanna case background/attorney working materials for review;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2463	Spear, Ryan M.	6/4/2017	1.00	\$620.00	\$620.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$100.00	Prepare discovery plan;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2464	Spear, Ryan M.	6/5/2017	2.20	\$620.00	\$1,364.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,122.00	\$902.00	\$220.00	Research issues regarding potential witnesses (2.0); emails with litigation team regarding same (.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2465	Khanna, Abha	6/6/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Email with legal team regarding potential fact witnesses;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2466	Spear, Ryan M.	6/6/2017	0.70	\$620.00	\$434.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$357.00	\$287.00	\$70.00	Emails with litigation team regarding potential witnesses (.3); research issues regarding same (.4);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2467	Branch, Aria C.	6/8/2017	0.50	\$650.00	\$325.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$205.00	\$172.50	\$32.50	Call witnesses and update potential witness contact list;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2468	Spear, Ryan M.	6/8/2017	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$255.00	\$205.00	\$50.00	Conference with A. Branch regarding potential witnesses;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2469	Spear, Ryan M.	6/8/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Conference with A. Khanna regarding potential witnesses;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2470	Branch, Aria C.	6/9/2017	2.80	\$650.00	\$1,820.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$1,148.00	\$966.00	\$182.00	Call witnesses and update potential witness contact list;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2471	Khanna, Abha	6/9/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Email with legal team regarding status of potential fact witnesses (0.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2472	Spear, Ryan M.	6/9/2017	1.30	\$620.00	\$806.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$663.00	\$533.00	\$130.00	Conference with potential witnesses (.7); prepare update and summary regarding same (.6);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2473	Spear, Ryan M.	6/9/2017	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$255.00	\$205.00	\$50.00	Conference with A. Branch regarding potential witnesses;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2474	Branch, Aria C.	6/12/2017	1.00	\$650.00	\$650.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$65.00	Contact potential witnesses and update potential witness contact list;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2475	Branch, Aria C.	6/13/2017	0.70	\$650.00	\$455.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$287.00	\$241.50	\$45.50	Contact potential witnesses and update potential witness contact list;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2476	Spear, Ryan M.	6/13/2017	0.70	\$620.00	\$434.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$357.00	\$287.00	\$70.00	Conference with potential witnesses (.3); prepare update and summary regarding same (.3); emails with A. Branch regarding same (.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2477	Branch, Aria C.	6/14/2017	0.50	\$650.00	\$325.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$205.00	\$172.50	\$32.50	Contact potential witnesses and update potential witness contact list;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2478	Khanna, Abha	6/14/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Confer with R. Spear regarding fact witnesses (0.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2479	Spear, Ryan M.	6/14/2017	0.60	\$620.00	\$372.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$306.00	\$246.00	\$60.00	Emails with A. Branch regarding fact witnesses (.2); conferences with fact witnesses (.4);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2480	Spear, Ryan M.	6/14/2017	0.80	\$620.00	\$496.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$408.00	\$328.00	\$80.00	Conference with potential witnesses (.4); prepare update and summary regarding same (.3); emails with A. Branch regarding same (.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2481	Branch, Aria C.	6/15/2017	2.00	\$650.00	\$1,300.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$820.00	\$690.00	\$130.00	Contact potential witnesses and update witness contact list (1.1); attend team conference call regarding expert and fact witnesses (.9);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2482	Khanna, Abha	6/15/2017	0.80	\$620.00	\$496.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$408.00	\$328.00	\$80.00	review updated witness chart circulated by A. Branch in preparation for same (0.2); email with M. Elias and J. Berkon regarding same (0.1); review previous witness lists and begin preparing same (0.5);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2483	Spear, Ryan M.	6/15/2017	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$459.00	\$369.00	\$90.00	Emails with litigation team regarding same, including witnesses (.2); conference with potential witnesses (.7);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2484	Stafford, William B.	6/15/2017	1.00	\$595.00	\$595.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$100.00	Prepare for and participate in strategy meeting regarding witness identification;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2485	Branch, Aria C.	6/16/2017	0.70	\$650.00	\$455.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$287.00	\$241.50	\$45.50	Contact potential witnesses and update potential witness contact list;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2486	Spear, Ryan M.	6/16/2017	0.60	\$620.00	\$372.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$306.00	\$246.00	\$60.00	Emails with litigation team regarding discovery issues (.4); emails with potential witness (.1); prepare update and summary regarding same (.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2487	Khanna, Abha	6/18/2017	1.20	\$620.00	\$744.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$612.00	\$492.00	\$120.00	Review, draft, and revise draft witness list and email with legal team regarding same (1.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2488	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/19/2017	0.90	\$755.00	\$679.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$607.50	\$517.50	\$90.00	Exchange email with team regarding discovery plan (.9);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2489	Spear, Ryan M.	6/19/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Emails with litigation team regarding draft witness list;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2490	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/19/2017	0.40	\$850.00	\$340.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$270.00	\$230.00	\$40.00	Review and comment on witness list (.4);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2491	Stafford, William B.	6/19/2017	0.70	\$595.00	\$416.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$353.50	\$283.50	\$70.00	Exchange correspondence related to witness disclosures and strategic considerations pertaining to same;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2492	Spear, Ryan M.	6/20/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Emails with litigation team regarding discovery issues;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2493	Spear, Ryan M.	6/20/2017	1.10	\$620.00	\$682.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$561.00	\$451.00	\$110.00	Conference with litigation team regarding discovery, status, and strategy;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2494	Stafford, William B.	6/20/2017	1.30	\$595.00	\$773.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$656.50	\$526.50	\$130.00	Meet with litigation team to discuss litigation preparation for witnesses, written discovery, and other upcoming deadlines (1.3);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2495	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/21/2017	1.40	\$755.00	\$1,057.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$945.00	\$805.00	\$140.00	Review email on factual investigation and potential new fact witnesses (.9); conference with legal team regarding same (.5);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2496	Khanna, Abha	6/21/2017	1.30	\$620.00	\$806.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$663.00	\$533.00	\$130.00	Review previous discovery plan and draft proposal(s) for new plan (1.3);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2497	Spear, Ryan M.	6/21/2017	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$459.00	\$369.00	\$90.00	Emails with litigation team regarding discovery issues (.1); prepare plan for written fact discovery (.7); review order granting motion for extension of time (.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2498	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/21/2017	0.50	\$850.00	\$425.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$337.50	\$287.50	\$50.00	Correspond with team regarding factual issues;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2499	Khanna, Abha	6/22/2017	0.40	\$620.00	\$248.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$204.00	\$164.00	\$40.00	Prepare draft joint discovery plan and email with legal team regarding same (0.4);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2500	Marino, Patricia	6/22/2017	0.40	\$285.00	\$114.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$92.00	\$76.00	\$16.00	Respond to attorney requests for information/documents;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2501	Spear, Ryan M.	6/22/2017	1.70	\$620.00	\$1,054.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$867.00	\$697.00	\$170.00	Emails with litigation team regarding discovery issues (.3); prepare plan for written fact discovery (1.4);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2502	Stafford, William B.	6/22/2017	0.30	\$595.00	\$178.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$151.50	\$121.50	\$30.00	Review and propose feedback regarding discovery deadline (.3);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2503	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/23/2017	0.40	\$755.00	\$302.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$270.00	\$230.00	\$40.00	Conference with A. Khanna regarding discovery schedule (.4);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2504	Spear, Ryan M.	6/23/2017	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$459.00	\$369.00	\$90.00	Emails with litigation team regarding discovery issues (.1); prepare written fact discovery plan (.8);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2505	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/23/2017	0.50	\$850.00	\$425.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$337.50	\$287.50	\$50.00	Review and comment on discovery plan;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2506	Marino, Patricia	6/24/2017	0.30	\$285.00	\$85.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$69.00	\$57.00	\$12.00	Respond to attorney requests for information/documents;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2507	Spear, Ryan M.	6/24/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Emails with litigation team regarding discovery issues;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2508	Spear, Ryan M.	6/25/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Emails with litigation team regarding discovery issues;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2509	Branch, Aria C.	6/26/2017	0.40	\$650.00	\$260.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$164.00	\$138.00	\$26.00	Contact witnesses and update potential witness contact list;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2510	Khanna, Abha	6/26/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Review, revise and circulate to opposing counsel proposed joint discovery plan (0.3);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2511	Louijeune, Ruthzee	6/26/2017	0.90	\$550.00	\$495.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$378.00	\$288.00	\$90.00	Call with counsel to discuss research assignment (0.2); Start pulling documents for discovery (0.7);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2512	Spear, Ryan M.	6/26/2017	2.10	\$620.00	\$1,302.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,071.00	\$861.00	\$210.00	Conference with R. Louijeune regarding discovery issues (.2); prepare plan for written fact discovery (1.0); emails with A. Khanna regarding discovery materials (.4); emails with A. Khanna regarding proposed discovery plan (.2); emails with A. Khanna regarding research topics (.1); coordinate preparation of review database (.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2513	Louijeune, Ruthzee	6/27/2017	2.30	\$550.00	\$1,265.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$966.00	\$736.00	\$230.00	Compile discovery from trial;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2514	Spear, Ryan M.	6/27/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Emails with A. Khanna regarding discovery issues (.1); emails with R. Louijeune regarding same (.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2515	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/28/2017	1.00	\$755.00	\$755.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$100.00	Review materials on potential trial witnesses (1.0);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2516	Khanna, Abha	6/28/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Email with opposing counsel regarding discovery schedule (0.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2517	Louijeune, Ruthzee	6/28/2017	1.90	\$550.00	\$1,045.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$798.00	\$608.00	\$190.00	Attend call with counsel re: outstanding discovery and expert issues in case (1.0); compile list of discovery (0.3); confer with counsel re: various issues related to same (.6);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2518	Marino, Patricia	6/28/2017	0.20	\$285.00	\$57.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$46.00	\$38.00	\$8.00	Communications with ESS/I. Balom and attorney team regarding document/database issues and related follow-up;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2519	Spear, Ryan M.	6/28/2017	2.20	\$620.00	\$1,364.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,122.00	\$902.00	\$220.00	Emails with A. Khanna regarding document collection issues (.4); research issues regarding previously produced documents (.3); coordinate preparation of document review database (.4); review original written discovery requests (1.0); emails with R. Louijeune regarding same (.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2520	Spear, Ryan M.	6/29/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Prepare initial discovery requests;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2521	Branch, Aria C.	6/30/2017	0.40	\$650.00	\$260.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$164.00	\$138.00	\$26.00	Attend team conference call regarding discovery schedule and trial date;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2522	Khanna, Abha	6/30/2017	1.10	\$620.00	\$682.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$561.00	\$451.00	\$110.00	review previous discovery requests and responses (0.6); confer with R. Spear regarding same (0.1); review and revise draft discovery requests and email with R. Spear regarding same (0.4);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2523	Marino, Patricia	6/30/2017	0.20	\$285.00	\$57.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$46.00	\$38.00	\$8.00	Conference with R. Spear regarding defendant-intervenor witness list and review of case files/transcripts;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2524	Spear, Ryan M.	6/30/2017	3.30	\$620.00	\$2,046.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,683.00	\$1,353.00	\$330.00	Conference with litigation team regarding discovery issues (.3); prepare initial discovery requests (2.0); emails with A. Khanna and B. Stafford regarding same (.2); research issues regarding same (.4); emails with I. Balom regarding document review database (.1); conference with T. Marino regarding defendant-intervenor's witness list)/3_;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2525	Marino, Patricia	7/2/2017	2.60	\$285.00	\$741.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$598.00	\$494.00	\$104.00	Respond to attorney requests for information/documents regarding defendant-intervenor witness list (.2); review litigation file, testimony and pleadings regarding same (1.0); compile/organize deposition transcripts and trial transcripts in preparation of loading into LiveNote database (1.4);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2526	Branch, Aria C.	7/3/2017	0.40	\$650.00	\$260.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$164.00	\$138.00	\$26.00	File supplemental expert witness list (.3); discuss research project with T. Brown (.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2527	Marino, Patricia	7/3/2017	1.70	\$285.00	\$484.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$391.00	\$323.00	\$68.00	Respond to attorney requests for information/documents (.3); review deposition transcripts and trial transcripts (1.1); communications with ESS/I. Balom and T. O'Rourke regarding database searches and related follow-up (.3);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2528	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/5/2017	1.30	\$755.00	\$981.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$877.50	\$747.50	\$130.00	Exchange email regarding expert and fact witnesses (.9); follow up regarding discovery planning (.4);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2529	Marino, Patricia	7/5/2017	0.30	\$285.00	\$85.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$69.00	\$57.00	\$12.00	Communications with ESS/I. Balom and T. O'Rourke regarding document database issues and related follow-up;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2530	Spear, Ryan M.	7/5/2017	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$255.00	\$205.00	\$50.00	Emails with litigation team regarding fact witnesses (.3); emails with litigation team regarding documents (.1); emails with R. Louijeune regarding research regarding proposed witnesses (.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2531	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/5/2017	0.20	\$850.00	\$170.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$135.00	\$115.00	\$20.00	Correspond with A. Branch regarding witness interviews;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2532	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/5/2017	1.30	\$850.00	\$1,105.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$877.50	\$747.50	\$130.00	Telephone conference with team regarding filing brief opposing continuance, fact witnesses, written discovery, experts and case status (1); correspond with team regarding legislator witnesses (.3);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2533	Branch, Aria C.	7/6/2017	0.50	\$650.00	\$325.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$205.00	\$172.50	\$32.50	Send email regarding proposed maps prior to HB 5005 (.3); schedule witness interviews (.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2534	Louijeune, Ruthzee	7/6/2017	0.90	\$550.00	\$495.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$378.00	\$288.00	\$90.00	Review transcript to determine whether intervenors have previously mentioned or included apparent new names on witness list (0.9);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2535	Branch, Aria C.	7/7/2017	2.00	\$650.00	\$1,300.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$820.00	\$690.00	\$130.00	Review SCOTUS opinions on redistricting in preparation for witness interviews;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2536	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/7/2017	0.40	\$755.00	\$302.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$270.00	\$230.00	\$40.00	Exchange email regarding witness interviews (.4);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2537	Louijeune, Ruthzee	7/7/2017	0.50	\$550.00	\$275.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$210.00	\$160.00	\$50.00	Research the definition of "residence" under Virginia law for interrogatories to defendant-intervenors (0.5);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2538	Spear, Ryan M.	7/7/2017	0.60	\$620.00	\$372.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$306.00	\$246.00	\$60.00	Prepare discovery requests (.4); emails with litigation team regarding proposed discovery plan and case schedule (.1); review plaintiffs' designations of facts (.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2539	Spear, Ryan M.	7/9/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Emails with B. Stafford regarding proposed discovery plan and case schedule (.1); emails with A. Branch and A. Khanna regarding discovery issues (.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2540	Branch, Aria C.	7/10/2017	5.90	\$650.00	\$3,835.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$2,419.00	\$2,035.50	\$383.50	Prepare for witness meetings;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2541	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/10/2017	0.70	\$755.00	\$528.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$472.50	\$402.50	\$70.00	Review report on witness interviews (.7);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2542	Spear, Ryan M.	7/10/2017	1.60	\$620.00	\$992.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$816.00	\$656.00	\$160.00	Emails with B. Stafford regarding proposed discovery plan and case schedule (.3); emails with I. Balom regarding document review (.2); emails with opposing counsel regarding discovery plan and case schedule (.1); prepare discovery requests (1.0);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2543	Branch, Aria C.	7/11/2017	6.00	\$650.00	\$3,900.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$2,460.00	\$2,070.00	\$390.00	Prepare for and interview witnesses in Richmond;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2544	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/11/2017	1.90	\$755.00	\$1,434.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,282.50	\$1,092.50	\$190.00	Exchange email re: witness interviews and related follow up (1.9);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2545	Spear, Ryan M.	7/11/2017	0.40	\$620.00	\$248.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$204.00	\$164.00	\$40.00	Emails with litigation team regarding witnesses (.3); emails with I. Balom regarding draft maps (.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2546	Stafford, William B.	7/11/2017	1.40	\$595.00	\$833.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$707.00	\$567.00	\$140.00	Finalize and coordinate filing of joint discovery plan;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2547	Branch, Aria C.	7/12/2017	2.40	\$650.00	\$1,560.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$984.00	\$828.00	\$156.00	Prepare for and conduct interview with witness (1.3); contact potential witnesses (.8); review exhibit list to locate draft maps (.3);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2548	Spear, Ryan M.	7/12/2017	0.60	\$620.00	\$372.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$306.00	\$246.00	\$60.00	Emails with I. Balom regarding document review (.2); prepare potential document codes (.4);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2549	Branch, Aria C.	7/13/2017	3.00	\$650.00	\$1,950.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$1,230.00	\$1,035.00	\$195.00	Draft interview memos of interviews with witnesses (3.0);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2550	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/13/2017	1.50	\$755.00	\$1,132.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,012.50	\$862.50	\$150.00	conference with R. Spear regarding follow up from court's order, including witness interviews, deposition scheduling, and subpoenas for depositions (1.0); review and respond to email regarding deposition preparation (.5);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2551	Louijeune, Ruthzee	7/13/2017	0.50	\$550.00	\$275.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$210.00	\$160.00	\$50.00	Confer with counsel re: master list of delegates listed as potential witnesses for Defendants (0.5);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2552	Marino, Patricia	7/13/2017	2.10	\$285.00	\$598.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$483.00	\$399.00	\$84.00	Respond to attorney requests for information/documents (.2); compile/organize documents for attorney/expert review (1.6); communications with ESS regarding database updates and supplemental witness preparation searches (.3);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2553	Spear, Ryan M.	7/13/2017	0.40	\$620.00	\$248.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$204.00	\$164.00	\$40.00	Conference with I. Balom and T. O'Rourke regarding document review (.3); emails with K. McKnight and M. Braden regarding issues regarding witnesses and depositions (.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2554	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/14/2017	1.60	\$755.00	\$1,208.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,080.00	\$920.00	\$160.00	Review and respond to email regarding witness interviews, court scheduling order, and related issues;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2555	Louijeune, Ruthzee	7/14/2017	0.40	\$550.00	\$220.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$168.00	\$128.00	\$40.00	Begin preparation for subpoenas;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2556	Spear, Ryan M.	7/14/2017	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$255.00	\$205.00	\$50.00	Emails with R. Louijeune regarding deposition subpoenas (.3); emails with litigation team regarding same (.2)	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2557	Spear, Ryan M.	7/14/2017	1.50	\$620.00	\$930.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$765.00	\$615.00	\$150.00	Prepare written discovery requests (1.0); emails with litigation team regarding same (.2); emails with K. McKnight regarding deposition subpoenas (.3);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2558	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/14/2017	0.50	\$850.00	\$425.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$337.50	\$287.50	\$50.00	Correspond with team regarding hearing and regarding subpoenas of witnesses;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2559	Spear, Ryan M.	7/16/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Emails with A. Khanna regarding correspondence with potential witness (.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2560	Branch, Aria C.	7/17/2017	5.70	\$650.00	\$3,705.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$2,337.00	\$1,966.50	\$370.50	Review Tyler deposition testimony (2.8); review discovery requests (.7); review stipulations (.7); review trial transcript re: A. Howell and M. James testimony (1.5);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2561	Khanna, Abha	7/17/2017	2.10	\$620.00	\$1,302.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,071.00	\$861.00	\$210.00	Review emails with legal team regarding discovery and depositions (0.4); confer with R. Spear regarding discovery requests (0.2); review and revise draft discovery requests (0.4); email and confer with R. Spear and B. Stafford regarding same (0.3); review A. Branch witness interview memos and email with legal team regarding same (0.4); email and confer with legal team regarding witness call to M. Elias (0.4);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2562	Louijeune, Ruthzee	7/17/2017	2.80	\$550.00	\$1,540.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$1,176.00	\$896.00	\$280.00	Prepare subpoenas to serve on Defendant-Intervenors' witnesses and experts (2.8);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2563	Spear, Ryan M.	7/17/2017	0.70	\$620.00	\$434.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$357.00	\$287.00	\$70.00	Emails with K. McKnight regarding discovery issues (.4); emails with A. Khanna regarding same (.1); emails with litigation team regarding written discovery requests (.1); emails with litigation team regarding witnesses (.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2564	Spear, Ryan M.	7/17/2017	3.30	\$620.00	\$2,046.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,683.00	\$1,353.00	\$330.00	Conference with K. McKnight regarding potential witnesses, depositions, and related matters (.8); prepare subpoenas for witness depositions (1.0); conference with R. Louijeune regarding same (.3); prepare written discovery requests (1.0); conference with A. Khanna regarding same (.1); emails with litigation team regarding same (1.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2565	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/17/2017	0.30	\$850.00	\$255.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$202.50	\$172.50	\$30.00	Correspond with team regarding call from witness (.3);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2566	Khanna, Abha	7/18/2017	0.70	\$620.00	\$434.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$357.00	\$287.00	\$70.00	Review and revise draft discovery requests and email with legal team and experts regarding same (0.3); review A. Branch interview memos and email with legal team regarding same (0.4);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2567	Louijeune, Ruthzee	7/18/2017	1.20	\$550.00	\$660.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$504.00	\$384.00	\$120.00	Prepare subpoenas;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2568	Marino, Patricia	7/18/2017	0.20	\$285.00	\$57.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$46.00	\$38.00	\$8.00	Respond to attorney request for information/documents regarding witness database searches;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2569	Spear, Ryan M.	7/18/2017	0.70	\$620.00	\$434.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$357.00	\$287.00	\$70.00	Emails with A. Branch regarding witness interviews (.4); review interview memoranda (.3);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2570	Spear, Ryan M.	7/18/2017	1.80	\$620.00	\$1,116.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$918.00	\$738.00	\$180.00	Review and revise written discovery requests (1.0); emails with A. Khanna regarding same (.1); conference with A. Khanna regarding same (.1); emails with R. Louijeune regarding notices of deposition and subpoenas (.2); conference with A. Khanna regarding witnesses (.2); emails with K. McKnight regarding draft maps (.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2571	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/18/2017	2.40	\$850.00	\$2,040.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,620.00	\$1,380.00	\$240.00	Review and comment on brief regarding discovery requests (.8); review and draft discovery requests (.5); correspond with A. Khanna and R. Spear regarding meet and confer discussions with defendants (.4); correspond with team regarding witnesses (.3); review witness interview notes (.4);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2572	Branch, Aria C.	7/19/2017	2.60	\$650.00	\$1,690.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$1,066.00	\$897.00	\$169.00	Draft interview summary memos for interviews with witnesses (1.70); draft email to A. Khanna and R. Spear regarding R. Tyler's deposition testimony (0.50); call regarding witnesses (0.40);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2573	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/19/2017	1.40	\$755.00	\$1,057.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$945.00	\$805.00	\$140.00	Review and respond to email regarding witness interviews and selection questions relating to trial presentation (1.4);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2574	Louijeune, Ruthzee	7/19/2017	0.50	\$550.00	\$275.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$210.00	\$160.00	\$50.00	Reach out to plaintiffs and confirm current address information;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2575	Spear, Ryan M.	7/19/2017	2.80	\$620.00	\$1,736.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,428.00	\$1,148.00	\$280.00	Emails with litigation team regarding notices of deposition and subpoenas (.4); review and revise notices of deposition (.7); finalize and serve written discovery requests (1.0); emails with litigation team regarding same (.1); emails with K. McKnight regarding written discovery requests and production (.1); emails with K. McKnight regarding representation (.2); emails with litigation team regarding potential witnesses (.1); emails with R. Louijeune regarding written discovery to plaintiffs (.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2576	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/19/2017	0.20	\$850.00	\$170.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$135.00	\$115.00	\$20.00	Correspond with team regarding discovery (.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2577	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/20/2017	1.10	\$755.00	\$830.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$742.50	\$632.50	\$110.00	Review and respond to email regarding incoming discovery, witness interview memoranda, and related issues (1.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2578	Khanna, Abha	7/20/2017	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$459.00	\$369.00	\$90.00	Review discovery requests from opposing counsel and email and confer with R. Spear regarding same (0.6); telephone conference with A. Branch regarding documents responsive to discovery requests (0.3);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2579	Louijeune, Ruthzee	7/20/2017	2.60	\$550.00	\$1,430.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$1,092.00	\$832.00	\$260.00	Prepare subpoenas (2.6);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2580	Marino, Patricia	7/20/2017	0.90	\$285.00	\$256.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$207.00	\$171.00	\$36.00	Respond to attorney requests regarding opposing counsel document requests (.5); communications with attorney/ESS teams regarding document collection/review/production issues and related follow-up (.4);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2581	Spear, Ryan M.	7/20/2017	2.00	\$620.00	\$1,240.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,020.00	\$820.00	\$200.00	emails with litigation team regarding responses and objections to written discovery (.2); conference with A. Khanna regarding responses and objections to written discovery (.2); prepare responses and objections to written discovery (1.0); review previously produced documents as relevant to responses and objections to written discovery (.2); review and revise notices of deposition and subpoenas (.2); emails with R. Louijeune and M. DePass regarding same (.1); emails with litigation team regarding potential fact witnesses (.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2582	Branch, Aria C.	7/21/2017	1.50	\$650.00	\$975.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$615.00	\$517.50	\$97.50	Review trial transcript for references to L. Spruill, M. James, and A. Howell and circulate email (1.00); answer questions regarding discovery process (0.50);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2583	Khanna, Abha	7/21/2017	1.50	\$620.00	\$930.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$765.00	\$615.00	\$150.00	Meet and confer with Defendants regarding discovery requests and confer with R. Spear regarding same (0.4); email and confer with legal team regarding document collection and engage in same (1.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2584	Louijeune, Ruthzee	7/21/2017	1.90	\$550.00	\$1,045.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$798.00	\$608.00	\$190.00	Prepare subpoenas (1.9);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2585	Marino, Patricia	7/21/2017	0.80	\$285.00	\$228.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$184.00	\$152.00	\$32.00	Further communications with attorney/ESS team regarding document collection/review/production issues and related follow-up;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2586	Spear, Ryan M.	7/21/2017	2.10	\$620.00	\$1,302.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,071.00	\$861.00	\$210.00	Emails with K. Hamilton regarding document collection (.3); emails with litigation team regarding same (.2); meet and confer with T. Cox regarding written discovery (1.4); emails with R. Louijeune regarding service of notices of deposition and subpoenas (.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2587	Frost, Elisabeth C.	7/22/2017	2.20	\$750.00	\$1,650.00	\$490.00	\$390.00	\$1,078.00	\$858.00	\$220.00	Collecting document per discovery requests and emails with R. Spear and R. Louijeune regarding same;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2588	Louijeune, Ruthzee	7/22/2017	0.30	\$550.00	\$165.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$126.00	\$96.00	\$30.00	Confer with counsel regarding witness issues;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2589	Spear, Ryan M.	7/22/2017	0.80	\$620.00	\$496.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$408.00	\$328.00	\$80.00	Emails with litigation team regarding document collection (.8);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2590	Louijeune, Ruthzee	7/23/2017	1.50	\$550.00	\$825.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$630.00	\$480.00	\$150.00	Work on discovery responses;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2591	Marino, Patricia	7/23/2017	0.30	\$285.00	\$85.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$69.00	\$57.00	\$12.00	Communications with attorney/ESS team regarding document collection/review/production issues;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2592	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/23/2017	0.90	\$850.00	\$765.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$607.50	\$517.50	\$90.00	Gather potentially responsive documents from my email (.7); correspond with R. Spear regarding same (.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2593	Branch, Aria C.	7/24/2017	0.40	\$650.00	\$260.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$164.00	\$138.00	\$26.00	Update potential witness list (.4);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2594	Khanna, Abha	7/24/2017	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$255.00	\$205.00	\$50.00	Telephone conference with T. Cox regarding discovery requests (0.1); email and confer with legal team regarding discovery responses (0.4);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2595	Spear, Ryan M.	7/24/2017	2.50	\$620.00	\$1,550.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,275.00	\$1,025.00	\$250.00	Emails with litigation team regarding document collection (.3); emails with K. McKnight regarding written discovery (.5); conference with A. Branch regarding written discovery, including privilege logs (.3); prepare responses and objections to written discovery from defendant-intervenors (1.3); emails with A. Khanna regarding written discovery (.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2596	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/24/2017	0.20	\$850.00	\$170.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$135.00	\$115.00	\$20.00	Correspond with R. Spear regarding potentially responsive emails and privilege (.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2597	Spear, Ryan M.	7/25/2017	1.20	\$620.00	\$744.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$612.00	\$492.00	\$120.00	Conference with A. Khanna regarding written discovery (.1); emails with T. Cox regarding same; (.1) review previous document productions by plaintiffs (.2); emails with A. Branch regarding same (.1); review production log (.1); emails with A. Khanna and B. Spiva regarding witnesses (.1); prepare responses and objections to written discovery from defendant-intervenors (.5);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2598	Branch, Aria C.	7/26/2017	0.40	\$650.00	\$260.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$164.00	\$138.00	\$26.00	Follow up with potential witness;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2599	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/26/2017	1.00	\$755.00	\$755.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$100.00	Review discovery responses served by all parties (.5); review various related email (.5);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2600	Spear, Ryan M.	7/26/2017	3.10	\$620.00	\$1,922.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,581.00	\$1,271.00	\$310.00	Finalize responses and objections to written discovery from defendant-intervenors (1.5); emails with litigation team regarding same (.1); review defendants' responses and objections to plaintiffs' written discovery (.7); review defendant-intervenors' responses and objections to plaintiffs' written discovery (.8);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2601	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/26/2017	0.50	\$850.00	\$425.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$337.50	\$287.50	\$50.00	Review and comment on discovery objections;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2602	Branch, Aria C.	7/27/2017	1.50	\$650.00	\$975.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$615.00	\$517.50	\$97.50	Telephone conference with potential witness(1.00); attend team conference call (0.50);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2603	Louijeune, Ruthzee	7/27/2017	0.40	\$550.00	\$220.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$168.00	\$128.00	\$40.00	Determine whether we served verifications for discovery responses in 2015 (0.4);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2604	Spear, Ryan M.	7/27/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Coordinate document collection and review (.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2605	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/28/2017	0.70	\$755.00	\$528.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$472.50	\$402.50	\$70.00	Review and respond to various emails regarding HD 63 & 80 (.4); and discovery (.3);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2606	Spear, Ryan M.	7/28/2017	0.40	\$620.00	\$248.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$204.00	\$164.00	\$40.00	Emails with R. Louijeune regarding document collection and review (.1); emails with R. Louijeune regarding interrogatory verifications (.1); coordinate document collection and review (.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2607	Spear, Ryan M.	7/29/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Emails with R. Louijeune regarding document review;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2608	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/1/2017	0.50	\$755.00	\$377.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$337.50	\$287.50	\$50.00	Review email regarding witness interviews and related issues (.5);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2609	Branch, Aria C.	8/2/2017	5.80	\$650.00	\$3,770.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$2,378.00	\$2,001.00	\$377.00	Conduct witness interviews (3.2); draft witness interview memos (2.0); attend team conference call (.4); circulate updated potential witness list (.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2610	Spear, Ryan M.	8/2/2017	0.70	\$620.00	\$434.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$357.00	\$287.00	\$70.00	Emails with A. Khanna regarding responses to plaintiffs' written discovery (.2); emails with K. McKnight regarding deposition schedule (.3); emails with litigation team regarding potential witnesses (.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2611	Branch, Aria C.	8/3/2017	0.45	\$650.00	\$292.50	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$184.50	\$155.25	\$29.25	Accept service of deposition notices and subpoenas (.25); send email regarding deposition notices and subpoenas (.1); send email regarding potential witnesses (.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2612	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/3/2017	2.90	\$755.00	\$2,189.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,957.50	\$1,667.50	\$290.00	Review witness lists and conference with team regarding winnowing witness lists (1.2); pull together transcripts from first trial for review in preparation for depositions (.9); conference with A. Khanna regarding depositions and trial preparation (.8);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2613	Spear, Ryan M.	8/3/2017	0.40	\$620.00	\$248.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$204.00	\$164.00	\$40.00	Emails with litigation team regarding notices of deposition and scheduling (.4);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2614	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/4/2017	1.70	\$755.00	\$1,283.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,147.50	\$977.50	\$170.00	Conference with R. Spear, A. Branch, and R. Louijeune regarding witnesses and depositions (.5); review witness interview memoranda (1.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2615	Spear, Ryan M.	8/4/2017	1.90	\$620.00	\$1,178.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$969.00	\$779.00	\$190.00	Conference with litigation team regarding witnesses (.5); emails with litigation team regarding witnesses (.4); emails with opposing counsel regarding privilege logs (.5); conference with opposing counsel regarding witnesses (.5);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2616	Louijeune, Ruthzee	8/6/2017	0.30	\$550.00	\$165.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$126.00	\$96.00	\$30.00	Draft subpoenas (0.3);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2617	Spear, Ryan M.	8/6/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Emails with R. Louijeune regarding subpoena and notice of deposition (.1); emails with A. Branch regarding document productions (.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2618	Louijeune, Ruthzee	8/7/2017	0.50	\$550.00	\$275.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$210.00	\$160.00	\$50.00	Confer with counsel on outstanding issues re: subpoenas (0.3); Draft subpoenas (0.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2619	Marino, Patricia	8/7/2017	0.50	\$285.00	\$142.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$115.00	\$95.00	\$20.00	Communications with attorneys/ESS team regarding database updates and related follow-up (.5);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2620	Spear, Ryan M.	8/7/2017	0.40	\$620.00	\$248.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$204.00	\$164.00	\$40.00	Emails with C. Donohue regarding document review and production (.2); review notice of deposition for J. Loewen (.1); emails with R. Louijeune regarding same (.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2621	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/8/2017	3.90	\$755.00	\$2,944.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$2,632.50	\$2,242.50	\$390.00	Prepare for deposition of Del. Jones (.8); review prior deposition transcript (2.0); compile transcripts of trial testimony and related exhibits (1.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2622	Louijeune, Ruthzee	8/8/2017	0.50	\$550.00	\$275.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$210.00	\$160.00	\$50.00	Draft subpoenas (0.5);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2623	Marino, Patricia	8/8/2017	0.90	\$285.00	\$256.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$207.00	\$171.00	\$36.00	Review litigation file (.3); respond to attorney requests for information/documents regarding witness background materials (.6);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2624	Branch, Aria C.	8/9/2017	0.70	\$650.00	\$455.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$287.00	\$241.50	\$45.50	Send email documents to T. Marino (.3); make scheduling calls with witnesses (.4);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2625	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/9/2017	1.50	\$755.00	\$1,132.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,012.50	\$862.50	\$150.00	Review Del. Jones' deposition transcript (1.5);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2626	Louijeune, Ruthzee	8/9/2017	0.20	\$550.00	\$110.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$84.00	\$64.00	\$20.00	Finalize subpoenas (0.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2627	Spear, Ryan M.	8/9/2017	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$459.00	\$369.00	\$90.00	Emails with litigation team regarding witnesses and depositions (.2); emails with K. McKnight regarding discovery issues (.3); emails with K. McKnight regarding witnesses and depositions (.3); emails with A. Branch regarding witnesses (.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2628	Branch, Aria C.	8/10/2017	1.20	\$650.00	\$780.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$492.00	\$414.00	\$78.00	Correspond with R. Spear regarding discovery (.3); attend team conference call (.9);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2629	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/10/2017	0.90	\$755.00	\$679.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$607.50	\$517.50	\$90.00	Prepare for and participate in telephone conference regarding deposition scheduling and related issues (.9);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2630	Marino, Patricia	8/10/2017	2.00	\$285.00	\$570.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$460.00	\$380.00	\$80.00	Respond to attorney requests (.4); compile/organize supplemental documents to be uploaded to database per attorney instruction (1.3); telephone conference/emails with ESS/T. O'Rourke regarding document processing/production issues and related follow-up (.3);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2631	Spear, Ryan M.	8/10/2017	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$459.00	\$369.00	\$90.00	Emails with litigation team regarding depositions (.2); review previous review guidelines (.3); emails with A. Branch regarding key documents (.2); prepare deposition calendar (.1); emails with litigation team regarding same (.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2632	Spiva, Bruce V.	8/10/2017	0.30	\$850.00	\$255.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$202.50	\$172.50	\$30.00	Correspond with team regarding depositions;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2633	Branch, Aria C.	8/11/2017	0.70	\$650.00	\$455.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$287.00	\$241.50	\$45.50	Make scheduling calls with witnesses;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2634	Khanna, Abha	8/11/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Email with legal team regarding deposition scheduling (0.2); email with PTS regarding document storage and review in preparation for discovery/trial (0.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2635	Louijeune, Ruthzee	8/11/2017	0.30	\$550.00	\$165.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$126.00	\$96.00	\$30.00	Ensure subpoena notices sent to witnesses (0.3);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2636	Marino, Patricia	8/11/2017	0.50	\$285.00	\$142.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$115.00	\$95.00	\$20.00	Emails with attorneys and ESS team regarding document collection/production/database issues and related follow-up (.5);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2637	Spear, Ryan M.	8/11/2017	2.60	\$620.00	\$1,612.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,326.00	\$1,066.00	\$260.00	Conference with K. McKnight and M. Braden regarding discovery issues (1.2); emails with litigation team regarding witnesses and deposition scheduling (.4); revise deposition calendar (.3); emails with litigation team regarding document production (.2); emails with R. Louijeune regarding deposition notices (.1); schedule depositions (.4);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2638	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/12/2017	4.50	\$755.00	\$3,397.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$3,037.50	\$2,587.50	\$450.00	Prepare for and telephone conference with R. Spear regarding deposition planning and scheduling (1.5); exchange email with legal team regarding depositions and legal strategy for retrial (1.4); prepare for and telephone conference with R. Spear, A. Branch, and R. Louijeune regarding deposition scheduling and logistics (1.6);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2639	Louijeune, Ruthzee	8/12/2017	0.20	\$550.00	\$110.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$84.00	\$64.00	\$20.00	Manage drafting of subpoenas (0.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2640	Spear, Ryan M.	8/12/2017	2.70	\$620.00	\$1,674.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,377.00	\$1,107.00	\$270.00	Conferences with litigation team regarding deposition scheduling and witnesses (2.3); emails with litigation team regarding same (.4);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2641	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/13/2017	2.00	\$755.00	\$1,510.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,350.00	\$1,150.00	\$200.00	Review and respond to email regarding deposition scheduling (1.5); draft and circulate email regarding communications with witness (.5);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2642	Spear, Ryan M.	8/13/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Emails with opposing counsel regarding deposition scheduling (.1); emails with litigation team regarding communications with witness (.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2643	Branch, Aria C.	8/14/2017	1.40	\$650.00	\$910.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$574.00	\$483.00	\$91.00	Prepare for and attend call with witness (1.4);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2644	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/14/2017	0.90	\$755.00	\$679.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$607.50	\$517.50	\$90.00	Conference with A. Khanna and R. Spear regarding witness scheduling (.9);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2645	Louijeune, Ruthzee	8/14/2017	0.10	\$550.00	\$55.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$42.00	\$32.00	\$10.00	Discuss service of subpoenas (0.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2646	Marino, Patricia	8/14/2017	1.80	\$285.00	\$513.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$414.00	\$342.00	\$72.00	Review litigation file (.2); compile/organize witness background/deposition preparation materials for attorneys' further review (1.4); communications with ESS regarding follow-up database issues (.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2647	Spear, Ryan M.	8/14/2017	1.00	\$620.00	\$620.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$100.00	Emails with litigation team regarding witnesses and depositions;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2648	Spiva, Bruce V.	8/14/2017	0.50	\$850.00	\$425.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$337.50	\$287.50	\$50.00	Correspond with team regarding depositions and witnesses;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2649	Branch, Aria C.	8/15/2017	2.00	\$650.00	\$1,300.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$820.00	\$690.00	\$130.00	Telephone conference with witness (1.0); telephone conference with witness (1.0);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2650	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/15/2017	2.50	\$755.00	\$1,887.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,687.50	\$1,437.50	\$250.00	Review materials in preparation for delegate depositions (1.5); conference with team regarding scheduling and related logistics (1.0);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2651	Khanna, Abha	8/15/2017	0.40	\$620.00	\$248.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$204.00	\$164.00	\$40.00	Review emails with opposing counsel and email with legal team regarding depositions, discovery, and potential motion to compel (0.4);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2652	Louijeune, Ruthzee	8/15/2017	1.50	\$550.00	\$825.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$630.00	\$480.00	\$150.00	Assist with deposition scheduling (1.5);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2653	Marino, Patricia	8/15/2017	0.60	\$285.00	\$171.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$138.00	\$114.00	\$24.00	Compile supplemental documents to be uploaded to database (.5); communications with attorneys/ESS team regarding same (.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2654	Spear, Ryan M.	8/15/2017	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$459.00	\$369.00	\$90.00	Emails with litigation team regarding witnesses and depositions (.3); emails with opposing counsel regarding deposition scheduling and related issues (.4); emails with R. Louijeune regarding revised notices of deposition and subpoenas (.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2655	Branch, Aria C.	8/16/2017	5.00	\$650.00	\$3,250.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$2,050.00	\$1,725.00	\$325.00	Telephone conference with witness (0.70); deposition scheduling call with team (1.00); draft deposition outline (3.30);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2656	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/16/2017	6.20	\$755.00	\$4,681.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$4,185.00	\$3,565.00	\$620.00	Review materials in preparation for delegate depositions (2.5); prepare for and participate in team meeting regarding discovery and expert reports (2.5); review and respond to related email (1.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2657	Khanna, Abha	8/16/2017	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$255.00	\$205.00	\$50.00	Email and confer with legal team regarding deposition scheduling and logistics (0.5);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2658	Louijeune, Ruthzee	8/16/2017	5.20	\$550.00	\$2,860.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$2,184.00	\$1,664.00	\$520.00	Assist in scheduling depositions (1.0); gather exhibits from former trial (0.6); Conduct research on defendant-intervenors' fact witnesses, sitting delegates (2.8); work on draft of deposition outline (0.8);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2659	Marino, Patricia	8/16/2017	0.20	\$285.00	\$57.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$46.00	\$38.00	\$8.00	Follow-up communications with ESS/T. O'Rourke regarding database issues (.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2660	Spear, Ryan M.	8/16/2017	2.20	\$620.00	\$1,364.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,122.00	\$902.00	\$220.00	Emails with litigation team regarding witnesses and depositions (.5); emails with witness regarding deposition date (.3); conference with opposing counsel regarding discovery issues (1.2); conference with litigation team regarding same (.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2661	Spiva, Bruce V.	8/16/2017	0.30	\$850.00	\$255.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$202.50	\$172.50	\$30.00	Correspond with team regarding depositions;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2662	Branch, Aria C.	8/17/2017	8.00	\$650.00	\$5,200.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$3,280.00	\$2,760.00	\$520.00	Prepare for and attend conference call (1.50); review trial exhibits and previous deposition transcripts (1.50); draft deposition outlines for Defendant-Intervenors' witnesses (5.00);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2663	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/17/2017	5.10	\$755.00	\$3,850.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$3,442.50	\$2,932.50	\$510.00	Prepare for and participate in telephone conference regarding delegate depositions (1.5); conference with team regarding deposition outlines and related issues (.6); review and respond to related email (1.5); coordinate logistics for depositions (1.5);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2664	Khanna, Abha	8/17/2017	2.60	\$620.00	\$1,612.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,326.00	\$1,066.00	\$260.00	Review witness summaries and proof sheet provided by A. Branch (0.8); email with legal team regarding deposition scheduling (0.2); confer with B. Stafford regarding C. Jones deposition preparation (0.5); review Memorandum Opinion in preparation for C. Jones deposition outline (1.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2665	Louijeune, Ruthzee	8/17/2017	6.80	\$550.00	\$3,740.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$2,856.00	\$2,176.00	\$680.00	Draft deposition outline for Delegate Massie (3.4); Assist with deposition scheduling (1.4); Conduct research on defendant-intervenor's fact witnesses (2.0);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2666	Marino, Patricia	8/17/2017	0.40	\$285.00	\$114.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$92.00	\$76.00	\$16.00	Respond to attorney requests for information/documents regarding witness preparation;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2667	Spear, Ryan M.	8/17/2017	3.50	\$620.00	\$2,170.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,785.00	\$1,435.00	\$350.00	Emails with litigation team regarding witnesses and depositions (.4); emails with opposing counsel regarding same (.5); coordinate scheduling and logistics regarding depositions (1.1); conference with litigation team regarding same (.3); emails with R. Louijeune regarding revised notices of deposition and subpoenas (.4); update deposition calendar (.3); emails with A. Khanna regarding issues regarding districts (.5);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2668	Spiva, Bruce V.	8/17/2017	0.30	\$850.00	\$255.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$202.50	\$172.50	\$30.00	Correspond with K. Hamilton and R. Spear regarding deposition scheduling;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2669	Branch, Aria C.	8/18/2017	5.70	\$650.00	\$3,705.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$2,337.00	\$1,966.50	\$370.50	Draft deposition outlines and organize deposition exhibits;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2670	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/18/2017	3.90	\$755.00	\$2,944.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$2,632.50	\$2,242.50	\$390.00	Prepare for and participate in call with litigation team regarding deposition scheduling, witness prep sessions and related strategy (1.2); prepare for and participate in call regarding C. Jones deposition (1.2); review and compile materials for delegate depositions (1.5);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2671	Khanna, Abha	8/18/2017	5.10	\$620.00	\$3,162.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$2,601.00	\$2,091.00	\$510.00	Confer with legal team regarding C. Jones deposition preparation (0.8); review materials in preparation for and prepare C. Jones outline (4.3);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2672	Louijeune, Ruthzee	8/18/2017	7.40	\$550.00	\$4,070.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$3,108.00	\$2,368.00	\$740.00	Assist in drafting subpoenas and scheduling depositions by calling delegates and their assistants (2.2); Draft deposition outline for Delegate Wright (3.9); send confirmation of court reporters and depositions (0.3); confer with counsel regarding outstanding issues (1.0);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2673	Spear, Ryan M.	8/18/2017	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$255.00	\$205.00	\$50.00	Emails with litigation team regarding witnesses and deposition scheduling;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2674	Spear, Ryan M.	8/18/2017	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$459.00	\$369.00	\$90.00	Emails with R. Louijeune regarding revised notices of deposition and subpoenas (.2); coordinate scheduling and logistics regarding deposition (.3); conference with opposing counsel regarding discovery issues (.4);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2675	Branch, Aria C.	8/19/2017	8.60	\$650.00	\$5,590.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$3,526.00	\$2,967.00	\$559.00	Draft deposition outlines and organize deposition exhibits;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2676	Spear, Ryan M.	8/19/2017	1.00	\$620.00	\$620.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$100.00	Emails with A. Branch regarding deposition of O'Bannon; emails with litigation team regarding deposition of Howell;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2677	Stafford, William B.	8/19/2017	8.00	\$595.00	\$4,760.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$4,040.00	\$3,240.00	\$800.00	Draft Jones deposition outline;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2678	Branch, Aria C.	8/20/2017	5.30	\$650.00	\$3,445.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$2,173.00	\$1,828.50	\$344.50	Prepare for depositions;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2679	Khanna, Abha	8/20/2017	3.10	\$620.00	\$1,922.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,581.00	\$1,271.00	\$310.00	Draft C. Jones deposition outline;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2680	Louijeune, Ruthzee	8/20/2017	7.30	\$550.00	\$4,015.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$3,066.00	\$2,336.00	\$730.00	Review transcripts of public hearings (2.0); Prepare exhibits for depositions (5.3);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2681	Spear, Ryan M.	8/20/2017	1.10	\$620.00	\$682.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$561.00	\$451.00	\$110.00	Coordinate scheduling of depositions (.3); emails with litigation team regarding same (.2); emails with opposing counsel regarding same (.4); update deposition calendar (.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2682	Spear, Ryan M.	8/20/2017	2.30	\$620.00	\$1,426.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,173.00	\$943.00	\$230.00	Emails with A. Branch regarding deposition of O'Bannon (.3); review and revise draft outline of O'Bannon deposition (1.8); emails with litigation team regarding deposition scheduling (.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2683	Stafford, William B.	8/20/2017	0.80	\$595.00	\$476.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$404.00	\$324.00	\$80.00	Revise C. Jones deposition outline;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2684	Branch, Aria C.	8/21/2017	7.50	\$650.00	\$4,875.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$3,075.00	\$2,587.50	\$487.50	Prepare for depositions in Richmond;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2685	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/21/2017	2.90	\$755.00	\$2,189.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,957.50	\$1,667.50	\$290.00	Prepare for fact witness depositions (2.9);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2686	Khanna, Abha	8/21/2017	5.80	\$620.00	\$3,596.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$2,958.00	\$2,378.00	\$580.00	Draft and revise C. Jones outline (4.6); confer with K. Hamilton and B. Stafford regarding same (1.1); email with legal team regarding fact witness updates (0.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2687	Louijeune, Ruthzee	8/21/2017	8.50	\$550.00	\$4,675.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$3,570.00	\$2,720.00	\$850.00	Prepare exhibits for depositions (3.0); Prepare items for deliver to Richmond (0.5); Continue working on Wright deposition outline (2.0); Assist in serving subpoenas and scheduling depositions (2.3); Review documents in Relativity regarding defendant-intervenor fact witnesses (0.7);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2688	Marino, Patricia	8/21/2017	0.80	\$285.00	\$228.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$184.00	\$152.00	\$32.00	Respond to attorney requests for deposition/background witness preparation materials;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2689	Spear, Ryan M.	8/21/2017	0.60	\$620.00	\$372.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$306.00	\$246.00	\$60.00	Emails with opposing counsel regarding objections to subpoenas and related issues (.6);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2690	Branch, Aria C.	8/22/2017	9.00	\$650.00	\$5,850.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$3,690.00	\$3,105.00	\$585.00	Take O'Bannon deposition (5.0); summarize deposition for the team (1.0); assist K. Hamilton in preparation for Jones deposition (3.0);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2691	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/22/2017	10.90	\$755.00	\$8,229.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$7,357.50	\$6,267.50	\$1,090.00	Prepare for deposition of C. Jones (9.0); conference with A. Branch regarding C. Jones deposition and related strategy issues (1.0); review and respond to team emails regarding deposition scheduling (.9);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2692	Khanna, Abha	8/22/2017	0.70	\$620.00	\$434.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$357.00	\$287.00	\$70.00	Email and confer with K. Hamilton regarding C. Jones deposition preparation (0.5); telephone conference with A. Branch regarding O'Bannon deposition (0.1); confer with R. Spear regarding deposition preparation (0.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2693	Louijeune, Ruthzee	8/22/2017	4.00	\$550.00	\$2,200.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$1,680.00	\$1,280.00	\$400.00	Continue drafting Wright deposition outline (1.7); Assist in deposition scheduling (1.7); Revise subpoenas (0.6);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2694	Branch, Aria C.	8/23/2017	8.00	\$650.00	\$5,200.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$3,280.00	\$2,760.00	\$520.00	Attend Jones deposition (5.0); prepare for additional depositions (.3);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2695	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/23/2017	11.40	\$755.00	\$8,607.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$7,695.00	\$6,555.00	\$1,140.00	Prepare for and depose C. Jones (9.0); conference with A. Branch and legal team regarding follow up and high points from deposition (.9); prepare for W. Armstrong and D. McQuinn depositions (1.5);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2696	Khanna, Abha	8/23/2017	1.60	\$620.00	\$992.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$816.00	\$656.00	\$160.00	Confer with K. Hamilton and A. Branch regarding debrief of C. Jones deposition (1.5); confer with R. Spear regarding deposition scheduling (0.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2697	Louijeune, Ruthzee	8/23/2017	1.40	\$550.00	\$770.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$588.00	\$448.00	\$140.00	Confer with counsel regarding outstanding issues (0.5); Finalize Del. Wright deposition outline (0.6); assist in scheduling depositions (0.3);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2698	Spear, Ryan M.	8/23/2017	1.10	\$620.00	\$682.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$561.00	\$451.00	\$110.00	Emails with litigation team regarding O'Bannon deposition (.3); emails with litigation team regarding deposition scheduling (.3); conference with litigation team regarding Jones deposition (.5);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2699	Stafford, William B.	8/23/2017	0.60	\$595.00	\$357.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$303.00	\$243.00	\$60.00	Conference with opposing counsel regarding discovery responses (.6);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2700	Branch, Aria C.	8/24/2017	7.00	\$650.00	\$4,550.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$2,870.00	\$2,415.00	\$455.00	Prepare to take and defend depositions;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2701	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/24/2017	7.90	\$755.00	\$5,964.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$5,332.50	\$4,542.50	\$790.00	Prepare for sessions with W. Armstrong and D. McQuinn (2.5); prep session with W. Armstrong (1.5); prep session with D. McQuinn (1.5); conference with A. Branch regarding depositions of defendant-intervenors' witnesses (.9); conference with A. Khanna regarding depositions (.5); review and respond to email regarding litigation strategy and related issues (1.0);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2702	Khanna, Abha	8/24/2017	0.40	\$620.00	\$248.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$204.00	\$164.00	\$40.00	Email with legal team regarding fact witness depositions (0.4);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2703	Spear, Ryan M.	8/24/2017	0.70	\$620.00	\$434.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$357.00	\$287.00	\$70.00	Emails with litigation team regarding deposition scheduling (.2); emails with A. Branch regarding deposition documents related to J. McClellan (.3); emails with opposing counsel regarding same (.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2704	Branch, Aria C.	8/25/2017	9.00	\$650.00	\$5,850.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$3,690.00	\$3,105.00	\$585.00	Prepare for, take and defend depositions;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2705	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/25/2017	9.00	\$755.00	\$6,795.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$6,075.00	\$5,175.00	\$900.00	Prepare for and attend deposition of W. Armstrong (2.0); prepare for and defend deposition of D. McQuinn (3.5); review notes from depositions for action items and follow up (.9); exchange email regarding depositions (.8); travel from depositions (1.8);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2706	Khanna, Abha	8/25/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Telephone conference with K. Hamilton regarding fact witness depositions (0.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2707	Spear, Ryan M.	8/25/2017	3.30	\$620.00	\$2,046.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,683.00	\$1,353.00	\$330.00	Coordinate deposition scheduling (.3); emails with R. Louijeune regarding same (.6); emails with opposing counsel regarding same (.3); coordinate transcript for C. Jones deposition (.2); emails with litigation team regarding same (.1); emails with A. Khanna regarding potential deposition testimony (.1); emails with K. Hamilton regarding deposition of W. Armstrong (.2); prepare for depositions (1.5);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2708	Branch, Aria C.	8/28/2017	8.00	\$650.00	\$5,200.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$3,280.00	\$2,760.00	\$520.00	Prepare for depositions, including preparation of witness	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2709	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/28/2017	0.90	\$755.00	\$679.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$607.50	\$517.50	\$90.00	Review and respond to email regarding deposition preparation and scheduling;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2710	Branch, Aria C.	8/29/2017	8.00	\$650.00	\$5,200.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$3,280.00	\$2,760.00	\$520.00	Prepare for, take and defend depositions;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2711	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/29/2017	3.90	\$755.00	\$2,944.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$2,632.50	\$2,242.50	\$390.00	Exchange email regarding deposition preparation and scheduling (1.0); review and compile materials in preparation for deposition of J. Morgan (2.5); review and respond to email regarding fact witness depositions (.4);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2712	Khanna, Abha	8/29/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Leave voicemail for and email with K. McKnight regarding expert deposition scheduling (0.1); email confer with R. Spear regarding same (0.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2713	Louijeune, Ruthzee	8/29/2017	1.80	\$550.00	\$990.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$756.00	\$576.00	\$180.00	Review discovery documents in relativity on defendant-intervenors' fact witnesses (1.2); assist in scheduling depositions (0.6);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2714	Spear, Ryan M.	8/29/2017	7.30	\$620.00	\$4,526.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$3,723.00	\$2,993.00	\$730.00	Prepare for depositions (4.4); research issues regarding same (.5); emails with A. Branch and R. Louijeune regarding same (.1); review deposition transcripts (2.0); emails with litigation team regarding deposition of J. Loewen (.1); emails with witnesses regarding deposition logistics (.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2715	Branch, Aria C.	8/30/2017	8.00	\$650.00	\$5,200.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$3,280.00	\$2,760.00	\$520.00	Deposition preparation with two witnesses;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2716	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/30/2017	10.20	\$755.00	\$7,701.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$6,885.00	\$5,865.00	\$1,020.00	Prepare for deposition of J. Morgan (9.2); prepare deposition exhibits regarding same (.7); conference with A. Khanna and B. Stafford regarding fact witness depositions (.3);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2717	Khanna, Abha	8/30/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Telephone conference with A. Branch regarding upcoming fact witness depositions (0.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2718	Louijeune, Ruthzee	8/30/2017	0.80	\$550.00	\$440.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$336.00	\$256.00	\$80.00	Confer with counsel regarding outstanding issues (0.2); Review exhibits for Morgan deposition regarding 55% rule (0.2); gather documents for deposition (0.4);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2719	Marino, Patricia	8/30/2017	1.10	\$285.00	\$313.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$253.00	\$209.00	\$44.00	Respond to attorney requests for deposition transcripts and supplemental potential deposition exhibit materials (1.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2720	Spear, Ryan M.	8/30/2017	7.70	\$620.00	\$4,774.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$3,927.00	\$3,157.00	\$770.00	Emails with K. McKnight regarding deposition scheduling (.4); prepare for depositions; emails with witnesses regarding deposition logistics (.2); emails with litigation team regarding deposition of J. Morgan (.2); prepare for and defend M. James for deposition and prepare J. McClellan for deposition (7.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2721	Branch, Aria C.	8/31/2017	7.00	\$650.00	\$4,550.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$2,870.00	\$2,415.00	\$455.00	Defend and attend deposition;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2722	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/31/2017	9.50	\$755.00	\$7,172.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$6,412.50	\$5,462.50	\$950.00	Prepare for and take J. Morgan deposition (8.5); report to litigation team regarding same (1.0);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2723	Khanna, Abha	8/31/2017	0.40	\$620.00	\$248.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$204.00	\$164.00	\$40.00	Email and telephone conference with legal team regarding J. Morgan deposition (0.4);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2724	Branch, Aria C.	9/1/2017	2.50	\$650.00	\$1,625.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$1,025.00	\$862.50	\$162.50	Review deposition transcripts (2.5);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2725	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/1/2017	1.50	\$755.00	\$1,132.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,012.50	\$862.50	\$150.00	Conference with A. Branch regarding delegate depositions and related issues (1.5);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2726	Khanna, Abha	9/1/2017	0.70	\$620.00	\$434.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$357.00	\$287.00	\$70.00	Telephone conference with K. McKnight regarding deposition scheduling and upcoming deadlines (0.2); draft and send emails to K. McKnight regarding same (0.3); confer with A. Branch and B. Stafford regarding statements from Dance deposition and HD63 (0.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2727	Marino, Patricia	9/1/2017	0.20	\$285.00	\$57.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$46.00	\$38.00	\$8.00	Process court reporter's draft deposition transcripts for attorneys' review;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2728	Louijeune, Ruthzee	9/2/2017	0.10	\$550.00	\$55.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$42.00	\$32.00	\$10.00	Confer with counsel re: status of subpoenas;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2729	Spear, Ryan M.	9/2/2017	1.00	\$620.00	\$620.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$100.00	Emails with litigation team regarding deposition of J. Morgan (.3); emails with litigation team regarding exhibits and discovery materials (.7);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2730	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/3/2017	0.50	\$755.00	\$377.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$337.50	\$287.50	\$50.00	Exchange email regarding depositions and subpoenas (.5);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2731	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/4/2017	0.50	\$755.00	\$377.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$337.50	\$287.50	\$50.00	Exchange email regarding depositions and related issues (.5);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2732	Khanna, Abha	9/4/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Confer with R. Spear regarding upcoming 9/8 disclosure deadline (0.1); confer with R. Spear regarding fact witness depositions (0.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2733	Spear, Ryan M.	9/4/2017	1.10	\$620.00	\$682.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$561.00	\$451.00	\$110.00	Emails with litigation team regarding depositions (.7); revise deposition calendar (.4);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2734	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/5/2017	2.00	\$755.00	\$1,510.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,350.00	\$1,150.00	\$200.00	Review deposition transcripts for delegate depositions (2.0);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2735	Spear, Ryan M.	9/5/2017	1.50	\$620.00	\$930.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$765.00	\$615.00	\$150.00	Conference with A. Khanna regarding discovery issues (.3); emails with A. Khanna regarding same (.3); conference with R. Louijeune regarding subpoenas (.2); emails with A. Branch regarding same (.1); emails with A. Branch and R. Louijeune regarding follow-up tasks from C. Jones deposition (.3); emails with K. McKnight regarding outstanding scheduling issues (.3);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2736	Branch, Aria C.	9/6/2017	0.30	\$650.00	\$195.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$123.00	\$103.50	\$19.50	Send email to A. Khanna regarding Jones and Morgan deposition testimony (.3);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2737	Louijeune, Ruthzee	9/6/2017	0.50	\$550.00	\$275.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$210.00	\$160.00	\$50.00	Perform follow-up tasks on service of subpoenas (0.5);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2738	Spear, Ryan M.	9/6/2017	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$459.00	\$369.00	\$90.00	Emails with K. McKnight regarding depositions and related issues (.3); review Defendant-Intervenors' production and privilege log (.5); emails with litigation team regarding same (.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2739	Stafford, William B.	9/6/2017	0.70	\$595.00	\$416.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$353.50	\$283.50	\$70.00	Conference with A. Khanna and R. Spear regarding case deadlines and discovery issues;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2740	Spear, Ryan M.	9/7/2017	1.40	\$620.00	\$868.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$714.00	\$574.00	\$140.00	Emails with K. McKnight regarding expert depositions (.2); emails with litigation team regarding expert depositions (.2); conference with K. McKnight regarding discovery issues (.4); emails with B. Stafford regarding Intervenors' privilege log (.2); review privilege log (.4);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2741	Khanna, Abha	9/8/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Telephone conference with R. Spear regarding Loewen deposition and exhibits (0.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2742	Spear, Ryan M.	9/8/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Emails with K. McKnight regarding Loewen deposition (.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2743	Spear, Ryan M.	9/11/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Emails with K. McKnight regarding deposition of J. Loewen (.2); emails with litigation team regarding Intervenors' privilege log (.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2744	Stafford, William B.	9/11/2017	0.30	\$595.00	\$178.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$151.50	\$121.50	\$30.00	Exchange correspondence with A. Khanna regarding deposition strategy;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2745	Branch, Aria C.	9/12/2017	2.80	\$650.00	\$1,820.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$1,148.00	\$966.00	\$182.00	Review Loewen report (1.3); review amicus brief regarding Loewen report (1.2); call with R. Spear regarding Loewen deposition (.3);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2746	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/12/2017	2.50	\$755.00	\$1,887.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,687.50	\$1,437.50	\$250.00	Exchange email regarding Loewen deposition and discovery disputes (1.2); review deposition transcripts (1.3);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2747	Louijeune, Ruthzee	9/12/2017	0.30	\$550.00	\$165.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$126.00	\$96.00	\$30.00	Confer with counsel on statements made in Delegate's deposition testimony;	Fact Discovery - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2748	Spear, Ryan M.	9/12/2017	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$459.00	\$369.00	\$90.00	Conference with A. Branch regarding deposition of J. Loewen (.3); emails with A. Branch regarding same (.1); emails with litigation team regarding cross-examination of C. Jones (.2); emails with R. Louijeune regarding service of trial subpoenas (.1); emails with K. McKnight regarding requests for production of invoices (.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2749	Marino, Patricia	9/13/2017	1.70	\$285.00	\$484.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$391.00	\$323.00	\$68.00	Process supplemental deposition transcript materials for attorneys review (1.3); update litigation file (.4);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2750	Spear, Ryan M.	9/13/2017	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$255.00	\$205.00	\$50.00	Research issues regarding assertion of privilege by testifying witnesses (.3); emails with K. McKnight regarding deposition of J. Loewen (.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2751	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/14/2017	0.40	\$755.00	\$302.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$270.00	\$230.00	\$40.00	Exchange email regarding Loewen deposition scheduling (.4);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2752	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/15/2017	0.90	\$755.00	\$679.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$607.50	\$517.50	\$90.00	Organize materials for Loewen deposition (.9);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2753	Marino, Patricia	9/15/2017	2.90	\$285.00	\$826.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$667.00	\$551.00	\$116.00	Process supplemental deposition materials (2.6); update litigation file and indices (.3);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2754	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/16/2017	4.50	\$755.00	\$3,397.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$3,037.50	\$2,587.50	\$450.00	Prepare for Loewen deposition (3.9); exchange email regarding exhibits and related issues (.6);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2755	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/17/2017	2.60	\$755.00	\$1,963.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,755.00	\$1,495.00	\$260.00	Review and revise draft outline for Loewen deposition (1.9); exchange email regarding same (.5); exchange email with M. Elias regarding Loewen deposition (.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2756	Khanna, Abha	9/18/2017	0.40	\$620.00	\$248.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$204.00	\$164.00	\$40.00	Email and confer with legal team regarding Loewen deposition and documents (0.3); call and leave voicemail for T. Cox regarding same (0.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2757	Spear, Ryan M.	9/18/2017	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$255.00	\$205.00	\$50.00	Coordinate preparation of transcript of voicemail for deposition of J. Loewen (.2); emails with K. McKnight regarding deposition of J. Loewen (.1); emails with litigation team regarding same (.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2758	Khanna, Abha	9/19/2017	1.40	\$620.00	\$868.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$714.00	\$574.00	\$140.00	Telephone conference with R. Spear regarding Loewen deposition and documents (0.2); review Loewen documents and email and confer with legal team regarding same (1.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2759	Spear, Ryan M.	9/19/2017	2.30	\$620.00	\$1,426.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,173.00	\$943.00	\$230.00	Emails with A. Khanna regarding communications with K. McKnight (.2); emails with K. Hamilton regarding deposition of J. Loewen (.2); emails with K. McKnight regarding documents regarding J. Loewen (.3); conference with A. Khanna regarding documents (.2); review documents (1.1); emails with K. Hamilton and A. Khanna regarding documents (.3);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2760	Khanna, Abha	9/20/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Email with legal team regarding Loewen deposition (0.1);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2761	Spear, Ryan M.	9/20/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Emails with litigation team regarding deposition of J. Loewen (.2);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2762	Spear, Ryan M.	9/21/2017	0.40	\$620.00	\$248.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$204.00	\$164.00	\$40.00	Emails with opposing counsel regarding production (.1); review production (.3);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2763	Louijeune, Ruthzee	9/24/2017	0.50	\$550.00	\$275.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$210.00	\$160.00	\$50.00	Confer with counsel A. Branch re: Jones deposition outline (0.5);	Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2764			561.35		\$359,733.50			\$280,267.50				SUBTOTAL for Fact Discovery - Second Trial
2765	Spear, Ryan M.	4/13/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Emails with A. Khanna and B. Stafford regarding expert (.2);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2766	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/27/2017	1.10	\$755.00	\$830.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$742.50	\$632.50	\$110.00	Exchange email regarding expert testimony and potential alternatives to S. Ansolabehere (1.1);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2767	Hamilton, Kevin J.	4/28/2017	1.10	\$755.00	\$830.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$742.50	\$632.50	\$110.00	conference with A. Khanna regarding S. Ansolabehere and potential alternatives (.9); call to S. Ansolabehere (.2);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2768	Spiva, Bruce V.	4/28/2017	0.40	\$850.00	\$340.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$270.00	\$230.00	\$40.00	Correspond with team regarding experts;	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2769	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/1/2017	1.50	\$755.00	\$1,132.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,012.50	\$862.50	\$150.00	Exchange email with litigation team regarding remand and potential alternative experts (1.5);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2770	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/1/2017	0.40	\$850.00	\$340.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$270.00	\$230.00	\$40.00	Correspond with team about experts; (.4);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2771	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/2/2017	0.50	\$755.00	\$377.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$337.50	\$287.50	\$50.00	Exchange email regarding potential alternative experts (.5);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2772	Khanna, Abha	5/2/2017	0.40	\$620.00	\$248.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$204.00	\$164.00	\$40.00	Telephone conference with S. Ansolabehere regarding potential experts (0.2); email with legal team regarding same (0.2);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2773	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/2/2017	0.50	\$850.00	\$425.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$337.50	\$287.50	\$50.00	Correspond with team regarding experts;	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2774	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/4/2017	1.40	\$755.00	\$1,057.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$945.00	\$805.00	\$140.00	Research regarding potential alternative experts (1.4);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2775	Khanna, Abha	5/12/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Email with B. Spiva regarding contacting new (corroborating) experts (0.1);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2776	Spiva, Bruce V.	5/12/2017	0.50	\$850.00	\$425.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$337.50	\$287.50	\$50.00	Correspond with A. Khanna regarding experts;	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2777	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/2/2017	1.50	\$755.00	\$1,132.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,012.50	\$862.50	\$150.00	Telephone conference with S. Ansolabehere regarding expert testimony and related scheduling issues (1.1); follow up with B. Spiva and A. Khanna regarding same (.4);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2778	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/5/2017	1.90	\$755.00	\$1,434.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,282.50	\$1,092.50	\$190.00	Review court order on deadlines leading up to trial (.5); prepare for and conference with legal team regarding identification of fact and expert witnesses (1.0); exchange calls with S. Ansolabehere (.4);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2779	Khanna, Abha	6/5/2017	2.90	\$620.00	\$1,798.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,479.00	\$1,189.00	\$290.00	Email and confer with legal team regarding trial order, experts, fact witnesses, and next steps (1.7); review Memorandum Opinion regarding Ansolabehere testimony and draft and circulate summary of same (1.2);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2780	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/6/2017	0.50	\$755.00	\$377.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$337.50	\$287.50	\$50.00	Review and respond to email regarding identification of experts and factual witnesses;	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2781	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/7/2017	0.90	\$755.00	\$679.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$607.50	\$517.50	\$90.00	Telephone conference with S. Ansolabehere regarding proposed expert report and analysis;	Expert Discovery - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2782	Khanna, Abha	6/7/2017	1.10	\$620.00	\$682.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$561.00	\$451.00	\$110.00	Email and confer with S. Ansolabehere regarding subsequent analysis and additional experts (0.8); research and call potential expert (0.3);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2783	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/7/2017	0.70	\$850.00	\$595.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$472.50	\$402.50	\$70.00	Review A. Khanna's summary of Court's findings regarding S. Ansolabehere's testimony and report following original trial and respond to same (.5); correspond with B. Stafford and A. Khanna regarding touching base with potential expert (.2);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2784	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/8/2017	1.20	\$755.00	\$906.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$810.00	\$690.00	\$120.00	Conference with A. Khanna regarding identification of experts and potential alternatives (1.2);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2785	Khanna, Abha	6/8/2017	1.30	\$620.00	\$806.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$663.00	\$533.00	\$130.00	Research and reach out to potential experts (0.7); telephone conference with S. Ansolabehere regarding expert analysis (0.2); telephone conference with potential expert (0.4);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2786	Khanna, Abha	6/9/2017	1.70	\$620.00	\$1,054.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$867.00	\$697.00	\$170.00	Email and confer with potential experts (1.1); email and confer with legal team regarding same (0.6);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2787	Spear, Ryan M.	6/9/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Emails with litigation team regarding experts (.1);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2788	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/9/2017	0.30	\$850.00	\$255.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$202.50	\$172.50	\$30.00	Correspond with team regarding experts;	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2789	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/12/2017	0.70	\$755.00	\$528.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$472.50	\$402.50	\$70.00	Exchange email with litigation team regarding identification of experts and factual witnesses;	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2790	Khanna, Abha	6/12/2017	3.40	\$620.00	\$2,108.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,734.00	\$1,394.00	\$340.00	Email and telephone conference with S. Ansolabehere regarding expert analysis of each region and draft outline for expert report (1.8); telephone conference with potential expert regarding potential expert testimony (0.2); email with legal team regarding same (0.1); telephone conference with additional potential experts (1.0); email with legal team regarding same (0.3);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2791	Spear, Ryan M.	6/12/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Emails with litigation team regarding experts;	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2792	Khanna, Abha	6/13/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Email with J. Rodden regarding information related to expert analysis;	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2793	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/13/2017	0.30	\$850.00	\$255.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$202.50	\$172.50	\$30.00	Correspond with team regarding expert disclosure;	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2794	Khanna, Abha	6/14/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Email with S. Ansolabehere regarding expert report (0.1);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2795	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/15/2017	1.90	\$755.00	\$1,434.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,282.50	\$1,092.50	\$190.00	Prepare for and participate in telephone conference with legal team regarding status of expert and factual witness identification (.9); exchange related email (.3); exchange email with S. Ansolabehere (.7);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2796	Khanna, Abha	6/15/2017	1.40	\$620.00	\$868.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$714.00	\$574.00	\$140.00	Prepare for and telephone conference with legal team regarding expert and lay witness list (1.2); email with existing and potential expert witnesses (0.2);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2797	Khanna, Abha	6/16/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Email with S. Ansolabehere and legal team regarding S. Ansolabehere availability and potential replacement experts (0.3);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2798	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/16/2017	0.40	\$850.00	\$340.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$270.00	\$230.00	\$40.00	Correspond with team regarding experts and witnesses;	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2799	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/17/2017	1.70	\$755.00	\$1,283.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,147.50	\$977.50	\$170.00	Telephone conference with S. Ansolabehere regarding health emergency and related impact on litigation (.8); report to litigation team and suggest strategy for extension (.9);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2800	Spear, Ryan M.	6/17/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Emails with litigation team regarding experts;	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2801	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/18/2017	0.40	\$755.00	\$302.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$270.00	\$230.00	\$40.00	Exchange email with S. Ansolabehere regarding alternative experts (.4);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2802	Khanna, Abha	6/18/2017	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$255.00	\$205.00	\$50.00	Telephone conference with J. Rodden regarding potential expert testimony (0.5);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2803	Spear, Ryan M.	6/18/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Emails with litigation team regarding experts;	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2804	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/19/2017	0.40	\$850.00	\$340.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$270.00	\$230.00	\$40.00	Correspond with team about alternate experts and Ansolabehere needing to drop out because of personal emergency (.4);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2805	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/20/2017	2.90	\$755.00	\$2,189.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,957.50	\$1,667.50	\$290.00	Review research on experts (.5); telephone conference with S. Ansolabehere (.5); prepare for and attend team meeting to review experts and potential discovery plan (1.9);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2806	Khanna, Abha	6/20/2017	0.80	\$620.00	\$496.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$408.00	\$328.00	\$80.00	Email and telephone conference with J. Rodden (0.5); research, call and leave voicemails for potential experts (0.3);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2807	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/21/2017	1.20	\$755.00	\$906.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$810.00	\$690.00	\$120.00	Exchange email regarding potential experts (.7); conference with A. Khanna regarding same (.5);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2808	Khanna, Abha	6/21/2017	0.70	\$620.00	\$434.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$357.00	\$287.00	\$70.00	Telephone conference with S. Ansolabehere regarding potential new experts and additional analysis (0.1); research call potential experts regarding same (0.5); prepare consulting agreements for experts (0.1);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2809	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/22/2017	1.50	\$755.00	\$1,132.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,012.50	\$862.50	\$150.00	Conference with A. Khanna regarding discovery plan and experts (.4); review and respond to related email (.6); review expert materials (.5);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2810	Khanna, Abha	6/22/2017	2.70	\$620.00	\$1,674.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,377.00	\$1,107.00	\$270.00	Research potential experts and email and telephone conferences with same (2.7);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2811	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/23/2017	0.80	\$755.00	\$604.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$540.00	\$460.00	\$80.00	Review and respond to email regarding disclosure of experts and related issues (.5); review expert materials (.3);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2812	Khanna, Abha	6/23/2017	4.20	\$620.00	\$2,604.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$2,142.00	\$1,722.00	\$420.00	Email and telephone conferences with potential experts (3.4); draft email update and circulate same to legal team (0.3); confer with K. Hamilton regarding proposed discovery schedule and experts (0.5);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2813	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/24/2017	0.50	\$850.00	\$425.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$337.50	\$287.50	\$50.00	Review A. Khanna's summary of potential expert interviews and commented on same;	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2814	Khanna, Abha	6/25/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Email with legal team regarding potential experts and regarding procuring expert documents/database from 2015);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2815	Marino, Patricia	6/25/2017	0.80	\$285.00	\$228.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$184.00	\$152.00	\$32.00	Review litigation file in response to attorney requests for information/documents regarding expert reports previously submitted by the parties and documents/data relied upon by experts;	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2816	Khanna, Abha	6/26/2017	1.50	\$620.00	\$930.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$765.00	\$615.00	\$150.00	Telephone conference with J. Rodden (0.9); telephone conference with S. Ansolabehere regarding potential expert analyses (0.4); email with potential experts (0.1); email with legal team regarding expert data from 2015 (0.1);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2817	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/27/2017	0.70	\$755.00	\$528.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$472.50	\$402.50	\$70.00	Exchange email regarding identification of experts (.3); review related materials (.4);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2818	Khanna, Abha	6/27/2017	0.80	\$620.00	\$496.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$408.00	\$328.00	\$80.00	Email with potential experts (0.2); review expert proposals and email with legal team regarding evaluation of same (0.6);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2819	Branch, Aria C.	6/28/2017	1.50	\$650.00	\$975.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$615.00	\$517.50	\$97.50	Attend team conference call regarding expert and fact witnesses;	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2820	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/28/2017	1.50	\$755.00	\$1,132.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,012.50	\$862.50	\$150.00	Review expert reports (.9); conference with team regarding potential experts (.6);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2821	Khanna, Abha	6/28/2017	1.70	\$620.00	\$1,054.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$867.00	\$697.00	\$170.00	Participate in legal team meeting regarding expert witnesses and trial strategy (1.4); confer with B. Stafford regarding testimony of potential experts (0.2); email with S. Ansolabehere regarding same (0.1);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2822	Spear, Ryan M.	6/28/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Emails with A. Khanna regarding potential experts (.3);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2823	Khanna, Abha	6/29/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Email and telephone conference with M. Palmer regarding expert report (0.3);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2824	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/30/2017	0.50	\$755.00	\$377.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$337.50	\$287.50	\$50.00	Conference with B. Stafford and A. Khanna regarding experts (.5);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2825	Khanna, Abha	6/30/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Telephone conference with S. Ansolabehere regarding expert testimony (0.1);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2826	Khanna, Abha	7/3/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Email with legal team regarding J. Katz data to provide to M. Palmer and email with M. Palmer regarding same (0.2);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2827	Spear, Ryan M.	7/3/2017	0.70	\$620.00	\$434.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$357.00	\$287.00	\$70.00	Emails with litigation team regarding document review database and transfer of files to experts (.3); coordinate delivery of documents to experts (.1); emails with A. Khanna and T. Marino regarding same (.1); emails with litigation team regarding experts (.2);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2828	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/3/2017	0.30	\$850.00	\$255.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$202.50	\$172.50	\$30.00	Review supplemental expert witness list and correspond with team regarding same;	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2829	Spear, Ryan M.	7/5/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	emails with litigation team regarding experts (.2);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2830	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/7/2017	0.90	\$755.00	\$679.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$607.50	\$517.50	\$90.00	Review expert witness material (.9);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2831	Khanna, Abha	7/7/2017	1.30	\$620.00	\$806.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$663.00	\$533.00	\$130.00	Telephone conference with J. Rodden regarding expert analysis (0.5); review comments from S. Ansolabehere regarding potential expert analysis (0.8);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2832	Khanna, Abha	7/8/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Email with A. Branch and J. Rodden about expert report;	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2833	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/10/2017	1.20	\$755.00	\$906.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$810.00	\$690.00	\$120.00	Review and respond to email regarding expert witness reports and witness interviews (1.2);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2834	Khanna, Abha	7/10/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Confer with S. Ansolabehere regarding M. Palmer preliminary analysis (0.2)	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2835	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/11/2017	0.90	\$755.00	\$679.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$607.50	\$517.50	\$90.00	Review expert reports and witness lists (.9);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2836	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/12/2017	1.00	\$755.00	\$755.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$100.00	Review status of experts and witness interviews (1.0);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2837	Khanna, Abha	7/17/2017	1.30	\$620.00	\$806.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$663.00	\$533.00	\$130.00	Email and telephone conference with M. Palmer regarding expert report and scheduling order (0.4); email and telephone conference with J. Rodden regarding expert report, data, and scheduling order (0.6); email with experts regarding proposed discovery requests (0.3);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2838	Spear, Ryan M.	7/17/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Emails with A. Khanna regarding issues regarding experts (.1);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2839	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/18/2017	0.60	\$755.00	\$453.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$405.00	\$345.00	\$60.00	Review email regarding discussion with experts (.6);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2840	Khanna, Abha	7/18/2017	5.10	\$620.00	\$3,162.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$2,601.00	\$2,091.00	\$510.00	Review expert data produced to opposing counsel in previous litigation (0.1); telephone conference with J. Rodden regarding expert analysis (0.4); review and provide comments on M. Palmer draft report (3.8); telephone conference with M. Palmer regarding same (0.8);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2841	Khanna, Abha	7/19/2017	2.50	\$620.00	\$1,550.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,275.00	\$1,025.00	\$250.00	Telephone conferences with M. Palmer regarding expert report (1.2); review and revise draft discovery requests (0.4); email with expert regarding same (0.1); confer with R. Spear regarding same (0.3); review Memorandum Opinion for district-specific justifications with regard to J. Rodden expert report (0.4); review emails with K. McKnight and confer with R. Spear regarding same (0.1);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2842	Khanna, Abha	7/21/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Telephone conference with M. Palmer regarding expert report (0.3);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2843	Khanna, Abha	7/24/2017	6.40	\$620.00	\$3,968.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$3,264.00	\$2,624.00	\$640.00	Telephone conference with M. Palmer regarding expert report (0.2); review and provide comments on J. Rodden draft report and email with J. Rodden regarding same (6.2);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2844	Khanna, Abha	7/25/2017	1.80	\$620.00	\$1,116.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$918.00	\$738.00	\$180.00	Email with J. Rodden regarding draft report and trial logistics (0.1); email with legal team regarding J. Rodden report (0.1); review and provide comments on M. Palmer draft report (1.6);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2845	Khanna, Abha	7/26/2017	3.30	\$620.00	\$2,046.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,683.00	\$1,353.00	\$330.00	Review and provide comments on M. Palmer report (2.5); review discovery responses and email with legal team regarding same (0.3); review discovery responses provided by opposing counsel (0.3); email with J. Rodden regarding same (0.2);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2846	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/27/2017	1.00	\$755.00	\$755.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$100.00	Review and respond to email regarding expert reports;	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2847	Khanna, Abha	7/27/2017	5.30	\$620.00	\$3,286.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$2,703.00	\$2,173.00	\$530.00	Review and provide comments on M. Palmer report (3.5); telephone conferences with M. Palmer regarding same (0.9); email with legal team regarding same (0.4); confer with B. Stafford regarding expert reports (0.3); email with J. Rodden regarding expert report (0.2);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2848	Stafford, William B.	7/27/2017	2.70	\$595.00	\$1,606.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,363.50	\$1,093.50	\$270.00	Review and provide comments on expert reports;	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2849	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/28/2017	0.30	\$755.00	\$226.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$202.50	\$172.50	\$30.00	Review and respond to various emails regarding expert reports (.3);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2850	Khanna, Abha	7/28/2017	2.00	\$620.00	\$1,240.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,020.00	\$820.00	\$200.00	Telephone conferences with M. Palmer regarding expert report (0.3); review and related telephone conference regarding draft expert report (1.2); email and confer with B. Stafford regarding all expert reports (0.5);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2851	Stafford, William B.	7/28/2017	1.10	\$595.00	\$654.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$555.50	\$445.50	\$110.00	Review expert reports and conference with A. Khanna regarding proposed additions for same;	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2852	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/31/2017	6.90	\$755.00	\$5,209.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$4,657.50	\$3,967.50	\$690.00	Review draft expert reports (2.5); conference with A. Khanna regarding same (.8); provide comments on draft reports (2.5); forward comments and questions to litigation team (1.1);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2853	Khanna, Abha	7/31/2017	4.50	\$620.00	\$2,790.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$2,295.00	\$1,845.00	\$450.00	Email with legal team to summarize and finalize expert report (0.7); confer with K. Hamilton regarding same (0.5); telephone conference with M. Palmer regarding same (0.1); email with J. Rodden regarding same (0.2); review and revise J. Rodden report and email with K. Hamilton regarding same (3.0)	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2854	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/1/2017	2.70	\$755.00	\$2,038.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,822.50	\$1,552.50	\$270.00	Review draft expert reports (1.8); conference with A. Khanna regarding same (.9);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2855	Khanna, Abha	8/1/2017	9.90	\$620.00	\$6,138.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$5,049.00	\$4,059.00	\$990.00	Revise and provide comments on J. Rodden report (3.0); revise and provide comments on M. Palmer report (6.9);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2856	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/2/2017	1.50	\$755.00	\$1,132.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,012.50	\$862.50	\$150.00	Review expert reports and conference with A. Khanna regarding same (1.5);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2857	Khanna, Abha	8/2/2017	7.60	\$620.00	\$4,712.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$3,876.00	\$3,116.00	\$760.00	Review, revise and finalize J. Rodden report (2.5); review, revise and finalize M. Palmer report (3.2); telephone conferences with M. Palmer regarding same (1.1); work with T. Marino to prepare and submit final reports and data files (0.7); email with opposing counsel regarding expert reports (0.1);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2858	Marino, Patricia	8/2/2017	6.80	\$285.00	\$1,938.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$1,564.00	\$1,292.00	\$272.00	Respond to attorney requests regarding preparations of plaintiffs' expert reports and production of expert data (.5); process/organize data files (2.9); confer with ESS/A. Gelsey regarding expert data/ file transfer issues (.5); finalize plaintiffs' expert reports and expert data productions per attorney instruction (2.2); assist with service/coordinate file transfers (.4); update litigation team file (.3);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2859	Marino, Patricia	8/3/2017	1.30	\$285.00	\$370.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$299.00	\$247.00	\$52.00	Respond to attorney requests regarding expert reports (.3); compile/organize attorney working materials (1.0);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2860	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/5/2017	0.50	\$755.00	\$377.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$337.50	\$287.50	\$50.00	Exchange email regarding expert reports and deposition timing;	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2861	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/7/2017	0.80	\$755.00	\$604.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$540.00	\$460.00	\$80.00	Review and respond to email regarding data underlying experts analysis (.8);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2862	Khanna, Abha	8/7/2017	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$459.00	\$369.00	\$90.00	Email with J. Rodden and M. Palmer regarding expert data and review scheduling order regarding same (0.5); email with opposing counsel regarding same (0.1); email and confer with R. Spear regarding same (0.1); email with J. Rodden and M. Palmer regarding final expert reports and preparation for reply reports (0.2);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2863	Marino, Patricia	8/7/2017	0.20	\$285.00	\$57.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$46.00	\$38.00	\$8.00	Respond to attorney requests regarding expert materials (.2);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2864	Spear, Ryan M.	8/7/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Conference with A. Khanna regarding request for expert code (.1); emails with K. McKnight regarding expert data (.1);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2865	Spear, Ryan M.	8/9/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Emails with K. McKnight regarding expert data (.3);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2866	Khanna, Abha	8/10/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Email with J. Rodden regarding question on data file from opposing counsel;	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2867	Khanna, Abha	8/11/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Email with J. Rodden and M. Palmer regarding reply reports and deposition scheduling (0.1);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2868	Branch, Aria C.	8/14/2017	0.50	\$650.00	\$325.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$205.00	\$172.50	\$32.50	Review expert report of J. Rodden (.5);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2869	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/14/2017	0.50	\$755.00	\$377.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$337.50	\$287.50	\$50.00	Review expert reports (.5);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2870	Louijeune, Ruthzee	8/14/2017	0.10	\$550.00	\$55.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$42.00	\$32.00	\$10.00	Discuss filing of motion to substitute (0.1);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2871	Khanna, Abha	8/15/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Email with experts regarding rebuttal and reply reports (0.3);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2872	Marino, Patricia	8/15/2017	0.20	\$285.00	\$57.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$46.00	\$38.00	\$8.00	Respond to attorney requests regarding materials for expert M. Palmer review (.2);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2873	Spear, Ryan M.	8/15/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Emails with experts regarding Intervenor's expert reports (.3);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2874	Khanna, Abha	8/16/2017	1.90	\$620.00	\$1,178.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$969.00	\$779.00	\$190.00	Review rebuttal expert reports (1.5); telephone conference with M. Palmer regarding rebuttal reports (0.2); email with opposing counsel regarding code for Dr. Hood's analysis (0.1); email with M. Palmer regarding same (0.1);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2875	Marino, Patricia	8/16/2017	0.30	\$285.00	\$85.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$69.00	\$57.00	\$12.00	Process/organize defendants' expert reports and data for attorneys' further review (.3);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2876	Spear, Ryan M.	8/16/2017	0.40	\$620.00	\$248.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$204.00	\$164.00	\$40.00	Emails with litigation team regarding experts (.4);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2877	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/17/2017	0.50	\$755.00	\$377.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$337.50	\$287.50	\$50.00	Conference with A. Khanna regarding expert reply reports (.5);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2878	Khanna, Abha	8/17/2017	2.10	\$620.00	\$1,302.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,071.00	\$861.00	\$210.00	Telephone conference with M. Palmer regarding reply report (1.2); telephone conference with J. Rodden regarding reply report (0.5); email with opposing counsel regarding Hood code data (0.1); review document provided by opposing counsel and email and confer with M. Palmer regarding same (0.3);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2879	Khanna, Abha	8/18/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Email with opposing counsel regarding T. Hood code and confer with M. Palmer regarding same (0.2);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2880	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/21/2017	2.00	\$755.00	\$1,510.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,350.00	\$1,150.00	\$200.00	Review expert reports (1.5); conference with team regarding same (.5);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2881	Spear, Ryan M.	8/21/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Emails with A. Khanna regarding experts (.3);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2882	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/22/2017	1.10	\$755.00	\$830.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$742.50	\$632.50	\$110.00	Exchange email with A. Khanna regarding expert depositions (1.1);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2883	Khanna, Abha	8/22/2017	2.60	\$620.00	\$1,612.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,326.00	\$1,066.00	\$260.00	Review expert schedules, draft proposed deposition schedule, and email and confer with K. Hamilton regarding same (0.9); telephone conferences with M. Palmer regarding reply report, Hood data, and deposition scheduling (0.4); telephone conference with J. Rodden regarding reply report and deposition schedule (0.2); review email from opposing counsel regarding Hood data and review data provided (0.6); review J. Rodden report in anticipation of submitting amended report and email with K. Hamilton regarding same (0.2); review information sent by M. Palmer in preparation for Hood deposition (0.3);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2884	Khanna, Abha	8/23/2017	1.20	\$620.00	\$744.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$612.00	\$492.00	\$120.00	Draft and send expert deposition schedule to opposing counsel (0.2); email and telephone conferences with experts and K. Hamilton regarding same (0.3); review J. Rodden report and prepare and send bullet points for amended report (0.4); review expert invoices and email with K. Hamilton regarding same (0.3);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2885	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/24/2017	1.50	\$755.00	\$1,132.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,012.50	\$862.50	\$150.00	Review expert reports (1.5);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2886	Khanna, Abha	8/24/2017	4.20	\$620.00	\$2,604.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$2,142.00	\$1,722.00	\$420.00	Telephone conference with J. Rodden and M. Palmer regarding reply reports (1.2); review and provide comments on M. Palmer draft reply report and email with M. Palmer regarding same (3.0);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2887	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/25/2017	1.50	\$755.00	\$1,132.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,012.50	\$862.50	\$150.00	Review expert reports and upcoming litigation deadlines for identification of witnesses, exhibits, and related issues (1.5);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2888	Khanna, Abha	8/25/2017	1.90	\$620.00	\$1,178.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$969.00	\$779.00	\$190.00	Review and revise M. Palmer reply report (0.8); telephone conference with M. Palmer regarding same (0.2); review and provide comments on J. Rodden reply report (0.9);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2889	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/27/2017	2.00	\$755.00	\$1,510.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,350.00	\$1,150.00	\$200.00	Review and study M. Palmer expert report (1.5); draft and circulate email to litigation team regarding same and potential illustrative exhibits (.5);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2890	Khanna, Abha	8/27/2017	2.90	\$620.00	\$1,798.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,479.00	\$1,189.00	\$290.00	Review and propose comments on M. Palmer reply report (2.7); email with K. Hamilton regarding same and M. Palmer expert report and trial testimony (0.2);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2891	Khanna, Abha	8/28/2017	4.90	\$620.00	\$3,038.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$2,499.00	\$2,009.00	\$490.00	Telephone conference with opposing counsel regarding expert deposition scheduling (0.2); review and provide comments on J. Rodden reply drafts (2.3); review and provide comments on M. Palmer reply drafts (2.1); telephone conference with M. Palmer regarding same (0.3);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2892	Khanna, Abha	8/29/2017	4.30	\$620.00	\$2,666.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$2,193.00	\$1,763.00	\$430.00	Review, revise, and finalize J. Rodden reply report (0.9); review, revise and finalize M. Palmer reply report (2.5); telephone conferences with M. Palmer regarding same (0.5); review and compile J. Rodden amended report (0.4); confer with legal team regarding same;	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2893	Marino, Patricia	8/29/2017	0.30	\$285.00	\$85.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$69.00	\$57.00	\$12.00	Communications with ESS regarding plaintiffs' expert reply reports (.1); coordinate database/file updates (.2);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2894	Spear, Ryan M.	8/29/2017	0.80	\$620.00	\$496.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$408.00	\$328.00	\$80.00	Conference with expert regarding same (.3); review documents regarding same (.5);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2895	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/30/2017	0.30	\$755.00	\$226.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$202.50	\$172.50	\$30.00	Coordinate preparation for expert witness depositions (.3);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2896	Khanna, Abha	8/30/2017	2.20	\$620.00	\$1,364.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,122.00	\$902.00	\$220.00	Telephone conference with M. Palmer regarding deposition preparation (0.7); circulate amended Rodden report and email with B. Stafford regarding same (0.3); prepare for Hood deposition (1.2);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2897	Marino, Patricia	8/30/2017	0.20	\$285.00	\$57.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$46.00	\$38.00	\$8.00	Communications with ESS regarding database update/amended expert report (.2);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2898	Stafford, William B.	8/30/2017	0.50	\$595.00	\$297.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$252.50	\$202.50	\$50.00	Review amended Rodden report and accompanying cover note and revise same;	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2899	Khanna, Abha	8/31/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Telephone conference with M. Palmer regarding deposition preparation (0.1);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2900	Spear, Ryan M.	8/31/2017	6.80	\$620.00	\$4,216.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$3,468.00	\$2,788.00	\$680.00	Prepare for and defend J. McClellan and R. Dance depositions and depose C. Peace;	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2901	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/1/2017	4.20	\$755.00	\$3,171.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$2,835.00	\$2,415.00	\$420.00	Compile materials and prepare for expert depositions of M. Palmer (4.2);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2902	Khanna, Abha	9/1/2017	3.20	\$620.00	\$1,984.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,632.00	\$1,312.00	\$320.00	Review materials in preparation for Hood/Katz depositions (2.8); email with J. Rodden and M. Palmer regarding deposition preparation (0.2); email with legal team regarding expert deposition subpoenas (0.2);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2903	Spear, Ryan M.	9/1/2017	0.40	\$620.00	\$248.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$204.00	\$164.00	\$40.00	Emails with A. Khanna regarding expert depositions (.3); emails with T. O'Rourke regarding same (.1);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2904	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/2/2017	5.50	\$755.00	\$4,152.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$3,712.50	\$3,162.50	\$550.00	Review Ansolabehere expert report in preparation for M. Palmer deposition (1.5); review deposition transcript of S. Ansolabehere in preparation for M. Palmer deposition (2.5); review expert materials (.5); exchange email regarding discovery requests and subpoenas (1.0);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2905	Spear, Ryan M.	9/2/2017	0.80	\$620.00	\$496.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$408.00	\$328.00	\$80.00	Emails with A. Khanna regarding expert depositions (.3); emails with T. O'Rourke and I. Balom regarding same (.2); emails with R. Louijeune regarding subpoenas to Intervenor's experts and subpoenas to plaintiffs' experts (.3);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2906	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/3/2017	1.90	\$755.00	\$1,434.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,282.50	\$1,092.50	\$190.00	Prepare for expert depositions (1.9);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2907	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/4/2017	7.20	\$755.00	\$5,436.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$4,860.00	\$4,140.00	\$720.00	Prepare for expert depositions (6.5); exchange email regarding M. Palmer deposition preparation session (.7);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2908	Khanna, Abha	9/4/2017	7.20	\$620.00	\$4,464.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$3,672.00	\$2,952.00	\$720.00	Review materials in preparation for Hood and Katz depositions (7.2);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2909	Spear, Ryan M.	9/4/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Emails with litigation team regarding experts (.3);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2910	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/5/2017	6.50	\$755.00	\$4,907.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$4,387.50	\$3,737.50	\$650.00	Preparation session with M. Palmer (6.5);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2911	Khanna, Abha	9/5/2017	5.10	\$620.00	\$3,162.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$2,601.00	\$2,091.00	\$510.00	Review materials in preparation for Hood and Katz depositions (4.1); email and confer with K. Hamilton in preparation for same (0.3); email and confer with K. Hamilton in preparation for Palmer deposition (0.2); confer with legal team regarding upcoming 9/8 deadlines and expert deposition subpoenas (0.5);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2912	Louijeune, Ruthzee	9/5/2017	4.50	\$550.00	\$2,475.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$1,890.00	\$1,440.00	\$450.00	Research instances in which Defendant-Intervenor's three experts have testified in other cases (2.6); Read court rulings related to expert witness issues (1.3); Summarize findings in an e-mail (0.6);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2913	Spear, Ryan M.	9/5/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Emails with litigation team regarding experts (.2);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2914	Stafford, William B.	9/5/2017	0.80	\$595.00	\$476.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$404.00	\$324.00	\$80.00	Conference with A. Khanna regarding expert deposition strategy;	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2915	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/6/2017	8.70	\$755.00	\$6,568.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$5,872.50	\$5,002.50	\$870.00	Prepare for and defend deposition of M. Palmer (8.2); review outline for J. Katz deposition and exchange email regarding same (.5);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2916	Khanna, Abha	9/6/2017	10.30	\$620.00	\$6,386.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$5,253.00	\$4,223.00	\$1,030.00	Prepare outline for Hood deposition (10.0); email with K. McKnight regarding upcoming deposition logistics and document requests (0.1); email with K. Hamilton regarding Palmer deposition (0.2);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2917	Spear, Ryan M.	9/6/2017	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$255.00	\$205.00	\$50.00	Emails with litigation team regarding experts (.2); review court order (.1); emails with A. Khanna regarding expert depositions (.2);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2918	Khanna, Abha	9/7/2017	10.50	\$620.00	\$6,510.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$5,355.00	\$4,305.00	\$1,050.00	Research and prepare outline for Hood and Katz depositions;	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2919	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/8/2017	0.90	\$755.00	\$679.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$607.50	\$517.50	\$90.00	Compile material for Hofeller deposition (.9)	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2920	Khanna, Abha	9/8/2017	15.10	\$620.00	\$9,362.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$7,701.00	\$6,191.00	\$1,510.00	Prepare for Hood deposition (1.5); take Hood deposition (6.0); research and draft Katz deposition outline (4.9); travel from Atlanta to Seattle (2.7);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2921	Marino, Patricia	9/8/2017	0.50	\$285.00	\$142.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$115.00	\$95.00	\$20.00	Respond to attorney requests for information/documents regarding expert deposition;	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2922	Khanna, Abha	9/9/2017	1.80	\$620.00	\$1,116.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$918.00	\$738.00	\$180.00	Research and draft J. Katz deposition outline;	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2923	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/10/2017	1.90	\$755.00	\$1,434.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,282.50	\$1,092.50	\$190.00	Review and respond to email from K. McKnight regarding Hofeller deposition (.9); forward materials for M. Palmer and J. Rodden to review in preparation for depositions (1.0);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2924	Khanna, Abha	9/10/2017	1.70	\$620.00	\$1,054.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$867.00	\$697.00	\$170.00	Prepare outline for J. Katz deposition (1.7);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2925	Branch, Aria C.	9/11/2017	2.00	\$650.00	\$1,300.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$820.00	\$690.00	\$130.00	Review deposition transcripts and expert reports;	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2926	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/11/2017	10.50	\$755.00	\$7,927.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$7,087.50	\$6,037.50	\$1,050.00	Prepare for T. Hofeller deposition (7.5); telephone conference regarding T. Hofeller deposition (.5); organize deposition exhibits (1.0); exchange emails with litigation team regarding expert depositions and litigation strategy (1.5);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2927	Khanna, Abha	9/11/2017	12.70	\$620.00	\$7,874.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$6,477.00	\$5,207.00	\$1,270.00	Prepare outline for J. Katz deposition (9.8); travel from Seattle to Los Angeles for same (2.9);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2928	Marino, Patricia	9/11/2017	1.40	\$285.00	\$399.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$322.00	\$266.00	\$56.00	Respond to attorney requests for information/documents regarding expert deposition preparation (.7); review/search database (.3); communications with ESS team regarding same and related follow-up (.4);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2929	Spear, Ryan M.	9/11/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Emails with litigation team regarding expert deposition (.1);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2930	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/12/2017	8.40	\$755.00	\$6,342.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$5,670.00	\$4,830.00	\$840.00	Prepare and take deposition of T. Hofeller (6.0); report to the team regarding deposition of T. Hofeller (1.5); conference with A. Khanna regarding deposition of J. Katz (.9);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2931	Khanna, Abha	9/12/2017	10.80	\$620.00	\$6,696.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$5,508.00	\$4,428.00	\$1,080.00	Take J. Katz deposition (5.5); prepare for same (1.2); draft and circulate to legal team summary of same (0.6); travel from L.A. to Seattle (3.5);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2932	Spear, Ryan M.	9/12/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Emails with litigation team regarding deposition of T. Hofeller (.1); emails with deposition team regarding deposition of J. Katz (.1);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2933	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/13/2017	8.30	\$755.00	\$6,266.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$5,602.50	\$4,772.50	\$830.00	Follow up from T. Hofeller deposition (.3); preparation sessions for J. Rodden (7.5); conference with A. Khanna regarding same (.5);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2934	Khanna, Abha	9/13/2017	4.10	\$620.00	\$2,542.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$2,091.00	\$1,681.00	\$410.00	Deposition preparation with J. Rodden;	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2935	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/14/2017	9.90	\$755.00	\$7,474.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$6,682.50	\$5,692.50	\$990.00	Prepare for and defend deposition of J. Rodden (9.0); exchange email regarding Rodden and related issues (.9);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2936	Spear, Ryan M.	9/14/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Emails with litigation team regarding expert deposition (.1);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2937	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/15/2017	2.30	\$755.00	\$1,736.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,552.50	\$1,322.50	\$230.00	Draft and circulate report on J. Rodden deposition (2.3);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2938	Spear, Ryan M.	9/15/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Emails with litigation team regarding experts and expert materials (.2); emails with litigation team regarding expert deposition (.1);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2939	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/18/2017	3.90	\$755.00	\$2,944.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$2,632.50	\$2,242.50	\$390.00	Prepare for Hofeller deposition (3.9);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2940	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/19/2017	7.90	\$755.00	\$5,964.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$5,332.50	\$4,542.50	\$790.00	Prepare for Hofeller deposition (4.9); organize deposition exhibits and review Katz deposition outline (1.8); exchange email with litigation team regarding outline and deposition goals/targets (1.2);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2941	Spear, Ryan M.	9/19/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Emails with litigation team regarding status and strategy regarding expert reports (.3);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2942	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/20/2017	5.10	\$755.00	\$3,850.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$3,442.50	\$2,932.50	\$510.00	Prepare for and take Hofeller deposition (4.2); report to team regarding Hofeller deposition (.9);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2943	Spear, Ryan M.	9/20/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Emails with litigation team regarding expert reports (.2);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2944	Khanna, Abha	9/25/2017	0.80	\$620.00	\$496.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$408.00	\$328.00	\$80.00	Review M. Palmer deposition transcript (0.8);	Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2945			382.70		\$253,742.50			\$215,876.00				SUBTOTAL for Expert Discovery - Second Trial
2946	Khanna, Abha	7/5/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Email with opposing counsel regarding proposed status conference and discovery plan (0.1);	Court Conferences - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2947	Khanna, Abha	7/6/2017	0.40	\$620.00	\$248.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$204.00	\$164.00	\$40.00	Participate in telephone conference with opposing counsel and Judge Payne's chambers (0.4);	Court Conferences - Second Trial
2948	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/12/2017	3.00	\$755.00	\$2,265.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$2,025.00	\$1,725.00	\$300.00	Prepare for and attend telephonic hearing on motion to delay trial (1.5); prepare and circulate report on hearing with related to do list and follow up items (1.5);	Court Conferences - Second Trial
2949	Spear, Ryan M.	7/12/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Emails with litigation team regarding court hearing (.1);	Court Conferences - Second Trial
2950	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/12/2017	0.40	\$850.00	\$340.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$270.00	\$230.00	\$40.00	Correspond with team regarding trial scheduling and call with the Court (.4);	Court Conferences - Second Trial
2951	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/11/2017	2.80	\$755.00	\$2,114.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,890.00	\$1,610.00	\$280.00	Telephone conference with B. Stafford regarding court-requested telephonic hearing (.4); prepare for hearing and related telephone conference with M. Elias, R. Louijeune, and B. Stafford (1.0); participate in hearing (.5); draft follow up report (.9);	Court Conferences - Second Trial
2952	Khanna, Abha	8/11/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Review emails regarding status conference with the Court (0.1);	Court Conferences - Second Trial
2953	Stafford, William B.	8/11/2017	0.90	\$595.00	\$535.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$454.50	\$364.50	\$90.00	Prepare for and participate in telephonic status conference with court;	Court Conferences - Second Trial
2954	Branch, Aria C.	8/12/2017	2.00	\$650.00	\$1,300.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$820.00	\$690.00	\$130.00	Prepare for and attend conference call regarding witnesses;	Court Conferences - Second Trial
2955	Louijeune, Ruthzee	8/15/2017	0.90	\$550.00	\$495.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$378.00	\$288.00	\$90.00	Confer with counsel regarding upcoming telephonic conference with court (0.2); Participate in teleconference with court (0.3); Confer with counsel regarding outcome of call (0.4);	Court Conferences - Second Trial
2956	Stafford, William B.	8/17/2017	0.30	\$595.00	\$178.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$151.50	\$121.50	\$30.00	Prepare for Rule 37 conference (.3);	Court Conferences - Second Trial
2957	Spear, Ryan M.	9/19/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Emails with K. McKnight regarding pretrial conference (.1);	Court Conferences - Second Trial
2958	Spear, Ryan M.	9/20/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Emails with K. McKnight regarding pretrial conference (.2);	Court Conferences - Second Trial
2959	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/22/2017	2.50	\$755.00	\$1,887.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,687.50	\$1,437.50	\$250.00	Prepare for and participate with court regarding agenda for final pre-trial conference (2.5);	Court Conferences - Second Trial
2960	Khanna, Abha	9/22/2017	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$255.00	\$205.00	\$50.00	Telephone conference with Court (0.5);	Court Conferences - Second Trial
2961	Spear, Ryan M.	9/22/2017	1.30	\$620.00	\$806.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$663.00	\$533.00	\$130.00	Prepare for conference with court (.4); emails with litigation team regarding same (.2); conference with opposing counsel regarding same (.2); emails with opposing counsel regarding same; attend conference with court (.5);	Court Conferences - Second Trial
2962	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/26/2017	2.10	\$755.00	\$1,585.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,417.50	\$1,207.50	\$210.00	Exchange email regarding pretrial conference and related materials (.9); review briefing over exhibits and deposition designations in preparation for pre-trial conference (1.2);	Court Conferences - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2963	Spear, Ryan M.	9/27/2017	1.70	\$620.00	\$1,054.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$867.00	\$697.00	\$170.00	Emails with K. Hamilton regarding preparation for pretrial conference (.2); prepare materials for pretrial conference (1.5);	Court Conferences - Second Trial
2964	Branch, Aria C.	9/28/2017	2.40	\$650.00	\$1,560.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$984.00	\$828.00	\$156.00	Review documents in preparation for pretrial conference (2.4);	Court Conferences - Second Trial
2965	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/28/2017	3.50	\$755.00	\$2,642.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$2,362.50	\$2,012.50	\$350.00	Prepare for pretrial conference and review related materials (2.5); conference with A. Branch regarding pretrial conference (.5); review materials forwarded by legal team regarding pretrial conference (.5);	Court Conferences - Second Trial
2966	Spear, Ryan M.	9/28/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Emails with litigation team regarding preparation for pretrial conference (.2);	Court Conferences - Second Trial
2967	Branch, Aria C.	9/29/2017	3.60	\$650.00	\$2,340.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$1,476.00	\$1,242.00	\$234.00	Prepare for and attend pretrial conference (2.5); Attend team conference call (1.1);	Court Conferences - Second Trial
2968	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/29/2017	3.60	\$755.00	\$2,718.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$2,430.00	\$2,070.00	\$360.00	Prepare for and attend pre-trial conference with the court (2.5); telephone conference with legal team regarding pretrial conference and related issues (1.1);	Court Conferences - Second Trial
2969	Khanna, Abha	9/29/2017	1.40	\$620.00	\$868.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$714.00	\$574.00	\$140.00	Telephone conference with legal team regarding pretrial conference, next steps, and trial strategy (1.4);	Court Conferences - Second Trial
2970	Spear, Ryan M.	9/29/2017	1.30	\$620.00	\$806.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$663.00	\$533.00	\$130.00	Conference with litigation team regarding pretrial conference (1.1); emails regarding same (.2);	Court Conferences - Second Trial
2971	Spear, Ryan M.	10/4/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Emails with litigation team regarding court conference (.3);	Court Conferences - Second Trial
2972	Khanna, Abha	10/5/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Telephone conference with Court (0.2);	Court Conferences - Second Trial
2973	Spear, Ryan M.	10/5/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Emails with litigation team regarding court conference (.1);	Court Conferences - Second Trial
2974			36.00		\$24,921.50			\$20,426.50				SUBTOTAL for Court Conferences - Second Trial
2975	Branch, Aria C.	3/1/2017	3.00	\$650.00	\$1,950.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$1,230.00	\$1,035.00	\$195.00	Read opinion (1.50); brief M. Elias on opinion (0.50); conference call regarding filing motion for expedited briefing (1.00);	General Briefing - Second Trial
2976	Khanna, Abha	5/29/2017	0.40	\$620.00	\$248.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$204.00	\$164.00	\$40.00	Review and revise merits brief (0.3); confer with R. Spear regarding same (0.1);	General Briefing - Second Trial
2977	Khanna, Abha	5/30/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Review and revise merits brief (0.2);	General Briefing - Second Trial
2978	Khanna, Abha	6/7/2017	2.30	\$620.00	\$1,426.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,173.00	\$943.00	\$230.00	Research and draft advisory to the Court on number of districts being challenged (2.1); confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.2);	General Briefing - Second Trial
2979	Stafford, William B.	6/7/2017	0.60	\$595.00	\$357.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$303.00	\$243.00	\$60.00	Revise brief regarding intent to pursue claims as to remaining challenged districts;	General Briefing - Second Trial
2980	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/8/2017	0.70	\$755.00	\$528.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$472.50	\$402.50	\$70.00	Review and revise draft brief for filing on Monday (.7);	General Briefing - Second Trial
2981	Khanna, Abha	6/8/2017	1.80	\$620.00	\$1,116.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$918.00	\$738.00	\$180.00	Review and revise draft advisory to the Court (1.5); email and confer with legal team regarding same (0.3);	General Briefing - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
2982	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/8/2017	0.50	\$850.00	\$425.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$337.50	\$287.50	\$50.00	Review and comment on draft filing regarding which districts we continue to challenge;	General Briefing - Second Trial
2983	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/9/2017	0.30	\$755.00	\$226.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$202.50	\$172.50	\$30.00	Exchange email regarding briefing and related issues (.3);	General Briefing - Second Trial
2984	Khanna, Abha	6/12/2017	0.40	\$620.00	\$248.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$204.00	\$164.00	\$40.00	Review, revise, and finalize Advisory to Court, incorporating cite check edits (0.4);	General Briefing - Second Trial
2985	Branch, Aria C.	6/18/2017	0.80	\$650.00	\$520.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$328.00	\$276.00	\$52.00	Draft consent motion and proposed consent order regarding expert disclosure deadline;	General Briefing - Second Trial
2986	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/18/2017	1.40	\$755.00	\$1,057.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$945.00	\$805.00	\$140.00	Exchange email with litigation team regarding request for extension and related filings (.7); draft and transmit email to opposing counsel requesting consent for schedule modification (.7);	General Briefing - Second Trial
2987	Khanna, Abha	6/18/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Email with legal team regarding communication with opposing counsel regarding motion for extension (0.3);	General Briefing - Second Trial
2988	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/18/2017	4.00	\$850.00	\$3,400.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$2,700.00	\$2,300.00	\$400.00	Correspond with team regarding need for extension to replace expert;	General Briefing - Second Trial
2989	Branch, Aria C.	6/19/2017	3.40	\$650.00	\$2,210.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$1,394.00	\$1,173.00	\$221.00	Draft and file motion for extension of expert witness disclosure and edit and file witness list;	General Briefing - Second Trial
2990	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/19/2017	1.50	\$755.00	\$1,132.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,012.50	\$862.50	\$150.00	Review and finalize stipulated motion regarding extension of time for disclosure of experts (1.5);	General Briefing - Second Trial
2991	Khanna, Abha	6/19/2017	0.70	\$620.00	\$434.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$357.00	\$287.00	\$70.00	Review and revise draft witness list and consent motion and email with legal team regarding same (0.7);	General Briefing - Second Trial
2992	Stafford, William B.	6/20/2017	1.60	\$595.00	\$952.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$808.00	\$648.00	\$160.00	Prepare proposed stipulation regarding fact findings and legal conclusions (1.6);	General Briefing - Second Trial
2993	Khanna, Abha	6/21/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Email and confer with B. Stafford regarding July 18 submission (0.2)	General Briefing - Second Trial
2994	Stafford, William B.	6/21/2017	1.60	\$595.00	\$952.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$808.00	\$648.00	\$160.00	Prepare form of stipulation;	General Briefing - Second Trial
2995	Stafford, William B.	6/22/2017	0.30	\$595.00	\$178.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$151.50	\$121.50	\$30.00	Call opposing counsel regarding stipulation deadline (.1); prepare stipulation (.2);	General Briefing - Second Trial
2996	Stafford, William B.	6/26/2017	0.20	\$595.00	\$119.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$101.00	\$81.00	\$20.00	Conference with opposing counsel regarding stipulation;	General Briefing - Second Trial
2997	Branch, Aria C.	7/5/2017	0.40	\$650.00	\$260.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$164.00	\$138.00	\$26.00	File brief (.4);	General Briefing - Second Trial
2998	Khanna, Abha	7/10/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Review draft statement of primary issues in dispute (0.1);	General Briefing - Second Trial
2999	Stafford, William B.	7/12/2017	1.90	\$595.00	\$1,130.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$959.50	\$769.50	\$190.00	Prepare written stipulation (1.0); review paralegal review of potential factual findings in Memorandum Opinion for citation accuracy (.9);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3000	Stafford, William B.	7/14/2017	1.10	\$595.00	\$654.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$555.50	\$445.50	\$110.00	Review and provide summary to team of proposed changes by Intervenor to stipulation;	General Briefing - Second Trial
3001	Spear, Ryan M.	7/16/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Emails with litigation team regarding Joint Statement of Questions and related issues (.2);	General Briefing - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3002	Stafford, William B.	7/16/2017	1.40	\$595.00	\$833.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$707.00	\$567.00	\$140.00	Review intervenors' counterdesignations to proposed stipulation and prepare summary and analysis of same;	General Briefing - Second Trial
3003	Khanna, Abha	7/17/2017	1.50	\$620.00	\$930.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$765.00	\$615.00	\$150.00	Confer with B. Stafford regarding stipulations (0.4); review materials in preparation for same (0.5); review and revise draft stipulations and cover email and email with B. Stafford regarding same (0.6);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3004	Spear, Ryan M.	7/17/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Emails with litigation team regarding Joint Statement of Questions and related issues (.1);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3005	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/17/2017	1.30	\$850.00	\$1,105.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$877.50	\$747.50	\$130.00	Correspond with B. Stafford and team regarding draft joint statement and discussions with defense counsel (.9); review designations of findings of fact and conclusions of law (.4);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3006	Stafford, William B.	7/17/2017	3.10	\$595.00	\$1,844.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,565.50	\$1,255.50	\$310.00	Review and revise draft stipulation regarding findings of fact and conclusions of law and questions presented document (2.7); exchange correspondence with internal team and opposing counsel regarding same (.4);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3007	Khanna, Abha	7/18/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Review and revise stipulated facts/conclusions of law and joint questions presented (0.2); email and confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.1);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3008	Spear, Ryan M.	7/18/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Emails with litigation team regarding Joint Statement of Questions and related issues (.1);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3009	Stafford, William B.	7/18/2017	0.80	\$595.00	\$476.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$404.00	\$324.00	\$80.00	Exchange correspondence with opposing counsel regarding proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law and finalize same;	General Briefing - Second Trial
3010	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/19/2017	0.60	\$755.00	\$453.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$405.00	\$345.00	\$60.00	Review email exchanges with opposing counsel regarding stipulations and court-required filings (.6);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3011	Spear, Ryan M.	7/25/2017	1.00	\$620.00	\$620.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$100.00	Review and revise proposed joint motion to substitute plaintiffs (.7); emails with opposing counsel regarding same (.3);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3012	Khanna, Abha	7/27/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Email with legal team regarding response to opposing counsel on proposed joint motion to amend complaint (0.3);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3013	Louijeune, Ruthzee	7/27/2017	1.40	\$550.00	\$770.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$588.00	\$448.00	\$140.00	Draft e-mail to opposing counsel regarding need to amend (1.4);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3014	Spear, Ryan M.	7/27/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Emails with K. McKnight regarding proposed joint motion to substitute plaintiffs (.1); emails with litigation team regarding same; emails with litigation team regarding response to K. McKnight regarding proposed joint motion to substitute plaintiffs (.1);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3015	Khanna, Abha	7/28/2017	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$255.00	\$205.00	\$50.00	Email and confer with legal team and opposing counsel regarding motion to amend complaint (0.5);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3016	Louijeune, Ruthzee	7/28/2017	6.00	\$550.00	\$3,300.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$2,520.00	\$1,920.00	\$600.00	Draft brief to court re: amendment and/or substitution (4.0); conduct research for brief (2.0);	General Briefing - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3017	Spear, Ryan M.	7/28/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Emails with litigation team regarding response to K. McKnight regarding proposed joint motion to substitute plaintiffs (.1);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3018	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/28/2017	0.80	\$850.00	\$680.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$540.00	\$460.00	\$80.00	Email with team regarding motion to substitute and review same;	General Briefing - Second Trial
3019	Khanna, Abha	7/31/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Email with opposing counsel regarding motion to amend complaint (0.1);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3020	Louijeune, Ruthzee	7/31/2017	2.90	\$550.00	\$1,595.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$1,218.00	\$928.00	\$290.00	Revise and finalize brief (2.0); Draft proposed orders (0.6); Draft suggestion of death (0.3);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3021	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/1/2017	0.90	\$755.00	\$679.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$607.50	\$517.50	\$90.00	Review draft motion to amend (.9);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3022	Khanna, Abha	8/1/2017	1.00	\$620.00	\$620.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$100.00	Revise and edit draft motion to amend complaint (0.7); email and confer with legal team regarding same (0.3);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3023	Elias, Marc E.	8/2/2017	0.10	\$1,050.00	\$105.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$67.50	\$57.50	\$10.00	Review draft complaint (.1);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3024	Khanna, Abha	8/2/2017	0.60	\$620.00	\$372.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$306.00	\$246.00	\$60.00	Confer with K. Hamilton regarding motion to amend (0.3); review and revise same (0.3);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3025	Louijeune, Ruthzee	8/2/2017	3.80	\$550.00	\$2,090.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$1,596.00	\$1,216.00	\$380.00	Edit drafts to motions to amend and substitute complaints (2.5); review related case law in 4th Circuit (1.3);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3026	Spear, Ryan M.	8/2/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Emails with litigation team regarding motion to substitute plaintiffs (.1);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3027	Spear, Ryan M.	8/3/2017	1.80	\$620.00	\$1,116.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$918.00	\$738.00	\$180.00	Review and revise motion to substitute plaintiffs (1.3); emails with litigation team regarding same (.2); emails with opposing counsel regarding same (.3);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3028	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/4/2017	1.00	\$755.00	\$755.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$100.00	Review and revise draft motion to file a second amended complaint (1.0);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3029	Spear, Ryan M.	8/4/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Emails with litigation team regarding motion to substitute plaintiffs (.1); emails with opposing counsel regarding motion to substitute plaintiffs (.2);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3030	Louijeune, Ruthzee	8/6/2017	0.50	\$550.00	\$275.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$210.00	\$160.00	\$50.00	Finalize filings on amending or substituting complaint (0.5);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3031	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/7/2017	0.30	\$755.00	\$226.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$202.50	\$172.50	\$30.00	Review draft motion to amend (.3);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3032	Louijeune, Ruthzee	8/7/2017	0.60	\$550.00	\$330.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$252.00	\$192.00	\$60.00	Finalize filings on amended complaint (0.6);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3033	Spear, Ryan M.	8/7/2017	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$255.00	\$205.00	\$50.00	Emails with A. Khanna regarding motion to substitute plaintiffs (.1); emails with R. Louijeune regarding motion to substitute (.1); review and revise motion to substitute (.3);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3034	Louijeune, Ruthzee	8/8/2017	0.30	\$550.00	\$165.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$126.00	\$96.00	\$30.00	File motions to amend complaint or substitute plaintiffs (0.3);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3035	Louijeune, Ruthzee	8/9/2017	0.10	\$550.00	\$55.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$42.00	\$32.00	\$10.00	Ensure copy of motion sent to Judge Payne (0.1);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3036	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/11/2017	1.10	\$755.00	\$830.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$742.50	\$632.50	\$110.00	Review and revise draft motion to substitute plaintiffs and exchange email regarding same (1.1);	General Briefing - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3037	Louijeune, Ruthzee	8/11/2017	0.70	\$550.00	\$385.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$294.00	\$224.00	\$70.00	Finalize consent motion to substitute parties and proposed order re: amended complaint (0.7);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3038	Spear, Ryan M.	8/11/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Emails with R. Louijeune regarding motion to substitute (.2);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3039	Spear, Ryan M.	8/13/2017	0.60	\$620.00	\$372.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$306.00	\$246.00	\$60.00	Emails with opposing counsel regarding motion to substitute (.3); review and revise motion to substitute (.3);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3040	Louijeune, Ruthzee	8/15/2017	1.20	\$550.00	\$660.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$504.00	\$384.00	\$120.00	Edit unopposed motion to consent motion to substitute plaintiffs (1.2);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3041	Spear, Ryan M.	8/15/2017	0.60	\$620.00	\$372.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$306.00	\$246.00	\$60.00	Emails with litigation team regarding consent motion to substitute plaintiffs (.1); coordinate filing of same (.2); emails with litigation team regarding potential motion to compel (.1); emails with opposing counsel regarding same (.2);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3042	Spear, Ryan M.	8/16/2017	0.60	\$620.00	\$372.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$306.00	\$246.00	\$60.00	Emails with litigation team regarding proposed stipulation (.5); emails with litigation team regarding potential motion to compel (.1);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3043	Spear, Ryan M.	8/18/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Emails with litigation team regarding motion to compel (.1);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3044	Khanna, Abha	8/22/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Confer with B. Stafford regarding motion to compel (0.2);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3045	Spear, Ryan M.	8/23/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Emails with litigation team regarding motion to compel (.1); conference with B. Stafford regarding motion to compel (.1);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3046	Stafford, William B.	8/23/2017	2.00	\$595.00	\$1,190.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,010.00	\$810.00	\$200.00	Research and draft potential motion to compel (2.0);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3047	Spear, Ryan M.	8/24/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Emails with A. Khanna regarding potential stipulation (.2);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3048	Khanna, Abha	8/28/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Confer with legal team regarding motion to compel (0.2);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3049	Khanna, Abha	8/29/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Confer with B. Stafford regarding motion to compel (0.2);	General Briefing - Second Trial
3050			72.40		\$46,140.00			\$36,908.50				SUBTOTAL for General Briefing - Second Trial
3051	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/5/2017	1.50	\$755.00	\$1,132.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,012.50	\$862.50	\$150.00	Exchange email regarding opposition to motion to continue trial date (1.5);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3052	Khanna, Abha	7/5/2017	3.80	\$620.00	\$2,356.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,938.00	\$1,558.00	\$380.00	Review and comment on highlighted version of memorandum opinion for purposes of factual and legal stipulations (1.5); research and draft outline for proposed response to motion for trial continuance (1.3); review R. Almon research regarding same and email and confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.4); review motion for trial continuance and email with B. Stafford regarding same (0.2); research Judge Payne's standard for motion for continuance (0.4);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3053	Spear, Ryan M.	7/5/2017	1.00	\$620.00	\$620.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$100.00	Emails with litigation team regarding defendant-intervenors' motion for continuance (.2); review motion for continuance (.8);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3054	Stafford, William B.	7/5/2017	4.80	\$595.00	\$2,856.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$2,424.00	\$1,944.00	\$480.00	Research and draft opposition to motion to continue (4.8);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3055	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/6/2017	1.40	\$755.00	\$1,057.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$945.00	\$805.00	\$140.00	Review Intervenors' motion to continue the trial date (.8); exchange email regarding preparation for opposition (.6);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3056	Khanna, Abha	7/6/2017	1.90	\$620.00	\$1,178.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$969.00	\$779.00	\$190.00	Review and revise draft opposition to motion for trial continuance (1.4); email and confer with B. Stafford regarding factual and legal stipulations (0.5);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3057	Stafford, William B.	7/6/2017	4.70	\$595.00	\$2,796.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$2,373.50	\$1,903.50	\$470.00	Research and draft opposition to motion to continue (1.8); Prepare proposed findings of fact and legal conclusions no longer in dispute (2.9);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3058	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/7/2017	1.20	\$755.00	\$906.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$810.00	\$690.00	\$120.00	Review and finalize opposition to Intervenors' motion to delay the trial date (.8); prepare for and telephone conference with clerk of the court regarding same (.4);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3059	Khanna, Abha	7/7/2017	2.20	\$620.00	\$1,364.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,122.00	\$902.00	\$220.00	Review and revise draft email regarding stipulations (0.1); Review and revise draft scheduling order sent by opposing counsel (1.4); email and confer with legal team regarding same (0.4); email and confer with opposing counsel regarding same (0.3);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3060	Stafford, William B.	7/7/2017	0.20	\$595.00	\$119.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$101.00	\$81.00	\$20.00	Draft correspondence to opposing counsel regarding draft stipulation (.2);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3061	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/11/2017	2.10	\$755.00	\$1,585.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,417.50	\$1,207.50	\$210.00	Review motion to continue trial date and related briefing (2.1);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3062	Khanna, Abha	7/17/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Review Court's pretrial schedule and email with legal team regarding motion to amend same (0.3);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3063	Khanna, Abha	8/23/2017	0.40	\$620.00	\$248.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$204.00	\$164.00	\$40.00	Confer with B. Stafford regarding trial brief and trial strategy (0.4);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3064	Khanna, Abha	9/1/2017	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$255.00	\$205.00	\$50.00	Confer with B. Stafford regarding pretrial brief (0.5);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3065	Stafford, William B.	9/1/2017	3.00	\$595.00	\$1,785.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,515.00	\$1,215.00	\$300.00	Research and draft trial brief;	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3066	Spear, Ryan M.	9/13/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Emails with discovery team regarding potential motion to exclude (.2);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3067	Stafford, William B.	9/17/2017	5.00	\$595.00	\$2,975.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$2,525.00	\$2,025.00	\$500.00	Research and draft trial brief (5.0);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3068	Khanna, Abha	9/18/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Confer with B. Stafford regarding pretrial brief (0.2);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3069	Stafford, William B.	9/18/2017	3.30	\$595.00	\$1,963.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,666.50	\$1,336.50	\$330.00	Prepare trial brief (3.3);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3070	Khanna, Abha	9/20/2017	0.40	\$620.00	\$248.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$204.00	\$164.00	\$40.00	Email with J. Rodden and legal team regarding Daubert motion (0.2); email and confer with B. Stafford regarding pretrial brief (0.2);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3071	Stafford, William B.	9/20/2017	4.10	\$595.00	\$2,439.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$2,070.50	\$1,660.50	\$410.00	Research and draft pretrial brief (4.1);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3072	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/21/2017	2.40	\$755.00	\$1,812.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,620.00	\$1,380.00	\$240.00	Conference with A. Khanna and R. Spear regarding coordination of trial briefing and factual stipulations (1.2); conference with litigation team regarding proposed stipulation regarding expert reports (1.2);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3073	Khanna, Abha	9/21/2017	2.80	\$620.00	\$1,736.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,428.00	\$1,148.00	\$280.00	Review and revise trial brief (2.8);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3074	Spiva, Bruce V.	9/21/2017	0.40	\$850.00	\$340.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$270.00	\$230.00	\$40.00	Correspond with A. Khanna regarding Daubert motion;	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3075	Stafford, William B.	9/21/2017	2.00	\$595.00	\$1,190.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,010.00	\$810.00	\$200.00	Prepare stipulations and assist in preparation of briefing regarding objections to exhibits and deposition designations (2.0);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3076	Khanna, Abha	9/22/2017	7.40	\$620.00	\$4,588.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$3,774.00	\$3,034.00	\$740.00	Review and revise pretrial brief (7.4);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3077	Stafford, William B.	9/22/2017	3.00	\$595.00	\$1,785.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,515.00	\$1,215.00	\$300.00	Research and draft pretrial brief;	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3078	Stafford, William B.	9/22/2017	2.00	\$595.00	\$1,190.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,010.00	\$810.00	\$200.00	Research and draft pretrial brief;	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3079	Branch, Aria C.	9/23/2017	2.00	\$650.00	\$1,300.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$820.00	\$690.00	\$130.00	Review trial brief (2.0);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3080	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/23/2017	3.00	\$755.00	\$2,265.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$2,025.00	\$1,725.00	\$300.00	Review and revise draft trial brief (3.0);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3081	Stafford, William B.	9/23/2017	0.70	\$595.00	\$416.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$353.50	\$283.50	\$70.00	Review and revise pretrial brief;	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3082	Branch, Aria C.	9/24/2017	0.70	\$650.00	\$455.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$287.00	\$241.50	\$45.50	Review trial brief (.7);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3083	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/24/2017	0.70	\$755.00	\$528.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$472.50	\$402.50	\$70.00	Exchange email regarding trial brief (.7);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3084	Stafford, William B.	9/24/2017	5.20	\$595.00	\$3,094.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$2,626.00	\$2,106.00	\$520.00	Research and draft pretrial brief;	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3085	Branch, Aria C.	9/25/2017	1.50	\$650.00	\$975.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$615.00	\$517.50	\$97.50	Review trial brief (1.5);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3086	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/25/2017	2.50	\$755.00	\$1,887.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,687.50	\$1,437.50	\$250.00	Review and revise draft trial brief (1.4); review and revise draft objections to Defendant-Intervenors' trial exhibits (.6); exchange email regarding factual stipulation and related issues (.5);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3087	Khanna, Abha	9/25/2017	5.40	\$620.00	\$3,348.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$2,754.00	\$2,214.00	\$540.00	Review and revise trial brief and email and confer with legal team regarding same (5.4);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3088	Marino, Patricia	9/25/2017	1.40	\$285.00	\$399.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$322.00	\$266.00	\$56.00	Respond to attorney requests regarding trial brief and appendix (1.4);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3089	Spear, Ryan M.	9/25/2017	2.50	\$620.00	\$1,550.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,275.00	\$1,025.00	\$250.00	Emails with A. Khanna and B. Stafford regarding draft pretrial brief (.4); emails with A. Khanna and B. Stafford regarding draft factual stipulation (.3); review and revise draft factual stipulation (.7); review and revise draft pretrial brief (1.1);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3090	Stafford, William B.	9/25/2017	2.50	\$595.00	\$1,487.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,262.50	\$1,012.50	\$250.00	Finalize trial brief and related exhibits (2.5);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3091	Khanna, Abha	9/26/2017	3.10	\$620.00	\$1,922.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,581.00	\$1,271.00	\$310.00	Review and revise pretrial brief and confer with legal team regarding same (3.1);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3092	Louijeune, Ruthzee	9/26/2017	0.20	\$550.00	\$110.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$84.00	\$64.00	\$20.00	Make edit to pre-trial brief (0.2);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3093	Spear, Ryan M.	9/26/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Review Intervenor's trial brief (.3);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3094	Stafford, William B.	9/26/2017	3.00	\$595.00	\$1,785.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,515.00	\$1,215.00	\$300.00	Finalize trial brief;	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3095	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/27/2017	0.90	\$755.00	\$679.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$607.50	\$517.50	\$90.00	Review and respond to email regarding pre-trial conference and related preparation (.9);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3096	Stafford, William B.	9/27/2017	2.80	\$595.00	\$1,666.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,414.00	\$1,134.00	\$280.00	Prepare factual stipulation and coordinate filing of same (2.3); participate in conference call regarding same (.5);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3097	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/28/2017	0.90	\$755.00	\$679.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$607.50	\$517.50	\$90.00	Telephone conference with A. Khanna regarding Defendant-Intervenor's trial brief and legal theories (.9);	Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3098			101.50		\$63,748.50			\$53,508.50				SUBTOTAL for Pretrial Briefing - Second Trial
3099	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/9/2017	1.00	\$755.00	\$755.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$100.00	Prepare for and conference with A. Khanna and A. Branch regarding witness and expert availability for retrial (1.0);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3100	Branch, Aria C.	6/20/2017	4.30	\$650.00	\$2,795.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$1,763.00	\$1,483.50	\$279.50	Review split precinct issue in HD 71 and draft email regarding proposal (4.30);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3101	Khanna, Abha	6/29/2017	1.20	\$620.00	\$744.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$612.00	\$492.00	\$120.00	Telephone conference with opposing counsel regarding case schedule (0.4); email and confer with legal team regarding same, including review of previous pleadings to determine opposing counsel's request for trial date (0.8);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3102	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/29/2017	0.30	\$850.00	\$255.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$202.50	\$172.50	\$30.00	Correspond with team about defendants' request for continuance;	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3103	Stafford, William B.	6/29/2017	0.60	\$595.00	\$357.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$303.00	\$243.00	\$60.00	Prepare for and participate in conference call with opposing counsel regarding case schedule;	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3104	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/30/2017	0.70	\$755.00	\$528.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$472.50	\$402.50	\$70.00	Review witness lists filed by defendants and defendant-intervenor's (.7);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3105	Khanna, Abha	6/30/2017	1.10	\$620.00	\$682.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$561.00	\$451.00	\$110.00	Participate in team meeting regarding trial schedule and related items (0.9); email opposing counsel regarding requested trial continuance (0.1); review Defendant-Intervenor's witnesses list (0.1);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3106	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/30/2017	1.00	\$850.00	\$850.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$100.00	Telephone conference with team regarding defendants' request for continuance of trial date and plans for trial;	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3107	Khanna, Abha	7/3/2017	0.60	\$620.00	\$372.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$306.00	\$246.00	\$60.00	Draft and revise Supplemental Expert Witness List (0.2); email and confer with legal team regarding same (0.2); confer with B. Stafford regarding potential summer associate research projects (0.2);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3108	Branch, Aria C.	7/5/2017	1.60	\$650.00	\$1,040.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$656.00	\$552.00	\$104.00	Schedule potential witness interviews and contact potential witnesses (1.6);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3109	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/5/2017	0.70	\$755.00	\$528.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$472.50	\$402.50	\$70.00	Exchange email regarding witness list filing (.7);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3110	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/6/2017	1.50	\$755.00	\$1,132.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,012.50	\$862.50	\$150.00	Prepare for and attend team meeting regarding experts, fact witnesses, and trial preparation (1.5);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3111	Khanna, Abha	7/6/2017	1.10	\$620.00	\$682.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$561.00	\$451.00	\$110.00	Telephone conference with S. Ansolabehere regarding potential expert testimony (0.7); telephone conference with M. Palmer regarding same (0.2); email with J. Rodden regarding same (0.2);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3112	Spear, Ryan M.	7/7/2017	0.70	\$620.00	\$434.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$357.00	\$287.00	\$70.00	Prepare analysis of defendant-intervenor's proposed witnesses (.3); emails with R. Louijeune regarding same (.2); emails with R. Louijeune regarding research regarding Virginia law (.2);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3113	Stafford, William B.	7/7/2017	0.60	\$595.00	\$357.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$303.00	\$243.00	\$60.00	Prepare for and participate in call with opposing counsel to discuss aspects of scheduling order and case schedule (.6);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3114	Spear, Ryan M.	7/11/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Emails with opposing counsel regarding court request (.1);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3115	Louijeune, Ruthzee	7/12/2017	0.30	\$550.00	\$165.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$126.00	\$96.00	\$30.00	Confer with counsel about tasks (0.3);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3116	Spear, Ryan M.	7/12/2017	0.60	\$620.00	\$372.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$306.00	\$246.00	\$60.00	Emails with B. Stafford regarding record citations (.2); emails with B. Stafford regarding remaining issues in dispute (.4);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3117	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/12/2017	0.50	\$850.00	\$425.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$337.50	\$287.50	\$50.00	Review order (.2); correspond with B. Stafford regarding issues in dispute (.3);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3118	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/13/2017	1.50	\$755.00	\$1,132.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,012.50	\$862.50	\$150.00	Email to coordinate paralegal assignment for trial (.5); coordinate trial preparation and discussions with opposing counsel (1.0);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3119	Louijeune, Ruthzee	7/13/2017	0.60	\$550.00	\$330.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$252.00	\$192.00	\$60.00	Call on status of tasks (0.6);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3120	Spear, Ryan M.	7/13/2017	1.00	\$620.00	\$620.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$100.00	Conference with K. Huston regarding demonstrative exhibits (.5); emails with B. Stafford and T. Marino regarding witness preparation research (.5);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3121	Branch, Aria C.	7/14/2017	1.50	\$650.00	\$975.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$615.00	\$517.50	\$97.50	Send email summarizing deadlines from court order (.6); review potential witness list and make contacts (.9);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3122	Branch, Aria C.	7/18/2017	2.00	\$650.00	\$1,300.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$820.00	\$690.00	\$130.00	Review trial transcript regarding references to L. Spruill, M. James, and A. Howell (1.3); send email regarding analysis of VTD splits in district (.7);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3123	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/18/2017	0.90	\$755.00	\$679.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$607.50	\$517.50	\$90.00	Review email with opposing counsel regarding court-required filings and related discussion (.9);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3124	Spear, Ryan M.	7/18/2017	1.10	\$620.00	\$682.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$561.00	\$451.00	\$110.00	Coordinate review of trial exhibits in preparation for retrial and witness preparation (.5); review previously produced documents regarding same (.5); emails with A. Khanna regarding same (.1);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3125	Spiva, Bruce V.	7/19/2017	0.70	\$850.00	\$595.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$472.50	\$402.50	\$70.00	Correspond with team regarding potential trial witnesses (.3); review A. Branch's memo on potential witnesses (.2); review subpoenas (.2);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3126	Khanna, Abha	7/27/2017	0.80	\$620.00	\$496.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$408.00	\$328.00	\$80.00	Telephone conference with A. Branch and R. Louijune regarding motion to amend complaint, fact witness update, and other trial prep (0.7); draft agenda for same (0.1);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3127	Louijeune, Ruthzee	7/27/2017	0.60	\$550.00	\$330.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$252.00	\$192.00	\$60.00	Confer with counsel regarding outstanding tasks in case (0.6);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3128	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/2/2017	4.40	\$755.00	\$3,322.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$2,970.00	\$2,530.00	\$440.00	review witness list and discussion with litigation team regarding winnowing lists (.9); review witness interview memoranda (1.2); prepare for and participate in legal team meeting regarding depositions, trial witnesses, and experts (1.5); review notes on calls with the court on upcoming deadlines (.8);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3129	Branch, Aria C.	8/4/2017	1.00	\$650.00	\$650.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$65.00	Attend conference call regarding potential trial witnesses (.5); draft email regarding same (.5);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3130	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/4/2017	0.90	\$755.00	\$679.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$607.50	\$517.50	\$90.00	Compile expert reports and trial transcript (.9);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3131	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/9/2017	2.40	\$755.00	\$1,812.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,620.00	\$1,380.00	\$240.00	Review Supreme Court decision to outline necessary elements of proof and to coordinate presentation of proof at trial (1.9); exchange email with team regarding same and regarding upcoming depositions (.5);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3132	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/10/2017	1.30	\$755.00	\$981.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$877.50	\$747.50	\$130.00	Exchange email regarding key elements of proof under new legal standard (.5); conference with B. Stafford regarding same (.5); review trial witnesses and allocate responsibility for trial (.3);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3133	Louijeune, Ruthzee	8/10/2017	2.50	\$550.00	\$1,375.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$1,050.00	\$800.00	\$250.00	Begin research on districts of Delegates on Defendant-Intervenors' witness list;	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3134	Louijeune, Ruthzee	8/11/2017	4.00	\$550.00	\$2,200.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$1,680.00	\$1,280.00	\$400.00	Review trial testimony and depositions regarding Delegate Jones interactions with black delegates (1.3); review documents, depositions, and trial testimony to determine potential relevance of testimony of Defendant-Intervenors' fact witnesses (2.7);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3135	Marino, Patricia	8/11/2017	1.90	\$285.00	\$541.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$437.00	\$361.00	\$76.00	Review litigation file; compile/organize exhibit materials from July 2015 trial in response to attorney request for information/documents (1.7); communications with attorneys regarding preliminary trial logistics/coordination (.2);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3136	Elias, Marc E.	8/12/2017	0.50	\$1,050.00	\$525.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$337.50	\$287.50	\$50.00	Review email regarding elements of proof;	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3137	Louijeune, Ruthzee	8/12/2017	2.80	\$550.00	\$1,540.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$1,176.00	\$896.00	\$280.00	Confer with counsel on status of delegates testifying on our behalf (1.0); Continue researching defendant-intervenors' fact witnesses (1.8);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3138	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/14/2017	0.50	\$755.00	\$377.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$337.50	\$287.50	\$50.00	Review trial preparation (.5);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3139	Branch, Aria C.	8/15/2017	4.00	\$650.00	\$2,600.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$1,640.00	\$1,380.00	\$260.00	Draft proof plan (3.0); research intervenors' witnesses (1.0);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3140	Louijeune, Ruthzee	8/15/2017	0.90	\$550.00	\$495.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$378.00	\$288.00	\$90.00	Research delegates on Defendant-Intervenors' witness list (0.9);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3141	Marino, Patricia	8/15/2017	0.40	\$285.00	\$114.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$92.00	\$76.00	\$16.00	Respond to attorney requests for background information/documents regarding July 2015 trial/exhibits (.4);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3142	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/16/2017	0.30	\$755.00	\$226.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$202.50	\$172.50	\$30.00	Review email regarding paralegal support (.3);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3143	Marino, Patricia	8/16/2017	1.10	\$285.00	\$313.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$253.00	\$209.00	\$44.00	Compile/organize witness background materials in response to attorneys' requests (1.1);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3144	Khanna, Abha	8/23/2017	0.40	\$620.00	\$248.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$204.00	\$164.00	\$40.00	Email with legal team regarding fact witnesses, stipulations, and trial strategy (0.4);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3145	Khanna, Abha	8/24/2017	0.60	\$620.00	\$372.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$306.00	\$246.00	\$60.00	Draft and circulate agenda for team meeting and upcoming tasks/assignments (0.4); confer with R. Spear regarding same (0.2);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3146	Spear, Ryan M.	8/24/2017	0.80	\$620.00	\$496.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$408.00	\$328.00	\$80.00	Review and revise trial subpoena (.7); emails with R. Louijeune regarding same (.1);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3147	Louijeune, Ruthzee	8/25/2017	0.60	\$550.00	\$330.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$252.00	\$192.00	\$60.00	Confer with counsel regarding outstanding issues;	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3148	Marino, Patricia	8/27/2017	0.30	\$285.00	\$85.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$69.00	\$57.00	\$12.00	Email with litigation team in response to attorney request regarding preparation of potential trial exhibit/demonstratives;	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3149	Louijeune, Ruthzee	8/28/2017	0.70	\$550.00	\$385.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$294.00	\$224.00	\$70.00	Prepare and review trial subpoenas (0.5); send past subpoenas to counsel (0.2);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3150	Khanna, Abha	8/29/2017	0.40	\$620.00	\$248.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$204.00	\$164.00	\$40.00	Email and confer with legal team regarding demonstrative exhibits (0.4);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3151	Branch, Aria C.	9/1/2017	2.50	\$650.00	\$1,625.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$1,025.00	\$862.50	\$162.50	Discussion with K. Hamilton regarding predominance standard (1.5); review redistricting court opinions (1.0);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3152	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/1/2017	4.20	\$755.00	\$3,171.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$2,835.00	\$2,415.00	\$420.00	Review Bethune-Hill and Cooper v. Harris decisions and research "predominance" (2.7); draft and circulate email to litigation team regarding predominance (1.5);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3153	Khanna, Abha	9/1/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Email with legal team regarding legal theory of predominance (0.2);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3154	Louijeune, Ruthzee	9/1/2017	0.30	\$550.00	\$165.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$126.00	\$96.00	\$30.00	Prepare and review trial subpoenas (0.2); send past subpoenas to counsel (0.1);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3155	Elias, Marc E.	9/2/2017	0.30	\$1,050.00	\$315.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$202.50	\$172.50	\$30.00	Review predominance test (.2); email regarding same (.1);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3156	Khanna, Abha	9/2/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Email with legal team regarding upcoming exhibit, discovery, and witness deadlines;	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3157	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/3/2017	1.00	\$755.00	\$755.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$100.00	Review transcript from Page litigation and first trial of Bethune (1.0);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3158	Spear, Ryan M.	9/3/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Emails with A. Branch regarding discovery designations;	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3159	Branch, Aria C.	9/4/2017	2.00	\$650.00	\$1,300.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$820.00	\$690.00	\$130.00	Review potential exhibits for exhibit list;	Trial Preparation - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3160	Branch, Aria C.	9/5/2017	4.60	\$650.00	\$2,990.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$1,886.00	\$1,587.00	\$299.00	Send deposition designations to R. Spear (2.4); review Jones and Morgan deposition transcripts (1.5); draft exhibit list (.7);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3161	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/5/2017	0.40	\$755.00	\$302.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$270.00	\$230.00	\$40.00	Exchange email regarding exhibit and witness lists (.4);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3162	Spear, Ryan M.	9/5/2017	2.30	\$620.00	\$1,426.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,173.00	\$943.00	\$230.00	Emails with A. Branch regarding discovery designations (.6); prepare outline for C. Jones cross-examination (1.5); emails with A. Branch regarding prior trial testimony (.2);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3163	Branch, Aria C.	9/6/2017	4.20	\$650.00	\$2,730.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$1,722.00	\$1,449.00	\$273.00	Draft exhibit and witness lists (4.2);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3164	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/6/2017	5.30	\$755.00	\$4,001.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$3,577.50	\$3,047.50	\$530.00	Review delegate deposition transcripts (3.5); review and respond to email regarding witness and exhibit lists (.9); review Rodden report and potential trial exhibits (.9);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3165	Louijeune, Ruthzee	9/6/2017	2.00	\$550.00	\$1,100.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$840.00	\$640.00	\$200.00	Conduct research regarding primary elections in challenged districts (1.7); draft e-mail of findings (0.3);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3166	Spear, Ryan M.	9/6/2017	0.40	\$620.00	\$248.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$204.00	\$164.00	\$40.00	Review and revise exhibit list and witness list (.4);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3167	Branch, Aria C.	9/7/2017	2.80	\$650.00	\$1,820.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$1,148.00	\$966.00	\$182.00	Send deposition designations to R. Spear (.8); review Jones and Morgan deposition transcripts (.8); draft exhibit and witness lists (1.2);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3168	Louijeune, Ruthzee	9/7/2017	2.00	\$550.00	\$1,100.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$840.00	\$640.00	\$200.00	Review public hearing transcripts to determine comments made of relevance (1.7); Draft e-mail with findings (0.3);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3169	Spear, Ryan M.	9/7/2017	2.40	\$620.00	\$1,488.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,224.00	\$984.00	\$240.00	Emails with A. Branch regarding witness and exhibit lists (.2); review and revise same (1.0); prepare discovery designations (1.0); emails with B. Stafford regarding discovery designations (.2);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3170	Stafford, William B.	9/7/2017	3.00	\$595.00	\$1,785.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,515.00	\$1,215.00	\$300.00	Meet with K. Hamilton and A. Branch regarding plaintiffs' exhibit list and prepare same;	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3171	Branch, Aria C.	9/8/2017	7.10	\$650.00	\$4,615.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$2,911.00	\$2,449.50	\$461.50	Draft exhibit and witness lists and file (1.5); draft district by district order of proof (5.0); review trial transcript (.6);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3172	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/8/2017	5.30	\$755.00	\$4,001.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$3,577.50	\$3,047.50	\$530.00	Review and finalize draft exhibit and witness lists (2.9); conference with R. Spear regarding proposed deposition designations (.9); draft and circulate proposed trial witness allocation and exchange related email (1.5);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3173	Khanna, Abha	9/8/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Telephone conferences with B. Stafford regarding exhibit list and strategy meetings (0.2);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3174	Spear, Ryan M.	9/8/2017	2.20	\$620.00	\$1,364.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,122.00	\$902.00	\$220.00	Emails with K. McKnight regarding discovery designations (.4); finalize and serve plaintiffs' discovery designations (1.3); review Intervenor's discovery designations (.4); emails with litigation team regarding witness allocation and trial (.1);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3175	Stafford, William B.	9/8/2017	4.00	\$595.00	\$2,380.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$2,020.00	\$1,620.00	\$400.00	Prepare witness and exhibit list and conference with A. Branch and K. Hamilton regarding finalization of same;	Trial Preparation - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3176	Branch, Aria C.	9/9/2017	3.90	\$650.00	\$2,535.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$1,599.00	\$1,345.50	\$253.50	Review trial transcript; add to Jones cross outline;	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3177	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/9/2017	3.00	\$755.00	\$2,265.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$2,025.00	\$1,725.00	\$300.00	Review trial transcript from first trial (2.5); review Hofeller report (.5);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3178	Spear, Ryan M.	9/9/2017	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$255.00	\$205.00	\$50.00	Emails with litigation team regarding trial testimony and strategy (.3); emails with R. Louijeune regarding service of trial subpoenas (.2);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3179	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/10/2017	2.50	\$755.00	\$1,887.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,687.50	\$1,437.50	\$250.00	Review trial transcript from first trial (2.5);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3180	Spear, Ryan M.	9/11/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Emails with litigation team regarding trial strategy (.1);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3181	Marino, Patricia	9/12/2017	10.80	\$285.00	\$3,078.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$2,484.00	\$2,052.00	\$432.00	Respond to attorney requests regarding trial preparation/logistics (.3); telephone conference with court clerk regarding same and related follow-up with litigation team (.9); process deposition transcript materials for attorneys' review (2.1); update litigation file (.6); compile/organize trial prep/background materials (5.2); process supplemental plaintiff expert materials for attorneys review (1.4); communications with ESS team regarding database updates and related follow-up (.3);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3182	Stafford, William B.	9/12/2017	0.30	\$595.00	\$178.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$151.50	\$121.50	\$30.00	Exchange correspondence regarding preparation of trial exhibits;	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3183	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/13/2017	1.30	\$755.00	\$981.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$877.50	\$747.50	\$130.00	Follow up re: potential trial exhibits (.4); exchange email with litigation team regarding trial preparation (.9);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3184	Marino, Patricia	9/13/2017	7.20	\$285.00	\$2,052.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$1,656.00	\$1,368.00	\$288.00	Respond to attorney requests regarding preparation of additional Plaintiff trial exhibits (.8); prepare customized set of selected maps from plaintiffs' expert reports per attorney instruction (4.5); revise/update master trial exhibit tracking index (1.2); telephone conference with Richmond Virginia vendor regarding potential support/demonstratives/logistics (.7);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3185	Spear, Ryan M.	9/13/2017	1.00	\$620.00	\$620.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$100.00	Emails with discovery team regarding discovery designations (.2); research issues regarding same (.4); emails with discovery team regarding demonstrative exhibits (.2); emails with litigation team regarding witness allocation (.2);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3186	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/14/2017	0.60	\$755.00	\$453.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$405.00	\$345.00	\$60.00	Review exhibit lists and exchange related email (.6);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3187	Marino, Patricia	9/14/2017	5.90	\$285.00	\$1,681.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$1,357.00	\$1,121.00	\$236.00	Respond to attorney requests regarding trial preparation and related follow-up/logistics (1.1); compile/organize attorney witness/exhibit/background material (4.5); revise/update indices (.3);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3188	Spear, Ryan M.	9/14/2017	2.20	\$620.00	\$1,364.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,122.00	\$902.00	\$220.00	Emails with A. Khanna regarding discovery designations and exhibits (.2); review Intervenor's initial discovery designations (.4); emails with litigation team regarding same (.1); review Intervenor's exhibit list (.5); emails with litigation team regarding same (.1); review Intervenor's witness list (.3); review Defendants' exhibit list (.2); review Defendants' witness list (.2); emails with K. McKnight regarding discovery designations (.2);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3189	Stafford, William B.	9/14/2017	2.50	\$595.00	\$1,487.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,262.50	\$1,012.50	\$250.00	Review intervenor's exhibit list and prepare analysis of same, including commencing work on potential objections to exhibit list;	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3190	Branch, Aria C.	9/15/2017	2.00	\$650.00	\$1,300.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$820.00	\$690.00	\$130.00	Attend team call (1.5); review deposition transcripts (.5);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3191	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/15/2017	3.30	\$755.00	\$2,491.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$2,227.50	\$1,897.50	\$330.00	Prepare for and attend litigation team meeting (1.5); follow up review of email regarding witness and exhibit lists and potential motions in limine (1.2); review logistics for trial and exchange email with local counsel regarding same (.6);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3192	Khanna, Abha	9/15/2017	5.50	\$620.00	\$3,410.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$2,805.00	\$2,255.00	\$550.00	Confer with K. Hamilton regarding Rodden deposition and trial prep (0.5); lead team meeting regarding trial prep (1.0); review and mark for designation expert-related exhibits (0.3); confer with B. Stafford regarding same and exhibit designations (0.2); review exhibit objections prepared by B. Stafford (0.1); review 2015 trial transcript (3.4);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3193	Marino, Patricia	9/15/2017	3.90	\$285.00	\$1,111.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$897.00	\$741.00	\$156.00	Respond to attorney requests regarding trial preparations (2.1); telephone conference with B. Stafford regarding trial preparation action items and related follow-up (.5); finalize plaintiffs' supplemental trial exhibits and coordinate file transfer to opposing counsel (1.3);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3194	Spear, Ryan M.	9/15/2017	0.60	\$620.00	\$372.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$306.00	\$246.00	\$60.00	Conference with litigation team regarding exhibits and witnesses (.6);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3195	Stafford, William B.	9/15/2017	1.60	\$595.00	\$952.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$808.00	\$648.00	\$160.00	Prepare analyses and exchange correspondence with opposing counsel and litigation team regarding obtaining copies of intervenor exhibits, exhibits to which plaintiffs previously objected and status of admission of such exhibits, and related matters (1.6);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3196	Marino, Patricia	9/16/2017	6.75	\$285.00	\$1,923.75	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$1,552.50	\$1,282.50	\$270.00	Compile/organize deposition/trial preparation witness materials in response to attorney A. Khanna requests;	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3197	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/17/2017	1.30	\$755.00	\$981.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$877.50	\$747.50	\$130.00	Exchange email regarding paralegal support (.9); review and respond to email regarding objections to exhibits (.4);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3198	Khanna, Abha	9/17/2017	1.80	\$620.00	\$1,116.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$918.00	\$738.00	\$180.00	Review trial transcript from 2015 (1.7); email with legal team regarding paralegal support and exhibit objections (0.1);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3199	Louijeune, Ruthzee	9/17/2017	7.10	\$550.00	\$3,905.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$2,982.00	\$2,272.00	\$710.00	Conduct research regarding historical Section 2 VRA cases (3.2); research cases (1.3); provide summaries for each case (2.6);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3200	Marino, Patricia	9/17/2017	5.50	\$285.00	\$1,567.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$1,265.00	\$1,045.00	\$220.00	Process supplemental Defendant-Intervenors trial exhibits for attorneys' review (3.4); update/organize trial preparation/background materials (1.0); assemble trial witness materials in response to attorney requests (1.0); revise/update indices (.1);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3201	Stafford, William B.	9/17/2017	0.40	\$595.00	\$238.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$202.00	\$162.00	\$40.00	Review intervenors' supplemental trial exhibits and provide analysis of same (.4);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3202	Branch, Aria C.	9/18/2017	1.20	\$650.00	\$780.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$492.00	\$414.00	\$78.00	File documents in case (.8); send emails scheduling witness prep meetings (.4);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3203	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/18/2017	1.60	\$755.00	\$1,208.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,080.00	\$920.00	\$160.00	Organize deposition exhibits and related logistics (.9); exchange email regarding trial coordination and strategy (.7);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3204	Khanna, Abha	9/18/2017	5.00	\$620.00	\$3,100.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$2,550.00	\$2,050.00	\$500.00	Email with legal team regarding trial logistics (0.1); review trial transcript (4.1); review and revise draft objections to intervenors' exhibits (0.8);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3205	Marino, Patricia	9/18/2017	10.30	\$285.00	\$2,935.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$2,369.00	\$1,957.00	\$412.00	Telephone conference with R. Ravelo regarding trial preparation/action items and related follow-up (.5); compile/organize/update trial resource/background materials (5.5); respond to attorney requests regarding filing of objections to Defendant-Intervenors trial exhibits (.9); communications with hotel regarding trial team logistics/contract (.4); process/organize supplemental plaintiffs' trial exhibits and deposition transcript materials for attorneys' review (3.1); update litigation file and indices (.1); compile/organize materials to be loaded into trial director (.8);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3206	Spear, Ryan M.	9/18/2017	6.80	\$620.00	\$4,216.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$3,468.00	\$2,788.00	\$680.00	Emails with litigation team regarding discovery designations (.3); conference with K. McKnight regarding same (.5); emails with K. McKnight regarding exhibits (.3); emails with R. Raile regarding Intervenor's discovery designations (.4); emails with litigation team regarding supplemental expert exhibits (.3); prepare objections to Intervenor's exhibits, including research issues regarding same (3.6); prepare objections to discovery designations (1.1); coordinate filing of objections to discovery designations (.2); emails with litigation team regarding trial strategy (.1);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3207	Stafford, William B.	9/18/2017	3.50	\$595.00	\$2,082.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,767.50	\$1,417.50	\$350.00	Prepare supplemental exhibit list (2.1); prepare objections to discovery designations (1.4);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3208	Khanna, Abha	9/19/2017	4.40	\$620.00	\$2,728.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$2,244.00	\$1,804.00	\$440.00	Telephone conference with M. Palmer regarding trial prep (0.3); email and confer with R. Spear and B. Stafford regarding objections to DI Exhibits 106-111 (0.3); email and confer with legal team regarding DI objections to Rodden reports (0.5); review J. Katz deposition transcript in preparation for trial (3.3);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3209	Marino, Patricia	9/19/2017	5.80	\$285.00	\$1,653.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$1,334.00	\$1,102.00	\$232.00	Respond to attorney requests for information/documents (.4); further coordination/communications with hotel/vendors regarding trial logistics and related follow-up (.8); compile/organize trial preparation materials (4.3); revise/update indices (.3)	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3210	Spear, Ryan M.	9/19/2017	0.70	\$620.00	\$434.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$357.00	\$287.00	\$70.00	Conference with B. Stafford and A. Khanna regarding objections to late-filed exhibits (.5); emails with B. Stafford and A. Khanna regarding same; (.2)	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3211	Stafford, William B.	9/19/2017	2.50	\$595.00	\$1,487.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,262.50	\$1,012.50	\$250.00	Review new exhibits (1.8), draft correspondence and meet with R. Spear and A. Khanna regarding same (.7);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3212	Branch, Aria C.	9/20/2017	5.00	\$650.00	\$3,250.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$2,050.00	\$1,725.00	\$325.00	Send emails regarding witness allocation (.2); review Vesilind redistricting decision and send summary to team (3.8); call with W. Durette regarding exhibits introduced in Vesilind (1.0);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3213	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/20/2017	5.90	\$755.00	\$4,454.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$3,982.50	\$3,392.50	\$590.00	Review and exchange email regarding witness allocation and timing (2.0); review Katz deposition transcript (1.5); exchange email with A. Branch regarding Jones cross examination outline (.5); review materials for trial examination (.9); exchange email with J. Rodden and C. Knowlden regarding trial illustrative exhibits (1.0);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3214	Khanna, Abha	9/20/2017	3.00	\$620.00	\$1,860.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,530.00	\$1,230.00	\$300.00	Participate in legal team meeting regarding Loewen deposition, upcoming deadlines, and trial strategy (1.1); email with legal team regarding details and applicability of Vesilind case (0.2); review and annotate J. Katz deposition transcript in preparation for trial (1.5); email with legal team regarding witness allocation; email with experts regarding trial logistics (0.2);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3215	Marino, Patricia	9/20/2017	4.50	\$285.00	\$1,282.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$1,035.00	\$855.00	\$180.00	Compile/organize materials to be loaded into trial director (1.2); conference with H. Schultz regarding trial director software, courtroom equipment/logistics and related follow-up (.3); process supplemental deposition transcript materials for attorneys' review (1.5); revise/update indices and litigation file (.2); respond to attorney requests for information/documents (1.3);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3216	Spear, Ryan M.	9/20/2017	1.40	\$620.00	\$868.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$714.00	\$574.00	\$140.00	Emails with K. McKnight regarding extension regarding plaintiffs' objections to intervenors' exhibits (.3); review intervenors' notice regarding exhibit objections (.4); prepare witness allocation tables (.5); emails with litigation team regarding Vesilind decision (.2);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3217	Branch, Aria C.	9/21/2017	1.80	\$650.00	\$1,170.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$738.00	\$621.00	\$117.00	Review deposition outlines (1.4); send scheduling emails for witness prep sessions (.4);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3218	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/21/2017	1.50	\$755.00	\$1,132.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,012.50	\$862.50	\$150.00	Review and respond to email with opposing counsel regarding various open issues (1.5);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3219	Khanna, Abha	9/21/2017	0.60	\$620.00	\$372.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$306.00	\$246.00	\$60.00	Email and confer with legal team regarding meet and confer with opposing counsel and next steps (0.3); review and revise draft exhibit objections (0.3);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3220	Louijeune, Ruthzee	9/21/2017	1.70	\$550.00	\$935.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$714.00	\$544.00	\$170.00	Discuss House of Delegate elections with counsel A. Branch and send research (0.3); Call with counsel to discuss outstanding tasks (0.5); call with counsel regarding Wilkins v. West (0.4); Call courthouse to determine availability of case docket in Wilkins v. West (0.2); Conduct research to determine whether docket in Wilkins v. West publicly available regarding expert Loewen's report (0.8);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3221	Marino, Patricia	9/21/2017	9.10	\$285.00	\$2,593.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$2,093.00	\$1,729.00	\$364.00	Respond to attorney requests for information/documents (5.4); compile/organize background materials for plaintiffs' expert review/trial witness preparation (1.2); coordinate file transfer regarding same (.2); telephone conference with P. Silk and K. Colon regarding trial preparation/logistics and related follow-up (.5); conference with K. Hamilton, B. Stafford, A. Khanna, R. Spear and A. Branch regarding trial preparation/action items and related follow-up; compile/organize/update trial materials (1.8);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3222	Spear, Ryan M.	9/21/2017	2.50	\$620.00	\$1,550.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,275.00	\$1,025.00	\$250.00	Conference with opposing counsel regarding objections to discovery designations and objections to exhibits (.4); conference with B. Stafford regarding same (.1); emails with litigation team regarding same (.1); prepare further objections to intervenors' trial exhibits (1.0); research issues regarding same (.3); emails with litigation team regarding same (.1); prepare estimated witness times (.4); emails regarding trial subpoenas (.1);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3223	Stafford, William B.	9/21/2017	0.40	\$595.00	\$238.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$202.00	\$162.00	\$40.00	Participate in meet and confer conference with opposing counsel regarding exhibit objections and discovery designations (.4);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3224	Branch, Aria C.	9/22/2017	10.10	\$650.00	\$6,565.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$4,141.00	\$3,484.50	\$656.50	Call regarding witness allocation (0.50); review deposition transcripts (5.00); draft cross examination outline (3.00); attend team conference call (1.10);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3225	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/22/2017	5.00	\$755.00	\$3,775.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$3,375.00	\$2,875.00	\$500.00	Conference with A. Branch and A. Khanna regarding witness outlines and allocation (1.0); compile materials for preparation of witness outlines for direct and cross examination (2.5); prepare for and telephone conference with J. Rodden regarding intervenors proposed exhibits/maps (1.5);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3226	Khanna, Abha	9/22/2017	0.70	\$620.00	\$434.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$357.00	\$287.00	\$70.00	Confer with K. Hamilton and A. Branch regarding witness allocation and trial prep (0.5); confer with K. Hamilton regarding demonstrative exhibits (0.2);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3227	Louijeune, Ruthzee	9/22/2017	1.00	\$550.00	\$550.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$100.00	Confer with counsel regarding house of delegate elections (0.2); conference regarding Wilkins v. West (0.3); conduct research on admissibility of expert reports (0.5);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3228	Marino, Patricia	9/22/2017	5.60	\$285.00	\$1,596.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$1,288.00	\$1,064.00	\$224.00	Compile/organize trial preparation/background materials (2.1); respond to attorney requests for information/documents (2.0); further coordination regarding trial logistics and related follow-up (.3); revise/update indices (.2); communications with ESS regarding LiveNote witness name searches (.3); coordinate/updates to database (.2);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3229	Spear, Ryan M.	9/22/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Emails with litigation team regarding objections to exhibits (.1);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3230	Branch, Aria C.	9/23/2017	7.00	\$650.00	\$4,550.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$2,870.00	\$2,415.00	\$455.00	Draft witness examination outlines (7.0);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3231	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/23/2017	1.50	\$755.00	\$1,132.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,012.50	\$862.50	\$150.00	Exchange email regarding trial logistics and related issues (1.5);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3232	Marino, Patricia	9/23/2017	5.30	\$285.00	\$1,510.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$1,219.00	\$1,007.00	\$212.00	Compile/organize expert report notebooks for judges' review in advance of trial (3.2); update trial exhibit per attorney instruction (.6); assemble/organize trial preparation materials (1.2); communication with ESS regarding trial equipment/logistics follow-up issues (.3);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3233	Branch, Aria C.	9/24/2017	2.80	\$650.00	\$1,820.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$1,148.00	\$966.00	\$182.00	Draft witness examination outlines (2.8);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3234	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/24/2017	0.80	\$755.00	\$604.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$540.00	\$460.00	\$80.00	Review email from R. Louijeune regarding Wilkins v. West litigation (.8);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3235	Louijeune, Ruthzee	9/24/2017	3.50	\$550.00	\$1,925.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$1,470.00	\$1,120.00	\$350.00	Conduct additional research on publicly available information on West. v. Wilkins (1.5); Summarize expert testimony and findings in case at trial level, briefing stage, and before the Supreme Court (2.0);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3236	Marino, Patricia	9/24/2017	9.50	\$285.00	\$2,707.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$2,185.00	\$1,805.00	\$380.00	Compile/organize attorney trial exhibit/preparation material and update trial director resources (5.5); revise/update master exhibit index (2.3); compile/organize judges' sets of plaintiffs' expert reports (.9); further coordination regarding logistics/equipment (.7);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3237	Branch, Aria C.	9/25/2017	6.30	\$650.00	\$4,095.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$2,583.00	\$2,173.50	\$409.50	Draft witness examination outlines (6.3);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3238	Louijeune, Ruthzee	9/25/2017	3.50	\$550.00	\$1,925.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$1,470.00	\$1,120.00	\$350.00	Draft example chart for district to show movement and split of counties and precincts with columns describing what each individual has said about the district (3.5);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3239	Marino, Patricia	9/25/2017	8.90	\$285.00	\$2,536.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$2,047.00	\$1,691.00	\$356.00	Process deposition transcript materials for attorneys' review (1.5); follow-up communication with court reporter (.5); revise/update indices and litigation file (.8); follow-up communications with ESS regarding LiveNote witness name searches (.7); finalize judges' working set of plaintiffs' expert reports (.6); compile attorney trial exhibit notebooks (2.6); organize/update trial director files (2.2);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3240	Spear, Ryan M.	9/25/2017	2.80	\$620.00	\$1,736.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,428.00	\$1,148.00	\$280.00	Prepare objections to Intervenor's discovery designations (1.0); research issues regarding same (.5); emails with litigation team regarding same (.1); review, revise, and coordinate filing of same (.5); emails with litigation team regarding stipulation regarding witnesses (.2); emails with T. Marino regarding trial preparation (.2); review Intervenor's objections to discovery designations (.3);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3241	Stafford, William B.	9/25/2017	1.60	\$595.00	\$952.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$808.00	\$648.00	\$160.00	Prepare stipulation on witnesses (1.0); prepare Loewen designations (.6);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3242	Branch, Aria C.	9/26/2017	3.10	\$650.00	\$2,015.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$1,271.00	\$1,069.50	\$201.50	Draft witness examination outlines (2.5); review deposition transcripts (.6);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3243	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/26/2017	5.80	\$755.00	\$4,379.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$3,915.00	\$3,335.00	\$580.00	Review Rodden-related materials and outline direct examination (5.8);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3244	Khanna, Abha	9/26/2017	3.30	\$620.00	\$2,046.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,683.00	\$1,353.00	\$330.00	Telephone conference with M. Palmer regarding trial prep (1.0); review M. Palmer deposition transcript (2.0); review Loewen designations (0.3);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3245	Louijeune, Ruthzee	9/26/2017	2.00	\$550.00	\$1,100.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$840.00	\$640.00	\$200.00	Call delegates regarding ability to accept service of subpoenas on their behalf (0.3); confer with counsel regarding trial preparation for fact witnesses (0.3); Draft chart for trial preparation regarding motivations for county and VTD splits (1.0); Finalize example chart for district 63 to show movement and split of counties and precincts with columns describing what each individual (district court, Rodden, Jones, Dance) has said about the changes in the district (0.4);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3246	Marino, Patricia	9/26/2017	8.80	\$285.00	\$2,508.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$2,024.00	\$1,672.00	\$352.00	Respond to attorney requests for information/documents; compile/organize trial preparation material; follow-up communications/coordination regarding trial logistics; process deposition transcript material for attorney review; revise/update indices and litigation file; update trial director; compile supplemental background trial materials for attorneys and expert review;	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3247	Spear, Ryan M.	9/26/2017	1.00	\$620.00	\$620.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$100.00	Emails with opposing counsel regarding trial subpoenas (.3); emails with litigation team regarding same (.2); prepare designations of J. Loewen deposition (.4); emails with opposing counsel regarding same (.1);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3248	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/27/2017	6.10	\$755.00	\$4,605.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$4,117.50	\$3,507.50	\$610.00	Draft and revise outline for J. Rodden direct examination (5.5); review maps and potential trial demonstrative exhibits (.6);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3249	Khanna, Abha	9/27/2017	5.70	\$620.00	\$3,534.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$2,907.00	\$2,337.00	\$570.00	Prepare M. Palmer direct examination (4.7); telephone conference with K. Hamilton and B. Stafford regarding trial prep (0.7); draft and circulate witness time estimate filing (0.3);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3250	Louijeune, Ruthzee	9/27/2017	1.10	\$550.00	\$605.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$462.00	\$352.00	\$110.00	Finalize draft example chart for district 63 to show movement and split of counties and precincts with columns describing what each individual (district court, Rodden, Jones, Dance) has said about the district (1.1);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3251	Marino, Patricia	9/27/2017	8.30	\$285.00	\$2,365.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$1,909.00	\$1,577.00	\$332.00	Respond to attorney requests for information/documents and follow-up logistics regarding delivery of judges' sets of plaintiffs' expert reports (.8); compile/organize attorney pretrial conference hearing/background materials (3.4); process deposition transcript material for attorneys' review (1.0); revise/update indices and litigation file (.3); update trial director (1.0); compile supplemental background trial preparation materials for experts' review/witness preparation (1.8);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3252	Spear, Ryan M.	9/27/2017	2.90	\$620.00	\$1,798.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,479.00	\$1,189.00	\$290.00	Emails with litigation team regarding exhibits (.2); emails with litigation team regarding expert stipulations (.2); prepare response to intervenors' objections to plaintiffs' discovery designations (.9); research issues regarding same (.3); emails with litigation team regarding same (.1); review, revise, and coordinate filing of same (.6); review intervenors' response to plaintiffs' objections to intervenors' discovery designations (.5); emails with litigation team regarding same (.1);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3253	Branch, Aria C.	9/28/2017	2.60	\$650.00	\$1,690.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$1,066.00	\$897.00	\$169.00	Prepare for and attend witness prep call with witness (2.6);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3254	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/28/2017	6.10	\$755.00	\$4,605.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$4,117.50	\$3,507.50	\$610.00	Draft outline for J. Rodden direct examination (4.1); review Defendant-Intervenors' trial brief (2.0);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3255	Khanna, Abha	9/28/2017	6.00	\$620.00	\$3,720.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$3,060.00	\$2,460.00	\$600.00	Prepare M. Palmer direct examination (4.2); telephone conference with M. Palmer regarding same (0.2); telephone conferences with K. Hamilton regarding pretrial conference and trial preparation (0.4); email and confer with legal team regarding exhibits, witness notebooks, trial prep, and prep for pretrial conference (0.5); review notes from J. Rodden (0.4); email with opposing counsel regarding witness estimates and finalize for filing (0.3);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3256	Marino, Patricia	9/28/2017	6.50	\$285.00	\$1,852.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$1,495.00	\$1,235.00	\$260.00	Respond to attorney requests regarding trial preparation materials/logistics and related follow-up (1.3); conference with B. Stafford regarding action items and attorney trial resources (1.0); compile/organize exhibit/witness materials per attorney instruction (3.2); further coordinate with ESS regarding courtroom/war room equipment (.3); update trial director materials (.5); revise/update indices (.2);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3257	Spear, Ryan M.	9/28/2017	1.10	\$620.00	\$682.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$561.00	\$451.00	\$110.00	Emails with litigation team regarding exhibits (.1); prepare counterdesignations for J. Loewen (.6); emails with opposing counsel regarding same (.2); review Intervenors' counterdesignations for J. Loewen (.1); emails with litigation team regarding expert testimony (.1);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3258	Stafford, William B.	9/28/2017	3.70	\$595.00	\$2,201.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,868.50	\$1,498.50	\$370.00	Review exhibits to create witness notebook excerpts (1.5); prepare spreadsheet analysis of pending status of trial exhibits and related objections (1.2); conference with T. Marino regarding various trial support items and issues (1.0);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3259	Branch, Aria C.	9/29/2017	3.30	\$650.00	\$2,145.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$1,353.00	\$1,138.50	\$214.50	Draft witness examination outlines (3.1); call J. Allen's chambers regarding expert reports (.2);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3260	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/29/2017	9.90	\$755.00	\$7,474.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$6,682.50	\$5,692.50	\$990.00	Prepare for and telephone conference with T. Marino regarding trial logistics and related issues (1.0); prepare for and telephone conference with J. Rodden regarding trial preparation (2.7); review J. Morgan deposition transcript (3.2); review and respond to email regarding trial preparation, witness sequencing and related issues (1.7); telephone conference with R. Spear regarding deposition designations and related briefing (.5); exchange email with R. Spear regarding discussions with opposing counsel regarding "deal" to avoid dispute (.8);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3261	Khanna, Abha	9/29/2017	4.60	\$620.00	\$2,852.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$2,346.00	\$1,886.00	\$460.00	Telephone conferences with M. Palmer regarding trial prep (1.4); draft, review and revise M. Palmer direct examination (2.9); prepare one-page summary of population equality as part of predominance analysis and circulate same to legal team (0.3);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3262	Louijeune, Ruthzee	9/29/2017	0.60	\$550.00	\$330.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$252.00	\$192.00	\$60.00	Confer with counsel A. Branch on direct examination outlines (0.4); call with delegate to finalize time for call with counsel and presence at trial (0.2);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3263	Marino, Patricia	9/29/2017	8.60	\$285.00	\$2,451.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$1,978.00	\$1,634.00	\$344.00	Telephone conference with K. Hamilton regarding pretrial conference/ trial preparation action items; follow-up conference with B. Stafford regarding same; communication with court regarding logistics and electronic authorization request forms; further update trial director; conference with ESS/J. DeGuzman regarding trial equipment/software issues and related follow-up; compile/organize attorney trial/witness materials;	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3264	Spear, Ryan M.	9/29/2017	1.10	\$620.00	\$682.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$561.00	\$451.00	\$110.00	Review revised witness list (.2); emails regarding discovery designations for first trial (.3); review documents regarding same (.2); conference with K. McKnight regarding same (.2); emails regarding exhibits (.1); emails with K. McKnight regarding logistical issues for trial (.1);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3265	Branch, Aria C.	9/30/2017	2.00	\$650.00	\$1,300.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$820.00	\$690.00	\$130.00	Draft witness examination outlines (1.0); review deposition transcripts (1.0);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3266	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/30/2017	9.30	\$755.00	\$7,021.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$6,277.50	\$5,347.50	\$930.00	Prepare cross examination outline for J. Morgan (7.2); review and exchange email regarding Intervenor's supplemental map exhibits (1.2); review and respond to email exchanges regarding proposed "deal" on withdrawing objections to various deposition designations (.9);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3267	Spear, Ryan M.	9/30/2017	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$459.00	\$369.00	\$90.00	Emails with litigation team regarding strategy regarding undisclosed maps (.5); emails with litigation team regarding strategy regarding witnesses (.2); emails with K. McKnight regarding discovery designations (.1); emails with litigation team regarding same (.1);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3268	Branch, Aria C.	10/1/2017	5.90	\$650.00	\$3,835.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$2,419.00	\$2,035.50	\$383.50	Draft witness examination outlines and engage in related trial preparation;	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3269	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/1/2017	6.20	\$755.00	\$4,681.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$4,185.00	\$3,565.00	\$620.00	Review and revise draft Morgan cross examination outline (1.9); review materials regarding Hofeller cross examination (2.1); review and respond to email regarding deposition designations and related dispute (2.2);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3270	Khanna, Abha	10/1/2017	2.60	\$620.00	\$1,612.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,326.00	\$1,066.00	\$260.00	Review materials in preparation for M. James and D. McQuinn direct examinations;	Trial Preparation - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3271	Marino, Patricia	10/1/2017	10.00	\$285.00	\$2,850.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$2,300.00	\$1,900.00	\$400.00	Compile/organize trial preparation materials and judge's working sets of plaintiffs' trial exhibits (6.5); revise/update master trial exhibit index per attorney instruction (.5); assemble trial witness preparation materials (3.0);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3272	Branch, Aria C.	10/2/2017	4.50	\$650.00	\$2,925.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$1,845.00	\$1,552.50	\$292.50	Draft witness examination outlines and engage in related trial preparation;	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3273	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/2/2017	7.50	\$755.00	\$5,662.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$5,062.50	\$4,312.50	\$750.00	Review Hofeller deposition and related materials (2.9); outline Hofeller cross examination (3.2); review and respond to email regarding dispute over stipulation (.9); review and respond to email regarding litigation strategy and trial logistics (.5);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3274	Khanna, Abha	10/2/2017	7.10	\$620.00	\$4,402.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$3,621.00	\$2,911.00	\$710.00	Review and revise M. Palmer direct examination and email with legal team (2.4); prepare direct examinations for D. McQuinn and M. James (3.3); email and confer with legal team regarding deposition designation stipulations (0.3); prepare notes for trial prep sessions with D. McQuinn and M. James (0.9); review and revise draft T. Hofeller cross-examination circulated by K. Hamilton (0.2);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3275	Louijeune, Ruthzee	10/2/2017	1.60	\$550.00	\$880.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$672.00	\$512.00	\$160.00	Conduct research on Dr. Thomas Hofeller (1.2); confer with counsel A. Branch about the changes that were made to House District 63;	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3276	Marino, Patricia	10/2/2017	6.30	\$285.00	\$1,795.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$1,449.00	\$1,197.00	\$252.00	Compile/organize attorneys' trial/witness preparation materials (1.5); respond to attorney requests for information/documents (5.7); further coordination regarding trial logistics (.3); telephone conference with opposing counsel paralegal regarding courtroom logistics in response to judges' requests (.4); revise/update trial director and indices (.4);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3277	Spear, Ryan M.	10/2/2017	2.90	\$620.00	\$1,798.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,479.00	\$1,189.00	\$290.00	Emails with K. McKnight regarding discovery designations (.3); emails with litigation team regarding same (.2); conference with K. McKnight regarding discovery designations (.4); prepare stipulation regarding discovery designations (1.0); prepare memorandum regarding discovery designations (.8); emails with K. Hamilton regarding same (.2);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3278	Branch, Aria C.	10/3/2017	5.50	\$650.00	\$3,575.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$2,255.00	\$1,897.50	\$357.50	Draft witness examination outlines and engage in related trial preparation;	Trial Preparation - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3279	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/3/2017	7.90	\$755.00	\$5,964.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$5,332.50	\$4,542.50	\$790.00	Finish outline of Hofeller cross examination (3.2); review draft outline of Jones cross (.9); conference with B. Stafford regarding Jones cross (.5); review and respond to various emails regarding dispute over stipulation (.5); conference with T. Marino regarding trial logistics and related issues (.9); review Jones deposition transcript (1.9)	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3280	Khanna, Abha	10/3/2017	10.00	\$620.00	\$6,200.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$5,100.00	\$4,100.00	\$1,000.00	Telephone conference with M. James regarding trial prep (0.8); confer with K. Hamilton regarding trial strategy and preparation (0.3); prepare J. Katz cross examination outline (8.9);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3281	Louijeune, Ruthzee	10/3/2017	1.50	\$550.00	\$825.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$630.00	\$480.00	\$150.00	Confer with counsel regarding Dance direct examination (0.2); Send subpoenas to counsel (0.1); Research issue on admission of evidence (1.2);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3282	Marino, Patricia	10/3/2017	9.70	\$285.00	\$2,764.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$2,231.00	\$1,843.00	\$388.00	Conference with K. Hamilton and C. Knowlden regarding trial demonstratives and related follow-up (.9); compile/organize attorneys' trial/witness materials (6.6); assemble/organize case materials/equipment to be shipped to Richmond Virginia for trial (.5); revise/update indices (.3); conference with ESS/J. DeGuzman regarding trial director updates (.4); further coordination regarding trial logistics/preparations (1.1);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3283	Spear, Ryan M.	10/3/2017	2.30	\$620.00	\$1,426.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,173.00	\$943.00	\$230.00	Emails with A. Khanna regarding request for invoices (.1); emails with K. McKnight regarding same (.2); review Intervenor's brief regarding discovery designations (.5); emails with litigation team regarding same (.1); conference with K. McKnight regarding stipulation regarding discovery designations (.2); emails with A. Branch and R. Louijene regarding research regarding trial exhibits (.2); review and revise examination outline for M. James (.9); emails with A. Khanna regarding same (.1);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3284	Stafford, William B.	10/3/2017	2.80	\$595.00	\$1,666.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,414.00	\$1,134.00	\$280.00	Review and revise C. Jones examination outline (2.4); coordinate pretrial discussion of deposition designations .4);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3285	Branch, Aria C.	10/4/2017	10.80	\$650.00	\$7,020.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$4,428.00	\$3,726.00	\$702.00	Draft witness examination outlines (6.6); witness prep calls (3.3); related trial preparation (.9);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3286	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/4/2017	7.90	\$755.00	\$5,964.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$5,332.50	\$4,542.50	\$790.00	Review and revise draft cross examination outline for C. Jones (5.5); conference with T. Marino regarding trial logistics and moving materials to Richmond (.9); review and revise draft illustrative exhibits for use during Rodden examination (1.5);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3287	Khanna, Abha	10/4/2017	6.70	\$620.00	\$4,154.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$3,417.00	\$2,747.00	\$670.00	Prepare J. Katz cross examination (4.1); confer with K. Hamilton regarding Palmer and Rodden direct examinations (0.5); confer with A. Branch regarding witness prep (0.8); telephone conference with D. McQuinn regarding trial prep (0.8); review and revise M. James direct examination (0.5);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3288	Louijeune, Ruthzee	10/4/2017	2.10	\$550.00	\$1,155.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$882.00	\$672.00	\$210.00	Research information about Data Analyst Clark Bensen (1.2); write summary of findings (0.6); research Bensen's former history as a legislator (0.2);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3289	Marino, Patricia	10/4/2017	12.80	\$285.00	\$3,648.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$2,944.00	\$2,432.00	\$512.00	Compile/organize trial/witness materials 7.4); respond to attorney requests for information/documents/demonstratives (3.8); assemble/organize case materials/ equipment to be shipped to Richmond, Virginia for trial (1.1); revise/update indices and trial director (.6); further coordination regarding trial logistics/preparations (.4);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3290	Spear, Ryan M.	10/4/2017	3.30	\$620.00	\$2,046.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,683.00	\$1,353.00	\$330.00	Emails regarding opening statement (.2); emails with litigation team regarding witness exclusion rule (.2); emails with opposing counsel regarding same (.2); review and revise witness examination outline for J. Rodden (.5); emails with litigation team regarding same (.1); review and revise witness examination outline for J. Morgan (.9); emails with litigation team regarding same (.1); review and revise witness examination outline for W. Armstrong (.4); emails with litigation team regarding same (.1); review and revise witness examination outline for M. Palmer (.5); emails with litigation team regarding same (.1);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3291	Stafford, William B.	10/4/2017	3.40	\$595.00	\$2,023.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,717.00	\$1,377.00	\$340.00	Draft C. Jones cross examination outline and opening statement;	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3292	Branch, Aria C.	10/5/2017	8.25	\$650.00	\$5,362.50	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$3,382.50	\$2,846.25	\$536.25	Trial preparation with witnesses (2.7); draft trial examination outlines (5.3); engage in trial preparation (.25);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3293	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/5/2017	10.50	\$755.00	\$7,927.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$7,087.50	\$6,037.50	\$1,050.00	Review and revise draft Jones cross outline (8.9); coordinate logistics in Richmond (.6); exchange email with team regarding order authorizing opening statements and closing argument (1.0);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3294	Khanna, Abha	10/5/2017	6.80	\$620.00	\$4,216.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$3,468.00	\$2,788.00	\$680.00	Telephone conference with M. Palmer for trial prep (3.5); review and revise outline in light of same (1.4); prepare D. McQuinn direct examination (1.9);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3295	Spear, Ryan M.	10/5/2017	2.40	\$620.00	\$1,488.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,224.00	\$984.00	\$240.00	Emails with litigation team regarding experts (.1); review court order regarding discovery designations (.1); review and revise witness examination outline for T. Hofeller (.9); emails with litigation team regarding same (.1); conference regarding witness examinations (.7); emails with litigation team regarding opening statement (.1); prepare opening statement (.4);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3296	Stafford, William B.	10/5/2017	0.70	\$595.00	\$416.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$353.50	\$283.50	\$70.00	Conference regarding strategy at upcoming trial;	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3297	Branch, Aria C.	10/6/2017	8.50	\$650.00	\$5,525.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$3,485.00	\$2,932.50	\$552.50	Attend courtroom walk-through (1.5); meet with J. McClellan and K. Hamilton (2.0); draft witness examination outlines (5.0);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3298	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/6/2017	10.50	\$755.00	\$7,927.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$7,087.50	\$6,037.50	\$1,050.00	Prepare for and participate in technology walk through in courtroom (1.5); prepare for and preparation meeting with Sen. McClellan (2.0); review and revise draft cross examination outline for C. Jones (6.0); conference with team regarding trial strategy and logistics (1.0);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3299	Khanna, Abha	10/6/2017	10.50	\$620.00	\$6,510.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$5,355.00	\$4,305.00	\$1,050.00	Review Hood deposition transcript and reports and prepare Hood cross examination (9.8); confer with trial team regarding trial strategy (0.7);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3300	Marino, Patricia	10/6/2017	13.50	\$285.00	\$3,847.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$3,105.00	\$2,565.00	\$540.00	Assemble/organize trial team working materials and court room case materials (5.9); attend court room technology walk-thru (1.5); assist with courtroom set up/logistics (.9); respond to attorney requests for information/documents regarding witness preparation/examinations and opening statement (4.6); revise/update indices and trial director (.1);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3301	Spear, Ryan M.	10/6/2017	2.60	\$620.00	\$1,612.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,326.00	\$1,066.00	\$260.00	Emails with litigation team regarding discovery designations (.3); prepare related filings (1.7); emails with K. McKnight regarding invoice production (.2); emails with litigation team regarding same (.1); conference with A. Branch regarding witness examinations (.3);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3302	Branch, Aria C.	10/7/2017	10.80	\$650.00	\$7,020.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$4,428.00	\$3,726.00	\$702.00	Prepare for trial;	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3303	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/7/2017	12.00	\$755.00	\$9,060.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$8,100.00	\$6,900.00	\$1,200.00	Trial preparation;	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3304	Khanna, Abha	10/7/2017	11.20	\$620.00	\$6,944.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$5,712.00	\$4,592.00	\$1,120.00	Prepare Hood cross-examination (7.2); review and revise Katz cross-examination (3.1); confer with trial team regarding trial strategy (0.9);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3305	Marino, Patricia	10/7/2017	12.00	\$285.00	\$3,420.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$2,760.00	\$2,280.00	\$480.00	Respond to attorney requests regarding trial/witness preparation (2.3); revise/update attorney working materials and demonstrative/illustrative materials (4.0); respond to attorney requests for information/documents (3.1); compile additional resources for courtroom (.9); review draft witness outlines (1.1); update trial director (.6);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3306	Spear, Ryan M.	10/7/2017	1.60	\$620.00	\$992.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$816.00	\$656.00	\$160.00	Emails with litigation team regarding discovery designations (.1); emails with K. McKnight regarding same (.2); review and revise examination outlines (.7); prepare opening statement (.6);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3307	Branch, Aria C.	10/8/2017	12.80	\$650.00	\$8,320.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$5,248.00	\$4,416.00	\$832.00	Prepare for trial;	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3308	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/8/2017	12.00	\$755.00	\$9,060.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$8,100.00	\$6,900.00	\$1,200.00	Trial preparation;	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3309	Khanna, Abha	10/8/2017	11.10	\$620.00	\$6,882.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$5,661.00	\$4,551.00	\$1,110.00	Trial prep with M. Palmer over telephone (1.5); review and revise draft opening statement (0.5); review and revise M. Palmer direct examination outline (3.2); review and revise J. Katz cross examination outline (5.2); confer with K. Hamilton and J. Rodden regarding trial preparation (0.7);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3310	Marino, Patricia	10/8/2017	15.00	\$285.00	\$4,275.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$3,450.00	\$2,850.00	\$600.00	Respond to attorney requests regarding trial/witness preparation (3.5); revise/update attorney working materials, demonstrative/illustrative and potential impeachment materials (5.6); compile additional courtroom resources for trial team (1.2); review draft witness outlines (1.1); update trial director (2.2); process supplemental documents produced by defendant-intervenors and communications with ESS regarding database updates (1.4);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3311	Spear, Ryan M.	10/8/2017	3.20	\$620.00	\$1,984.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,632.00	\$1,312.00	\$320.00	Emails with K. McKnight regarding discovery designations (.3); emails with litigation team regarding opening statement (.2); review and revise same (.5); prepare closing statement (.7); review and revise examination outlines (.7); conference with A. Branch regarding same (.1); prepare examination outline for C. Peace (.5); emails with A. Khanna regarding same (.1); emails with expert regarding same (.1)	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3312	Branch, Aria C.	10/9/2017	14.00	\$650.00	\$9,100.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$5,740.00	\$4,830.00	\$910.00	Draft witness examination outlines (8.5); trial preparation with witnesses (5.5);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3313	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/9/2017	12.00	\$755.00	\$9,060.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$8,100.00	\$6,900.00	\$1,200.00	Finalize last minute trial preparation (4.5); finalize cross outline of D. Jones (1.0); trial preparation with Dr. Rodden (5.0); trial preparation with M. Palmer (.5);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3314	Khanna, Abha	10/9/2017	9.00	\$620.00	\$5,580.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$4,590.00	\$3,690.00	\$900.00	Trial preparation (meet with witnesses and modify direct and cross-examination outlines) (9.0);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3315	Marino, Patricia	10/9/2017	15.80	\$285.00	\$4,503.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$3,634.00	\$3,002.00	\$632.00	Respond to attorney requests regarding trial/witness preparation (1.6); revise/update attorney working materials and demonstrative/impeachment materials (4.6); respond to attorney requests for information/documents (6.4); revise/update trial team resources (1.3); review draft witness outlines (1.5); update trial director and indices (.4);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3316	Spear, Ryan M.	10/9/2017	2.20	\$620.00	\$1,364.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,122.00	\$902.00	\$220.00	Emails with K. McKnight regarding discovery designations (.2); review, revise, and file conformed set of discovery designations (.6); prepare summary of data tables for cross examination outlines (.5); review witness examination outlines (.4); emails with A. Branch regarding same (.1); review witness examination outline for D. McQuinn (.3); emails with A. Khanna regarding same (.1);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3317	Stafford, William B.	10/10/2017	1.10	\$595.00	\$654.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$555.50	\$445.50	\$110.00	Review and revise draft deposition outline for J. Katz;	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3318	Stafford, William B.	10/12/2017	1.90	\$595.00	\$1,130.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$959.50	\$769.50	\$190.00	Review transcript for trial question regarding Morgan (.6); assist in other trial preparation (1.3);	Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3319			845.40		\$474,098.25			\$376,676.00				SUBTOTAL for Trial Preparation - Second Trial
3320	Frost, Elisabeth C.	5/1/2017	0.30	\$750.00	\$225.00	\$490.00	\$390.00	\$147.00	\$117.00	\$30.00	Telephone call with M. Elias, B. Spiva, A. Khanna, and A. Branch regarding litigation strategy;	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3321	Khanna, Abha	5/23/2017	0.80	\$620.00	\$496.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$408.00	\$328.00	\$80.00	Confer with R. Spear and B. Stafford regarding implications of Cooper opinion on Bethune-Hill next steps (0.8);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3322	Spear, Ryan M.	5/23/2017	1.20	\$620.00	\$744.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$612.00	\$492.00	\$120.00	Review Supreme Court's opinion in Cooper (.5); conference with A. Khanna and B. Stafford regarding status and strategy (.7);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3323	Stafford, William B.	5/23/2017	1.20	\$595.00	\$714.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$606.00	\$486.00	\$120.00	Prepare for and conference with A. Khanna and R. Spear regarding strategy on remand in light of Harris decision;	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3324	Khanna, Abha	5/25/2017	1.10	\$620.00	\$682.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$561.00	\$451.00	\$110.00	Confer with legal team regarding legal strategy, remedy, and preliminary injunction (0.7); confer with R. Spear regarding same (0.2); review previous draft merits brief in preparation for same (0.1); telephone conference with A. Branch regarding same (0.1);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3325	Spear, Ryan M.	5/25/2017	0.70	\$620.00	\$434.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$357.00	\$287.00	\$70.00	Conference with A. Khanna regarding status and strategy (.5); emails with A. Khanna regarding same (.2);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3326	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/31/2017	0.50	\$755.00	\$377.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$337.50	\$287.50	\$50.00	Review order from the court (.2); conference with B. Stafford regarding same (.3)	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3327	Branch, Aria C.	6/2/2017	1.00	\$650.00	\$650.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$65.00	Meeting with B. Spiva, A. Khanna, K. Hamilton, and B. Stafford regarding court order and next steps;	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3328	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/2/2017	2.00	\$755.00	\$1,510.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,350.00	\$1,150.00	\$200.00	Review order setting hearing and related dates (.9); prepare for and conference with A. Khanna, B. Spiva, and B. Stafford regarding same (1.1);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3329	Khanna, Abha	6/2/2017	2.00	\$620.00	\$1,240.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,020.00	\$820.00	\$200.00	Review court order regarding trial schedule (0.2); email and confer with legal team regarding same and next steps (1.8);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3330	Spear, Ryan M.	6/2/2017	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$459.00	\$369.00	\$90.00	Emails with litigation team regarding order setting case schedule (.2); review order setting case schedule (.2); research issues regarding same (.5);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3331	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/2/2017	1.50	\$850.00	\$1,275.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,012.50	\$862.50	\$150.00	Meet with team regarding Court's order setting trial and preparations for same;	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3332	Stafford, William B.	6/2/2017	1.00	\$595.00	\$595.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$100.00	Participate in conference call to discuss case strategy and approach (1.0); review and prepare summary of key deadlines from order for litigation team (.2);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3333	Spiva, Bruce V.	6/3/2017	0.30	\$850.00	\$255.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$202.50	\$172.50	\$30.00	Correspond with team regarding trial;	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3334	Stafford, William B.	6/5/2017	0.70	\$595.00	\$416.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$353.50	\$283.50	\$70.00	Participate in conference call with M. Elias, A. Khanna, and K. Hamilton to discuss litigation strategy;	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3335	Khanna, Abha	6/8/2017	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$459.00	\$369.00	\$90.00	Confer with K. Hamilton and B. Stafford regarding case strategy, experts, and fact witnesses (0.9);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3336	Stafford, William B.	6/8/2017	0.70	\$595.00	\$416.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$353.50	\$283.50	\$70.00	Meet with litigation team to discuss case strategy;	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3337	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/9/2017	0.60	\$755.00	\$453.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$405.00	\$345.00	\$60.00	Exchange email regarding paralegal staffing for Virginia travel (.6);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3338	Branch, Aria C.	6/20/2017	1.00	\$650.00	\$650.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$65.00	Call with R. Spear, A. Khanna, K. Hamilton, and B. Stafford regarding case (1.00);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3339	Khanna, Abha	6/20/2017	2.00	\$620.00	\$1,240.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,020.00	\$820.00	\$200.00	Prepare detailed agenda for legal team meeting (0.4); participate in strategy meeting of legal team (1.4); email with legal team regarding action items (0.2);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3340	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/26/2017	0.90	\$755.00	\$679.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$607.50	\$517.50	\$90.00	Research regarding potential paralegal support for October trial (.5); conference with team regarding staffing (.4);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3341	Stafford, William B.	6/28/2017	1.60	\$595.00	\$952.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$808.00	\$648.00	\$160.00	Prepare for and attend team strategy meeting;	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3342	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/30/2017	1.30	\$755.00	\$981.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$877.50	\$747.50	\$130.00	Prepare for and conference with A. Khanna and legal team regarding position with respect to potential deferment of trial and identification of experts (.9); review draft email to opposing counsel regarding same (.4);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3343	Khanna, Abha	7/3/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Draft agenda for weekly team meeting (0.1);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3344	Khanna, Abha	7/5/2017	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$459.00	\$369.00	\$90.00	Participate in strategy meeting with legal team (0.9);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3345	Spear, Ryan M.	7/5/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Conference with litigation team regarding status and strategy (.1);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3346	Stafford, William B.	7/5/2017	3.40	\$595.00	\$2,023.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,717.00	\$1,377.00	\$340.00	Prepare proposed findings of fact and legal conclusions no longer in dispute (2.9); meet with litigation team for weekly strategy meeting (.5);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3347	Branch, Aria C.	7/13/2017	1.00	\$650.00	\$650.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$65.00	Attend team teleconference (1.0);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3348	Spear, Ryan M.	7/13/2017	0.60	\$620.00	\$372.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$306.00	\$246.00	\$60.00	Conference with litigation team regarding status and strategy (.6);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3349	Khanna, Abha	7/20/2017	1.00	\$620.00	\$620.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$100.00	Lead weekly strategy call with legal team (0.9); prepare and circulate agenda for same (0.1);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3350	Louijeune, Ruthzee	7/26/2017	0.50	\$550.00	\$275.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$210.00	\$160.00	\$50.00	Participate in weekly call about case (0.5);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3351	Elias, Marc E.	8/2/2017	1.60	\$1,050.00	\$1,680.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,080.00	\$920.00	\$160.00	Telephone conference regarding litigation steps (1.5); review same (.1);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3352	Khanna, Abha	8/2/2017	1.30	\$620.00	\$806.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$663.00	\$533.00	\$130.00	Lead weekly strategy meeting with legal team (1.1); prepare detailed agenda for same (0.2);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3353	Spear, Ryan M.	8/10/2017	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$459.00	\$369.00	\$90.00	Conference with litigation team regarding status and strategy (.9);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3354	Khanna, Abha	8/17/2017	1.30	\$620.00	\$806.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$663.00	\$533.00	\$130.00	Lead team strategy meeting (1.2); prepare agenda for same (0.1);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3355	Stafford, William B.	8/17/2017	1.50	\$595.00	\$892.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$757.50	\$607.50	\$150.00	Prepare for and participate in meetings regarding case strategy and next steps (1.5);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3356	Khanna, Abha	8/18/2017	1.20	\$620.00	\$744.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$612.00	\$492.00	\$120.00	Lead strategy meeting with legal team (1.1); draft agenda for same (0.1);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3357	Stafford, William B.	8/18/2017	2.00	\$595.00	\$1,190.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,010.00	\$810.00	\$200.00	Attend team strategy meeting (.7); participate in follow-up conference regarding C. Jones deposition and potential motion to compel (1.3);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3358	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/25/2017	1.50	\$755.00	\$1,132.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,012.50	\$862.50	\$150.00	Prepare for and participate in litigation team strategy meeting (1.5);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3359	Khanna, Abha	8/25/2017	1.00	\$620.00	\$620.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$100.00	Lead team strategy meeting (1.0);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3360	Spear, Ryan M.	8/25/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Conference with litigation team regarding status and strategy (.2);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3361	Spear, Ryan M.	9/5/2017	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$255.00	\$205.00	\$50.00	Conference with A. Khanna and B. Stafford regarding status and strategy (.5);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3362	Spear, Ryan M.	9/8/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Conference with K. Hamilton and B. Stafford regarding status and strategy (.3);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3363	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/9/2017	0.50	\$755.00	\$377.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$337.50	\$287.50	\$50.00	Coordinate agenda for team call on Sunday (.5);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3364	Branch, Aria C.	9/10/2017	2.50	\$650.00	\$1,625.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$1,025.00	\$862.50	\$162.50	Prepare for and attend team conference call;	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3365	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/10/2017	1.50	\$755.00	\$1,132.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,012.50	\$862.50	\$150.00	Prepare for and participate in legal team call (1.5);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3366	Khanna, Abha	9/10/2017	1.40	\$620.00	\$868.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$714.00	\$574.00	\$140.00	Attend conference call with legal team regarding upcoming deadlines and trial strategy (1.4);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3367	Spear, Ryan M.	9/10/2017	1.50	\$620.00	\$930.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$765.00	\$615.00	\$150.00	Conference with litigation team regarding trial preparation; emails with litigation team regarding same;	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3368	Stafford, William B.	9/10/2017	1.70	\$595.00	\$1,011.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$858.50	\$688.50	\$170.00	Participate in conference call with litigation team regarding case strategy;	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3369	Spear, Ryan M.	9/15/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Emails with litigation team regarding status and strategy (.1);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3370	Stafford, William B.	9/15/2017	1.00	\$595.00	\$595.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$100.00	Participate in team strategy meeting (1.0);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3371	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/20/2017	1.90	\$755.00	\$1,434.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,282.50	\$1,092.50	\$190.00	Prepare for and participate in litigation team strategy and coordination call (1.9);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3372	Spear, Ryan M.	9/20/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Conference with litigation team regarding status and strategy (.3);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3373	Stafford, William B.	9/20/2017	1.00	\$595.00	\$595.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$100.00	Participate in conference call with litigation team regarding case strategy (1.0);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3374	Branch, Aria C.	9/21/2017	1.00	\$650.00	\$650.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$65.00	Attend team conference call (1.0);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3375	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/21/2017	1.90	\$755.00	\$1,434.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,282.50	\$1,092.50	\$190.00	Prepare for and participate in litigation team call regarding depositions, trial exhibits and related litigation strategy (1.9);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3376	Khanna, Abha	9/21/2017	1.80	\$620.00	\$1,116.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$918.00	\$738.00	\$180.00	Prepare for and participate in legal team meeting (1.8);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3377	Spear, Ryan M.	9/21/2017	1.80	\$620.00	\$1,116.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$918.00	\$738.00	\$180.00	Conference with litigation team regarding status and strategy (1.8);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3378	Stafford, William B.	9/21/2017	2.00	\$595.00	\$1,190.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,010.00	\$810.00	\$200.00	Participate in team strategy meeting (1.8); send correspondence related to same (.2);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3379	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/27/2017	0.50	\$755.00	\$377.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$337.50	\$287.50	\$50.00	Telephone conference with legal team regarding strategy (.5);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3380	Spear, Ryan M.	10/3/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Conference with litigation team regarding status and strategy (.3);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3381	Khanna, Abha	8/7/2018	0.30	\$665.00	\$199.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$165.00	\$123.00	\$42.00	Email with legal team regarding draft remedy map and anticipated stay ruling (0.2); review order from court regarding party names and email with legal team regarding same (0.1);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3382	Khanna, Abha	6/12/2019	0.20	\$720.00	\$144.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$118.00	\$82.00	\$36.00	Confer with legal team regarding Tuesday primary under remedial map and implications of same (0.2);	General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3383			68.30		\$45,004.00			\$36,793.50				SUBTOTAL for General Strategy Meetings - Second Trial
3384	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/12/2017	0.90	\$755.00	\$679.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$607.50	\$517.50	\$90.00	Review docket entry on denial of motion and discuss with litigation team (.9);	Case Analysis - Second Trial
3385	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/13/2017	1.50	\$755.00	\$1,132.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,012.50	\$862.50	\$150.00	Review order from the court denying motion to delay trial (1.5);	Case Analysis - Second Trial
3386	Spear, Ryan M.	7/13/2017	0.40	\$620.00	\$248.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$204.00	\$164.00	\$40.00	Review scheduling order (.1); conference with K. Hamilton regarding same; emails with litigation team regarding same (.3);	Case Analysis - Second Trial
3387			2.80		\$2,060.00			\$1,824.00				SUBTOTAL for Case Analysis - Second Trial
3388	Branch, Aria C.	10/10/2017	14.00	\$650.00	\$9,100.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$5,740.00	\$4,830.00	\$910.00	Prepare for and attend trial;	Second Trial
3389	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/10/2017	14.00	\$755.00	\$10,570.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$9,450.00	\$8,050.00	\$1,400.00	Prepare for and attend trial (10.0); prepare for next day of trial (4.0);	Second Trial
3390	Khanna, Abha	10/10/2017	15.20	\$620.00	\$9,424.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$7,752.00	\$6,232.00	\$1,520.00	Travel to and from, prepare for, and attend Trial Day 1 (10.0); prepare witnesses and examination outlines in preparation for Trial Day 2 (5.2);	Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3391	Marino, Patricia	10/10/2017	17.00	\$285.00	\$4,845.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$3,910.00	\$3,230.00	\$680.00	Prepare/organize trial materials; attend trial and assist with electronic evidence presentation; respond to attorney requests for information/documents; prepare/compile working binders of parties' deposition designations per trial judge's instruction/request; process trial transcript for attorneys' review; update litigation file and attorney working materials; review witness outlines and update trial director;	Second Trial
3392	Branch, Aria C.	10/11/2017	14.00	\$650.00	\$9,100.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$5,740.00	\$4,830.00	\$910.00	Prepare for and attend trial;	Second Trial
3393	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/11/2017	15.00	\$755.00	\$11,325.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$10,125.00	\$8,625.00	\$1,500.00	Prepare for and attend trial (10.0); prepare for next day of trial (5.0);	Second Trial
3394	Khanna, Abha	10/11/2017	14.00	\$620.00	\$8,680.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$7,140.00	\$5,740.00	\$1,400.00	Travel to and from and attend Trial Day 2 (10.5); prepare witness examinations and closing argument for Trial Day 3 (3.5);	Second Trial
3395	Marino, Patricia	10/11/2017	17.50	\$285.00	\$4,987.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$4,025.00	\$3,325.00	\$700.00	Prepare/organize trial materials (2.0); attend trial and assist with electronic evidence presentation (10.0); respond to attorney requests for information/documents (2.0); process trial transcript for attorneys' review (.7); update litigation file and attorney working materials (1.0); review witness outlines (.6); compile potential impeachment material per attorney instruction (.9); update trial director and indices (.3);	Second Trial
3396	Spear, Ryan M.	10/11/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Emails with A. Branch regarding status of trial (.1); emails with litigation team regarding same (.1);	Second Trial
3397	Branch, Aria C.	10/12/2017	15.00	\$650.00	\$9,750.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$6,150.00	\$5,175.00	\$975.00	Prepare for and attend trial;	Second Trial
3398	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/12/2017	14.00	\$755.00	\$10,570.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$9,450.00	\$8,050.00	\$1,400.00	Prepare for and attend trial (10.0); prepare for next day of trial (4.0);	Second Trial
3399	Khanna, Abha	10/12/2017	13.20	\$620.00	\$8,184.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$6,732.00	\$5,412.00	\$1,320.00	Travel to and from and attend Trial Day 3 (10.5); prepare rebuttal case for Trial Day 4 (2.7);	Second Trial
3400	Marino, Patricia	10/12/2017	16.50	\$285.00	\$4,702.50	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$3,795.00	\$3,135.00	\$660.00	Prepare/organize trial materials (1.0); attend trial and assist with electronic evidence presentation (10.0); respond to attorney requests for information/documents (1.5); process trial transcript for attorneys' review (.5); update litigation file and attorney working materials (1.0); review witness outlines (.5); compile supplemental potential impeachment material per attorney instruction (.5); respond to attorney request regarding closing argument/presentation (.5); update trial director and indices (.5); assemble/organize case materials in preparation of return shipment to Seattle (.5);	Second Trial

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3401	Spear, Ryan M.	10/12/2017	0.90	\$620.00	\$558.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$459.00	\$369.00	\$90.00	Review and revise closing statement (.9);	Second Trial
3402	Branch, Aria C.	10/13/2017	6.00	\$650.00	\$3,900.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$2,460.00	\$2,070.00	\$390.00	Prepare for and attend trial (5.0); reconcile admitted exhibits with exhibit binders (1.0);	Second Trial
3403	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/13/2017	8.50	\$755.00	\$6,417.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$5,737.50	\$4,887.50	\$850.00	Prepare for and attend trial (5.0); report to M. Elias regarding trial (1.5); break down war room and coordinate logistics (.9); exchange email with experts and legal team (1.1);	Second Trial
3404	Khanna, Abha	10/13/2017	5.70	\$620.00	\$3,534.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$2,907.00	\$2,337.00	\$570.00	Travel to and from and attend Trial Day 4 (5.0); email and confer with B. Stafford regarding post-trial brief (0.7);	Second Trial
3405			200.70		\$115,771.50			\$91,674.50				SUBTOTAL for Second Trial
3406	Spear, Ryan M.	10/11/2017	1.30	\$620.00	\$806.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$663.00	\$533.00	\$130.00	Emails with litigation team regarding post-trial briefing (.2); review trial transcript in preparation for preparing post-trial brief (.9); emails with B. Stafford regarding same (.2);	Post Second-Trial Work
3407	Stafford, William B.	10/11/2017	2.50	\$595.00	\$1,487.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,262.50	\$1,012.50	\$250.00	Review trial transcripts and research and draft post-trial brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3408	Spear, Ryan M.	10/12/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Emails with B. Stafford regarding post-trial brief (.1);	Post Second-Trial Work
3409	Khanna, Abha	10/13/2017	0.40	\$620.00	\$248.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$204.00	\$164.00	\$40.00	Transcribe notes from trial in preparation for post-trial brief (0.4);	Post Second-Trial Work
3410	Stafford, William B.	10/13/2017	2.50	\$595.00	\$1,487.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,262.50	\$1,012.50	\$250.00	Draft post-trial brief and review trial transcripts and conference with trial team in relation to same;	Post Second-Trial Work
3411	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/14/2017	10.00	\$755.00	\$7,550.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$6,750.00	\$5,750.00	\$1,000.00	Exchange email regarding trial, post-trial briefs and related issues (6.5); conference with A. Khanna regarding follow up from trial (1.5); coordinate filing of filings, witness materials, and exhibits (1.5); exchange email with T. Marino regarding logistics (.5);	Post Second-Trial Work
3412	Stafford, William B.	10/14/2017	2.50	\$595.00	\$1,487.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,262.50	\$1,012.50	\$250.00	Draft post-trial brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3413	Marino, Patricia	10/15/2017	0.40	\$285.00	\$114.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$92.00	\$76.00	\$16.00	Process trial transcript for attorneys' review (.2); update litigation file (.1); coordinate return of ESS/trial equipment (.1);	Post Second-Trial Work
3414	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/16/2017	2.50	\$755.00	\$1,887.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,687.50	\$1,437.50	\$250.00	Coordinate filing and storage of trial materials (1.5); conference with team regarding post-trial briefing (1.0);	Post Second-Trial Work
3415	Khanna, Abha	10/16/2017	3.30	\$620.00	\$2,046.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,683.00	\$1,353.00	\$330.00	Draft up notes/portions of post-trial brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3416	Marino, Patricia	10/16/2017	3.80	\$285.00	\$1,083.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$874.00	\$722.00	\$152.00	Organize return of attorney trial materials and courtroom equipment (.3); respond to attorney requests regarding trial exhibits (1.0); review/verify defendant-intervenors' proposed set of admitted exhibits, prior to opposing counsel submission to court (2.0); communications with litigation team regarding same (.5);	Post Second-Trial Work

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3417	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/17/2017	0.50	\$755.00	\$377.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$337.50	\$287.50	\$50.00	Follow up on post-trial briefing;	Post Second-Trial Work
3418	Khanna, Abha	10/17/2017	1.50	\$620.00	\$930.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$765.00	\$615.00	\$150.00	Draft portions of post-trial brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3419	Marino, Patricia	10/17/2017	0.80	\$285.00	\$228.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$184.00	\$152.00	\$32.00	Process/organize return of litigation team trial materials and equipment;	Post Second-Trial Work
3420	Spear, Ryan M.	10/17/2017	1.50	\$620.00	\$930.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$765.00	\$615.00	\$150.00	Review trial transcript in preparation for preparing post-trial brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3421	Khanna, Abha	10/18/2017	0.80	\$620.00	\$496.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$408.00	\$328.00	\$80.00	Draft post-trial brief and circulate outline of same to legal team;	Post Second-Trial Work
3422	Marino, Patricia	10/18/2017	1.20	\$285.00	\$342.00	\$230.00	\$190.00	\$276.00	\$228.00	\$48.00	Respond to attorney requests for information/documents (.8); process/organize litigation team trial materials (.4);	Post Second-Trial Work
3423	Stafford, William B.	10/18/2017	3.30	\$595.00	\$1,963.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,666.50	\$1,336.50	\$330.00	Research and draft post-trial brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3424	Stafford, William B.	10/19/2017	3.80	\$595.00	\$2,261.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,919.00	\$1,539.00	\$380.00	Research and draft post-trial brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3425	Khanna, Abha	10/20/2017	0.80	\$620.00	\$496.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$408.00	\$328.00	\$80.00	Telephone conference with B. Stafford regarding substance, organization, and allocation of post-trial brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3426	Spear, Ryan M.	10/20/2017	1.10	\$620.00	\$682.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$561.00	\$451.00	\$110.00	Review trial transcript in preparation for preparing post-trial brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3427	Stafford, William B.	10/20/2017	1.00	\$595.00	\$595.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$100.00	Research and draft post-trial brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3428	Stafford, William B.	10/21/2017	4.90	\$595.00	\$2,915.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$2,474.50	\$1,984.50	\$490.00	Draft post-trial brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3429	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/23/2017	0.50	\$755.00	\$377.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$337.50	\$287.50	\$50.00	Exchange email regarding post-trial briefing schedule and related issues;	Post Second-Trial Work
3430	Khanna, Abha	10/23/2017	1.10	\$620.00	\$682.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$561.00	\$451.00	\$110.00	Draft, review and revise post-trial brief and email with B. Stafford regarding same;	Post Second-Trial Work
3431	Louijeune, Ruthzee	10/23/2017	0.50	\$550.00	\$275.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$210.00	\$160.00	\$50.00	Conduct research on core preservation;	Post Second-Trial Work
3432	Stafford, William B.	10/23/2017	2.90	\$595.00	\$1,725.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,464.50	\$1,174.50	\$290.00	Research and draft post-trial brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3433	Khanna, Abha	10/24/2017	1.70	\$620.00	\$1,054.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$867.00	\$697.00	\$170.00	Draft, review, and revise post-trial brief (1.4); telephone conference with B. Stafford regarding same (0.3);	Post Second-Trial Work
3434	Louijeune, Ruthzee	10/24/2017	2.00	\$550.00	\$1,100.00	\$420.00	\$320.00	\$840.00	\$640.00	\$200.00	Conduct research on whether courts have stated core preservation can be motivated by racial considerations (1.5); Draft findings and send to counsel (0.5);	Post Second-Trial Work
3435	Stafford, William B.	10/24/2017	5.70	\$595.00	\$3,391.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$2,878.50	\$2,308.50	\$570.00	Research and draft post-trial brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3436	Branch, Aria C.	10/25/2017	2.20	\$650.00	\$1,430.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$902.00	\$759.00	\$143.00	Review trial transcript (.5); draft section of post-trial brief (1.7);	Post Second-Trial Work
3437	Khanna, Abha	10/25/2017	3.70	\$620.00	\$2,294.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,887.00	\$1,517.00	\$370.00	Draft, review, and revise post-trial brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3438	Spear, Ryan M.	10/25/2017	3.50	\$620.00	\$2,170.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$1,785.00	\$1,435.00	\$350.00	Review, research, and revise post-trial brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3439	Stafford, William B.	10/25/2017	2.20	\$595.00	\$1,309.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,111.00	\$891.00	\$220.00	Research and draft post-trial brief;	Post Second-Trial Work

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3440	Branch, Aria C.	10/26/2017	6.60	\$650.00	\$4,290.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$2,706.00	\$2,277.00	\$429.00	Draft post-trial brief sections;	Post Second-Trial Work
3441	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/26/2017	0.50	\$755.00	\$377.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$337.50	\$287.50	\$50.00	Exchange email regarding post-trial briefing;	Post Second-Trial Work
3442	Khanna, Abha	10/26/2017	7.30	\$620.00	\$4,526.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$3,723.00	\$2,993.00	\$730.00	Draft, review, and revise post-trial brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3443	Spear, Ryan M.	10/26/2017	4.00	\$620.00	\$2,480.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$2,040.00	\$1,640.00	\$400.00	Review, research, and revise post-trial brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3444	Stafford, William B.	10/26/2017	9.60	\$595.00	\$5,712.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$4,848.00	\$3,888.00	\$960.00	Research and draft post-trial brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3445	Khanna, Abha	10/27/2017	1.80	\$620.00	\$1,116.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$918.00	\$738.00	\$180.00	Review and revise post-trial brief (1.5); email and confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.3);	Post Second-Trial Work
3446	Spear, Ryan M.	10/27/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Emails with B. Stafford and A. Khanna regarding post-trial brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3447	Stafford, William B.	10/27/2017	3.30	\$595.00	\$1,963.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,666.50	\$1,336.50	\$330.00	Research and draft post-trial brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3448	Branch, Aria C.	10/28/2017	1.50	\$650.00	\$975.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$615.00	\$517.50	\$97.50	Review post-trial brief and send comments;	Post Second-Trial Work
3449	Stafford, William B.	10/28/2017	0.50	\$595.00	\$297.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$252.50	\$202.50	\$50.00	Revise post-trial brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3450	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/29/2017	1.90	\$755.00	\$1,434.50	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$1,282.50	\$1,092.50	\$190.00	Review and revise draft trial brief (1.5); exchange email with litigation team regarding same (.4);	Post Second-Trial Work
3451	Khanna, Abha	10/29/2017	0.50	\$620.00	\$310.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$255.00	\$205.00	\$50.00	Review and revise post-trial brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3452	Khanna, Abha	10/30/2017	5.00	\$620.00	\$3,100.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$2,550.00	\$2,050.00	\$500.00	Review and revise post-trial brief (4.6); confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.4);	Post Second-Trial Work
3453	Stafford, William B.	10/30/2017	6.20	\$595.00	\$3,689.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$3,131.00	\$2,511.00	\$620.00	Research and finalize post-trial brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3454	Khanna, Abha	10/31/2017	1.50	\$620.00	\$930.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$765.00	\$615.00	\$150.00	Review post-trial brief and pre trial conference transcript and draft notes of research/topics to draft in anticipation of opposing brief (1.1); confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.4);	Post Second-Trial Work
3455	Stafford, William B.	10/31/2017	0.30	\$595.00	\$178.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$151.50	\$121.50	\$30.00	Conference with A. Khanna regarding preparation work for intervenors post-trial brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3456	Branch, Aria C.	11/1/2017	0.30	\$650.00	\$195.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$123.00	\$103.50	\$19.50	Research related to post-trial briefing;	Post Second-Trial Work
3457	Khanna, Abha	11/1/2017	1.70	\$620.00	\$1,054.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$867.00	\$697.00	\$170.00	Review materials in preparation for meeting on post-trial reply brief (0.2); participate in same with B. Stafford and R. Spear (1.0); review case law in preparation for chart of circumstantial evidence (0.5);	Post Second-Trial Work
3458	Stafford, William B.	11/1/2017	0.70	\$595.00	\$416.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$353.50	\$283.50	\$70.00	Conference with A. Khanna and R. Spear regarding case deadlines and discovery issues;	Post Second-Trial Work
3459	Stafford, William B.	11/4/2017	2.10	\$595.00	\$1,249.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,060.50	\$850.50	\$210.00	Research and draft anticipatory sections of post-trial reply brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3460	Stafford, William B.	11/5/2017	1.50	\$595.00	\$892.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$757.50	\$607.50	\$150.00	Research and draft post-trial reply brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3461	Branch, Aria C.	11/6/2017	1.00	\$650.00	\$650.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$65.00	Legal research in preparation for post-trial brief reply;	Post Second-Trial Work

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3462	Khanna, Abha	11/6/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Confer with B. Stafford regarding reply brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3463	Branch, Aria C.	11/7/2017	1.70	\$650.00	\$1,105.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$697.00	\$586.50	\$110.50	Legal research in preparation for post-trial brief reply;	Post Second-Trial Work
3464	Stafford, William B.	11/8/2017	0.90	\$595.00	\$535.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$454.50	\$364.50	\$90.00	Research and draft reply post-trial brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3465	Khanna, Abha	11/9/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Research and confer with B. Stafford regarding incorporating elections results in reply brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3466	Branch, Aria C.	11/10/2017	3.60	\$650.00	\$2,340.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$1,476.00	\$1,242.00	\$234.00	Legal research in preparation for post-trial brief reply;	Post Second-Trial Work
3467	Khanna, Abha	11/10/2017	0.10	\$620.00	\$62.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$51.00	\$41.00	\$10.00	Email with legal team regarding legal research of reply brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3468	Stafford, William B.	11/10/2017	3.00	\$595.00	\$1,785.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,515.00	\$1,215.00	\$300.00	Research and draft post-trial reply brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3469	Stafford, William B.	11/13/2017	2.10	\$595.00	\$1,249.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,060.50	\$850.50	\$210.00	Review intervenors' post-trial brief and prepare preliminary analysis of same and additional areas of research;	Post Second-Trial Work
3470	Khanna, Abha	11/14/2017	0.70	\$620.00	\$434.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$357.00	\$287.00	\$70.00	Email and confer with B. Stafford regarding substance and logistics of reply trial brief (0.5); email and confer with M. Palmer regarding same (0.2);	Post Second-Trial Work
3471	Stafford, William B.	11/14/2017	0.50	\$595.00	\$297.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$252.50	\$202.50	\$50.00	Research and draft reply post-trial brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3472	Branch, Aria C.	11/15/2017	1.50	\$650.00	\$975.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$615.00	\$517.50	\$97.50	Review Intervenor's post-trial brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3473	Stafford, William B.	11/15/2017	0.90	\$595.00	\$535.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$454.50	\$364.50	\$90.00	Research and draft post-trial reply brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3474	Khanna, Abha	11/16/2017	0.60	\$620.00	\$372.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$306.00	\$246.00	\$60.00	Email and telephone conference with M. Palmer regarding response to Intervenor's post-trial brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3475	Stafford, William B.	11/16/2017	0.80	\$595.00	\$476.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$404.00	\$324.00	\$80.00	Research and draft post-trial reply brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3476	Khanna, Abha	11/17/2017	10.20	\$620.00	\$6,324.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$5,202.00	\$4,182.00	\$1,020.00	Review Intervenor's trial brief and draft portions of reply brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3477	Stafford, William B.	11/17/2017	3.00	\$595.00	\$1,785.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,515.00	\$1,215.00	\$300.00	Research and draft reply post-trial brief and exchange related correspondence with expert and A. Khanna regarding same;	Post Second-Trial Work
3478	Stafford, William B.	11/19/2017	5.20	\$595.00	\$3,094.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$2,626.00	\$2,106.00	\$520.00	Research and draft post-trial reply brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3479	Khanna, Abha	11/20/2017	0.30	\$620.00	\$186.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$153.00	\$123.00	\$30.00	Review and revise draft post-trial reply brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3480	Stafford, William B.	11/20/2017	4.00	\$595.00	\$2,380.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$2,020.00	\$1,620.00	\$400.00	Research and draft post-trial reply brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3481	Branch, Aria C.	11/21/2017	1.90	\$650.00	\$1,235.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$779.00	\$655.50	\$123.50	Draft footnotes for post-trial reply brief (1.4); review district-specific section of post-trial reply brief (.5);	Post Second-Trial Work
3482	Stafford, William B.	11/21/2017	7.90	\$595.00	\$4,700.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$3,989.50	\$3,199.50	\$790.00	Research and draft post-trial reply brief;	Post Second-Trial Work

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3483	Branch, Aria C.	11/22/2017	2.60	\$650.00	\$1,690.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$1,066.00	\$897.00	\$169.00	Draft footnotes for post-trial reply brief (.9); draft chart regarding district specific evidence of racial predominance for post-trial reply brief (1.7);	Post Second-Trial Work
3484	Khanna, Abha	11/22/2017	5.50	\$620.00	\$3,410.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$2,805.00	\$2,255.00	\$550.00	Draft, review, and revise post-trial reply brief and email and confer with legal team regarding same;	Post Second-Trial Work
3485	Stafford, William B.	11/22/2017	6.40	\$595.00	\$3,808.00	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$3,232.00	\$2,592.00	\$640.00	Research, draft, and finalize post-trial reply brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3486	Stafford, William B.	11/22/2017	2.90	\$595.00	\$1,725.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$1,464.50	\$1,174.50	\$290.00	Research, draft, and finalize post-trial reply brief;	Post Second-Trial Work
3487	Khanna, Abha	1/16/2018	0.20	\$665.00	\$133.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$110.00	\$82.00	\$28.00	Email with B. Stafford regarding applicability of findings in NC partisan gerrymandering opinion to Bethune-Hill case/experts (0.2);	Post Second-Trial Work
3488	Khanna, Abha	2/7/2018	0.30	\$665.00	\$199.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$165.00	\$123.00	\$42.00	Review newly-released documents on T. Hofeller (opposing expert) and email with B. Stafford regarding whether to alert the court (0.3);	Post Second-Trial Work
3489			201.50		\$123,206.50			\$100,692.00				SUBTOTAL for Post Second-Trial Work
3490	Frost, Elisabeth C.	1/2/2018	0.20	\$750.00	\$150.00	\$530.00	\$390.00	\$106.00	\$78.00	\$28.00	Emails with A. Khanna regarding proposed legislation on redistricting related to litigation;	Remedial Proceedings
3491	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/2/2018	0.50	\$795.00	\$397.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$357.50	\$287.50	\$70.00	Review and respond to email regarding proposed remedial maps;	Remedial Proceedings
3492	Khanna, Abha	1/2/2018	0.30	\$665.00	\$199.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$165.00	\$123.00	\$42.00	Research, review, and email with legal team regarding proposed legislation in VA House regarding criteria for remedial maps (0.3);	Remedial Proceedings
3493	Khanna, Abha	1/4/2018	0.10	\$665.00	\$66.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$55.00	\$41.00	\$14.00	Confer with B. Stafford regarding proposed remedial redistricting criteria and timing of court ruling/remedy (0.1);	Remedial Proceedings
3494	Khanna, Abha	1/8/2018	0.20	\$665.00	\$133.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$110.00	\$82.00	\$28.00	Review proposed bill on split precincts and email with legal team regarding same and effect on potential remedy phase (0.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3495	Stafford, William B.	6/27/2018	0.30	\$675.00	\$202.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$163.50	\$121.50	\$42.00	Draft email regarding agenda for discussion on next steps in light of memorandum opinion (.3);	Remedial Proceedings
3496	Khanna, Abha	8/1/2018	0.30	\$665.00	\$199.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$165.00	\$123.00	\$42.00	Confer with client and legal team regarding next steps on remedy map;	Remedial Proceedings
3497	Branch, Aria C.	8/2/2018	0.50	\$720.00	\$360.00	\$430.00	\$345.00	\$215.00	\$172.50	\$42.50	Attend call regarding remedial map process;	Remedial Proceedings
3498	Elias, Marc E.	8/2/2018	1.30	\$1,130.00	\$1,469.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$929.50	\$747.50	\$182.00	Teleconference regarding next legislative steps (.5); review same (.8);	Remedial Proceedings
3499	Khanna, Abha	8/7/2018	1.60	\$665.00	\$1,064.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$880.00	\$656.00	\$224.00	Telephone conference with B. Stafford and consulting expert regarding draft remedy map (1.3); confer with consulting expert regarding same (0.2); confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.1);	Remedial Proceedings
3500	Spear, Ryan M.	8/7/2018	0.50	\$675.00	\$337.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$275.00	\$205.00	\$70.00	Emails with litigation team regarding remedy issues; review court order regarding proper parties;	Remedial Proceedings
3501	Stafford, William B.	8/7/2018	1.50	\$675.00	\$1,012.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$817.50	\$607.50	\$210.00	Conference with A. Khanna and consulting expert regarding remedial map;	Remedial Proceedings

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3502	Elias, Marc E.	8/8/2018	0.50	\$1,130.00	\$565.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$357.50	\$287.50	\$70.00	Review court order (.2); email and conference regarding same (.3);	Remedial Proceedings
3503	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/8/2018	1.00	\$795.00	\$795.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$140.00	Review order from the court regarding substitution of the parties (.2); exchange email regarding same (.3); review order regarding redistricting (.3); exchange email regarding same (.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3504	Khanna, Abha	8/8/2018	0.40	\$665.00	\$266.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$220.00	\$164.00	\$56.00	Review submission from intervenors (0.1); review court order on remedy map and email with legal team regarding same (0.2); confer with client regarding same (0.1);	Remedial Proceedings
3505	Spear, Ryan M.	8/8/2018	0.50	\$675.00	\$337.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$275.00	\$205.00	\$70.00	Review court order regarding remedial issues; emails with litigation team regarding same;	Remedial Proceedings
3506	Khanna, Abha	8/10/2018	0.10	\$665.00	\$66.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$55.00	\$41.00	\$14.00	Email with M. DePass regarding address information for remedial process (0.1);	Remedial Proceedings
3507	Elias, Marc E.	8/11/2018	1.50	\$1,130.00	\$1,695.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$1,072.50	\$862.50	\$210.00	Teleconference and review regarding legislative next steps regarding maps;	Remedial Proceedings
3508	Khanna, Abha	8/13/2018	0.10	\$665.00	\$66.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$55.00	\$41.00	\$14.00	Email with legal team regarding possible special session for remedy map (0.1);	Remedial Proceedings
3509	Elias, Marc E.	8/17/2018	1.00	\$1,130.00	\$1,130.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$140.00	Teleconference and email regarding possible special session options and maps;	Remedial Proceedings
3510	Khanna, Abha	8/20/2018	0.10	\$665.00	\$66.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$55.00	\$41.00	\$14.00	Confer with B. Stafford regarding special session and proposed filings on remedial process (0.1);	Remedial Proceedings
3511	Elias, Marc E.	8/21/2018	0.80	\$1,130.00	\$904.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$572.00	\$460.00	\$112.00	Teleconference regarding legislative action (.5); review same (.3);	Remedial Proceedings
3512	Khanna, Abha	8/21/2018	0.50	\$665.00	\$332.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$275.00	\$205.00	\$70.00	Email and confer with legal team regarding remedial map and legislative session (0.5);	Remedial Proceedings
3513	Branch, Aria C.	8/22/2018	0.70	\$720.00	\$504.00	\$430.00	\$345.00	\$301.00	\$241.50	\$59.50	Provide advice regarding remedial map;	Remedial Proceedings
3514	Stafford, William B.	8/22/2018	0.40	\$675.00	\$270.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$218.00	\$162.00	\$56.00	Review proposed bill on redistricting criteria for relevance to remedial process;	Remedial Proceedings
3515	Khanna, Abha	8/23/2018	1.20	\$665.00	\$798.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$660.00	\$492.00	\$168.00	Review and circulate to legal team comments and suggestions regarding proposed remedy criteria (1.1); confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.1);	Remedial Proceedings
3516	Stafford, William B.	8/23/2018	0.20	\$675.00	\$135.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$109.00	\$81.00	\$28.00	Exchange correspondence regarding proposed criteria for redistricting;	Remedial Proceedings
3517	Elias, Marc E.	8/24/2018	1.00	\$1,130.00	\$1,130.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$140.00	Review legislature's notification to the court (.6); teleconference and email regarding same;	Remedial Proceedings
3518	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/24/2018	0.50	\$795.00	\$397.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$357.50	\$287.50	\$70.00	Review filing from Defendant-Intervenors regarding redistricting plan (.3); exchange related email (.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3519	Khanna, Abha	8/24/2018	1.60	\$665.00	\$1,064.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$880.00	\$656.00	\$224.00	review and revise proposed draft criteria and email with legal team regarding same and timing issues (1.2); review House notice to court and confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.3); coordinate court remedy strategy meeting (0.1);	Remedial Proceedings
3520	Spear, Ryan M.	8/24/2018	0.30	\$675.00	\$202.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$165.00	\$123.00	\$42.00	Review defendant-intervenors' supplemental brief (.2); emails with litigation team regarding same (.1);	Remedial Proceedings

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3521	Elias, Marc E.	8/26/2018	0.50	\$1,130.00	\$565.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$357.50	\$287.50	\$70.00	Review redistricting criteria;	Remedial Proceedings
3522	Khanna, Abha	8/26/2018	0.20	\$665.00	\$133.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$110.00	\$82.00	\$28.00	Email with legal team regarding legislative remedial process (0.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3523	Branch, Aria C.	8/27/2018	1.20	\$720.00	\$864.00	\$430.00	\$345.00	\$516.00	\$414.00	\$102.00	Prepare for and attend call regarding remedial map;	Remedial Proceedings
3524	Elias, Marc E.	8/27/2018	0.70	\$1,130.00	\$791.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$500.50	\$402.50	\$98.00	Teleconference regarding next steps in impasse;	Remedial Proceedings
3525	Khanna, Abha	8/27/2018	0.70	\$665.00	\$465.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$385.00	\$287.00	\$98.00	Confer with B. Stafford regarding legislative remedial process (0.3); telephone conference with legal team regarding same (0.4);	Remedial Proceedings
3526	Stafford, William B.	8/27/2018	1.00	\$675.00	\$675.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$140.00	Prepare for and participate in call regarding legislative process and impact on remedial phase;	Remedial Proceedings
3527	Khanna, Abha	8/28/2018	0.10	\$665.00	\$66.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$55.00	\$41.00	\$14.00	email with legal team regarding census error in VA with respect to proposed remedial maps (0.1);	Remedial Proceedings
3528	Branch, Aria C.	8/29/2018	0.90	\$720.00	\$648.00	\$430.00	\$345.00	\$387.00	\$310.50	\$76.50	Advise on next steps in remedial process;	Remedial Proceedings
3529	Khanna, Abha	8/29/2018	0.40	\$665.00	\$266.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$220.00	\$164.00	\$56.00	Review maps and data from consulting expert regarding proposed remedy map for court (0.4);	Remedial Proceedings
3530	Branch, Aria C.	8/30/2018	0.20	\$720.00	\$144.00	\$430.00	\$345.00	\$86.00	\$69.00	\$17.00	Advise on next steps in remedial process;	Remedial Proceedings
3531	Elias, Marc E.	8/30/2018	0.60	\$1,130.00	\$678.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$429.00	\$345.00	\$84.00	review correspondence regarding special session (.3); email same (.3);	Remedial Proceedings
3532	Khanna, Abha	8/30/2018	1.40	\$665.00	\$931.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$770.00	\$574.00	\$196.00	Email with legal team regarding special session (0.2); confer with B. Stafford and R. Spear regarding proposed remedial maps drafted by consulting expert and review materials in advance of same (1.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3533	Spear, Ryan M.	8/30/2018	1.00	\$675.00	\$675.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$140.00	Conference with A. Khanna and W. Stafford regarding remedy issues (1.0);	Remedial Proceedings
3534	Stafford, William B.	8/30/2018	1.40	\$675.00	\$945.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$763.00	\$567.00	\$196.00	Prepare for and meet with A. Khanna and R. Spear regarding remedial phase and approach to preparations for same;	Remedial Proceedings
3535	Khanna, Abha	8/31/2018	0.30	\$665.00	\$199.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$165.00	\$123.00	\$42.00	Review correspondence regarding special session and email with legal team regarding same (0.3);	Remedial Proceedings
3536	Stafford, William B.	9/4/2018	0.50	\$675.00	\$337.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$272.50	\$202.50	\$70.00	Review and revise correspondence related to remedial phase (.5);	Remedial Proceedings
3537	Khanna, Abha	9/5/2018	0.50	\$665.00	\$332.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$275.00	\$205.00	\$70.00	Email and confer with legal team regarding legislative remedial process (0.5);	Remedial Proceedings
3538	Stafford, William B.	9/5/2018	0.20	\$675.00	\$135.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$109.00	\$81.00	\$28.00	Conference with A. Khanna regarding timing of response to jurisdictional statement (.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3539	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/10/2018	2.20	\$795.00	\$1,749.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$1,573.00	\$1,265.00	\$308.00	Review order from the court re: remedial phase (.3); conference with B. Stafford regarding same (.2); review motion filed by state regarding remedial phase (.8); exchange email regarding same (.5); review outline of proposed filing and related email (.4);	Remedial Proceedings

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3540	Khanna, Abha	9/10/2018	0.80	\$665.00	\$532.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$440.00	\$328.00	\$112.00	Review State's motion to alter judgment (0.2); email and confer with B. Stafford regarding proposed response to same (0.4); review and revise draft response brief (0.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3541	Spear, Ryan M.	9/10/2018	0.20	\$675.00	\$135.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$110.00	\$82.00	\$28.00	Review motion to alter judgment (.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3542	Spiva, Bruce V.	9/10/2018	0.40	\$995.00	\$398.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$286.00	\$230.00	\$56.00	Review State's motion to proceed to remedial phase immediately;	Remedial Proceedings
3543	Stafford, William B.	9/10/2018	2.30	\$675.00	\$1,552.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$1,253.50	\$931.50	\$322.00	Review State's motion to alter judgment (.3); discuss potential responses to same with litigation team (.2); draft response (1.8);	Remedial Proceedings
3544	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/11/2018	0.90	\$795.00	\$715.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$643.50	\$517.50	\$126.00	Review remedial activity in prior cases (.3); conference with B. Stafford regarding same (.2); review outline of proposed response;	Remedial Proceedings
3545	Khanna, Abha	9/11/2018	0.50	\$665.00	\$332.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$275.00	\$205.00	\$70.00	Review and revise draft response to motion to alter judgment (0.2); email and confer with legal team regarding same (0.1); email with legal team regarding remedy map (0.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3546	Stafford, William B.	9/11/2018	1.70	\$675.00	\$1,147.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$926.50	\$688.50	\$238.00	Prepare analysis of HD 92 and 95 for evaluation of potential remedial plans;	Remedial Proceedings
3547	Branch, Aria C.	9/12/2018	0.20	\$720.00	\$144.00	\$430.00	\$345.00	\$86.00	\$69.00	\$17.00	Advise on remedial process;	Remedial Proceedings
3548	Elias, Marc E.	9/12/2018	1.00	\$1,130.00	\$1,130.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$140.00	Review response brief (.8); email regarding same (.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3549	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/12/2018	2.70	\$795.00	\$2,146.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$1,930.50	\$1,552.50	\$378.00	Review brief in opposition to state's motion to accelerate the remedial phase (1.0); conference with B. Stafford regarding opposition (.4); review and revise draft opposition (1.3);	Remedial Proceedings
3550	Khanna, Abha	9/12/2018	0.60	\$665.00	\$399.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$330.00	\$246.00	\$84.00	Review Intervenor's response to motion to alter judgment (0.3); email and confer with legal team regarding same (0.2); review and revise draft response in light of same (0.1);	Remedial Proceedings
3551	Spear, Ryan M.	9/12/2018	0.40	\$675.00	\$270.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$220.00	\$164.00	\$56.00	Review opposition to motion to alter judgment (.2); emails with litigation team regarding same (.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3552	Stafford, William B.	9/12/2018	0.70	\$675.00	\$472.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$381.50	\$283.50	\$98.00	Finalize and coordinate service of response to motion to alter judgment;	Remedial Proceedings
3553	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/13/2018	1.00	\$795.00	\$795.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$140.00	Review reply brief from state (.5); conference with B. Stafford regarding same (.2); confernece with B. Stafford regarding alternative maps (.3);	Remedial Proceedings
3554	Khanna, Abha	9/13/2018	0.40	\$665.00	\$266.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$220.00	\$164.00	\$56.00	Email with legal team regarding draft letter from minority leader to speaker (0.2); review State's reply ISO motion to alter judgment (0.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3555	Stafford, William B.	9/13/2018	0.20	\$675.00	\$135.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$109.00	\$81.00	\$28.00	Review and provide summary of State reply in support of motion to alter judgment;	Remedial Proceedings
3556	Elias, Marc E.	9/14/2018	0.70	\$1,130.00	\$791.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$500.50	\$402.50	\$98.00	Review court order (.5); email regarding same (.2);	Remedial Proceedings

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3557	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/14/2018	1.30	\$795.00	\$1,033.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$929.50	\$747.50	\$182.00	Review court order in remedial phase (.3); exchange email regarding potential special master candidates (.5); review draft email to opposing counsel and exchange email regarding same (.5);	Remedial Proceedings
3558	Khanna, Abha	9/14/2018	0.30	\$665.00	\$199.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$165.00	\$123.00	\$42.00	Review order on motion to alter judgment (0.1); email with legal team and client regarding same (0.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3559	Spear, Ryan M.	9/14/2018	0.10	\$675.00	\$67.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$55.00	\$41.00	\$14.00	Review order regarding motion to alter judgment (.1);	Remedial Proceedings
3560	Spiva, Bruce V.	9/14/2018	0.30	\$995.00	\$298.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$214.50	\$172.50	\$42.00	Review Court order granting in part State's motion to start remedial phase and correspond with team regarding same;	Remedial Proceedings
3561	Elias, Marc E.	9/18/2018	0.50	\$1,130.00	\$565.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$357.50	\$287.50	\$70.00	Review map proposal (.3); email and teleconference regarding same (.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3562	Khanna, Abha	9/18/2018	0.20	\$665.00	\$133.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$110.00	\$82.00	\$28.00	Email with legal team regarding House of Delegates' proposed remedial plan (0.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3563	Khanna, Abha	9/19/2018	0.90	\$665.00	\$598.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$495.00	\$369.00	\$126.00	Review House proposed remedy map and email and confer with client and legal team regarding same (0.9);	Remedial Proceedings
3564	Stafford, William B.	9/19/2018	0.80	\$675.00	\$540.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$436.00	\$324.00	\$112.00	Conference with A. Khanna regarding proposed Republican legislative plan and proposed responses to same;	Remedial Proceedings
3565	Branch, Aria C.	9/20/2018	0.20	\$720.00	\$144.00	\$430.00	\$345.00	\$86.00	\$69.00	\$17.00	Advise on remedial process;	Remedial Proceedings
3566	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/20/2018	1.50	\$795.00	\$1,192.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$1,072.50	\$862.50	\$210.00	Review special master nominations from the state (.2); exchange email regarding same (.3); review draft submission on plaintiff's proposals (.4); exchange email regarding Cooper (.3); exchange email regarding Intervenor's suggestions (.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3567	Khanna, Abha	9/20/2018	0.10	\$665.00	\$66.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$55.00	\$41.00	\$14.00	Review opposing counsel's special master submissions (0.1);	Remedial Proceedings
3568	Spear, Ryan M.	9/20/2018	0.20	\$675.00	\$135.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$110.00	\$82.00	\$28.00	Review defendant-intervenors' notice of proposed special masters (.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3569	Spiva, Bruce V.	9/20/2018	0.30	\$995.00	\$298.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$214.50	\$172.50	\$42.00	Confer with team regarding State's choices for special master and about our proposals;	Remedial Proceedings
3570	Stafford, William B.	9/20/2018	0.70	\$675.00	\$472.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$381.50	\$283.50	\$98.00	Prepare submission regarding proposed special masters (.3); conference with potential special master (.2); exchange correspondence with A. Khanna and K. Hamilton regarding same (.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3571	Branch, Aria C.	9/21/2018	0.60	\$720.00	\$432.00	\$430.00	\$345.00	\$258.00	\$207.00	\$51.00	Advise on remedial process;	Remedial Proceedings
3572	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/21/2018	1.00	\$795.00	\$795.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$140.00	Review special master nominations; review and respond to email regarding same;	Remedial Proceedings
3573	Khanna, Abha	9/21/2018	0.90	\$665.00	\$598.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$495.00	\$369.00	\$126.00	Email with legal team regarding objections to intervenors' proposed special masters (0.6); confer with outside attorney regarding experience with D. Johnson (0.2); review court order regarding same (0.1);	Remedial Proceedings

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3574	Spiva, Bruce V.	9/21/2018	0.30	\$995.00	\$298.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$214.50	\$172.50	\$42.00	Confer with team regarding intervenors proposed special masters and response to Court.;	Remedial Proceedings
3575	Louijeune, Ruthzee	9/22/2018	4.00	\$630.00	\$2,520.00	\$430.00	\$320.00	\$1,720.00	\$1,280.00	\$440.00	Conduct research on expert witness (2.5); Draft page for motion contesting expert's ability to serve as special master (1.5);	Remedial Proceedings
3576	Khanna, Abha	9/24/2018	0.50	\$665.00	\$332.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$275.00	\$205.00	\$70.00	Review and revise draft objections to special master (0.2); confer with B. Stafford regarding research on same (0.3);	Remedial Proceedings
3577	Spear, Ryan M.	9/24/2018	0.10	\$675.00	\$67.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$55.00	\$41.00	\$14.00	Emails with parties regarding court order regarding special masters (.1);	Remedial Proceedings
3578	Stafford, William B.	9/24/2018	0.20	\$675.00	\$135.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$109.00	\$81.00	\$28.00	Draft opposition to intervenors' proposed special master candidates;	Remedial Proceedings
3579	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/25/2018	1.20	\$795.00	\$954.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$858.00	\$690.00	\$168.00	Review and respond to email regarding briefing regarding proposed court-appointed special masters (.5); review briefing regarding same (.7);	Remedial Proceedings
3580	Khanna, Abha	9/25/2018	0.30	\$665.00	\$199.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$165.00	\$123.00	\$42.00	Review and revise draft objections to special master submissions (0.2); email with legal team regarding same (0.1);	Remedial Proceedings
3581	Spiva, Bruce V.	9/25/2018	0.40	\$995.00	\$398.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$286.00	\$230.00	\$56.00	Review and revise draft brief regarding special matters;	Remedial Proceedings
3582	Stafford, William B.	9/25/2018	0.30	\$675.00	\$202.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$163.50	\$121.50	\$42.00	Prepare opposition to intervenors' special master candidates;	Remedial Proceedings
3583	Branch, Aria C.	9/26/2018	0.30	\$720.00	\$216.00	\$430.00	\$345.00	\$129.00	\$103.50	\$25.50	Advise on remedial process;	Remedial Proceedings
3584	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/26/2018	1.10	\$795.00	\$874.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$786.50	\$632.50	\$154.00	Review and revise draft briefing regarding court appointed special master (.3); exchange related email (.2); review briefing filed by state and by Intervenor (.6);	Remedial Proceedings
3585	Khanna, Abha	9/26/2018	0.80	\$665.00	\$532.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$440.00	\$328.00	\$112.00	Email with legal team regarding legislative remedy process (0.4); review, revise, and finalize special master objections (0.2); review objections submitted by opposing counsel (0.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3586	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/28/2018	1.30	\$795.00	\$1,033.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$929.50	\$747.50	\$182.00	Review and revise draft reply brief regarding court-appointed special masters (.3); review briefing filed by state and by Intervenor (1.0);	Remedial Proceedings
3587	Khanna, Abha	9/28/2018	0.20	\$665.00	\$133.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$110.00	\$82.00	\$28.00	Review and revise response to objections regarding special master (0.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3588	Khanna, Abha	10/15/2018	0.20	\$665.00	\$133.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$110.00	\$82.00	\$28.00	Email with legal team regarding remedial map (0.1); confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.1);	Remedial Proceedings
3589	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/16/2018	0.90	\$795.00	\$715.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$643.50	\$517.50	\$126.00	Review order setting status conference call (.3); review materials in preparation for status call with court (.6);	Remedial Proceedings
3590	Khanna, Abha	10/16/2018	0.10	\$665.00	\$66.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$55.00	\$41.00	\$14.00	Email and confer with legal team regarding conference call with Court (0.1);	Remedial Proceedings
3591	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/17/2018	3.40	\$795.00	\$2,703.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$2,431.00	\$1,955.00	\$476.00	Review email from court changing timing for call (.3); exchange related email (.2); review recent filings in preparation for telephonic hearing (2.9);	Remedial Proceedings

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3592	Khanna, Abha	10/17/2018	0.70	\$665.00	\$465.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$385.00	\$287.00	\$98.00	Confer with legal team in preparation for conference call with court (0.7);	Remedial Proceedings
3593	Spear, Ryan M.	10/17/2018	0.50	\$675.00	\$337.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$275.00	\$205.00	\$70.00	Emails with A. Khanna and W. Stafford regarding remedies (.3); review materials regarding same (.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3594	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/18/2018	1.00	\$795.00	\$795.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$140.00	Review proposed schedule and potential issues for telephonic hearing (.7); exchange related email (.3);	Remedial Proceedings
3595	Spear, Ryan M.	10/18/2018	0.30	\$675.00	\$202.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$165.00	\$123.00	\$42.00	Review court order regarding special master (.2); review court order regarding hearing (.1);	Remedial Proceedings
3596	Spiva, Bruce V.	10/18/2018	0.20	\$995.00	\$199.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$143.00	\$115.00	\$28.00	Review court's order appointing special master (.1); confer with team regarding same (.1);	Remedial Proceedings
3597	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/19/2018	3.10	\$795.00	\$2,464.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$2,216.50	\$1,782.50	\$434.00	Prepare for telephonic hearing (1.2); telephone conference with B. Stafford and A. Khanna in advance of hearing to review proposed schedule and other issues (.4); review new court minute order outlining issues to be discussed (.3); outline potential positions and exchange thoughts on positions with B. Stafford and A. Khanna regarding same (1.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3598	Khanna, Abha	10/19/2018	1.30	\$665.00	\$864.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$715.00	\$533.00	\$182.00	Conference with Court regarding remedial map schedule and process (0.6); confer and email with K. Hamilton and B. Stafford in preparation for and after same (0.7);	Remedial Proceedings
3599	Spiva, Bruce V.	10/19/2018	0.40	\$995.00	\$398.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$286.00	\$230.00	\$56.00	Confer with team regarding today's hearing on remedy and plans for map;	Remedial Proceedings
3600	Stafford, William B.	10/19/2018	2.70	\$675.00	\$1,822.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$1,471.50	\$1,093.50	\$378.00	Prepare for and participate in court hearing (.6); review subsequent court order and start drafting briefing regarding remedial plan (2.1);	Remedial Proceedings
3601	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/20/2018	1.50	\$795.00	\$1,192.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$1,072.50	\$862.50	\$210.00	Review court ordered schedule (.4); exchange related email regarding proposed map (.6); exchange email regarding hearing date coverage (.5);	Remedial Proceedings
3602	Louijeune, Ruthzee	10/21/2018	0.20	\$630.00	\$126.00	\$430.00	\$320.00	\$86.00	\$64.00	\$22.00	Begin research on equal population question (0.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3603	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/22/2018	1.00	\$795.00	\$795.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$140.00	Conference with A. Khanna regarding proposed maps and related filings (.3); review court orders regarding special master and related issues (.5); conference with B. Stafford regarding same (.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3604	Khanna, Abha	10/22/2018	0.70	\$665.00	\$465.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$385.00	\$287.00	\$98.00	Review remedy map in relation to court order (0.6); confer with K. Hamilton regarding remedy map hearing (0.1);	Remedial Proceedings
3605	Louijeune, Ruthzee	10/22/2018	1.30	\$630.00	\$819.00	\$430.00	\$320.00	\$559.00	\$416.00	\$143.00	Research whether Supreme Court has announced a permissible percentage buy which population of court-drawn legislative districts can deviate (0.9); draft analysis (0.4);	Remedial Proceedings
3606	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/23/2018	0.40	\$795.00	\$318.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$286.00	\$230.00	\$56.00	Exchange email regarding proposed map and related filings (.4);	Remedial Proceedings

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3607	Khanna, Abha	10/23/2018	1.80	\$665.00	\$1,197.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$990.00	\$738.00	\$252.00	Review map filings from Page as reference for remedy map proposal (0.6); confer with B. Stafford regarding same, substance of maps, and next steps (0.7); telephone conference with consulting expert regarding same (0.5);	Remedial Proceedings
3608	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/24/2018	0.60	\$795.00	\$477.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$429.00	\$345.00	\$84.00	review orders from the court regarding oath of confidentiality and appointment of state officials to assist special master (.3); exchange email regarding same (.3);	Remedial Proceedings
3609	Khanna, Abha	10/24/2018	0.60	\$665.00	\$399.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$330.00	\$246.00	\$84.00	Review proposed remedy maps in context of order on liability (0.5); email and confer with B. Stafford regarding evaluation of remedy maps (0.1);	Remedial Proceedings
3610	Stafford, William B.	10/24/2018	2.40	\$675.00	\$1,620.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$1,308.00	\$972.00	\$336.00	Draft remedial plan brief;	Remedial Proceedings
3611	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/25/2018	1.50	\$795.00	\$1,192.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$1,072.50	\$862.50	\$210.00	Review orders from the court regarding special master, state assistants and related issues (.6); review prior orders in Page to compare (.4); exchange email regarding same (.5);	Remedial Proceedings
3612	Khanna, Abha	10/25/2018	2.50	\$665.00	\$1,662.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$1,375.00	\$1,025.00	\$350.00	Review Memorandum Opinion and draft bullet-point outline of objective predominance evidence in preparation for evaluation of remedial plans (2.4); email and confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.1);	Remedial Proceedings
3613	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/26/2018	0.50	\$795.00	\$397.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$357.50	\$287.50	\$70.00	Review court orders regarding court's communications with special master and related issues (.5);	Remedial Proceedings
3614	Khanna, Abha	10/26/2018	0.20	\$665.00	\$133.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$110.00	\$82.00	\$28.00	Email and confer with B. Stafford regarding remedial map evaluation (0.1); email with consulting expert regarding same (0.1);	Remedial Proceedings
3615	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/29/2018	0.70	\$795.00	\$556.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$500.50	\$402.50	\$98.00	Review letter received by court (.2); review status of maps and briefing (.2); exchange related email (.3);	Remedial Proceedings
3616	Khanna, Abha	10/29/2018	2.80	\$665.00	\$1,862.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$1,540.00	\$1,148.00	\$392.00	Review and revise draft remedy maps (1.4); confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.7); telephone conference with consulting expert regarding same (0.7);	Remedial Proceedings
3617	Stafford, William B.	10/29/2018	4.80	\$675.00	\$3,240.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$2,616.00	\$1,944.00	\$672.00	Research and draft brief in support of proposed remedial plans;	Remedial Proceedings
3618	Khanna, Abha	10/30/2018	2.40	\$665.00	\$1,596.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$1,320.00	\$984.00	\$336.00	Review VA remedy map (0.2); confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.5); confer with B. Stafford and consulting expert regarding same (1.7);	Remedial Proceedings
3619	Stafford, William B.	10/30/2018	0.50	\$675.00	\$337.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$272.50	\$202.50	\$70.00	Research and draft brief in support of proposed remedial plans;	Remedial Proceedings
3620	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/31/2018	0.70	\$795.00	\$556.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$500.50	\$402.50	\$98.00	Exchange email with A. Khanna and B. Stafford regarding proposed maps and draft brief;	Remedial Proceedings
3621	Khanna, Abha	10/31/2018	1.70	\$665.00	\$1,130.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$935.00	\$697.00	\$238.00	Review remedial maps (0.3); email and confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.2); review and revise draft brief in support of proposed remedial plan (1.2);	Remedial Proceedings

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3622	Hamilton, Kevin J.	11/1/2018	0.90	\$795.00	\$715.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$643.50	\$517.50	\$126.00	Review court filings and orders (.3); exchange email with B. Stafford and A. Khanna regarding timing and logistics of filing proposed maps and brief (.6);	Remedial Proceedings
3623	Khanna, Abha	11/1/2018	4.30	\$665.00	\$2,859.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$2,365.00	\$1,763.00	\$602.00	Review revised remedy maps and data (0.8); email and confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.8); email and telephone conferences with consulting expert regarding same (0.6); review and revise draft brief in support of remedial plans (0.9); review special master reports and court order in VA congressional case in doing same (1.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3624	Stafford, William B.	11/1/2018	4.80	\$675.00	\$3,240.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$2,616.00	\$1,944.00	\$672.00	Research and draft brief in support of proposed remedial plans;	Remedial Proceedings
3625	Depass, Michelle	11/2/2018	4.10	\$310.00	\$1,271.00	\$235.00	\$235.00	\$963.50	\$963.50	\$0.00	Assist with brief and filing;	Remedial Proceedings
3626	Hamilton, Kevin J.	11/2/2018	3.10	\$795.00	\$2,464.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$2,216.50	\$1,782.50	\$434.00	Review and revise draft brief in support of proposed remedial maps (1.2); review related email (.3); review filings from other parties (1.3); exchange email regarding same (.3);	Remedial Proceedings
3627	Khanna, Abha	11/2/2018	3.90	\$665.00	\$2,593.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$2,145.00	\$1,599.00	\$546.00	Review, revise, and finalize proposed maps and briefs in support (2.6); confer with legal team regarding same (0.8); confer with consulting expert regarding same (0.5);	Remedial Proceedings
3628	Spiva, Bruce V.	11/2/2018	1.00	\$995.00	\$995.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$140.00	Review and comment on brief in support of Plaintiffs' remedial plan;	Remedial Proceedings
3629	Stafford, William B.	11/2/2018	2.70	\$675.00	\$1,822.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$1,471.50	\$1,093.50	\$378.00	Research and draft brief in support of proposed remedial plans;	Remedial Proceedings
3630	Spiva, Bruce V.	11/3/2018	0.20	\$995.00	\$199.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$143.00	\$115.00	\$28.00	Correspond with A. Khanna and B. Stafford regarding remedial plan brief;	Remedial Proceedings
3631	Hamilton, Kevin J.	11/5/2018	0.50	\$795.00	\$397.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$357.50	\$287.50	\$70.00	Review court order and additional filings;	Remedial Proceedings
3632	Khanna, Abha	11/5/2018	1.70	\$665.00	\$1,130.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$935.00	\$697.00	\$238.00	Review briefing from Intervenor on remedy maps (0.4); review NAACP briefing on remedy maps (0.6); review maps proposed by these and other parties (0.5); email and confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3633	Hamilton, Kevin J.	11/6/2018	1.00	\$795.00	\$795.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$140.00	Review additional filings regarding remedial maps (.6); exchange related email (.4);	Remedial Proceedings
3634	Khanna, Abha	11/6/2018	2.00	\$665.00	\$1,330.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$1,100.00	\$820.00	\$280.00	Review maps submitted by Intervenor and non-parties (0.4); email with consulting expert regarding same (0.1); confer with B. Stafford regarding response to same (1.5);	Remedial Proceedings
3635	Stafford, William B.	11/6/2018	1.60	\$675.00	\$1,080.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$872.00	\$648.00	\$224.00	Prepare for and meet with A. Khanna to review other parties' submissions and develop strategic overview of response to same;	Remedial Proceedings
3636	Khanna, Abha	11/7/2018	0.30	\$665.00	\$199.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$165.00	\$123.00	\$42.00	Review Intervenor's map data files and email with B. Stafford regarding same (0.3);	Remedial Proceedings
3637	Stafford, William B.	11/7/2018	1.60	\$675.00	\$1,080.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$872.00	\$648.00	\$224.00	Prepare opposition to other parties' remedial plans;	Remedial Proceedings

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3638	Khanna, Abha	11/8/2018	0.20	\$665.00	\$133.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$110.00	\$82.00	\$28.00	Email with consulting expert and legal team regarding Intervenor's maps (0.1); email and confer with B. Stafford regarding same and legal briefing regarding same (0.1);	Remedial Proceedings
3639	Stafford, William B.	11/8/2018	0.70	\$675.00	\$472.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$381.50	\$283.50	\$98.00	Draft brief regarding other parties' submissions;	Remedial Proceedings
3640	Stafford, William B.	11/8/2018	1.70	\$675.00	\$1,147.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$926.50	\$688.50	\$238.00	Additional drafting of brief responding to other parties' submissions;	Remedial Proceedings
3641	Khanna, Abha	11/9/2018	0.40	\$665.00	\$266.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$220.00	\$164.00	\$56.00	Email and confer with B. Stafford regarding remedial map objections (0.2); email with M. Palmer regarding data for same (0.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3642	Stafford, William B.	11/9/2018	1.50	\$675.00	\$1,012.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$817.50	\$607.50	\$210.00	Draft briefs regarding other parties' submissions;	Remedial Proceedings
3643	Stafford, William B.	11/10/2018	4.10	\$675.00	\$2,767.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$2,234.50	\$1,660.50	\$574.00	Research and draft response to other parties' remedial submissions;	Remedial Proceedings
3644	Khanna, Abha	11/13/2018	1.90	\$665.00	\$1,263.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$1,045.00	\$779.00	\$266.00	Review and revise draft objections to Intervenor's proposed remedial plans (1.7); confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3645	Stafford, William B.	11/13/2018	1.30	\$675.00	\$877.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$708.50	\$526.50	\$182.00	Review data regarding other parties' submissions and draft brief regarding same;	Remedial Proceedings
3646	Khanna, Abha	11/14/2018	3.90	\$665.00	\$2,593.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$2,145.00	\$1,599.00	\$546.00	Draft, review, and revise portions of objections to Intervenor's remedial plans (3.9);	Remedial Proceedings
3647	Spiva, Bruce V.	11/14/2018	0.40	\$995.00	\$398.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$286.00	\$230.00	\$56.00	Correspond with B. Stafford and A. Khanna regarding remedial brief;	Remedial Proceedings
3648	Stafford, William B.	11/14/2018	4.60	\$675.00	\$3,105.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$2,507.00	\$1,863.00	\$644.00	Research and draft brief regarding responses to other parties' remedial plan submissions;	Remedial Proceedings
3649	Khanna, Abha	11/15/2018	0.60	\$665.00	\$399.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$330.00	\$246.00	\$84.00	Review and revise draft objections regarding remedy map (0.6);	Remedial Proceedings
3650	Stafford, William B.	11/15/2018	1.10	\$675.00	\$742.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$599.50	\$445.50	\$154.00	Revise brief and address NAACP orders;	Remedial Proceedings
3651	Spiva, Bruce V.	11/16/2018	0.50	\$995.00	\$497.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$357.50	\$287.50	\$70.00	Review and comment on our opposition to Intervenor's remedial brief;	Remedial Proceedings
3652	Stafford, William B.	11/16/2018	1.40	\$675.00	\$945.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$763.00	\$567.00	\$196.00	Finalize and coordinate filing of response to other parties' remedial plan submissions (.8); review and provide summary of Intervenor's brief (.6);	Remedial Proceedings
3653	Stafford, William B.	11/19/2018	0.10	\$675.00	\$67.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$54.50	\$40.50	\$14.00	Review NAACP filing;	Remedial Proceedings
3654	Stafford, William B.	12/2/2018	2.30	\$675.00	\$1,552.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$1,253.50	\$931.50	\$322.00	Review data analysis of special master's proposed plans and prepare summary of same and next steps for team;	Remedial Proceedings
3655	Khanna, Abha	12/6/2018	0.30	\$665.00	\$199.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$165.00	\$123.00	\$42.00	Review Personhubballah brief on special master remedy in preparation for drafting same in present case (0.3);	Remedial Proceedings
3656	Elias, Marc E.	12/7/2018	1.70	\$1,130.00	\$1,921.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$1,215.50	\$977.50	\$238.00	Review special master's report (1.3); email regarding same (.4);	Remedial Proceedings
3657	Hamilton, Kevin J.	12/7/2018	1.30	\$795.00	\$1,033.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$929.50	\$747.50	\$182.00	Review special master report (.8); conference with B. Stafford regarding same (.5);	Remedial Proceedings
3658	Khanna, Abha	12/7/2018	3.50	\$665.00	\$2,327.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$1,925.00	\$1,435.00	\$490.00	Review special master's report (2.9); email and confer with legal team regarding same (0.6);	Remedial Proceedings

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3659	Hamilton, Kevin J.	12/9/2018	0.50	\$795.00	\$397.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$357.50	\$287.50	\$70.00	Review initial analysis of special master's plans;	Remedial Proceedings
3660	Spiva, Bruce V.	12/9/2018	0.50	\$995.00	\$497.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$357.50	\$287.50	\$70.00	Review B. Stafford's analysis of special master report;	Remedial Proceedings
3661	Hamilton, Kevin J.	12/10/2018	0.90	\$795.00	\$715.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$643.50	\$517.50	\$126.00	Conference with B. Stafford regarding special master's report (.4); review special master's report (.5);	Remedial Proceedings
3662	Khanna, Abha	12/10/2018	2.10	\$665.00	\$1,396.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$1,155.00	\$861.00	\$294.00	Review and revise data files from consulting expert regarding special master remedy alternatives alongside special master report (1.6); confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.5);	Remedial Proceedings
3663	Khanna, Abha	12/11/2018	3.60	\$665.00	\$2,394.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$1,980.00	\$1,476.00	\$504.00	Draft portions of brief in response to special master's plans (1.2); telephone conference with consulting expert regarding intricacies of various modules (2.1); confer with B. Stafford regarding legal strategy in light of same (0.3);	Remedial Proceedings
3664	Stafford, William B.	12/11/2018	4.50	\$675.00	\$3,037.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$2,452.50	\$1,822.50	\$630.00	Analyze data related to special master report and draft response to same (2.5); prepare for and conference with consulting expert regarding same (2.0);	Remedial Proceedings
3665	Khanna, Abha	12/12/2018	0.60	\$665.00	\$399.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$330.00	\$246.00	\$84.00	Draft portion of brief in response to special master report (0.2); email with J. Berkon regarding incumbent addresses in references to same (0.2); confer with B. Stafford regarding Petersburg configuration (0.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3666	Stafford, William B.	12/12/2018	2.00	\$675.00	\$1,350.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$1,090.00	\$810.00	\$280.00	Draft response to special master report;	Remedial Proceedings
3667	Hamilton, Kevin J.	12/13/2018	2.10	\$795.00	\$1,669.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$1,501.50	\$1,207.50	\$294.00	Review draft brief on remedial maps (1.5); conference with B. Stafford regarding same (.6);	Remedial Proceedings
3668	Khanna, Abha	12/13/2018	2.70	\$665.00	\$1,795.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$1,485.00	\$1,107.00	\$378.00	Review and review draft brief in response to special master maps (2.1); email and confer with legal team regarding same (0.3); email and confer with legal team regarding remedial hearing (0.3);	Remedial Proceedings
3669	Spiva, Bruce V.	12/13/2018	0.70	\$995.00	\$696.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$500.50	\$402.50	\$98.00	Review and comment on draft brief regarding remedial plan and B. Stafford's accompanying email memo regarding same;	Remedial Proceedings
3670	Stafford, William B.	12/13/2018	0.40	\$675.00	\$270.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$218.00	\$162.00	\$56.00	Revise comments on special master report (.4);	Remedial Proceedings
3671	Depass, Michelle	12/14/2018	1.10	\$310.00	\$341.00	\$235.00	\$235.00	\$258.50	\$258.50	\$0.00	Assist with and file brief;	Remedial Proceedings
3672	Hamilton, Kevin J.	12/14/2018	1.30	\$795.00	\$1,033.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$929.50	\$747.50	\$182.00	Review and approve final draft of brief on proposed remedial plans (.4); conference with B. Stafford regarding same (.4); review briefing filed by other parties on remedial plans (.5);	Remedial Proceedings
3673	Khanna, Abha	12/14/2018	0.40	\$665.00	\$266.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$220.00	\$164.00	\$56.00	Review submissions from parties and non-parties regarding special master proposal (0.4);	Remedial Proceedings
3674	Spiva, Bruce V.	12/14/2018	0.30	\$995.00	\$298.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$214.50	\$172.50	\$42.00	Review and comment on remedy brief;	Remedial Proceedings

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3675	Hamilton, Kevin J.	12/17/2018	2.10	\$795.00	\$1,669.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$1,501.50	\$1,207.50	\$294.00	Review filings in preparation for telephonic hearing (1.8); conference with B. Stafford and A. Khanna regarding same (.3);	Remedial Proceedings
3676	Khanna, Abha	12/17/2018	0.60	\$665.00	\$399.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$330.00	\$246.00	\$84.00	Email with legal team in preparation for conference with court regarding remedial hearing (0.2); telephone conference with A. Riggs (NAACP) regarding same (0.2); prepare e-binder for remedial hearing (0.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3677	Hamilton, Kevin J.	12/18/2018	3.90	\$795.00	\$3,100.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$2,788.50	\$2,242.50	\$546.00	Review filings in preparation for telephonic hearing (2.4); conference with A. Khanna and B. Stafford in preparation for hearing (.5); prepare for and participate in telephonic hearing (.8); report to M. Elias and team regarding same (.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3678	Khanna, Abha	12/18/2018	0.90	\$665.00	\$598.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$495.00	\$369.00	\$126.00	Telephone conference with Court regarding remedial hearing (0.5); email and confer with K. Hamilton in preparation for same (0.3); email with legal team regarding summary of same (0.1);	Remedial Proceedings
3679	Spiva, Bruce V.	12/18/2018	0.30	\$995.00	\$298.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$214.50	\$172.50	\$42.00	Correspond with team regarding call with the Court and intervenors' requests;	Remedial Proceedings
3680	Hamilton, Kevin J.	12/19/2018	0.50	\$795.00	\$397.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$357.50	\$287.50	\$70.00	Review materials compiled for hearing on remedial maps (.5);	Remedial Proceedings
3681	Hamilton, Kevin J.	12/20/2018	1.00	\$795.00	\$795.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$140.00	Coordinate local counsel to appear at January 10 hearing (1.0);	Remedial Proceedings
3682	Hamilton, Kevin J.	12/21/2018	0.30	\$795.00	\$238.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$214.50	\$172.50	\$42.00	Exchange email with M. Rhoads regarding preparation for hearing on remedial plans (.3);	Remedial Proceedings
3683	Elias, Marc E.	12/28/2018	0.70	\$1,130.00	\$791.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$500.50	\$402.50	\$98.00	Review special master filing;	Remedial Proceedings
3684	Khanna, Abha	12/28/2018	0.40	\$665.00	\$266.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$220.00	\$164.00	\$56.00	Review special master addendum report (0.3); email with B. Stafford regarding same (0.1);	Remedial Proceedings
3685	Stafford, William B.	12/28/2018	2.20	\$675.00	\$1,485.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$1,199.00	\$891.00	\$308.00	Review special master report and prepare response to same;	Remedial Proceedings
3686	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/2/2019	1.00	\$845.00	\$845.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$175.00	Review filings and addendums to special master's report;	Remedial Proceedings
3687	Khanna, Abha	1/2/2019	0.50	\$720.00	\$360.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$295.00	\$205.00	\$90.00	Review and revise draft supplemental brief on remedy (0.3); email and confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3688	Stafford, William B.	1/2/2019	4.20	\$710.00	\$2,982.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$2,457.00	\$1,701.00	\$756.00	Draft response to special master addendum (4.0); conference with A. Khanna regarding same (.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3689	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/3/2019	1.60	\$845.00	\$1,352.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$1,200.00	\$920.00	\$280.00	Review and revise draft memorandum regarding docket entry (.9); review compilation of materials for pre-hearing preparation (.7);	Remedial Proceedings
3690	Depass, Michelle	1/4/2019	0.80	\$365.00	\$292.00	\$250.00	\$235.00	\$200.00	\$188.00	\$12.00	Assist with preparation and file brief;	Remedial Proceedings
3691	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/4/2019	1.70	\$845.00	\$1,436.50	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$1,275.00	\$977.50	\$297.50	Review and revise draft response to docket entry (.7); conference with B. Stafford regarding same (.2); conference with A. Khanna regarding pre-hearing preparation (.3); review filings from other parties (.5);	Remedial Proceedings

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3692	Khanna, Abha	1/4/2019	0.50	\$720.00	\$360.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$295.00	\$205.00	\$90.00	Review remedial submission from NAACP (0.2); prepare materials for remedial hearing and email and confer with K. Hamilton and administrative staff regarding same (0.3);	Remedial Proceedings
3693	Stafford, William B.	1/4/2019	3.20	\$710.00	\$2,272.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$1,872.00	\$1,296.00	\$576.00	Research and draft response to special master addendum;	Remedial Proceedings
3694	Khanna, Abha	1/5/2019	0.70	\$720.00	\$504.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$413.00	\$287.00	\$126.00	Review Intervenor's late-filed objections to special master proposals and take notes on same in preparation for remedial hearing (0.7);	Remedial Proceedings
3695	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/7/2019	4.50	\$845.00	\$3,802.50	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$3,375.00	\$2,587.50	\$787.50	Review materials in preparation for remedial hearing (1.5); conference with A. Khanna and B. Stafford regarding remedial hearing preparation (1.5); review court order regarding special master reports (.3); review special master reports and related materials (1.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3696	Khanna, Abha	1/7/2019	1.80	\$720.00	\$1,296.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$1,062.00	\$738.00	\$324.00	Confer with K. Hamilton and B. Stafford in preparation for remedial hearing (1.6); confer with client regarding remedial map update (0.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3697	Stafford, William B.	1/7/2019	3.00	\$710.00	\$2,130.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$1,755.00	\$1,215.00	\$540.00	Meet with K. Hamilton and A. Khanna to discuss preparations for hearing;	Remedial Proceedings
3698	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/8/2019	9.60	\$845.00	\$8,112.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$7,200.00	\$5,520.00	\$1,680.00	Review briefing regarding proposed remedial plans in preparation for remedial hearing on January 10 (5.8); telephone conference with B. Stafford regarding same (.2); telephone conference with A. Khanna regarding same (.3); outline argument for hearing (1.5); outline examination alternatives for Dr. Grofman (1.5);	Remedial Proceedings
3699	Khanna, Abha	1/8/2019	1.50	\$720.00	\$1,080.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$885.00	\$615.00	\$270.00	Review and revise draft outline for K. Hamilton in preparation for remedial hearing (0.8); confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.2); review fourth addendum report of special master (0.5);	Remedial Proceedings
3700	Stafford, William B.	1/8/2019	1.90	\$710.00	\$1,349.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$1,111.50	\$769.50	\$342.00	Review special master's latest addendum (.4); draft outline of issues for oral argument (1.5);	Remedial Proceedings
3701	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/9/2019	11.00	\$845.00	\$9,295.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$8,250.00	\$6,325.00	\$1,925.00	Review special masters reports and addenda prepared with respect to his proposed remedial districts (5.0); review Intervenor's briefing attacking special master districts and outline potential responses (2.9); review and revise outline for potential rehabilitation cross examination of special master (1.5); exchange email with A. Khanna and B. Stafford regarding same (.5); review, revise and finalize notes for argument over remedial plan (.6); coordinate logistics for hearing (.5);	Remedial Proceedings
3702	Khanna, Abha	1/9/2019	0.90	\$720.00	\$648.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$531.00	\$369.00	\$162.00	Telephone conference with K. Hamilton in preparation for remedial hearing (0.5); draft outline of questions for special master regarding same (0.3); email with B. Stafford regarding same (0.1);	Remedial Proceedings

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3703	Stafford, William B.	1/9/2019	1.00	\$710.00	\$710.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$180.00	Provide assistance to K. Hamilton regarding oral argument preparation, including telephonic conference (.5) and information via email (.5);	Remedial Proceedings
3704	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/10/2019	13.00	\$845.00	\$10,985.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$9,750.00	\$7,475.00	\$2,275.00	Prepare for and attend hearing on remedial districting maps (11.5); follow up conference with B. Stafford regarding hearing (.5); draft and circulate report on hearing (1.0);	Remedial Proceedings
3705	Khanna, Abha	1/10/2019	1.10	\$720.00	\$792.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$649.00	\$451.00	\$198.00	Email with K. Hamilton and B. Stafford to provide assistance during ongoing remedial hearing (0.5); review court orders regarding remedial hearing (0.1); confer with legal team regarding summary of (day-long) remedial hearing and next steps (0.3); review written summary of same provided by K. Hamilton (0.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3706	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/11/2019	1.90	\$845.00	\$1,605.50	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$1,425.00	\$1,092.50	\$332.50	Follow up on court orders regarding supplemental filings (.8); review court order on inquiry for data files and exchange related email (.7); follow up on hearing (.4);	Remedial Proceedings
3707	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/14/2019	0.80	\$845.00	\$676.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$600.00	\$460.00	\$140.00	Exchange email regarding supplemental filing with BVAP numbers;	Remedial Proceedings
3708	Khanna, Abha	1/14/2019	0.50	\$720.00	\$360.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$295.00	\$205.00	\$90.00	Review BVAP chart created by consulting expert (0.1); email and confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.2); review and revise cover submission and draft email to all counsel regarding same (0.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3709	Stafford, William B.	1/14/2019	1.30	\$710.00	\$923.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$760.50	\$526.50	\$234.00	Prepare submission regarding BVAP data chart requested by court;	Remedial Proceedings
3710	Depass, Michelle	1/15/2019	2.40	\$365.00	\$876.00	\$250.00	\$235.00	\$600.00	\$564.00	\$36.00	Assist with filing response to court order and prepare hard copy documents for court;	Remedial Proceedings
3711	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/15/2019	0.60	\$845.00	\$507.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$450.00	\$345.00	\$105.00	Review email regarding supplemental filing on BVAP (.6);	Remedial Proceedings
3712	Khanna, Abha	1/15/2019	0.20	\$720.00	\$144.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$118.00	\$82.00	\$36.00	Email with legal team and opposing counsel regarding joint submission on BVAP data (0.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3713	Depass, Michelle	1/17/2019	2.60	\$365.00	\$949.00	\$250.00	\$235.00	\$650.00	\$611.00	\$39.00	Prepare courtesy copies of prior filings and send to courts;	Remedial Proceedings
3714	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/17/2019	1.20	\$845.00	\$1,014.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$900.00	\$690.00	\$210.00	Review revised Special Master's report (.8); exchange email regarding same (.4);	Remedial Proceedings
3715	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/18/2019	0.70	\$845.00	\$591.50	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$525.00	\$402.50	\$122.50	Review and respond to email regarding Special Master's Second Report (.7);	Remedial Proceedings
3716	Elias, Marc E.	1/22/2019	1.00	\$1,190.00	\$1,190.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$175.00	Review court order regarding new map (.7); email regarding same (.3);	Remedial Proceedings
3717	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/29/2019	0.60	\$845.00	\$507.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$450.00	\$345.00	\$105.00	Review order regarding final remedial maps from court (.4); exchange email regarding analysis of maps (.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3718	Khanna, Abha	1/29/2019	0.60	\$720.00	\$432.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$354.00	\$246.00	\$108.00	Review special master order on final plan (0.4); email and confer with B. Stafford and consulting expert regarding same (0.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3719	Stafford, William B.	1/29/2019	0.50	\$710.00	\$355.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$292.50	\$202.50	\$90.00	Draft brief regarding Special Master's final remedial plan;	Remedial Proceedings
3720	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/30/2019	0.60	\$845.00	\$507.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$450.00	\$345.00	\$105.00	Review order from the court on remedial plans (.6);	Remedial Proceedings

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3721	Depass, Michelle	1/31/2019	0.70	\$365.00	\$255.50	\$250.00	\$235.00	\$175.00	\$164.50	\$10.50	Assist with and file response to remedial plan;	Remedial Proceedings
3722	Khanna, Abha	1/31/2019	0.60	\$720.00	\$432.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$354.00	\$246.00	\$108.00	Review and revise draft motion for division and enlargement of oral argument time (0.3); email with T. Heytens regarding same and response to U.S. motion (0.1); Review and revise draft response to special master map and email with B. Stafford regarding same (0.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3723	Spiva, Bruce V.	1/31/2019	0.30	\$1,050.00	\$315.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$225.00	\$172.50	\$52.50	Review and comment on response to Special Master's final remedial plan;	Remedial Proceedings
3724	Stafford, William B.	1/31/2019	0.50	\$710.00	\$355.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$292.50	\$202.50	\$90.00	Revise draft brief regarding final remedial plan in light of additional data flagged by consulting expert (.3); conference with consulting expert (.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3725	Khanna, Abha	2/1/2019	0.30	\$720.00	\$216.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$177.00	\$123.00	\$54.00	Review objections to remedial plan filed by Intervenor (0.3);	Remedial Proceedings
3726	Hamilton, Kevin J.	2/4/2019	0.90	\$845.00	\$760.50	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$675.00	\$517.50	\$157.50	Review order from the court on remedial map (.7); exchange related email regarding same (.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3727	Khanna, Abha	2/4/2019	0.10	\$720.00	\$72.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$59.00	\$41.00	\$18.00	Review order from Court regarding special master plan (0.1);	Remedial Proceedings
3728	Elias, Marc E.	2/14/2019	1.00	\$1,190.00	\$1,190.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$175.00	Review court decision regarding new map;	Remedial Proceedings
3729	Hamilton, Kevin J.	2/14/2019	1.00	\$845.00	\$845.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$175.00	Review order imposing remedial map (.8); exchange related email (.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3730	Khanna, Abha	2/14/2019	0.90	\$720.00	\$648.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$531.00	\$369.00	\$162.00	Review memorandum opinion on remedy (0.7); email with legal team regarding same (0.1); confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.1);	Remedial Proceedings
3731	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/21/2019	0.20	\$845.00	\$169.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$150.00	\$115.00	\$35.00	Review and respond to email regarding special master fee application;	Remedial Proceedings
3732	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/27/2019	0.50	\$845.00	\$422.50	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$375.00	\$287.50	\$87.50	Review and respond to email regarding special master's fee request (.3); review draft filing regarding same (.2);	Remedial Proceedings
3733	Stafford, William B.	3/27/2019	1.30	\$710.00	\$923.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$760.50	\$526.50	\$234.00	Draft response to special master fee request (1.3);	Remedial Proceedings
3734			304.00		\$225,322.00			\$185,288.50				SUBTOTAL for Remedial Proceedings
3735	Branch, Aria C.	8/7/2018	0.70	\$720.00	\$504.00	\$430.00	\$345.00	\$301.00	\$241.50	\$59.50	Discuss research project with S. Mahmood regarding standing and intervenors;	Second Appeal
3736	Khanna, Abha	8/9/2018	0.70	\$665.00	\$465.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$385.00	\$287.00	\$98.00	Review memo on House standing and email with legal team regarding legal strategy surrounding same (0.7);	Second Appeal
3737	Elias, Marc E.	8/30/2018	0.40	\$1,130.00	\$452.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$286.00	\$230.00	\$56.00	Review court denial of stay (.2); email regarding same (.2);	Second Appeal
3738	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/30/2018	0.50	\$795.00	\$397.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$357.50	\$287.50	\$70.00	Review order denying motion to stay (.3); conference with B. Stafford regarding same (.2);	Second Appeal
3739	Khanna, Abha	8/30/2018	0.30	\$665.00	\$199.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$165.00	\$123.00	\$42.00	Review order denying stay and confer with B. Stafford regarding same and SCOTUS stay brief (0.3);	Second Appeal
3740	Spear, Ryan M.	8/30/2018	0.20	\$675.00	\$135.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$110.00	\$82.00	\$28.00	Review order denying motion for stay of injunction (.2);	Second Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3741	Stafford, William B.	8/31/2018	2.90	\$675.00	\$1,957.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$1,580.50	\$1,174.50	\$406.00	Research and draft opposition to motion to stay before Supreme Court;	Second Appeal
3742	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/4/2018	0.90	\$795.00	\$715.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$643.50	\$517.50	\$126.00	Review jurisdictional statement (.7); conference with B. Stafford regarding same (.2);	Second Appeal
3743	Stafford, William B.	9/4/2018	1.50	\$675.00	\$1,012.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$817.50	\$607.50	\$210.00	Review jurisdictional statement to prepare preliminary analysis of proposed response to same (1.5);	Second Appeal
3744	Hamilton, Kevin J.	9/5/2018	0.50	\$795.00	\$397.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$357.50	\$287.50	\$70.00	Review jurisdictional statement and discuss with A. Khanna;	Second Appeal
3745	Khanna, Abha	9/5/2018	0.40	\$665.00	\$266.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$220.00	\$164.00	\$56.00	Email and confer with B. Stafford regarding opposition to jurisdictional statement (0.4);	Second Appeal
3746	Stafford, William B.	9/5/2018	0.60	\$675.00	\$405.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$327.00	\$243.00	\$84.00	Prepare analysis in preparation for remedial plan (.6);	Second Appeal
3747	Khanna, Abha	9/6/2018	0.30	\$665.00	\$199.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$165.00	\$123.00	\$42.00	Email and confer with B. Stafford regarding response to Jurisdictional Statement and forthcoming stay petition (0.3);	Second Appeal
3748	Elias, Marc E.	9/10/2018	1.00	\$1,130.00	\$1,130.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$140.00	Review court brief (.7); email regarding same (.3);	Second Appeal
3749	Khanna, Abha	9/11/2018	0.10	\$665.00	\$66.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$55.00	\$41.00	\$14.00	Email with B. Stafford regarding SCOTUS briefing (0.1);	Second Appeal
3750	Khanna, Abha	9/14/2018	0.10	\$665.00	\$66.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$55.00	\$41.00	\$14.00	review docketing notice and coordinate electronic filing credentials and SCOTUS brief printer (0.1);	Second Appeal
3751	Khanna, Abha	9/17/2018	0.10	\$665.00	\$66.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$55.00	\$41.00	\$14.00	Email with SCOTUS printer regarding opposition to jurisdictional statement (0.1);	Second Appeal
3752	Stafford, William B.	9/17/2018	1.00	\$675.00	\$675.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$140.00	Draft motion to dismiss or affirm;	Second Appeal
3753	Khanna, Abha	9/18/2018	0.30	\$665.00	\$199.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$165.00	\$123.00	\$42.00	Review and revise draft outline for opposition to jurisdictional statement (0.3);	Second Appeal
3754	Spear, Ryan M.	9/20/2018	0.20	\$675.00	\$135.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$110.00	\$82.00	\$28.00	Emails with litigation team regarding status and strategy regarding response to jurisdictional statement (.2);	Second Appeal
3755	Stafford, William B.	9/21/2018	2.60	\$675.00	\$1,755.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$1,417.00	\$1,053.00	\$364.00	Draft motion to dismiss or affirm;	Second Appeal
3756	Khanna, Abha	9/25/2018	2.20	\$665.00	\$1,463.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$1,210.00	\$902.00	\$308.00	Review Jurisdictional Statement in preparation for opposition brief (2.2);	Second Appeal
3757	Spear, Ryan M.	9/25/2018	0.20	\$675.00	\$135.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$110.00	\$82.00	\$28.00	Conference with A. Khanna regarding response to jurisdictional statement (.2);	Second Appeal
3758	Khanna, Abha	9/26/2018	5.70	\$665.00	\$3,790.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$3,135.00	\$2,337.00	\$798.00	Research and draft SCOTUS opposition to Jurisdictional Statement (5.7);	Second Appeal
3759	Louijeune, Ruthzee	9/26/2018	0.60	\$630.00	\$378.00	\$430.00	\$320.00	\$258.00	\$192.00	\$66.00	Confer regarding research assignment regarding jurisdictional statement (0.2); begin research assignment regarding same (0.4);	Second Appeal
3760	Khanna, Abha	9/27/2018	5.50	\$665.00	\$3,657.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$3,025.00	\$2,255.00	\$770.00	Research and draft opposition to SCOTUS Jurisdictional Statement (5.5);	Second Appeal
3761	Louijeune, Ruthzee	9/27/2018	0.80	\$630.00	\$504.00	\$430.00	\$320.00	\$344.00	\$256.00	\$88.00	Write e-mail summarizing research findings for jurisdictional statement (0.8);	Second Appeal
3762	Louijeune, Ruthzee	9/27/2018	4.30	\$630.00	\$2,709.00	\$430.00	\$320.00	\$1,849.00	\$1,376.00	\$473.00	Conduct research into cases cited by Defendants regarding law of the case and weight courts have given to core preservation as a redistricting principle;	Second Appeal
3763	Khanna, Abha	9/28/2018	5.40	\$665.00	\$3,591.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$2,970.00	\$2,214.00	\$756.00	Research and draft opposition to SCOTUS jurisdictional statement (5.4);	Second Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3764	Spear, Ryan M.	9/28/2018	0.10	\$675.00	\$67.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$55.00	\$41.00	\$14.00	Review status report (.1);	Second Appeal
3765	Stafford, William B.	9/28/2018	0.50	\$675.00	\$337.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$272.50	\$202.50	\$70.00	Prepare for and conference with A. Khanna regarding motion to dismiss or affirm;	Second Appeal
3766	Khanna, Abha	9/29/2018	1.10	\$665.00	\$731.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$605.00	\$451.00	\$154.00	Research and draft SCOTUS opposition brief (1.1);	Second Appeal
3767	Spear, Ryan M.	9/29/2018	5.00	\$675.00	\$3,375.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$2,750.00	\$2,050.00	\$700.00	Prepare motion to affirm (3.0); research issues regarding same (2.0);	Second Appeal
3768	Khanna, Abha	9/30/2018	3.90	\$665.00	\$2,593.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$2,145.00	\$1,599.00	\$546.00	Research and draft SCOTUS opposition to Jurisdictional Statement (3.9);	Second Appeal
3769	Spear, Ryan M.	9/30/2018	2.40	\$675.00	\$1,620.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$1,320.00	\$984.00	\$336.00	Prepare motion to affirm (1.4); research issues regarding same (1.0);	Second Appeal
3770	Khanna, Abha	10/1/2018	3.00	\$665.00	\$1,995.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$1,650.00	\$1,230.00	\$420.00	Draft, review and revise SCOTUS opposition brief (3.0);	Second Appeal
3771	Spear, Ryan M.	10/1/2018	8.70	\$675.00	\$5,872.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$4,785.00	\$3,567.00	\$1,218.00	Prepare motion to affirm (7.5); research issues regarding same (1.0); emails with A. Khanna regarding same (.2);	Second Appeal
3772	Khanna, Abha	10/2/2018	7.00	\$665.00	\$4,655.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$3,850.00	\$2,870.00	\$980.00	Revise and draft SCOTUS motion to dismiss or affirm (7.0);	Second Appeal
3773	Spear, Ryan M.	10/2/2018	5.30	\$675.00	\$3,577.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$2,915.00	\$2,173.00	\$742.00	Prepare motion to affirm (3.5); research issues regarding same (1.3); emails with A. Khanna and B. Stafford regarding same (.5);	Second Appeal
3774	Stafford, William B.	10/2/2018	1.30	\$675.00	\$877.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$708.50	\$526.50	\$182.00	Research and draft parts of motion to dismiss or affirm;	Second Appeal
3775	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/3/2018	2.20	\$795.00	\$1,749.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$1,573.00	\$1,265.00	\$308.00	Review and revise draft motion to dismiss or affirm (2.0); exchange related email (.2);	Second Appeal
3776	Khanna, Abha	10/3/2018	6.60	\$665.00	\$4,389.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$3,630.00	\$2,706.00	\$924.00	Draft, review, and revise SCOTUS opposition brief (6.3); confer and email with legal team regarding same (0.3);	Second Appeal
3777	Louijeune, Ruthzee	10/3/2018	2.70	\$630.00	\$1,701.00	\$430.00	\$320.00	\$1,161.00	\$864.00	\$297.00	Research case law supporting proposition that agreeing to or stipulating to the admissibility of expert testimony equals waiver of Daubert objection (1.0); research citations stating that courts can properly infer legislative intent from the results/impact of the map (1.2); draft e-mail with findings (0.5);	Second Appeal
3778	Spear, Ryan M.	10/3/2018	5.10	\$675.00	\$3,442.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$2,805.00	\$2,091.00	\$714.00	Prepare motion to affirm (4.0); research issues regarding same (.6); emails with A. Khanna and B. Stafford regarding same (.5);	Second Appeal
3779	Branch, Aria C.	10/4/2018	0.50	\$720.00	\$360.00	\$430.00	\$345.00	\$215.00	\$172.50	\$42.50	Research for Supreme Court brief;	Second Appeal
3780	Khanna, Abha	10/4/2018	6.50	\$665.00	\$4,322.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$3,575.00	\$2,665.00	\$910.00	Review and revise draft SCOTUS opposition brief and prepare same for printer (6.0); email and confer with legal team regarding same (0.4); prepare appendix to same (0.1);	Second Appeal
3781	Spear, Ryan M.	10/4/2018	4.10	\$675.00	\$2,767.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$2,255.00	\$1,681.00	\$574.00	Prepare motion to affirm (3.3); emails with A. Khanna and B. Stafford regarding same (.8);	Second Appeal
3782	Stafford,	10/4/2018	5.80	\$675.00	\$3,915.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$3,161.00	\$2,349.00	\$812.00	Draft and revise motion to dismiss or affirm;	Second Appeal
3783	Branch, Aria C.	10/5/2018	0.10	\$720.00	\$72.00	\$430.00	\$345.00	\$43.00	\$34.50	\$8.50	Review question related to Supreme Court brief;	Second Appeal
3784	Gitt Webster, Mallory	10/5/2018	1.90	\$465.00	\$883.50	\$370.00	\$370.00	\$703.00	\$703.00	\$0.00	Conference with B. Stafford (.3); research Supreme Court and Courts of Appeals decisions regarding delay in seeking a stay pending appeal (1.6);	Second Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3785	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/5/2018	0.80	\$795.00	\$636.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$572.00	\$460.00	\$112.00	Conference with A. Khanna and B. Stafford regarding motion to affirm or dismiss (.5); follow up email regarding footnote on standing (.3);	Second Appeal
3786	Khanna, Abha	10/5/2018	4.10	\$665.00	\$2,726.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$2,255.00	\$1,681.00	\$574.00	Confer with legal team regarding briefing strategy (0.5); confer with R. Spear regarding Georgia v. Ashcroft argument (0.3); review and revise printer's proofs of SCOTUS brief (3.3);	Second Appeal
3787	Marino, Patricia	10/5/2018	3.40	\$300.00	\$1,020.00	\$235.00	\$190.00	\$799.00	\$646.00	\$153.00	Respond to attorney request for information/documents in connection with appeal; review parties trial exhibits and revise/update tracking index for attorney further evaluation;	Second Appeal
3788	Spear, Ryan M.	10/5/2018	1.80	\$675.00	\$1,215.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$990.00	\$738.00	\$252.00	Conference with K. Hamilton, A. Khanna, and W. Stafford regarding motion to affirm (.5); prepare motion to affirm (.8); emails with A. Khanna and W. Stafford regarding same (.2); conference with A. Khanna regarding same (.3);	Second Appeal
3789	Stafford,	10/5/2018	1.20	\$675.00	\$810.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$654.00	\$486.00	\$168.00	Revise motion to dismiss or affirm;	Second Appeal
3790	Elias, Marc E.	10/6/2018	1.50	\$1,130.00	\$1,695.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$1,072.50	\$862.50	\$210.00	Review draft motion to dismiss appeal;	Second Appeal
3791	Hamilton,	10/6/2018	0.50	\$795.00	\$397.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$357.50	\$287.50	\$70.00	Review draft motion to dismiss or affirm;	Second Appeal
3792	Spear, Ryan M.	10/6/2018	3.50	\$675.00	\$2,362.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$1,925.00	\$1,435.00	\$490.00	Prepare motion to affirm (3.1); research issues regarding same (.6); emails with A. Khanna and W. Stafford regarding same (.1);	Second Appeal
3793	Khanna, Abha	10/7/2018	0.50	\$665.00	\$332.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$275.00	\$205.00	\$70.00	Review and revise draft SCOTUS brief (0.5);	Second Appeal
3794	Spear, Ryan M.	10/7/2018	3.50	\$675.00	\$2,362.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$1,925.00	\$1,435.00	\$490.00	Prepare motion to affirm (3.5);	Second Appeal
3795	Spiva, Bruce V.	10/7/2018	1.00	\$995.00	\$995.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$140.00	Review draft motion to dismiss or affirm and comment on same;	Second Appeal
3796	Gitt Webster, Mallory	10/8/2018	2.60	\$465.00	\$1,209.00	\$370.00	\$370.00	\$962.00	\$962.00	\$0.00	Research and analyze federal appellate court treatment of a delay in seeking a stay pending appeal (1.5); conference with B. Stafford (.3); draft and revise case citations with parenthetical explanations (.6);	Second Appeal
3797	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/8/2018	0.80	\$795.00	\$636.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$572.00	\$460.00	\$112.00	Review and respond to email regarding finalization of motion to affirm or dismiss (.5); review and respond to email regarding state's motion (.3);	Second Appeal
3798	Khanna, Abha	10/8/2018	5.90	\$665.00	\$3,923.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$3,245.00	\$2,419.00	\$826.00	Review and revise multiple redrafts of SCOTUS brief (5.3); email with legal team regarding same (0.2); confer with R. Spear regarding legal strategy for narrow tailoring section (0.4);	Second Appeal
3799	Marino, Patricia	10/8/2018	0.20	\$300.00	\$60.00	\$235.00	\$190.00	\$47.00	\$38.00	\$9.00	Follow-up communication with A. Khanna regarding appeal brief and trial exhibit issues;	Second Appeal
3800	Spear, Ryan M.	10/8/2018	3.40	\$675.00	\$2,295.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$1,870.00	\$1,394.00	\$476.00	Prepare motion to affirm (2.9); emails with A. Khanna and B. Stafford regarding same (.5);	Second Appeal
3801	Khanna, Abha	10/9/2018	2.60	\$665.00	\$1,729.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$1,430.00	\$1,066.00	\$364.00	Review, revise, and finalize for filing and printing SCOTUS Motion to Dismiss or Affirm (2.3); coordinate electronic filing of same (0.3);	Second Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3802	Spear, Ryan M.	10/9/2018	4.00	\$675.00	\$2,700.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$2,200.00	\$1,640.00	\$560.00	Prepare motion to affirm (3.2); emails with A. Khanna regarding same (.1); conference with A. Khanna regarding same (.2); review State Defendants' motion to dismiss (.4); emails with A. Khanna and W. Stafford regarding same (.1);	Second Appeal
3803	Spiva, Bruce V.	10/9/2018	0.50	\$995.00	\$497.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$357.50	\$287.50	\$70.00	Review and comment on revised motion to dismiss or affirm;	Second Appeal
3804	Stafford,	10/9/2018	1.40	\$675.00	\$945.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$763.00	\$567.00	\$196.00	Review and revise jurisdictional statement;	Second Appeal
3805	Hamilton,	10/12/2018	1.00	\$795.00	\$795.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$140.00	Review state motion to dismiss (1.0);	Second Appeal
3806	Stafford, William B.	10/12/2018	0.80	\$675.00	\$540.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$436.00	\$324.00	\$112.00	Research and draft opposition to stay application;	Second Appeal
3807	Khanna, Abha	10/16/2018	0.20	\$665.00	\$133.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$110.00	\$82.00	\$28.00	Confer with clerk of U.S. Supreme Court regarding electronic filing notice (0.1); email with M. Elias regarding same (0.1);	Second Appeal
3808	Spiva, Bruce V.	10/17/2018	0.70	\$995.00	\$696.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$500.50	\$402.50	\$98.00	Review State's motion to dismiss intervenors' Supreme Court appeal;	Second Appeal
3809	Hamilton,	10/22/2018	0.20	\$795.00	\$159.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$143.00	\$115.00	\$28.00	Review motion to dismiss or affirm (.2);	Second Appeal
3810	Hamilton,	10/23/2018	1.10	\$795.00	\$874.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$786.50	\$632.50	\$154.00	Review opposition to motion to dismiss (1.1)	Second Appeal
3811	Hamilton,	10/24/2018	0.90	\$795.00	\$715.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$643.50	\$517.50	\$126.00	Review opposition to dismiss or affirm (.9);	Second Appeal
3812	Hamilton, Kevin J.	10/26/2018	1.40	\$795.00	\$1,113.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$1,001.00	\$805.00	\$196.00	Review opposition to motion to dismiss or affirm (.8); exchange related email (.6);	Second Appeal
3813	Khanna, Abha	11/12/2018	0.10	\$665.00	\$66.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$55.00	\$41.00	\$14.00	Email with client regarding Supreme Court review of and decision on jurisdictional statement (0.1);	Second Appeal
3814	Khanna, Abha	11/13/2018	0.50	\$665.00	\$332.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$275.00	\$205.00	\$70.00	Review SCOTUS order granting jurisdiction and email with client and legal team regarding same (0.5);	Second Appeal
3815	Hamilton, Kevin J.	11/16/2018	1.00	\$795.00	\$795.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$140.00	Review and respond to email regarding Supreme Court review (.5); exchange email regarding compiling record for Supreme Court merits briefing (.5);	Second Appeal
3816	Gitt Webster, Mallory	11/28/2018	3.70	\$465.00	\$1,720.50	\$370.00	\$370.00	\$1,369.00	\$1,369.00	\$0.00	Research Local Rules for the Eastern District of Virginia regarding time for responding to motions (.3); research standard under Fourth Circuit law and the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure for a motion for reconsideration (2.8); draft legal standard for a motion for reconsideration (.6);	Second Appeal
3817	Hamilton, Kevin J.	11/28/2018	0.50	\$795.00	\$397.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$357.50	\$287.50	\$70.00	Review briefing on emergency motion (.3); conference with B. Stafford regarding same (.2);	Second Appeal
3818	Khanna, Abha	11/28/2018	0.50	\$665.00	\$332.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$275.00	\$205.00	\$70.00	Email and confer with B. Stafford regarding Intervenor's proposed motion to stay and motion to expedite (0.3); review and revise draft opposition to motion to expedite (0.2);	Second Appeal
3819	Spiva, Bruce V.	11/28/2018	0.30	\$995.00	\$298.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$214.50	\$172.50	\$42.00	Confer with team regarding intervenors' motion to stay;	Second Appeal
3820	Stafford, William B.	11/28/2018	1.10	\$675.00	\$742.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$599.50	\$445.50	\$154.00	Draft opposition to motion to expedite (.9); exchange correspondence with opposing counsel and team regarding motion to expedite and motion to stay (.2);	Second Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3821	Stafford, William B.	11/28/2018	4.20	\$675.00	\$2,835.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$2,289.00	\$1,701.00	\$588.00	Correspondence with opposing counsel and related correspondence with team regarding motions to stay and to expedite (.4); draft opposition to motion to expedite (1.5); draft opposition to motion to stay (2.2);	Second Appeal
3822	Depass,	11/29/2018	0.30	\$310.00	\$93.00	\$235.00	\$235.00	\$70.50	\$70.50	\$0.00	Assist with and file opposition to motion;	Second Appeal
3823	Gitt Webster, Mallory	11/29/2018	0.30	\$465.00	\$139.50	\$370.00	\$370.00	\$111.00	\$111.00	\$0.00	Conference with B. Stafford regarding research and drafting standing argument for brief opposing motion to stay;	Second Appeal
3824	Hamilton, Kevin J.	11/29/2018	0.90	\$795.00	\$715.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$643.50	\$517.50	\$126.00	Review emergency motion for stay (.3); exchange email with B. Stafford regarding opposition (.2); review opposition (.4);	Second Appeal
3825	Khanna, Abha	11/29/2018	0.90	\$665.00	\$598.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$495.00	\$369.00	\$126.00	Review and revise draft opposition to motion to expedite (0.1); Email and confer with B. Stafford regarding same and argument in response to motion to stay (0.8)	Second Appeal
3826	Spiva, Bruce V.	11/29/2018	0.40	\$995.00	\$398.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$286.00	\$230.00	\$56.00	Review and comment on brief in opposition to motion to stay;	Second Appeal
3827	Stafford,	11/29/2018	4.10	\$675.00	\$2,767.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$2,234.50	\$1,660.50	\$574.00	Research and draft opposition to motion for stay;	Second Appeal
3828	Gitt Webster, Mallory	11/30/2018	2.50	\$465.00	\$1,162.50	\$370.00	\$370.00	\$925.00	\$925.00	\$0.00	Review case materials (.4); research standing on appeal for an intervenor when the defendant declines to appeal (2.1);	Second Appeal
3829	Hamilton, Kevin J.	11/30/2018	0.50	\$795.00	\$397.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$357.50	\$287.50	\$70.00	Review draft opposition to emergency motion (.3); exchange email with B. Stafford regarding same (.2);	Second Appeal
3830	Khanna, Abha	11/30/2018	0.20	\$665.00	\$133.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$110.00	\$82.00	\$28.00	Email with B. Stafford regarding opposition to stay application (0.2);	Second Appeal
3831	Stafford,	11/30/2018	2.10	\$675.00	\$1,417.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$1,144.50	\$850.50	\$294.00	Research and draft opposition to motion for stay;	Second Appeal
3832	Gitt Webster, Mallory	12/1/2018	2.80	\$465.00	\$1,302.00	\$370.00	\$370.00	\$1,036.00	\$1,036.00	\$0.00	Research standing on appeal for an intervenor when the defendant declines to appeal;	Second Appeal
3833	Gitt Webster, Mallory	12/2/2018	1.70	\$465.00	\$790.50	\$370.00	\$370.00	\$629.00	\$629.00	\$0.00	Research standing on appeal for an intervenor when the defendant declines to appeal;	Second Appeal
3834	Elias, Marc E.	12/3/2018	1.00	\$1,130.00	\$1,130.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$140.00	Review opposition to motion to stay;	Second Appeal
3835	Gitt Webster, Mallory	12/3/2018	0.80	\$465.00	\$372.00	\$370.00	\$370.00	\$296.00	\$296.00	\$0.00	Conference with B. Stafford regarding standing argument for opposition to motion for a stay pending appeal (.6); draft outline for standing argument (.2);	Second Appeal
3836	Hamilton, Kevin J.	12/3/2018	0.50	\$795.00	\$397.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$357.50	\$287.50	\$70.00	Review draft opposition to motion for stay (.3); conference with B. Stafford regarding same (.2);	Second Appeal
3837	Khanna, Abha	12/3/2018	0.90	\$665.00	\$598.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$495.00	\$369.00	\$126.00	Review and revise draft stay opposition (0.5); confer with B. Stafford regarding same and intricacies of standing argument on appeal in preparation for SCOTUS stay briefing (0.4);	Second Appeal
3838	Stafford, William B.	12/3/2018	2.50	\$675.00	\$1,687.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$1,362.50	\$1,012.50	\$350.00	Conference with M. Webster regarding standing argument for insertion into merits brief and/or opposition to potential application for stay before Supreme Court (.6); draft opposition to anticipated application for stay (1.9);	Second Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3839	Gitt Webster, Mallory	12/4/2018	2.90	\$465.00	\$1,348.50	\$370.00	\$370.00	\$1,073.00	\$1,073.00	\$0.00	Research institutional standing and requirements for institutional injury (1.9); draft standing argument regarding a state's interest and authorization to proceed under state law (1.0);	Second Appeal
3840	Hamilton,	12/4/2018	0.20	\$795.00	\$159.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$143.00	\$115.00	\$28.00	Follow up on opposition to motion to stay;	Second Appeal
3841	Khanna, Abha	12/4/2018	0.10	\$665.00	\$66.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$55.00	\$41.00	\$14.00	Confer with B. Stafford in preparation for SCOTUS stay briefing and special master plan (0.1);	Second Appeal
3842	Depass,	12/5/2018	0.50	\$310.00	\$155.00	\$235.00	\$235.00	\$117.50	\$117.50	\$0.00	Prepare and file pleadings;	Second Appeal
3843	Gitt Webster, Mallory	12/5/2018	8.20	\$465.00	\$3,813.00	\$370.00	\$370.00	\$3,034.00	\$3,034.00	\$0.00	Draft standing argument based on the state's interests and authorization under state law; draft standing argument based on institutional injury requirements; research legal standard for Article III standing; research institutional standing;	Second Appeal
3844	Hamilton, Kevin J.	12/5/2018	1.50	\$795.00	\$1,192.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$1,072.50	\$862.50	\$210.00	Review and revise draft opposition to motion to stay (1.1); conference with B. Stafford regarding same (.4);	Second Appeal
3845	Spiva, Bruce V.	12/5/2018	0.70	\$995.00	\$696.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$500.50	\$402.50	\$98.00	Review and comment on our stay opposition brief;	Second Appeal
3846	Stafford,	12/5/2018	1.70	\$675.00	\$1,147.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$926.50	\$688.50	\$238.00	Research and draft opposition to motion for stay;	Second Appeal
3847	Gitt Webster, Mallory	12/6/2018	6.70	\$465.00	\$3,115.50	\$370.00	\$370.00	\$2,479.00	\$2,479.00	\$0.00	Draft, revise, and edit standing argument; conference with B. Stafford regarding timing of opposition to motion to stay pending appeal and merits of standing argument;	Second Appeal
3848	Khanna, Abha	12/6/2018	0.40	\$665.00	\$266.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$220.00	\$164.00	\$56.00	review draft argument on standing circulated by M. Webster and email with legal team regarding same (0.4);	Second Appeal
3849	Gitt Webster, Mallory	12/7/2018	0.20	\$465.00	\$93.00	\$370.00	\$370.00	\$74.00	\$74.00	\$0.00	Conference with B. Stafford regarding timing of opposition to motion to stay pending appeal;	Second Appeal
3850	Hamilton, Kevin J.	12/7/2018	0.50	\$795.00	\$397.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$357.50	\$287.50	\$70.00	Review reply in support of motion to stay (.3); review order denying motion to stay (.2);	Second Appeal
3851	Khanna, Abha	12/7/2018	0.60	\$665.00	\$399.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$330.00	\$246.00	\$84.00	Review Intervenor's reply in support of stay (0.5); review order on motion for stay (0.1);	Second Appeal
3852	Spiva, Bruce V.	12/7/2018	0.40	\$995.00	\$398.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$286.00	\$230.00	\$56.00	Correspond with A. Khanna and team regarding Bethune Hill footnote in special master's report and potential significance for laches argument;	Second Appeal
3853	Khanna, Abha	12/10/2018	0.30	\$665.00	\$199.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$165.00	\$123.00	\$42.00	email with legal team regarding same and implicated standing issues (0.3);	Second Appeal
3854	Gitt Webster, Mallory	12/11/2018	0.30	\$465.00	\$139.50	\$370.00	\$370.00	\$111.00	\$111.00	\$0.00	Conference with B. Stafford regarding the status of Intervenor's motion to stay pending appeal and arguments regarding standing in light of the District Court's adoption of a remedial plan;	Second Appeal
3855	Elias, Marc E.	12/13/2018	2.00	\$1,130.00	\$2,260.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$1,430.00	\$1,150.00	\$280.00	Review stay petition (1.0); review materials regarding same (1.0);	Second Appeal
3856	Khanna, Abha	12/13/2018	1.50	\$665.00	\$997.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$825.00	\$615.00	\$210.00	Review SCOTUS stay petition and confer with B. Stafford regarding same (1.5);	Second Appeal
3857	Stafford, William B.	12/13/2018	4.70	\$675.00	\$3,172.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$2,561.50	\$1,903.50	\$658.00	Review application for stay and begin drafting opposition to same (4.7);	Second Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3858	Khanna, Abha	12/14/2018	0.70	\$665.00	\$465.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$385.00	\$287.00	\$98.00	Email and confer with B. Stafford regarding legal strategy and argument for stay opposition (0.7);	Second Appeal
3859	Stafford, William B.	12/15/2018	6.90	\$675.00	\$4,657.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$3,760.50	\$2,794.50	\$966.00	Research and draft opposition to application for stay;	Second Appeal
3860	Gitt Webster, Mallory	12/16/2018	2.40	\$465.00	\$1,116.00	\$370.00	\$370.00	\$888.00	\$888.00	\$0.00	Review Intervenor's motion to the United States Supreme Court for a stay pending appeal (.5); research the procedural posture and factual background of the cases Intervenor's cite to argue that a stay pending appeal in redistricting cases is typical (1.5); summarize research regarding the procedural posture and factual background of those cases (.4);	Second Appeal
3861	Stafford, William B.	12/16/2018	4.30	\$675.00	\$2,902.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$2,343.50	\$1,741.50	\$602.00	Research and draft opposition to stay application;	Second Appeal
3862	Gitt Webster, Mallory	12/17/2018	0.90	\$465.00	\$418.50	\$370.00	\$370.00	\$333.00	\$333.00	\$0.00	Analyze Coleman v. Miller decision (0.4); draft section regarding Coleman v. Miller decision for response to motion for a stay pending appeal (0.2); conference with B. Stafford regarding standing arguments in response to motion for a stay pending appeal (0.3);	Second Appeal
3863	Khanna, Abha	12/17/2018	1.90	\$665.00	\$1,263.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$1,045.00	\$779.00	\$266.00	Research and email with legal team procedures for filing and service of stay opposition (0.4); review stay petition in preparation for opposition brief (1.5);	Second Appeal
3864	Stafford, William B.	12/17/2018	5.60	\$675.00	\$3,780.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$3,052.00	\$2,268.00	\$784.00	Research and draft opposition to stay application;	Second Appeal
3865	Khanna, Abha	12/18/2018	3.30	\$665.00	\$2,194.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$1,815.00	\$1,353.00	\$462.00	Review and revise draft SCOTUS stay opposition (3.3);	Second Appeal
3866	Stafford, William B.	12/18/2018	1.60	\$675.00	\$1,080.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$872.00	\$648.00	\$224.00	Review and revise opposition to stay application to incorporate A. Khanna comments;	Second Appeal
3867	Hamilton, Kevin J.	12/19/2018	2.40	\$795.00	\$1,908.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$1,716.00	\$1,380.00	\$336.00	Review and revise draft brief in opposition to emergency motion to stay in U.S. Supreme Court (1.9); conference with B. Stafford regarding same (.3); conference with A. Khanna regarding same(.2);	Second Appeal
3868	Khanna, Abha	12/19/2018	2.20	\$665.00	\$1,463.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$1,210.00	\$902.00	\$308.00	Review, revise, and finalize for filing SCOTUS brief and proof of service (1.9); email with legal team regarding same (0.3);	Second Appeal
3869	Stafford, William B.	12/19/2018	0.90	\$675.00	\$607.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$490.50	\$364.50	\$126.00	Conduct final review of opposition to stay application and draft filing instructions for M. DePass;	Second Appeal
3870	Depass,	12/20/2018	3.80	\$310.00	\$1,178.00	\$235.00	\$235.00	\$893.00	\$893.00	\$0.00	Prepare and file Supreme Court brief;	Second Appeal
3871	Hamilton, Kevin J.	12/20/2018	1.30	\$795.00	\$1,033.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$929.50	\$747.50	\$182.00	Conference with A. Khanna regarding joint appendix issues (.5); review related email (.5); review final brief filed in Supreme Court opposing stay (.3);	Second Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3872	Khanna, Abha	12/20/2018	1.30	\$665.00	\$864.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$715.00	\$533.00	\$182.00	Coordinate finalization and filing of SCOTUS stay opposition and email with B. Stafford and M. DePass regarding same (0.3); email with opposing counsel regarding joint appendix (0.1); review docket entries reflected in same (0.2); email and confer with legal team regarding same (0.3); email and confer with B. Stafford in preparation for remedial briefing and SCOTUS merits brief (0.4);	Second Appeal
3873	Stafford, William B.	12/20/2018	0.60	\$675.00	\$405.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$327.00	\$243.00	\$84.00	Exchange correspondence with A. Khanna and M. DePass regarding final issues concerning formatting and filing;	Second Appeal
3874	Gitt Webster, Mallory	12/21/2018	0.40	\$465.00	\$186.00	\$370.00	\$370.00	\$148.00	\$148.00	\$0.00	Conference with B. Stafford regarding Intervenor's arguments about standing in their reply brief;	Second Appeal
3875	Hamilton, Kevin J.	12/21/2018	0.70	\$795.00	\$556.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$500.50	\$402.50	\$98.00	Review and respond to internal email among legal team regarding joint appendix (.5); review exchange of email with opposing counsel regarding same (.2);	Second Appeal
3876	Khanna, Abha	12/21/2018	0.40	\$665.00	\$266.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$220.00	\$164.00	\$56.00	Review stay reply brief filed by Intervenor and email with B. Stafford regarding same (0.4);	Second Appeal
3877	Stafford, William B.	12/21/2018	1.60	\$675.00	\$1,080.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$872.00	\$648.00	\$224.00	Review proposed joint appendix citations (.4); provide proposed response to same to A. Khanna (.1); review appellants' reply brief regarding stay specifically for arguments regarding standing and prepare summary of response to same (1.1);	Second Appeal
3878	Gitt Webster, Mallory	12/23/2018	1.20	\$465.00	\$558.00	\$370.00	\$370.00	\$444.00	\$444.00	\$0.00	Review Intervenor's motion for a stay pending appeal (0.5); review Appellees' response to motion for a stay pending appeal (0.5); and review Intervenor's reply in support of motion for a stay pending appeal (0.2);	Second Appeal
3879	Khanna, Abha	12/24/2018	0.30	\$665.00	\$199.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$165.00	\$123.00	\$42.00	Download and review draft joint appendix (0.2); email with opposing counsel regarding same (0.1);	Second Appeal
3880	Khanna, Abha	1/2/2019	1.70	\$720.00	\$1,224.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$1,003.00	\$697.00	\$306.00	Confer with B. Stafford regarding SCOTUS arguments (0.2); email with printer regarding deadlines for SCOTUS response brief (0.1); review Appellants' opening brief (1.4);	Second Appeal
3881	Stafford, William B.	1/2/2019	0.20	\$710.00	\$142.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$117.00	\$81.00	\$36.00	Conference with A. Khanna regarding supreme court response (.2);	Second Appeal
3882	Khanna, Abha	1/3/2019	2.70	\$720.00	\$1,944.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$1,593.00	\$1,107.00	\$486.00	Review and draft notes and outline in response to opening SCOTUS brief (2.7);	Second Appeal
3883	Gitt Webster, Mallory	1/4/2019	0.75	\$525.00	\$393.75	\$400.00	\$370.00	\$300.00	\$277.50	\$22.50	Conference with B. Stafford regarding standing arguments to include in response to Intervenor's merits brief before the United States Supreme Court;	Second Appeal
3884	Khanna, Abha	1/4/2019	2.90	\$720.00	\$2,088.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$1,711.00	\$1,189.00	\$522.00	Draft outline and comments for SCOTUS brief (1.9); meet with R. Spear and B. Stafford regarding same (including legal strategy and delegation of assignments) (1.0);	Second Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3885	Spear, Ryan M.	1/4/2019	3.40	\$730.00	\$2,482.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$2,006.00	\$1,394.00	\$612.00	Review appellants' opening brief (.7); research issues regarding same (.5); conference with A. Khanna and W. Stafford regarding status and strategy, including preparation of appellees' brief (1.1); emails with A. Khanna regarding research issues (.1);	Second Appeal
3886	Frost, Elisabeth C.	1/7/2019	0.20	\$995.00	\$199.00	\$570.00	\$390.00	\$114.00	\$78.00	\$36.00	Telephone call with A. Khanna regarding preparing for SCOTUS argument	Second Appeal
3887	Gitt Webster, Mallory	1/7/2019	1.10	\$525.00	\$577.50	\$400.00	\$370.00	\$440.00	\$407.00	\$33.00	Email conference with A. Khanna and B. Stafford regarding narrow tailoring and standing research (.3); review Intervenor's merits brief (.8);	Second Appeal
3888	Khanna, Abha	1/7/2019	1.40	\$720.00	\$1,008.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$826.00	\$574.00	\$252.00	Review Solicitor General's Amicus Brief (1.1); email with M. Webster and R. Louijune regarding research assignments for SCOTUS briefs (0.3);	Second Appeal
3889	Elias, Marc E.	1/8/2019	0.30	\$1,190.00	\$357.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$225.00	\$172.50	\$52.50	Review Supreme Court order (.1); email regarding same (.2);	Second Appeal
3890	Gitt Webster, Mallory	1/8/2019	2.30	\$525.00	\$1,207.50	\$400.00	\$370.00	\$920.00	\$851.00	\$69.00	Research whether time constraints factor into analysis of race-based redistricting (1.1); draft standing argument (1.2);	Second Appeal
3891	Khanna, Abha	1/8/2019	0.60	\$720.00	\$432.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$354.00	\$246.00	\$108.00	Review research results from R. Louijune and email with R. Louijune regarding same (0.2); draft outline in response to U.S. amicus brief and email with legal team regarding same (0.3); email with legal team regarding SCOTUS stay denial (0.1);	Second Appeal
3892	Louijune, Ruthzee	1/8/2019	2.80	\$755.00	\$2,114.00	\$480.00	\$320.00	\$1,344.00	\$896.00	\$448.00	Conduct research on what the courts and the Department of Justice have stated regarding the best evidence needed to perform a functional analysis, and whether such evidence required data from contested elections (1.8); draft e-mail with research findings (0.7); confer with counsel (0.3);	Second Appeal
3893	Stafford,	1/8/2019	2.80	\$710.00	\$1,988.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$1,638.00	\$1,134.00	\$504.00	Draft section of supreme court brief (2.8);	Second Appeal
3894	Branch, Aria C.	1/9/2019	1.00	\$815.00	\$815.00	\$480.00	\$345.00	\$480.00	\$345.00	\$135.00	Perform research for SCOTUS brief;	Second Appeal
3895	Gitt Webster, Mallory	1/9/2019	3.20	\$525.00	\$1,680.00	\$400.00	\$370.00	\$1,280.00	\$1,184.00	\$96.00	Research whether time constraints factor into analysis of race-based redistricting (1.2); draft standing argument (1.0); conference with B. Stafford regarding time constraints (.2); review Intervenor's previous briefing to determine evolution of standing arguments (.8);	Second Appeal
3896	Gitt Webster, Mallory	1/10/2019	5.95	\$525.00	\$3,123.75	\$400.00	\$370.00	\$2,380.00	\$2,201.50	\$178.50	Research whether time constraints factor into analysis of race-based redistricting (.9); draft standing argument (3.6); conference with A. Khanna regarding time constraints (.3); review Intervenor's previous briefing to determine evolution of standing arguments (1.15);	Second Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3897	Louijeune, Ruthzee	1/10/2019	1.80	\$755.00	\$1,359.00	\$480.00	\$320.00	\$864.00	\$576.00	\$288.00	Conduct research on whether Supreme Court or 4th Circuit has made any general pronouncement about district court's ability to reopen the entire record when case remanded (1.8);	Second Appeal
3898	Stafford,	1/10/2019	6.00	\$710.00	\$4,260.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$3,510.00	\$2,430.00	\$1,080.00	Research and draft section of merits brief;	Second Appeal
3899	Gitt Webster, Mallory	1/11/2019	6.50	\$525.00	\$3,412.50	\$400.00	\$370.00	\$2,600.00	\$2,405.00	\$195.00	Draft and revise standing argument (4.2); research law to support standing argument (2.3);	Second Appeal
3900	Khanna, Abha	1/11/2019	0.50	\$720.00	\$360.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$295.00	\$205.00	\$90.00	Review research summaries provided by M. Webster and R. Louijeune for SCOTUS brief (0.3); confer with M. Webster regarding same (0.2);	Second Appeal
3901	Louijeune, Ruthzee	1/11/2019	5.00	\$755.00	\$3,775.00	\$480.00	\$320.00	\$2,400.00	\$1,600.00	\$800.00	Conduct research on whether Supreme Court or another federal court has made any pronouncements about trial court re-opening record in full on remand in light of new evidence to question credibility determination of witness at first trial (1.7); read past brief on issue (0.3); have call with researcher regarding support for proposition (0.3); draft analysis of findings (0.5); conduct research regarding whether anything under state law or Constitution requires run-off elections (0.7); draft e-mail with findings (0.3); conduct research on whether Intervenor-Defendants could have cross-appealed (0.8); draft analysis (0.4);	Second Appeal
3902	Spear, Ryan M.	1/11/2019	0.10	\$730.00	\$73.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$59.00	\$41.00	\$18.00	Conference with W. Stafford regarding stipulation of admissibility;	Second Appeal
3903	Stafford, William B.	1/11/2019	3.70	\$710.00	\$2,627.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$2,164.50	\$1,498.50	\$666.00	Research and draft sections of Supreme Court merits brief;	Second Appeal
3904	Gitt Webster, Mallory	1/13/2019	2.65	\$525.00	\$1,391.25	\$400.00	\$370.00	\$1,060.00	\$980.50	\$79.50	Draft and revise standing argument for Supreme Court brief;	Second Appeal
3905	Spear, Ryan M.	1/13/2019	0.10	\$730.00	\$73.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$59.00	\$41.00	\$18.00	Emails with A. Khanna and W. Stafford regarding status and strategy;	Second Appeal
3906	Gitt Webster, Mallory	1/14/2019	6.90	\$525.00	\$3,622.50	\$400.00	\$370.00	\$2,760.00	\$2,553.00	\$207.00	Draft and revise standing argument for Supreme Court brief (3.2); research issues relevant to the standing argument (3.7);	Second Appeal
3907	Khanna, Abha	1/14/2019	0.20	\$720.00	\$144.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$118.00	\$82.00	\$36.00	review materials in preparation for SCOTUS briefing (0.2);	Second Appeal
3908	Gitt Webster, Mallory	1/15/2019	1.45	\$525.00	\$761.25	\$400.00	\$370.00	\$580.00	\$536.50	\$43.50	Revise standing argument for Supreme Court brief;	Second Appeal
3909	Spear, Ryan M.	1/15/2019	3.10	\$730.00	\$2,263.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$1,829.00	\$1,271.00	\$558.00	Emails with A. Khanna and W. Stafford regarding appellees' merits brief (.3); research issues regarding same (1.3); prepare appellees' merits brief (1.5);	Second Appeal
3910	Branch, Aria C.	1/16/2019	2.00	\$815.00	\$1,630.00	\$480.00	\$345.00	\$960.00	\$690.00	\$270.00	Research related to SCOTUS brief;	Second Appeal
3911	Gitt Webster, Mallory	1/16/2019	1.70	\$525.00	\$892.50	\$400.00	\$370.00	\$680.00	\$629.00	\$51.00	Revise standing argument for Supreme Court brief;	Second Appeal
3912	Khanna, Abha	1/16/2019	2.00	\$720.00	\$1,440.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$1,180.00	\$820.00	\$360.00	Review materials in preparation for SCOTUS brief (2.0);	Second Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3913	Spear, Ryan M.	1/16/2019	1.20	\$730.00	\$876.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$708.00	\$492.00	\$216.00	Emails with A. Khanna and W. Stafford regarding appellees' merits brief (.2); prepare appellees' merits brief (1.0);	Second Appeal
3914	Stafford, William B.	1/16/2019	2.30	\$710.00	\$1,633.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$1,345.50	\$931.50	\$414.00	Research and draft sections of Supreme Court brief;	Second Appeal
3915	Branch, Aria C.	1/17/2019	3.00	\$815.00	\$2,445.00	\$480.00	\$345.00	\$1,440.00	\$1,035.00	\$405.00	Perform legal research for SCOTUS brief;	Second Appeal
3916	Gitt Webster, Mallory	1/17/2019	0.10	\$525.00	\$52.50	\$400.00	\$370.00	\$40.00	\$37.00	\$3.00	Conference with A. Khanna regarding legal error waiver;	Second Appeal
3917	Khanna, Abha	1/17/2019	6.00	\$720.00	\$4,320.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$3,540.00	\$2,460.00	\$1,080.00	Research and draft SCOTUS brief (6.0);	Second Appeal
3918	Spear, Ryan M.	1/17/2019	1.40	\$730.00	\$1,022.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$826.00	\$574.00	\$252.00	Emails with A. Khanna, A. Branch, and W. Stafford regarding appellees' merits brief (.5); prepare appellees' merits brief (.9);	Second Appeal
3919	Spiva, Bruce V.	1/17/2019	0.90	\$1,050.00	\$945.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$675.00	\$517.50	\$157.50	Review intervenor defendants' Supreme Court opening brief;	Second Appeal
3920	Branch, Aria C.	1/18/2019	0.80	\$815.00	\$652.00	\$480.00	\$345.00	\$384.00	\$276.00	\$108.00	Prepare for and attend telephone conversation with R. Spear regarding SCOTUS brief;	Second Appeal
3921	Gitt Webster, Mallory	1/18/2019	0.10	\$525.00	\$52.50	\$400.00	\$370.00	\$40.00	\$37.00	\$3.00	Conference with A. Khanna regarding legal error waiver;	Second Appeal
3922	Khanna, Abha	1/18/2019	8.30	\$720.00	\$5,976.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$4,897.00	\$3,403.00	\$1,494.00	Research and draft SCOTUS brief (8.3);	Second Appeal
3923	Spear, Ryan M.	1/18/2019	7.50	\$730.00	\$5,475.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$4,425.00	\$3,075.00	\$1,350.00	Emails with A. Khanna, A. Branch, and W. Stafford regarding appellees' merits brief (.5); conference with A. Branch regarding same (.4); prepare appellees' merits brief (4.5); research issues regarding same (2.1);	Second Appeal
3924	Stafford, William B.	1/18/2019	0.60	\$710.00	\$426.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$351.00	\$243.00	\$108.00	Draft section of SCOTUS brief (.6);	Second Appeal
3925	Khanna, Abha	1/19/2019	4.10	\$720.00	\$2,952.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$2,419.00	\$1,681.00	\$738.00	Research, draft, and revise SCOTUS brief (4.1);	Second Appeal
3926	Spear, Ryan M.	1/19/2019	7.80	\$730.00	\$5,694.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$4,602.00	\$3,198.00	\$1,404.00	Emails with A. Khanna and W. Stafford regarding appellees' merits brief (.2); prepare appellees' merits brief (5.5); research issues regarding same (2.1);	Second Appeal
3927	Stafford, William B.	1/19/2019	1.10	\$710.00	\$781.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$643.50	\$445.50	\$198.00	Revise Supreme Court brief;	Second Appeal
3928	Gitt Webster, Mallory	1/20/2019	2.95	\$525.00	\$1,548.75	\$400.00	\$370.00	\$1,180.00	\$1,091.50	\$88.50	Research the waiver of a standard of review not raised in an opening brief;	Second Appeal
3929	Khanna, Abha	1/20/2019	1.00	\$720.00	\$720.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$180.00	Research and draft SCOTUS brief (1.0);	Second Appeal
3930	Spear, Ryan M.	1/20/2019	1.70	\$730.00	\$1,241.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$1,003.00	\$697.00	\$306.00	Emails with A. Khanna and W. Stafford regarding appellees' merits brief (.2); prepare appellees' merits brief (1.5);	Second Appeal
3931	Stafford, William B.	1/20/2019	3.70	\$710.00	\$2,627.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$2,164.50	\$1,498.50	\$666.00	Research and draft section of Supreme Court merits brief;	Second Appeal
3932	Gitt Webster, Mallory	1/21/2019	1.55	\$525.00	\$813.75	\$400.00	\$370.00	\$620.00	\$573.50	\$46.50	Research waiver of a standard of review not raised in an opening brief (.7); draft analysis regarding waiver of a standard of review not raised in an opening brief (.6); email correspondence with A. Khanna and B. Stafford regarding the same (.25);	Second Appeal
3933	Khanna, Abha	1/21/2019	7.10	\$720.00	\$5,112.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$4,189.00	\$2,911.00	\$1,278.00	Research, draft, and revise SCOTUS brief (7.1);	Second Appeal
3934	Spear, Ryan M.	1/21/2019	0.40	\$730.00	\$292.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$236.00	\$164.00	\$72.00	Emails with A. Khanna and W. Stafford regarding appellees' merits brief (.2); conference with A. Khanna regarding same (.2);	Second Appeal
3935	Stafford, William B.	1/21/2019	3.30	\$710.00	\$2,343.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$1,930.50	\$1,336.50	\$594.00	Revise SCOTUS brief;	Second Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3936	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/22/2019	0.50	\$845.00	\$422.50	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$375.00	\$287.50	\$87.50	Follow up on merits briefing progress and timing;	Second Appeal
3937	Khanna, Abha	1/22/2019	9.90	\$720.00	\$7,128.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$5,841.00	\$4,059.00	\$1,782.00	Draft, review, and revise SCOTUS brief (9.5); confer with legal team regarding same (0.4);	Second Appeal
3938	Marino, Patricia	1/22/2019	9.70	\$315.00	\$3,055.50	\$250.00	\$190.00	\$2,425.00	\$1,843.00	\$582.00	Respond to attorney requests regarding brief of appellees, including review/compile/organize joint appendix/trial transcripts and exhibits, cross reference cites per attorney instruction with court record and edit/update draft brief for attorneys' further review/evaluation (9.7);	Second Appeal
3939	Spear, Ryan M.	1/22/2019	0.70	\$730.00	\$511.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$413.00	\$287.00	\$126.00	Review and revise appellees' merits brief (.5); conference with A. Khanna and W. Stafford regarding same (.2);	Second Appeal
3940	Spiva, Bruce V.	1/22/2019	0.90	\$1,050.00	\$945.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$675.00	\$517.50	\$157.50	Review defendant intervenor's brief and begin reviewing our draft opposition;	Second Appeal
3941	Stafford,	1/22/2019	5.50	\$710.00	\$3,905.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$3,217.50	\$2,227.50	\$990.00	Revise merits brief;	Second Appeal
3942	Elias, Marc E.	1/23/2019	2.00	\$1,190.00	\$2,380.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$1,500.00	\$1,150.00	\$350.00	Review draft brief for SCOTUS;	Second Appeal
3943	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/23/2019	1.00	\$845.00	\$845.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$175.00	Exchange email regarding timing of merits briefing (.5); exchange email regarding preparation for argument and related issues (.5);	Second Appeal
3944	Khanna, Abha	1/23/2019	11.90	\$720.00	\$8,568.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$7,021.00	\$4,879.00	\$2,142.00	Draft, review, and revise SCOTUS brief (11.4); email and confer with legal team regarding same (0.4); email with printer regarding same (0.1);	Second Appeal
3945	Marino, Patricia	1/23/2019	4.30	\$315.00	\$1,354.50	\$250.00	\$190.00	\$1,075.00	\$817.00	\$258.00	Respond to attorney requests regarding brief of appellees, which include: review/compile/organize joint appendix/trial transcripts and exhibits; cross reference cites per attorney instruction with court record and edit/update draft brief for attorneys' further review/evaluation;	Second Appeal
3946	Spear, Ryan M.	1/23/2019	4.30	\$730.00	\$3,139.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$2,537.00	\$1,763.00	\$774.00	Review and revise appellees' merits brief (4.0); emails with A. Khanna and W. Stafford regarding same (.3);	Second Appeal
3947	Spiva, Bruce V.	1/23/2019	0.70	\$1,050.00	\$735.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$525.00	\$402.50	\$122.50	Continue reviewing and commenting on our draft opposition brief;	Second Appeal
3948	Stafford, William B.	1/23/2019	2.30	\$710.00	\$1,633.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$1,345.50	\$931.50	\$414.00	Research and draft section of Supreme Court merits brief;	Second Appeal
3949	Branch, Aria C.	1/24/2019	1.50	\$815.00	\$1,222.50	\$480.00	\$345.00	\$720.00	\$517.50	\$202.50	Respond to questions regarding SCOTUS brief;	Second Appeal
3950	Depass,	1/24/2019	4.80	\$365.00	\$1,752.00	\$250.00	\$235.00	\$1,200.00	\$1,128.00	\$72.00	Cite check Supreme Court brief;	Second Appeal
3951	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/24/2019	1.30	\$845.00	\$1,098.50	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$975.00	\$747.50	\$227.50	Review draft merits briefing (1.1); conference with A. Khanna regarding same (.2);	Second Appeal
3952	Khanna, Abha	1/24/2019	4.40	\$720.00	\$3,168.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$2,596.00	\$1,804.00	\$792.00	Review and revise proof of brief (4.0); email and confer with printer regarding same (0.2); email with legal team regarding cite check edits (0.2);	Second Appeal
3953	Spiva, Bruce V.	1/24/2019	2.00	\$1,050.00	\$2,100.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$1,500.00	\$1,150.00	\$350.00	Review and comment on draft opposition brief (1.7); correspond with team regarding same (.3);	Second Appeal
3954	Elias, Marc E.	1/25/2019	1.50	\$1,190.00	\$1,785.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$1,125.00	\$862.50	\$262.50	Review SCOTUS requests regarding time (.3); review prior argument procedures (.5); review outline of record (.7);	Second Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3955	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/25/2019	6.20	\$845.00	\$5,239.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$4,650.00	\$3,565.00	\$1,085.00	Review and revise merits brief (3.5); conference with A. Khanna regarding proposed changes (.5); review order setting argument and exchange email regarding allocation of argument time (.5); conference with D. Bernstein at Georgetown regarding scheduling moot and related discussion with litigation team (.9); exchange email with M. Elias regarding argument preparation (.8);	Second Appeal
3956	Khanna, Abha	1/25/2019	3.70	\$720.00	\$2,664.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$2,183.00	\$1,517.00	\$666.00	Review and revise proof of SCOTUS brief (2.9); confer with printer regarding same (0.1); confer with K. Hamilton regarding edits to same (0.4); confer with R. Spear and B. Stafford regarding same and next steps to finalize (0.3);	Second Appeal
3957	Spear, Ryan M.	1/25/2019	6.10	\$730.00	\$4,453.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$3,599.00	\$2,501.00	\$1,098.00	Review and revise district-specific section of appellees' merits brief;	Second Appeal
3958	Spiva, Bruce V.	1/25/2019	0.20	\$1,050.00	\$210.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$150.00	\$115.00	\$35.00	Confer with A. Khanna regarding edits to opposition brief;	Second Appeal
3959	Stafford,	1/25/2019	1.80	\$710.00	\$1,278.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$1,053.00	\$729.00	\$324.00	Revise Supreme Court merits brief;	Second Appeal
3960	Spear, Ryan M.	1/26/2019	0.20	\$730.00	\$146.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$118.00	\$82.00	\$36.00	Emails with W. Stafford and A. Khanna regarding appellees' merits brief;	Second Appeal
3961	Stafford,	1/26/2019	4.00	\$710.00	\$2,840.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$2,340.00	\$1,620.00	\$720.00	Revise Supreme Court merits brief;	Second Appeal
3962	Khanna, Abha	1/27/2019	5.00	\$720.00	\$3,600.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$2,950.00	\$2,050.00	\$900.00	Review, revise, and finalize brief for printing (5.0);	Second Appeal
3963	Spear, Ryan M.	1/27/2019	6.30	\$730.00	\$4,599.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$3,717.00	\$2,583.00	\$1,134.00	Review and revise district-specific section of appellees' merits brief (5.5); research issues regarding same (.4); conference with A. Khanna regarding same (.4);	Second Appeal
3964	Branch, Aria C.	1/28/2019	0.50	\$815.00	\$407.50	\$480.00	\$345.00	\$240.00	\$172.50	\$67.50	Answer questions regarding district-specific section of SCOTUS briefing;	Second Appeal
3965	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/28/2019	1.50	\$845.00	\$1,267.50	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$1,125.00	\$862.50	\$262.50	Exchange email regarding moot court and argument preparation logistics (.9); review incoming merits briefing (.6);	Second Appeal
3966	Khanna, Abha	1/28/2019	2.80	\$720.00	\$2,016.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$1,652.00	\$1,148.00	\$504.00	Review, revise, and finalize SCOTUS brief for printing and service (2.8);	Second Appeal
3967	Spear, Ryan M.	1/28/2019	3.00	\$730.00	\$2,190.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$1,770.00	\$1,230.00	\$540.00	Review and revise appellees' merits brief (2.6); conference with A. Khanna regarding same (.2); emails with W. Stafford and A. Branch regarding same (.2);	Second Appeal
3968	Stafford, William B.	1/28/2019	0.50	\$710.00	\$355.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$292.50	\$202.50	\$90.00	Review and provide team with analysis of state merits brief;	Second Appeal
3969	Depass,	1/29/2019	0.50	\$365.00	\$182.50	\$250.00	\$235.00	\$125.00	\$117.50	\$7.50	Assist with letter filing;	Second Appeal
3970	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/29/2019	2.00	\$845.00	\$1,690.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$1,500.00	\$1,150.00	\$350.00	Review and respond to email regarding division of time and related motion (.4); coordinate moot court and argument preparation activities (.9); exchange email with M. Elias regarding same (.2); review incoming merits briefing (.5);	Second Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3971	Khanna, Abha	1/29/2019	0.60	\$720.00	\$432.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$354.00	\$246.00	\$108.00	Email with Georgetown regarding SCOTUS moot and panelists (0.2); review and revise draft motion for expansion and division of oral argument time and email with State Appellees regarding same (0.4);	Second Appeal
3972	Spiva, Bruce V.	1/29/2019	0.30	\$1,050.00	\$315.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$225.00	\$172.50	\$52.50	Correspond with M. Elias and A. Khanna and telephone conference with D. Bernstein regarding Georgetown moot;	Second Appeal
3973	Hamilton, Kevin J.	1/30/2019	0.90	\$845.00	\$760.50	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$675.00	\$517.50	\$157.50	Review merits briefing (.5); conference with A. Khanna regarding moot court and argument preparation (.3); exchange email with M. Elias regarding argument preparation (.1);	Second Appeal
3974	Khanna, Abha	1/30/2019	0.30	\$720.00	\$216.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$177.00	\$123.00	\$54.00	Telephone conference with T. Heytens regarding motion for enlargement and division of argument time (0.2); email with legal team regarding same (0.1);	Second Appeal
3975	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/1/2019	0.80	\$995.00	\$796.00	\$570.00	\$390.00	\$456.00	\$312.00	\$144.00	Telephone call with litigation team regarding preparation for SCOTUS argument (.4); emails with J. Winovich and J. Geise regarding preparing oral argument prep materials (.4);	Second Appeal
3976	Hamilton, Kevin J.	2/1/2019	1.90	\$845.00	\$1,605.50	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$1,425.00	\$1,092.50	\$332.50	Participate in call regarding prep session for argument (.5); review and respond to related email (.5); compile record and related materials (.9);	Second Appeal
3977	Khanna, Abha	2/1/2019	0.70	\$720.00	\$504.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$413.00	\$287.00	\$126.00	Telephone conference with legal team regarding SCOTUS argument prep (0.4); prepare materials for M. Elias's argument prep and email with legal team regarding same (0.3);	Second Appeal
3978	Hamilton, Kevin J.	2/4/2019	0.50	\$845.00	\$422.50	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$375.00	\$287.50	\$87.50	Review materials for Supreme Court preparation (.5);	Second Appeal
3979	Frost, Elisabeth C.	2/5/2019	0.20	\$995.00	\$199.00	\$570.00	\$390.00	\$114.00	\$78.00	\$36.00	Meet with M. Elias regarding oral argument preparation (.1); meet with J. Geise regarding same (.1);	Second Appeal
3980	Khanna, Abha	2/7/2019	0.40	\$720.00	\$288.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$236.00	\$164.00	\$72.00	Confer with B. Stafford regarding oral argument prep (0.2); confer with A. Branch regarding same (0.2);	Second Appeal
3981	Hamilton, Kevin J.	2/19/2019	0.80	\$845.00	\$676.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$600.00	\$460.00	\$140.00	Review and respond to email regarding blow ups for Supreme Court prep sessions (.3); review order from Supreme Court on argument timing and exchange related email (.5);	Second Appeal
3982	Khanna, Abha	2/19/2019	0.10	\$720.00	\$72.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$59.00	\$41.00	\$18.00	Review SCOTUS order on oral argument and email with legal team regarding same (0.1);	Second Appeal
3983	Khanna, Abha	2/25/2019	0.10	\$720.00	\$72.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$59.00	\$41.00	\$18.00	Email with J. Geise regarding SCOTUS prep materials (0.1);	Second Appeal
3984	Hamilton, Kevin J.	2/26/2019	2.80	\$845.00	\$2,366.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$2,100.00	\$1,610.00	\$490.00	Review trial transcript in preparation for Supreme Court prep sessions (1.5); review relevant legal authority (.8); compile list of key lawyers and roles for Supreme Court prep (.5);	Second Appeal
3985	Khanna, Abha	2/26/2019	0.20	\$720.00	\$144.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$118.00	\$82.00	\$36.00	Email with legal team regarding moots and documents in preparation for SCOTUS argument (0.2);	Second Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
3986	Elias, Marc E.	2/27/2019	1.80	\$1,190.00	\$2,142.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$1,350.00	\$1,035.00	\$315.00	Review new jurisdiction statement regarding remedial maps (.8); Begin reviewing materials in prep for SCOTUS oral argument (1.0);	Second Appeal
3987	Hamilton, Kevin J.	2/27/2019	1.50	\$845.00	\$1,267.50	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$1,125.00	\$862.50	\$262.50	Review materials in preparation for SCOTUS prep sessions;	Second Appeal
3988	Khanna, Abha	2/27/2019	0.60	\$720.00	\$432.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$354.00	\$246.00	\$108.00	Review summary of SCOTUS reply brief circulated by B. Stafford (0.3); confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.2); confer with docketing regarding deadline for response to jurisdictional statement (0.1);	Second Appeal
3989	Spear, Ryan M.	2/27/2019	0.60	\$730.00	\$438.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$354.00	\$246.00	\$108.00	Review appellants' reply brief (.5); emails with litigation team regarding same (.1);	Second Appeal
3990	Stafford,	2/27/2019	2.90	\$710.00	\$2,059.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$1,696.50	\$1,174.50	\$522.00	Research and draft motion to dismiss or affirm;	Second Appeal
3991	Stafford,	2/28/2019	0.60	\$710.00	\$426.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$351.00	\$243.00	\$108.00	Research and draft motion to dismiss or affirm;	Second Appeal
3992	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/1/2019	0.10	\$995.00	\$99.50	\$570.00	\$390.00	\$57.00	\$39.00	\$18.00	Email from J. Geise regarding prep for argument (.1);	Second Appeal
3993	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/1/2019	1.00	\$845.00	\$845.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$175.00	Review trial transcript and related SCOTUS preparation materials;	Second Appeal
3994	Khanna, Abha	3/1/2019	1.10	\$720.00	\$792.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$649.00	\$451.00	\$198.00	Research case law on standard of review for appellate review of remedial map (0.8); email and confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.2); confer with E. Frost regarding SCOTUS prep (0.1);	Second Appeal
3995	Stafford,	3/1/2019	3.00	\$710.00	\$2,130.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$1,755.00	\$1,215.00	\$540.00	Research and draft motion to dismiss or affirm;	Second Appeal
3996	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/2/2019	1.50	\$845.00	\$1,267.50	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$1,125.00	\$862.50	\$262.50	Review trial transcript and related SCOTUS preparation material;	Second Appeal
3997	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/4/2019	7.80	\$845.00	\$6,591.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$5,850.00	\$4,485.00	\$1,365.00	Review trial transcript from 2017 trial in preparation for SCOTUS preparation sessions (6.5); compile and review key cases (1.3);	Second Appeal
3998	Khanna, Abha	3/4/2019	1.10	\$720.00	\$792.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$649.00	\$451.00	\$198.00	Research case law on judicial intent in adopting remedial plan, in preparation for SCOTUS Motion to Dismiss or Affirm on remedy plan (0.8); email and confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.3);	Second Appeal
3999	Elias, Marc E.	3/5/2019	5.00	\$1,190.00	\$5,950.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$3,750.00	\$2,875.00	\$875.00	Review trial record and past opinions in prep for Supreme Court argument;	Second Appeal
4000	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/5/2019	2.80	\$845.00	\$2,366.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$2,100.00	\$1,610.00	\$490.00	Review trial materials, exhibits and transcripts from 2017 trial in preparation for SCOTUS sessions;	Second Appeal
4001	Khanna, Abha	3/5/2019	0.20	\$720.00	\$144.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$118.00	\$82.00	\$36.00	Email with legal team regarding oral argument prep (0.2);	Second Appeal
4002	Stafford, William B.	3/5/2019	0.90	\$710.00	\$639.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$526.50	\$364.50	\$162.00	Review materials relating to standard of review and related legal issue for remedy appeal;	Second Appeal
4003	Branch, Aria C.	3/6/2019	0.70	\$815.00	\$570.50	\$480.00	\$345.00	\$336.00	\$241.50	\$94.50	Call regarding SCOTUS prep;	Second Appeal
4004	Elias, Marc E.	3/6/2019	4.70	\$1,190.00	\$5,593.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$3,525.00	\$2,702.50	\$822.50	Prep for SCOTUS argument by reviewing record below and SCOTUS briefing (4.0); teleconference regarding same (.7);	Second Appeal
4005	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/6/2019	1.00	\$995.00	\$995.00	\$570.00	\$390.00	\$570.00	\$390.00	\$180.00	Emails with A. Khanna regarding drafting outlines for argument (.1); Telephone call regarding SCOTUS prep with M. Elias, A. Khanna, K. Hamilton, A. Branch (.7); emails with A. Khanna regarding same (.2);	Second Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
4006	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/6/2019	4.20	\$845.00	\$3,549.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$3,150.00	\$2,415.00	\$735.00	Review trial transcript from 2017 trial for SCOTUS preparation sessions (2.5); compile materials for preparation sessions and ship to DC office (.8); prepare for and participate in telephone conference regarding SCOTUS preparation sessions (.9);	Second Appeal
4007	Khanna, Abha	3/6/2019	1.30	\$720.00	\$936.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$767.00	\$533.00	\$234.00	Telephone conference with legal team regarding SCOTUS prep (0.7); review email archives regarding draft oral argument outlines and email with E. Frost regarding same (0.4); email with M. Elias and K. Hamilton regarding staffing throughout case in preparation for SCOTUS argument (0.2);	Second Appeal
4008	Stafford,	3/6/2019	6.10	\$710.00	\$4,331.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$3,568.50	\$2,470.50	\$1,098.00	Research and draft motion to dismiss or affirm;	Second Appeal
4009	Elias, Marc E.	3/7/2019	4.00	\$1,190.00	\$4,760.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$3,000.00	\$2,300.00	\$700.00	Review trials record in prep for SCOTUS argument;	Second Appeal
4010	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/7/2019	6.00	\$845.00	\$5,070.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$4,500.00	\$3,450.00	\$1,050.00	Review trial materials from 2017 trial for SCOTUS preparation sessions (5.5); exchange related email (.5);	Second Appeal
4011	Spear, Ryan M.	3/7/2019	0.30	\$730.00	\$219.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$177.00	\$123.00	\$54.00	Emails with A. Khanna and W. Stafford regarding various issues regarding preparations for oral argument;	Second Appeal
4012	Stafford,	3/7/2019	0.70	\$710.00	\$497.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$409.50	\$283.50	\$126.00	Research and draft motion to dismiss or affirm;	Second Appeal
4013	Elias, Marc E.	3/8/2019	3.00	\$1,190.00	\$3,570.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$2,250.00	\$1,725.00	\$525.00	Review lower court materials in prep for SCOTUS argument;	Second Appeal
4014	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/8/2019	4.50	\$845.00	\$3,802.50	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$3,375.00	\$2,587.50	\$787.50	Organize materials for DC SCOTUS preparation sessions (1.2); review trial transcript of 2015 trial (2.2); exchange email regarding SCOTUS preparation (1.1);	Second Appeal
4015	Khanna, Abha	3/8/2019	0.30	\$720.00	\$216.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$177.00	\$123.00	\$54.00	Review materials in preparation for SCOTUS argument (0.3);	Second Appeal
4016	Spear, Ryan M.	3/8/2019	0.50	\$730.00	\$365.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$295.00	\$205.00	\$90.00	Emails with A. Khanna and W. Stafford regarding various issues regarding preparations for oral argument;	Second Appeal
4017	Stafford,	3/8/2019	1.70	\$710.00	\$1,207.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$994.50	\$688.50	\$306.00	Prepare list of hard questions for oral argument;	Second Appeal
4018	Branch, Aria C.	3/9/2019	3.00	\$815.00	\$2,445.00	\$480.00	\$345.00	\$1,440.00	\$1,035.00	\$405.00	Listen to SCOTUS redistricting oral arguments to assist in preparation of M. Elias for oral argument;	Second Appeal
4019	Elias, Marc E.	3/9/2019	3.50	\$1,190.00	\$4,165.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$2,625.00	\$2,012.50	\$612.50	Review lower court record in prep for oral argument;	Second Appeal
4020	Elias, Marc E.	3/10/2019	7.50	\$1,190.00	\$8,925.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$5,625.00	\$4,312.50	\$1,312.50	Review court cases and record in prep for oral argument;	Second Appeal
4021	Khanna, Abha	3/10/2019	5.30	\$720.00	\$3,816.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$3,127.00	\$2,173.00	\$954.00	Review materials in preparation for oral argument and prepare questions/outlines for same (5.3);	Second Appeal
4022	Branch, Aria C.	3/11/2019	12.00	\$815.00	\$9,780.00	\$480.00	\$345.00	\$5,760.00	\$4,140.00	\$1,620.00	Assist with preparation for SCOTUS argument by discussing argument strategy, preparing argument outline, and exchanging emails regarding same;	Second Appeal
4023	Elias, Marc E.	3/11/2019	12.00	\$1,190.00	\$14,280.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$9,000.00	\$6,900.00	\$2,100.00	Review court record and case history in prep for oral argument;	Second Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
4024	Gitt Webster, Mallory	3/11/2019	1.40	\$525.00	\$735.00	\$400.00	\$370.00	\$560.00	\$518.00	\$42.00	Analyze the evolution of Appellants' standing arguments over time (.5); draft chart reflecting the same (.9);	Second Appeal
4025	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/11/2019	11.00	\$845.00	\$9,295.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$8,250.00	\$6,325.00	\$1,925.00	SCOTUS prep sessions to discuss argument strategy;	Second Appeal
4026	Khanna, Abha	3/11/2019	9.40	\$720.00	\$6,768.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$5,546.00	\$3,854.00	\$1,692.00	Oral argument prep with M. Elias (9.4);	Second Appeal
4027	Spear, Ryan M.	3/11/2019	0.50	\$730.00	\$365.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$295.00	\$205.00	\$90.00	Emails with A. Khanna and W. Stafford regarding various issues regarding preparations for oral argument;	Second Appeal
4028	Stafford, William B.	3/11/2019	0.10	\$710.00	\$71.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$58.50	\$40.50	\$18.00	Exchange correspondence regarding oral argument preparation;	Second Appeal
4029	Branch, Aria C.	3/12/2019	11.40	\$815.00	\$9,291.00	\$480.00	\$345.00	\$5,472.00	\$3,933.00	\$1,539.00	Assist with preparation for SCOTUS argument;	Second Appeal
4030	Elias, Marc E.	3/12/2019	10.00	\$1,190.00	\$11,900.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$7,500.00	\$5,750.00	\$1,750.00	Prepare for oral argument (reviewing cases, reviewing outlines and case summary charts, meeting with team to prepare for moots and for argument);	Second Appeal
4031	Gitt Webster, Mallory	3/12/2019	2.30	\$525.00	\$1,207.50	\$400.00	\$370.00	\$920.00	\$851.00	\$69.00	Analyze the evolution of Appellants' standing arguments over time (1.0); draft chart reflecting the same (1.3);	Second Appeal
4032	Khanna, Abha	3/12/2019	14.70	\$720.00	\$10,584.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$8,673.00	\$6,027.00	\$2,646.00	Oral argument preparation (12.5); review materials and draft notes/outlines in preparation for same (2.2);	Second Appeal
4033	Spear, Ryan M.	3/12/2019	0.20	\$730.00	\$146.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$118.00	\$82.00	\$36.00	Emails with A. Khanna and W. Stafford regarding various issues regarding preparations for oral argument;	Second Appeal
4034	Stafford, William B.	3/12/2019	4.50	\$710.00	\$3,195.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$2,632.50	\$1,822.50	\$810.00	Review factul record and prepare various data for A. Khanna for use in oral argument preparation, including history of standing arguments and various data regarding challenged districts and remedial plan versions;	Second Appeal
4035	Branch, Aria C.	3/13/2019	8.00	\$815.00	\$6,520.00	\$480.00	\$345.00	\$3,840.00	\$2,760.00	\$1,080.00	Assist with preparation for SCOTUS argument;	Second Appeal
4036	Elias, Marc E.	3/13/2019	11.50	\$1,190.00	\$13,685.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$8,625.00	\$6,612.50	\$2,012.50	Prep for oral argument (10); prep for moots (3.5);	Second Appeal
4037	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/13/2019	9.50	\$845.00	\$8,027.50	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$7,125.00	\$5,462.50	\$1,662.50	SCOTUS preparation (7.9); read materials and cases (1.6); conference with team;	Second Appeal
4038	Khanna, Abha	3/13/2019	9.70	\$720.00	\$6,984.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$5,723.00	\$3,977.00	\$1,746.00	Oral argument preparation (9.7);	Second Appeal
4039	Stafford, William B.	3/13/2019	1.30	\$710.00	\$923.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$760.50	\$526.50	\$234.00	Research and draft motion to dismiss or affirm second appeal of Intervenor regarding remedial order;	Second Appeal
4040	Branch, Aria C.	3/14/2019	9.00	\$815.00	\$7,335.00	\$480.00	\$345.00	\$4,320.00	\$3,105.00	\$1,215.00	Assist with SCOTUS oral argument preparation; attend moot court arguments;	Second Appeal
4041	Elias, Marc E.	3/14/2019	13.00	\$1,190.00	\$15,470.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$9,750.00	\$7,475.00	\$2,275.00	Prep for oral argument (10.0); Conduct two moots re same (3.0)	Second Appeal
4042	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/14/2019	11.50	\$845.00	\$9,717.50	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$8,625.00	\$6,612.50	\$2,012.50	SCOTUS prep sessions (9.5); review merits briefing (1.0); review supporting cases (1.0);	Second Appeal
4043	Khanna, Abha	3/14/2019	12.20	\$720.00	\$8,784.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$7,198.00	\$5,002.00	\$2,196.00	Prepare for and attend Georgetown moots (4.5); SCOTUS oral argument prep (7.7);	Second Appeal
4044	Branch, Aria C.	3/15/2019	7.10	\$815.00	\$5,786.50	\$480.00	\$345.00	\$3,408.00	\$2,449.50	\$958.50	Assist with Supreme Court preparation;	Second Appeal
4045	Elias, Marc E.	3/15/2019	11.00	\$1,190.00	\$13,090.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$8,250.00	\$6,325.00	\$1,925.00	Prep for oral argument;	Second Appeal
4046	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/15/2019	9.50	\$845.00	\$8,027.50	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$7,125.00	\$5,462.50	\$1,662.50	SCOTUS prep sessions (8.5); prepare for SCOTUS prep sessions (1.0);	Second Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
4047	Khanna, Abha	3/15/2019	7.90	\$720.00	\$5,688.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$4,661.00	\$3,239.00	\$1,422.00	Oral argument preparation (7.9);	Second Appeal
4048	Spear, Ryan M.	3/15/2019	1.40	\$730.00	\$1,022.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$826.00	\$574.00	\$252.00	Emails with A. Khanna and W. Stafford regarding various issues regarding preparations for oral argument (.5); review prior briefing regarding same (.9);	Second Appeal
	Branch, Aria C.	3/16/2019	8.00	\$815.00	\$6,520.00	\$480.00	\$345.00	\$3,840.00	\$2,760.00	\$1,080.00	Assist with Supreme Court preparation;	Second Appeal
4050	Elias, Marc E.	3/16/2019	10.00	\$1,190.00	\$11,900.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$7,500.00	\$5,750.00	\$1,750.00	Prep for oral argument (6.5); practice timed moots (3.5);	Second Appeal
4051	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/16/2019	10.00	\$845.00	\$8,450.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$7,500.00	\$5,750.00	\$1,750.00	SCOTUS prep sessions (9.0); prepare for SCOTUS prep sessions (1.0);	Second Appeal
4052	Khanna, Abha	3/16/2019	9.30	\$720.00	\$6,696.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$5,487.00	\$3,813.00	\$1,674.00	Oral argument prep (9.3);	Second Appeal
4053	Branch, Aria C.	3/17/2019	7.50	\$815.00	\$6,112.50	\$480.00	\$345.00	\$3,600.00	\$2,587.50	\$1,012.50	Assist with Supreme Court oral argument prep;	Second Appeal
4054	Elias, Marc E.	3/17/2019	8.50	\$1,190.00	\$10,115.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$6,375.00	\$4,887.50	\$1,487.50	Prep for oral argument; Review materials and meet re same;	Second Appeal
4055	Hamilton,	3/17/2019	1.20	\$845.00	\$1,014.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$900.00	\$690.00	\$210.00	SCOTUS prep session;	Second Appeal
4056	Khanna, Abha	3/17/2019	8.40	\$720.00	\$6,048.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$4,956.00	\$3,444.00	\$1,512.00	Oral argument prep (8.4);	Second Appeal
4057	Elias, Marc E.	3/18/2019	3.00	\$1,190.00	\$3,570.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$2,250.00	\$1,725.00	\$525.00	Prep for and argue case before US Supreme Court;	Second Appeal
4058	Stafford, William B.	3/18/2019	0.30	\$710.00	\$213.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$175.50	\$121.50	\$54.00	Review transcript of hearing for use in Intervenor's second appeal regarding remedial plan;	Second Appeal
4059	Hamilton,	3/20/2019	0.50	\$845.00	\$422.50	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$375.00	\$287.50	\$87.50	Review orders from district court;	Second Appeal
4060	Khanna, Abha	3/20/2019	0.30	\$720.00	\$216.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$177.00	\$123.00	\$54.00	Confer with B. Stafford regarding motion to dismiss or affirm on remedy map (0.3);	Second Appeal
4061	Stafford,	3/20/2019	4.90	\$710.00	\$3,479.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$2,866.50	\$1,984.50	\$882.00	Research and draft motion to dismiss or affirm;	Second Appeal
4062	Khanna, Abha	3/21/2019	0.10	\$720.00	\$72.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$59.00	\$41.00	\$18.00	Confer with B. Stafford regarding motion to dismiss or affirm (0.1);	Second Appeal
4063	Stafford,	3/21/2019	2.40	\$710.00	\$1,704.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$1,404.00	\$972.00	\$432.00	Research and draft motion to dismiss or affirm;	Second Appeal
4064	Khanna, Abha	3/22/2019	1.80	\$720.00	\$1,296.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$1,062.00	\$738.00	\$324.00	Review Appellants' jurisdictional statement on remedy map (0.9); review and revise draft Motion to Dismiss or Affirm (0.9);	Second Appeal
4065	Khanna, Abha	3/25/2019	2.00	\$720.00	\$1,440.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$1,180.00	\$820.00	\$360.00	Review and revise draft Motion to Dismiss or Affirm SCOTUS appeal on remedy (2.0);	Second Appeal
4066	Stafford,	3/25/2019	1.10	\$710.00	\$781.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$643.50	\$445.50	\$198.00	Research and draft motion to dismiss or affirm;	Second Appeal
4067	Khanna, Abha	3/26/2019	1.00	\$720.00	\$720.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$180.00	Email and confer with B. Stafford regarding Motion to Dismiss or Affirm (0.3); research and summarize case law regarding same (0.6); review M. Verrilli memo on other courts who have addressed special master (0.1);	Second Appeal
4068	Stafford,	3/26/2019	7.40	\$710.00	\$5,254.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$4,329.00	\$2,997.00	\$1,332.00	Research and draft motion to dismiss or affirm;	Second Appeal
4069	Khanna, Abha	3/27/2019	1.60	\$720.00	\$1,152.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$944.00	\$656.00	\$288.00	Review and revise draft motion to dismiss or affirm regarding remedy (1.6);	Second Appeal
4070	Stafford, William B.	3/27/2019	5.00	\$710.00	\$3,550.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$2,925.00	\$2,025.00	\$900.00	Research and draft motion to dismiss or affirm (5.0);	Second Appeal
4071	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/28/2019	1.10	\$845.00	\$929.50	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$825.00	\$632.50	\$192.50	Review motion to affirm or dismiss (.9); exchange email regarding same (.2);	Second Appeal
4072	Khanna, Abha	3/28/2019	1.80	\$720.00	\$1,296.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$1,062.00	\$738.00	\$324.00	Review and revise draft SCOTUS brief (motion to dismiss or affirm) (1.5); email and confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.3);	Second Appeal
4073	Stafford,	3/28/2019	3.70	\$710.00	\$2,627.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$2,164.50	\$1,498.50	\$666.00	Research and draft motion to dismiss or affirm;	Second Appeal

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
4074	Hamilton, Kevin J.	3/29/2019	0.50	\$845.00	\$422.50	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$375.00	\$287.50	\$87.50	Review motion to affirm (.3); review and respond to email regarding same (.2);	Second Appeal
4075	Khanna, Abha	3/29/2019	2.20	\$720.00	\$1,584.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$1,298.00	\$902.00	\$396.00	Review and revise draft SCOTUS brief (motion to dismiss or affirm) (1.9); email and confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.3);	Second Appeal
4076	Stafford, William B.	3/29/2019	1.10	\$710.00	\$781.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$643.50	\$445.50	\$198.00	Review and revise proof of motion to dismiss or affirm;	Second Appeal
4077	Stafford, William B.	3/30/2019	3.80	\$710.00	\$2,698.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$2,223.00	\$1,539.00	\$684.00	Review proof and revise motion to dismiss or affirm;	Second Appeal
4078	Khanna, Abha	3/31/2019	2.10	\$720.00	\$1,512.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$1,239.00	\$861.00	\$378.00	Review and revise draft SCOTUS brief (1.9); email with B. Stafford regarding same (0.2);	Second Appeal
4079	Stafford, William B.	3/31/2019	1.00	\$710.00	\$710.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$180.00	Review and revise proof of brief;	Second Appeal
4080	Elias, Marc E.	4/1/2019	1.50	\$1,190.00	\$1,785.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$1,125.00	\$862.50	\$262.50	Review Supreme Court filings;	Second Appeal
4081	Stafford, William B.	4/2/2019	1.80	\$710.00	\$1,278.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$1,053.00	\$729.00	\$324.00	Finalize and coordinate filing of motion to dismiss;	Second Appeal
4082	Khanna, Abha	4/19/2019	0.60	\$720.00	\$432.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$354.00	\$246.00	\$108.00	Review SCOTUS reply brief on remedy (0.3); confer with B. Stafford regarding same and potential notice to court regarding status of 2019 elections (0.3);	Second Appeal
4083	Khanna, Abha	4/23/2019	0.30	\$720.00	\$216.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$177.00	\$123.00	\$54.00	Email with legal team regarding potential mootness argument in SCOTUS (0.3);	Second Appeal
4084			962.40		\$734,827.00			\$562,056.50		\$141,974.00		SUBTOTAL for Second Appeal
4085	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/13/2016	1.20	\$655.00	\$786.00	\$575.00		\$690.00			Telephone conference with opposing counsel regarding fee application (.8); exchange related email with litigation team (.4);	Fee Petitions
4086	Spiva, Bruce V.	3/7/2017	0.40	\$850.00	\$340.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$270.00	\$230.00	\$40.00	Correspond with team regarding attorneys fee petition and State's position on remand;	Fee Petitions
4087	Stafford, William B.	3/7/2017	0.10	\$595.00	\$59.50	\$505.00	\$405.00	\$50.50	\$40.50	\$10.00	Exchange correspondence regarding timing of fee petition;	Fee Petitions
4088	Branch, Aria C.	3/22/2017	3.00	\$650.00	\$1,950.00	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$1,230.00	\$1,035.00	\$195.00	Legal research regarding seeking attorney's fees;	Fee Petitions
4089	Spear, Ryan M.	3/22/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Emails with litigation team regarding attorneys' fees;	Fee Petitions
4090	Spiva, Bruce V.	3/22/2017	0.20	\$850.00	\$170.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$135.00	\$115.00	\$20.00	Correspond with team regarding attorneys fees;	Fee Petitions
4091	Spiva, Bruce V.	3/22/2017	0.20	\$850.00	\$170.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$135.00	\$115.00	\$20.00	Correspond with A. Branch regarding follow up questions;	Fee Petitions
4092	Spiva, Bruce V.	3/22/2017	0.50	\$850.00	\$425.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$337.50	\$287.50	\$50.00	Review A. Branch's research on time to move for fees and standards;	Fee Petitions
4093	Frost, Elisabeth C.	3/23/2017	0.10	\$750.00	\$75.00	\$490.00	\$390.00	\$49.00	\$39.00	\$10.00	Email from B. Spiva regarding attorney's fees issue;	Fee Petitions
4094	Branch, Aria C.	3/27/2017	0.55	\$650.00	\$357.50	\$410.00	\$345.00	\$225.50	\$189.75	\$35.75	Legal research regarding seeking attorney's fees;	Fee Petitions
4095	Khanna, Abha	3/27/2017	0.60	\$620.00	\$372.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$306.00	\$246.00	\$60.00	Review award of costs (0.2); email and confer with legal team regarding implications of same (0.2); research supreme court rules on imposition of costs and email with legal team regarding same (0.2);	Fee Petitions
4096	Spear, Ryan M.	3/27/2017	0.20	\$620.00	\$124.00	\$510.00	\$410.00	\$102.00	\$82.00	\$20.00	Emails with litigation team regarding attorneys' fees;	Fee Petitions

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
4097	Spiva, Bruce V.	3/27/2017	0.30	\$850.00	\$255.00	\$675.00	\$575.00	\$202.50	\$172.50	\$30.00	Correspond with team regarding Supreme Court's issuance of certified opinion, review same, and award of costs;	Fee Petitions
4098	Stafford, William B.	6/27/2018	1.00	\$675.00	\$675.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$140.00	Conference with A. Branch regarding staffing on fee petition (.3); outline list of necessary tasks and gather information for preparation of fee petition (.7);	Fee Petitions
4099	Stafford, William B.	6/28/2018	3.80	\$675.00	\$2,565.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$2,071.00	\$1,539.00	\$532.00	Prepare fee petition by reviewing time entries and exercising billing judgment;	Fee Petitions
4100	Stafford, William B.	6/29/2018	2.40	\$675.00	\$1,620.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$1,308.00	\$972.00	\$336.00	Prepare fee petition by reviewing time entries and exercising billing judgment;	Fee Petitions
4101	Stafford, William B.	6/30/2018	1.50	\$675.00	\$1,012.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$817.50	\$607.50	\$210.00	Prepare fee petition by reviewing time entries and exercising billing judgment;	Fee Petitions
4102	Branch, Aria C.	7/2/2018	1.20	\$720.00	\$864.00	\$430.00	\$345.00	\$516.00	\$414.00	\$102.00	Legal research regarding fee petition (1.0); circulate email regarding same to litigation team (.2);	Fee Petitions
4103	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/2/2018	1.50	\$795.00	\$1,192.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$1,072.50	\$862.50	\$210.00	Conference with team regarding fee application, deadlines and motion (.9); conference with B. Stafford regarding fee application (.3); conference with team regarding same (.3);	Fee Petitions
4104	Branch, Aria C.	7/4/2018	1.20	\$720.00	\$864.00	\$430.00	\$345.00	\$516.00	\$414.00	\$102.00	Work on cost bill by identifying categorizes of recoverable costs and coordinating identification and organization of supporting records;	Fee Petitions
4105	Stafford, William B.	7/4/2018	2.00	\$675.00	\$1,350.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$1,090.00	\$810.00	\$280.00	Prepare fee petition by reviewing time entries and exercising billing judgment;	Fee Petitions
4106	Depass, Michelle	7/5/2018	3.40	\$310.00	\$1,054.00	\$235.00	\$235.00	\$799.00	\$799.00	\$0.00	Assist with bill of costs by identifying and organizing categories and records of expenses;	Fee Petitions
4107	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/5/2018	1.00	\$795.00	\$795.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$140.00	Follow up regarding attorneys' fee motion and supporting papers;	Fee Petitions
4108	Stafford, William B.	7/5/2018	3.10	\$675.00	\$2,092.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$1,689.50	\$1,255.50	\$434.00	Revise fee petition memorandum and, in course of doing same, prepare supporting declaration;	Fee Petitions
4109	Branch, Aria C.	7/6/2018	3.30	\$720.00	\$2,376.00	\$430.00	\$345.00	\$1,419.00	\$1,138.50	\$280.50	Review expenses for cost bill and motion for attorneys fees;	Fee Petitions
4110	Depass, Michelle	7/6/2018	3.50	\$310.00	\$1,085.00	\$235.00	\$235.00	\$822.50	\$822.50	\$0.00	Assist with bill of costs by identifying and organizing categories and records of expenses;	Fee Petitions
4111	Branch, Aria C.	7/8/2018	0.80	\$720.00	\$576.00	\$430.00	\$345.00	\$344.00	\$276.00	\$68.00	Finalize and circulate draft cost bill;	Fee Petitions
4112	Stafford, William B.	7/9/2018	1.20	\$675.00	\$810.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$654.00	\$486.00	\$168.00	Review preliminary draft of cost bill and related information regarding categories of expenses and exercise billing discretion with regard to same;	Fee Petitions
4113	Branch, Aria C.	7/10/2018	1.00	\$720.00	\$720.00	\$430.00	\$345.00	\$430.00	\$345.00	\$85.00	Draft attorney fee and expense petition;	Fee Petitions
4114	Depass, Michelle	7/10/2018	10.10	\$310.00	\$3,131.00	\$235.00	\$235.00	\$2,373.50	\$2,373.50	\$0.00	Assist with preparation and file motion for attorney fees;	Fee Petitions
4115	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/10/2018	0.70	\$795.00	\$556.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$500.50	\$402.50	\$98.00	Review and revise draft Hamilton Declaration in support of Fee Petition;	Fee Petitions
4116	Stafford, William B.	7/10/2018	4.20	\$675.00	\$2,835.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$2,289.00	\$1,701.00	\$588.00	Finalize fee petition and related papers;	Fee Petitions
4117	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/11/2018	1.00	\$795.00	\$795.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$140.00	Review and revise draft fee petition; conference with B. Stafford regarding same;	Fee Petitions

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
4118	Stafford, William B.	7/30/2018	0.70	\$675.00	\$472.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$381.50	\$283.50	\$98.00	Conference with State Defendants' counsel regarding requested extension to respond to fee application and exchange correspondence with team regarding same;	Fee Petitions
4119	Hamilton,	8/8/2018	0.30	\$795.00	\$238.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$214.50	\$172.50	\$42.00	Review status of attorneys' fees briefing (.3);	Fee Petitions
4120	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/9/2018	0.80	\$795.00	\$636.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$572.00	\$460.00	\$112.00	Review memorandum in opposition to fee application (.5); conference with B. Stafford regarding same (.3);	Fee Petitions
4121	Khanna, Abha	8/9/2018	0.50	\$665.00	\$332.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$275.00	\$205.00	\$70.00	Review opposition to fee petition and accompanying exhibits (0.4); email with legal team regarding same and strategy for reply brief (0.1);	Fee Petitions
4122	Spear, Ryan M.	8/9/2018	0.50	\$675.00	\$337.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$275.00	\$205.00	\$70.00	Review opposition to fee petition;	Fee Petitions
4123	Stafford,	8/9/2018	1.80	\$675.00	\$1,215.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$981.00	\$729.00	\$252.00	Research and draft reply in support of fee petition;	Fee Petitions
4124	Stafford,	8/10/2018	0.90	\$675.00	\$607.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$490.50	\$364.50	\$126.00	Research and draft reply in support of fee petition;	Fee Petitions
4125	Stafford,	8/11/2018	3.00	\$675.00	\$2,025.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$1,635.00	\$1,215.00	\$420.00	Research and draft reply in support of fee petition;	Fee Petitions
4126	Stafford,	8/12/2018	2.10	\$675.00	\$1,417.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$1,144.50	\$850.50	\$294.00	Research and draft reply to fee petition;	Fee Petitions
4127	Khanna, Abha	8/13/2018	0.20	\$665.00	\$133.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$110.00	\$82.00	\$28.00	Confer with B. Stafford regarding reply ISO fee petition (0.2);	Fee Petitions
4128	Stafford,	8/13/2018	2.60	\$675.00	\$1,755.00	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$1,417.00	\$1,053.00	\$364.00	Draft reply in support of fee petition;	Fee Petitions
4129	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/14/2018	1.50	\$795.00	\$1,192.50	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$1,072.50	\$862.50	\$210.00	Review and revise draft reply memorandum regarding fee application (1.2); conference with B. Stafford regarding same (.3);	Fee Petitions
4130	Khanna, Abha	8/14/2018	1.80	\$665.00	\$1,197.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$990.00	\$738.00	\$252.00	Review and revise draft reply brief ISO fee petition (1.6); confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.2);	Fee Petitions
4131	Stafford,	8/14/2018	1.90	\$675.00	\$1,282.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$1,035.50	\$769.50	\$266.00	Research and draft reply to fee petition;	Fee Petitions
4132	Depass, Michelle	8/15/2018	0.50	\$310.00	\$155.00	\$235.00	\$235.00	\$117.50	\$117.50	\$0.00	Assist with and file response to motion for attorneys fees;	Fee Petitions
4133	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/15/2018	0.60	\$795.00	\$477.00	\$715.00	\$575.00	\$429.00	\$345.00	\$84.00	Review and revise draft Hamilton declaration in support of fee application;	Fee Petitions
4134	Khanna, Abha	8/15/2018	0.30	\$665.00	\$199.50	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$165.00	\$123.00	\$42.00	Review and revise draft reply ISO fee petition and email with B. Stafford regarding same (0.3);	Fee Petitions
4135	Spear, Ryan M.	8/15/2018	1.00	\$675.00	\$675.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$550.00	\$410.00	\$140.00	Review and revise reply in support of fee petition and supporting declaration (.8); emails with litigation team regarding same (.2);	Fee Petitions
4136	Stafford, William B.	8/15/2018	1.70	\$675.00	\$1,147.50	\$545.00	\$405.00	\$926.50	\$688.50	\$238.00	Finalize and coordinate filing of reply in support of fee petition;	Fee Petitions
4137	Khanna, Abha	5/28/2019	0.20	\$720.00	\$144.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$118.00	\$82.00	\$36.00	Email and confer with B. Stafford regarding cost allocation of JA (0.2);	Fee Petitions
4138	Hamilton, Kevin J.	5/29/2019	0.50	\$845.00	\$422.50	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$375.00	\$287.50	\$87.50	Exchange email regarding cost bill for Joint Appendix;	Fee Petitions
4139	Branch, Aria C.	6/17/2019	1.00	\$815.00	\$815.00	\$480.00	\$345.00	\$480.00	\$345.00	\$135.00	Prepare for and attend call regarding Virginia Supreme Court decision (.60); call with B. Stafford regarding fee petition (.4);	Fee Petitions
4140	Khanna, Abha	6/17/2019	0.50	\$720.00	\$360.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$295.00	\$205.00	\$90.00	Review SCOTUS opinion and email with legal team regarding next steps on fees (0.5);	Fee Petitions

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
4141	Stafford, William B.	6/17/2019	1.70	\$710.00	\$1,207.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$994.50	\$688.50	\$306.00	Exchange correspondence with A. Branch and M. Elias regarding preparation of fee petition (.7); review opinion (.7); email C. Lawrence regarding pulling fee data for fee petition (.1); review past fee petition in preparation for preparing revised petition (.2);	Fee Petitions
4142	Branch, Aria C.	6/20/2019	2.50	\$815.00	\$2,037.50	\$480.00	\$345.00	\$1,200.00	\$862.50	\$337.50	Legal research regarding deadline for attorney fee motion and review research related to substance of motion;	Fee Petitions
4143	Khanna, Abha	6/20/2019	0.10	\$720.00	\$72.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$59.00	\$41.00	\$18.00	Confer with B. Stafford regarding fee application;	Fee Petitions
4144	Stafford, William B.	6/20/2019	1.30	\$710.00	\$923.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$760.50	\$526.50	\$234.00	Prepare revised fee petition by reviewing time entries to exercise billing discretion;	Fee Petitions
4145	Stafford, William B.	6/21/2019	0.90	\$710.00	\$639.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$526.50	\$364.50	\$162.00	Prepare revised fee petition by reviewing time entries to exercise billing discretion;	Fee Petitions
4146	Stafford, William B.	6/23/2019	0.90	\$710.00	\$639.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$526.50	\$364.50	\$162.00	Prepare revised fee petition by reviewing time entries to exercise billing discretion;	Fee Petitions
4147	Hamilton, Kevin J.	6/25/2019	0.50	\$845.00	\$422.50	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$375.00	\$287.50	\$87.50	Telephone conference with T. Heytens regarding fee petition (.3); report to team regarding same (.2);	Fee Petitions
4148	Stafford, William B.	6/25/2019	1.30	\$710.00	\$923.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$760.50	\$526.50	\$234.00	Prepare revised fee petition by reviewing time entries to exercise billing discretion;	Fee Petitions
4149	Stafford, William B.	6/28/2019	0.90	\$710.00	\$639.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$526.50	\$364.50	\$162.00	Prepare revised fee petition by reviewing time entries to exercise billing discretion;	Fee Petitions
4150	Stafford, William B.	6/29/2019	2.90	\$710.00	\$2,059.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$1,696.50	\$1,174.50	\$522.00	Prepare revised fee petition by reviewing time entries to exercise billing discretion;	Fee Petitions
4151	Branch, Aria C.	6/30/2019	1.40	\$815.00	\$1,141.00	\$480.00	\$345.00	\$672.00	\$483.00	\$189.00	Legal research related to attorneys fee motion;	Fee Petitions
4152	Branch, Aria C.	7/1/2019	0.60	\$815.00	\$489.00	\$480.00	\$345.00	\$288.00	\$207.00	\$81.00	Legal research regarding motion for attorney's fees (.5); send email to B. Stafford regarding same (.1);	Fee Petitions
4153	Branch, Aria C.	7/10/2019	0.50	\$815.00	\$407.50	\$480.00	\$345.00	\$240.00	\$172.50	\$67.50	Answer questions regarding timing and substance of fee petition;	Fee Petitions
4154	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/18/2019	0.50	\$845.00	\$422.50	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$375.00	\$287.50	\$87.50	Review and respond to email regarding attorneys' fee application and related deadlines;	Fee Petitions
4155	Stafford, William B.	7/20/2019	0.50	\$710.00	\$355.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$292.50	\$202.50	\$90.00	Prepare fee petition memorandum and related papers;	Fee Petitions
4156	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/22/2019	0.30	\$845.00	\$253.50	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$225.00	\$172.50	\$52.50	Exchange email with B. Stafford regarding fee petition;	Fee Petitions
4157	Stafford, William B.	7/22/2019	0.50	\$710.00	\$355.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$292.50	\$202.50	\$90.00	Prepare fee petition memorandum and related papers;	Fee Petitions
4158	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/23/2019	1.90	\$845.00	\$1,605.50	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$1,425.00	\$1,092.50	\$332.50	Prepare for and participate in telephone conference to discuss current status of attorneys' fee request (1.1); report to team regarding same (.4); conference with B. Stafford regarding same (.4);	Fee Petitions
4159	Branch, Aria C.	7/25/2019	0.10	\$815.00	\$81.50	\$480.00	\$345.00	\$48.00	\$34.50	\$13.50	Call with B. Stafford regarding preparation of fee petition;	Fee Petitions
4160	Kevin J.	7/25/2019	0.30	\$845.00	\$253.50	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$225.00	\$172.50	\$52.50	Follow up with B. Stafford regarding fee petition;	Fee Petitions
4161	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/28/2019	0.50	\$845.00	\$422.50	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$375.00	\$287.50	\$87.50	Review and respond to email regarding fee petition and related deadlines (.3); finalize and transmit confirming email to T. Heytens regarding extension (.2);	Fee Petitions

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
4162	Stafford, William B.	7/28/2019	0.60	\$710.00	\$426.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$351.00	\$243.00	\$108.00	Prepare fee petition memorandum and related papers;	Fee Petitions
4163	Branch, Aria C.	7/29/2019	2.00	\$815.00	\$1,630.00	\$480.00	\$345.00	\$960.00	\$690.00	\$270.00	Draft motion for attorney's fees;	Fee Petitions
4164	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/29/2019	0.90	\$845.00	\$760.50	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$675.00	\$517.50	\$157.50	Conference with B. Stafford regarding fee petition (.2); review and revise draft declaration supporting fee application (.5); exchange related email (.2);	Fee Petitions
4165	Stafford, William B.	7/29/2019	0.70	\$710.00	\$497.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$409.50	\$283.50	\$126.00	Talk with S. Klinkowski, C. Anderson, and A. Branch regarding filing logistics and support for creation of appendices;	Fee Petitions
4166	Branch, Aria C.	7/30/2019	3.70	\$815.00	\$3,015.50	\$480.00	\$345.00	\$1,776.00	\$1,276.50	\$499.50	Draft motion for attorneys' fees;	Fee Petitions
4167	Hamilton, Kevin J.	7/30/2019	1.50	\$845.00	\$1,267.50	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$1,125.00	\$862.50	\$262.50	Review draft fee application (.9); telephone conference with T. Haytens regarding fee application and related issues (.3); conference with team regarding same (.3);	Fee Petitions
4168	Stafford, William B.	7/30/2019	1.00	\$710.00	\$710.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$180.00	Prepare fee petition draft along with supporting K. Hamilton declaration (.8); exchange correspondence with A. Branch and S. Klinkowski to coordinate and oversee preparation of cost bill (.2)	Fee Petitions
4169	Branch, Aria C.	7/31/2019	0.20	\$815.00	\$163.00	\$480.00	\$345.00	\$96.00	\$69.00	\$27.00	Exchange emails with B. Stafford related to cost bill;	Fee Petitions
4170	Branch, Aria C.	8/1/2019	1.80	\$815.00	\$1,467.00	\$480.00	\$345.00	\$864.00	\$621.00	\$243.00	Update Exhibit A to cost bill (1.4); draft cost bill (.4);	Fee Petitions
4171	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/1/2019	1.20	\$845.00	\$1,014.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$900.00	\$690.00	\$210.00	Review and revise draft declaration in support of fee application (.6); review and revise draft fee application (.6);	Fee Petitions
4172	Stafford, William B.	8/1/2019	0.90	\$710.00	\$639.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$526.50	\$364.50	\$162.00	Exchange correspondence with S. Klinkowski regarding finalization of cost bill spreadsheet (.3); review various components of filing and confirm status and finalization work necessary (.5); send correspondence to litigation team regarding plan and timing for filing of fee petition and cost bill (.1);	Fee Petitions
4173	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/2/2019	1.50	\$845.00	\$1,267.50	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$1,125.00	\$862.50	\$262.50	Review final draft of fee application (.5); review and respond to related email regarding finalization and filing (.6); review email regarding same (.2); correspondence with B. Stafford regarding same (.2);	Fee Petitions
4174	Khanna, Abha	8/2/2019	1.80	\$720.00	\$1,296.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$1,062.00	\$738.00	\$324.00	Review and revise all documents regarding fee petition (1.6); email and confer with B. Stafford regarding same (0.2);	Fee Petitions
4175	William B.	8/2/2019	0.30	\$710.00	\$213.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$175.50	\$121.50	\$54.00	Coordinate filing of fee petition;	Fee Petitions
4176	Branch, Aria C.	8/3/2019	0.10	\$815.00	\$81.50	\$480.00	\$345.00	\$48.00	\$34.50	\$13.50	Circulate response to email from VA attorney general's office;	Fee Petitions
4177	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/5/2019	0.50	\$845.00	\$422.50	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$375.00	\$287.50	\$87.50	Exchange email regarding status of fee application and opposition to same;	Fee Petitions
4178	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/6/2019	0.50	\$845.00	\$422.50	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$375.00	\$287.50	\$87.50	Follow up on fee application status (.2); conference with B. Stafford regarding same (.3);	Fee Petitions

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.

Exhibit 1, Case No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-AWA-BMK

	Timekeeper Name	Date	Hours	Rate (Billed)	Subtotal (Billed)	Rate (Richmond)	Rate Approved in Page	Subtotal (at Richmond Rate)	Revised Subtotal (at Page rate)	Difference using Page rate	Description of Work	Category
4179	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/7/2019	1.60	\$845.00	\$1,352.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$1,200.00	\$920.00	\$280.00	Prepare for and telephone conference regarding fee application status (.9); conference with B. Stafford regarding same (.3); report to team regarding same (.4);	Fee Petitions
4180	Stafford, William B.	8/7/2019	0.90	\$710.00	\$639.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$526.50	\$364.50	\$162.00	Participate in conference call regarding with K. Hamilton regarding current status of outstanding fee petition;	Fee Petitions
4181	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/8/2019	0.80	\$845.00	\$676.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$600.00	\$460.00	\$140.00	Follow up with B. Stafford regarding negotiations and fee application (.3); exchange related email (.5);	Fee Petitions
4182	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/19/2019	0.40	\$845.00	\$338.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$300.00	\$230.00	\$70.00	Exchange email regarding proposal on settlement and related issues;	Fee Petitions
4183	Khanna, Abha	8/19/2019	0.10	\$720.00	\$72.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$59.00	\$41.00	\$18.00	Email and confer with B. Stafford regarding state's negotiation of fee petition (0.1);	Fee Petitions
4184	Stafford, William B.	8/19/2019	0.50	\$710.00	\$355.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$292.50	\$202.50	\$90.00	Conference call with T. Heytens regarding status of fee petition (.2); draft cover email regarding same to team (.3);	Fee Petitions
4185	Hamilton, Kevin J.	8/20/2019	0.20	\$845.00	\$169.00	\$750.00	\$575.00	\$150.00	\$115.00	\$35.00	Correspondence regarding attorneys' fees petition and related communications with the state;	Fee Petitions
4186	Branch, Aria C.	8/29/2019	0.30	\$815.00	\$244.50	\$480.00	\$345.00	\$144.00	\$103.50	\$40.50	Send email to B. Stafford regarding motion for attorneys' fees reply brief;	Fee Petitions
4187	Stafford, William B.	8/29/2019	0.20	\$710.00	\$142.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$117.00	\$81.00	\$36.00	Prepare outline of anticipated reply in support of fee petition;	Fee Petitions
4188	Branch, Aria C.	8/30/2019	0.20	\$815.00	\$163.00	\$480.00	\$345.00	\$96.00	\$69.00	\$27.00	Call with B. Stafford regarding attorneys fees reply brief;	Fee Petitions
4189	Khanna, Abha	8/30/2019	1.40	\$720.00	\$1,008.00	\$590.00	\$410.00	\$826.00	\$574.00	\$252.00	Revise draft reply brief on fees;	Fee Petitions
4190	Branch, Aria C.	9/3/2019	1.20	\$815.00	\$978.00	\$480.00	\$345.00	\$576.00	\$414.00	\$162.00	Draft reply to brief in opposition to motion for attorneys' fees;	Fee Petitions
4191	Stafford, William B.	9/3/2019	3.40	\$710.00	\$2,414.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$1,989.00	\$1,377.00	\$612.00	Draft fee petition reply brief to consolidate sections drafted by A. Branch and B. Stafford and to revise same;	Fee Petitions
4192	Branch, Aria C.	9/4/2019	3.70	\$815.00	\$3,015.50	\$480.00	\$345.00	\$1,776.00	\$1,276.50	\$499.50	Draft reply to brief in opposition to motion for attorneys' fees;	Fee Petitions
4193	William B.	9/4/2019	1.50	\$710.00	\$1,065.00	\$585.00	\$405.00	\$877.50	\$607.50	\$270.00	Finalize draft fee petition and supporting papers;	Fee Petitions
4194			136.05		\$92,685.50			\$71,413.50		\$17,017.75		SUBTOTAL for Fee Petitions
4195	Total		9262.15		\$4,973,809.25			\$4,115,893.75		\$441,355.25		

NOTE: Rows 2182, 2216, 2220, and 2270 are entries from 2016 adjusted to correct rates as reflected in Hamilton Declaration (ECF No. 403) at page 11.

Defendants' Rate Reduction Calculation

\$441,355.25 Total difference using Page rate (see row 4195 above)
-\$141,974.00 Subtotal difference using Page rate for Second Appeal (see row 4084 above)
-\$2,348.45 Subtotal difference using Page rate for Fee Petitions (see row 4194 above), multiplied by 13.8% (see response p.6 n.10)
17,017.75*.138 = 2,348.45

\$297,032.80	TOTAL RATE REDUCTION REQUESTED BY DEFENDANTS (for 2017, 2018, 2019 Richmond rates)
---------------------	---

Columns in green added to show changes related to billing rates.

Red highlighting indicates block billing; yellow highlighting indicates vague entries.